
Paul Edward Dunbar

Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses

Part of the Music Commons

Recommended Citation

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at LSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in LSU Historical Dissertations and Theses by an authorized administrator of LSU Digital Commons. For more information, please contact gradetd@lsu.edu.
THE SIX SCHÜBLER CHORALES FOR ORGAN: A PERFORMING EDITION

A Comparative Study of the Cantata Movements From Which They Were Transcribed

A Monograph

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the Louisiana State University and Agricultural and Mechanical College in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts in

The School of Music

by

Paul Edward Dunbar
B.M., Henderson State University, 1974
M.M., Louisiana State University, 1975
August 1980
MANUSCRIPT THESES

Unpublished theses submitted for the Master's and Doctor's Degrees and deposited in the Louisiana State University Library are available for inspection. Use of any thesis is limited by the rights of the author. Bibliographical references may be noted, but passages may not be copied unless the author has given permission. Credit must be given in subsequent written or published work.

A Library which borrows this thesis for use by its clientele is expected to make sure that the borrower is aware of the above restrictions.

LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my thanks to several people who have helped make this study possible. Dr. Herndon Spillman, Chairman of my committee, is recognized for his encouragement and timely suggestions throughout the final stages of this project. The other members of my committee are also due special appreciation: Dr. Wallace McKenzie, Mr. Paul Louis Abel, Dr. Milton Hallman, Dr. Jack Guerry, and Mr. George Walter.

Sincere appreciation is also extended to Dr. A. Duane White of Bob Jones University in Greenville, South Carolina, and to Dr. Richard Heschke of Concordia College in Bronxville, New York, for their guidance during the initial stages of this project.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents, Mr. and Mrs. Charles Dunbar, and my wife, Pam, for their constant love, support, and encouragement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF EXAMPLES</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. THE SIX SCHÜBLER CHORALES FOR ORGAN</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme&quot;</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wo soll ich fliehen hin&quot;</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten&quot;</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren&quot;</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ&quot;</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter&quot;</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. EVALUATION OF PRESENT-DAY EDITIONS</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peters Edition</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novello Edition</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riemenschneider Edition</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bornemann Edition</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schirmer Edition</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breitkopf and Härtel</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. PERFORMING EDITION</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme&quot;</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wo soll ich fliehen hin&quot;</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten&quot;</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren&quot;</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ&quot;</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter&quot;</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. BACH-GESELLSCHAFT EDITION OF THE CHORALE PRELUDES</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title page of the original edition</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme&quot;</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wo soll ich fliehen hin&quot;</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten&quot;</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"Meine Seele erhebet den Herren" 143
"Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ" 144
"Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter" 147

B. BACH-GESELLSCHAFT EDITION OF THE
CANTATA MOVEMENTS 150
"Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme" 151
"Wer nur den lieben Gott lüsst walten" 155
"Meine Seele erhebet den Herren" 158
"Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ" 160
"Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter" 163

BIBLIOGRAPHY 166
VITA 172
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Chart Summarizing Slur Combinations, 1600-1780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Comparison of tied and untied notes, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Reconstructed Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude, &quot;Wo soll ich fliehen hin&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude, &quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and original edition of Chorale Prelude, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and revised edition of Chorale Prelude, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 18; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 21; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Components of the Trill according to Putnam Aldrich</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Trill with a turned ending</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Trill with an anticipation</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Summary of cadential trills involving the anticipation</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; (a) Chorale Prelude, m. 18; (b) Chorale Prelude, m. 21</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Interpretation for the Appoggiatura</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Interpretation for the Appoggiatura (dotted note)</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; (a) Cantata, m. 65; (b) Chorale Prelude, m. 45</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 5; (a) Chorale Prelude, (b) Cantata</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; (a) Chorale Prelude, m. 6; (b) Chorale Prelude, m. 33</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 7; (a) Chorale Prelude, (b) Cantata</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 8; (a) Chorale Prelude, (b) Possible Interpretation</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; (a) Chorale Prelude, mm. 9-10; (b) Chorale Prelude, mm. 40-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 9, Possible Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme,&quot; m. 40, Possible Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Basic Motive used throughout &quot;Wo soll ich fliehen hin&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 1-6, Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; m. 5; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 22-24; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 30-31, Cantata Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 1-6, Chorale Prelude, as edited by Riemenschneider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 17-19 illustrating agogic accents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; m. 14, Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten,&quot; mm. 1-2, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; m. 13, Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 7-8; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 11-13; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 18-22; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 14-15; (a) Chorale Prelude, (b) Suggested Interpretation</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Notation of Passing Appoggiaturas</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Interpretation of Passing Appoggiaturas</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Notation of Nachschlags according to Walter Emery</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Comparison of mm. 12 and 23 of Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren;&quot; (a) Chorale Prelude, m. 12; (b) Chorale Prelude, m. 23</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 1-5, Chorale Prelude, as phrased by the Composer</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 1-9, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Bach, &quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ,&quot; mm. 1-18, Articulation Indications by the Composer, Cantata Movement</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Bach, &quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ,&quot; mm. 6-9, Chorale Prelude; Phrasing Indications by the Composer</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. Bach, &quot;Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ,&quot; mm. 1-16, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 6-9, Bass line of Cantata Movement</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; m. 2; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; m. 32; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 43-44; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 13-14; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 52-53; (a) Cantata, (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; (a) Chorale Prelude, mm. 13-18; (b) Chorale Prelude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 16-17; (a) Chorale Prelude, (b) Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 1-14, Cantata Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter,&quot; mm. 5-9, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Meine Seele erhebet den Herren,&quot; mm. 1-9; (a) Bach-Gesellschaft edition, (b) Riemenschneider edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57.</td>
<td>Bach, &quot;Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten,&quot; Bornemann edition, m. 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

Between 1746 and 1750 Johann Sebastian Bach submitted six chorale preludes to his friend and former pupil, Johann Georg Schübler, for publication. These works were transcriptions of vocal movements from Bach's own church cantatas. The goal of this Performing Edition of the so-called Schübler Chorales is to provide an edition of each chorale prelude which will preserve Bach's own indications for performance. This edition has been prepared after examining the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of both the cantata movements and the chorale preludes. When no indications for interpretation were provided by the composer, this writer has endeavored to make suggestions which are after the manner of the performance practice of the late Baroque.

Various present-day editions of these chorale preludes have also been examined to determine the edition which comes closest to the interpretation of the chorale preludes as presented in the Gesellschaft edition of both the organ works and the cantata movements.
INTRODUCTION

Performers today are especially concerned with creating a stylistically valid performance of Baroque music. Therefore, in order to recapture this spirit in early music, it becomes necessary to take the indications of the composer, modify them when necessary, and add our own markings when none are provided. Numerous treatises were written during the Baroque era and offer the performer guidelines for solving the problems presented in such music. It is only after we have a working knowledge of this style that our decisions concerning such problems can be made in accordance with the performance practices of the day.

Between 1746 and 1750, Johann Georg Schübler published the "Six Chorales of various sorts, to be performed on an organ with 2 manuals and pedal," by Johann Sebastian Bach. These chorale preludes, transcriptions of vocal movements from Bach's own cantatas, have come to be known as the Schübler Chorales.

This project is a study of the six so-called Schübler Chorales as they appear in the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of Bach's works, along with the cantata movements from which they were transcribed. The purpose of the study is to determine Bach's indications for the performance of the Six Schübler Chorales.
Bach was careful to indicate phrasing and articulation markings in the instrumental parts of most of the cantata movements under consideration, but many of these markings are not found in the chorale preludes of the Gesellschaft edition. Problems of interpretation arise when these indications are not provided. Therefore, it is necessary to look to the cantata movements for Bach's own phrasing and articulation. The specific problems of each piece are isolated and discussed individually. Solutions to these problems are suggested using the cantata movements as a source, and a performing edition has been prepared in accordance with the performance practice of the late Baroque. Various present-day editions of the Six Chorales have been examined to determine which edition comes closest to the interpretation of the chorale preludes as presented in the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of both the organ works and the cantata movements. Five of the cantata movements are found in the Bach-Gesellschaft edition; the sixth chorale prelude is presumably transcribed from a lost cantata.

In a study of this scope it is perhaps advantageous to discuss the importance of the cantata in the service at St. Thomas' Church in Leipzig during the late Baroque. In 1723 Bach was appointed Cantor of St. Thomas' Church and Director of Music for the City of Leipzig. Bach was also officially a member of the teaching staff of St. Thomas' School where he taught singing, elementary Latin, and the
Lutheran catechism. His principal duties, however, were supervising the four choirs for the churches of St. Thomas, St. Nicolas, St. Peter, and the New Church, now called St. Matthew. Bach was in charge of training the two principal choirs, those of St. Thomas and St. Nicholas. Here he had the tremendous responsibility of coordinating the music for each Sunday service at these two churches, a service which began at 7 a.m. and lasted for four hours.

The **Hauptgottesdienst**, the principal Lutheran service on Sundays and Feast Days, was, up to the administration of Holy Communion, primarily centered around the Gospel lesson for the day. This lesson dictated not only the choice of prayers and subject of the sermon, but also the choice of the music for the entire service, including the motet, the chorales, and the libretto for the **Hauptmusik**, or cantata. The cantata, which preceded the sermon, was the chief musical composition of the morning service and was approximately twenty minutes in length. No standard form existed for these works, but they normally consisted of an elaborate opening chorus followed by a series of recitatives and arias. They often ended with a chorale, which might have been sung by the entire congregation. Occasionally the cantata was divided into two parts with each part approximately fifteen to twenty minutes in length. The second part was performed after the sermon.
Listed below is the typical order of service followed by the churches of St. Thomas and St. Nicholas in Bach's time.\(^1\)

1. Organ voluntary.
2. Motet, from the collections of Bodenschatz or Vulpis.
3. Missa (Kyrie and Gloria in excelsis).
5. Epistle.
6. Hymn de tempore.
8. Creed (Latin).
10. Luther's metrical version of the Creed, as a hymn.
11. Sermon
12. Church notices.
13. Prayers and intercessions.
14. Hymn, or Part II of the Cantata.
15. The Lord's Prayer and Verba Institutionis.
16. Administration of the Sacrament, during which hymns or (and) a Motet were sung.
17. Collects.
18. Blessing.

According to C. P. E. Bach, his father composed five cantatas for every occasion on which they were required at Leipzig. The total number then is 295, of which 208 survive. The earliest cantata is No. 4, "Christ lag in Todesbanden" and was written in Mühlhausen in 1707. Cantata No. 195, "Dem Gerechten muss das Licht immer wieder aufgehen," was Bach's last cantata and was composed in Leipzig in 1741.\(^2\)

During Bach's time St. Thomas' and St. Nicolas' were the only churches in which cantatas were regularly performed

---


\(^2\) The customary numbering of the cantatas is according to the *Bach-Gesellschaft* edition and is not chronological. This numbering corresponds to that of the *Bach-Werk-Verzeichnis*, the thematic catalog of the works of J. S. Bach, edited by Wolfgang Schmieder in 1950.
in Leipzig. They were performed on alternate Sundays at each church. In 1744 the Cantata Choir consisted of seventeen singers: five sopranos, two altos, three tenors, and seven basses. The Cantata Choir always attended the church service at which the cantata was performed. The cantata was accompanied by an orchestra which rarely exceeded ten or twelve players besides the organ, which played the continuo. Additional personnel were added on festive occasions, but for the most part, the size of the orchestra was relatively small.

Cantatas were not sung during Lent nor were they performed on the second and following Sundays in Advent. These works were heard at both churches on six days of the church year: Christmas, Easter, Whitsunday or Pentecost, and the day immediately following them. Cantatas were also sung on the three festivals of the Blessed Virgin Mary (Purification, February 2; Annunciation, March 25; and Visitation, July 2), on St. Michael (September 29) and St. John the Baptist (June 24), and on New Year's Day, Ascension (forty days after Easter), Epiphany (January 6), and the Reformation Festival (October 31). The annual inauguration of the Town Council was also an occasion for which a cantata was performed. Thus Bach was called on to provide some fifty-nine cantatas annually.

---

From the cantatas come Bach's most precise information concerning phrasing and articulation in his music. In his preparation of cantatas for rehearsal, Bach often gave precise bowing indications for the string players, and he prepared two bass parts: an unfigured one for the string or wind instrument which doubled the bass line and a figured one for the organ. Few articulation markings are found in these two parts. Bach often composed these cantatas weeks in advance without knowing what particular instrument would be at his disposal to double the bass line. We are sure, however, that Bach "customarily used the organ . . . for continuo accompaniments in his church music."⁴ The organ continuo was not designed to be heavy or overbearing; rather, the "chords were played short and detached so that they really punctuated the vocal and instrumental texture and did not obscure it."⁵

When Bach wrote for keyboard instruments he put down few suggestions for interpretation. The majority of Bach's organ works carry no indications for phrasing or articulation. This stands in marked contrast to the works for stringed and wind instruments, works in which he was quite liberal in his instructions to the players of those instruments. The lack of suggestions in the keyboard works was not due to carelessness or laziness


⁵Ibid., p. 360.
but was merely the custom of composers of this period. Music was often studied directly under the tutelage of the composer, and thus, the interpretation was transmitted directly from teacher to student. Furthermore, composers of this period had a certain preference for spontaneity. Strict rules and rigid interpretations were out of place in both the teaching and performance of early music. The composer tended to entrust as much as possible to the performer and was content to be suggestive rather than definitive. Therefore, a strict system of rules for Baroque performance did not exist. Rather, the rules were very broad and could be relaxed under certain conditions to conform to specific examples.

Just as Bach left little indication in his keyboard works for the phrasing and articulation he desired, he left few indications as to the correct tempo for a piece. This was another act of faith in the principle of individualism as applied to the interpretation of music. Just as no two performers are alike, no two interpretations will be alike. The important rule in determining the correct tempo is that "the choice of tempo comes not from the notation but from the implications of the music itself, as modified by the overall mood of the interpretation and the acoustic circumstances--in other words, by the peculiar conditions of the performance in question."6 The matter of tempo must be, in the final analysis, the performer's choice and must be

determined by the acoustics in the room, by the mood of the performer, and by what the music communicates as a whole.

Nowhere are rigid rules more distorted than in the problem of maintaining a steady tempo. No factor is more important than the ability to keep a steady tempo, but the idea of maintaining one tempo throughout an entire composition ("sewing-machine rhythm" as Donington calls it\(^7\)) has been overworked in recent years. One can render a steady performance of a composition by Bach and, yet, at the same time bring out important lines and phrases through a clean, well-thought-out interpretation of the piece. Donington points out that the performer can "yield to each passing nuance as the music itself implies it, while holding the underlying tempo with the utmost sureness. That will not feel unsteady; it will simply feel natural.\(^8\)

Therefore, the typical Baroque performer should constantly strive for a relaxed, vivid, and natural performance. The piece should not be made to feel artificial or contrived. There is always the "necessity for keeping an unfailing sense of line.\(^9\)

Two facets of the complex process we call interpretation in the keyboard works of Johann Sebastian Bach are concerned with the problems of phrasing and articulation.


\(^9\)Ibid.
Phrasing refers to the "clear separation of a melody into its constituent phrases, whereas articulation refers to the subdivision of a phrase into smaller units."¹⁰ Often Bach's music falls quite naturally into well-marked phrases; thus it is the problem of the subdivision of the phrase which presents problems to the performer.

Until about 1725 the principal means of articulation discussed in woodwind treatises on performance practice consisted of tonguing rather than slurring. Slurs became more prominent as motives increased in length. Articulation, then, was disjunctive rather than connective.

Late Baroque principles of woodwind articulation made use of both slurring and tonguing. Increased attention was also given to slurring in the instruction books for strings and woodwinds, and printed music also began to exhibit an increased awareness in articulation by relying more extensively on slurred combinations to achieve the desired results. This change in articulation also shows a change in the structural framework during the eighteenth century.

It is in the orchestral parts of Bach's cantatas that we find his most persistent use of slurs. The reason for this is not clear, but perhaps it could have been due to the local circumstances that existed at Leipzig. Here Bach was often dependent on local students and amateurs for the musicians in his orchestra. These musicians were not as

experienced as the cantor would have liked, and perhaps Bach was determined to provide as many suggestions as possible to save valuable rehearsal time for the Sunday cantata. Again, this custom can also be traced to the fact that in the Baroque period keyboard works were often written for the personal use of the composer, along with that of his students. Here the interpretation could have been transmitted orally from teacher to student.

When slurs are not provided in musical works of the Baroque period, it becomes necessary for the performer to add his own phrasing and articulation indications. In order to be as true as possible to the eighteenth-century ideas on performance practice, one must consult various treatises of that time to determine the guidelines for a stylistic interpretation.

There are no clear-cut answers to the problems raised in the interpretation of Baroque music. Various methods of articulation can be presented and all contain solid ideas that follow prevailing customs of performance. In order to arrive at an interpretation which follows these customs, several areas should be discussed.

Organ performances of early music are commonly underphrased. This is due to the fact that performers are not aware that performance practice in the Baroque period generally stressed clear phrasing in order to point up the harmonic structure and the formal structure.
The roots of numerous Baroque forms of organ music lie deep in the early vocal music of the Renaissance, and hence, organ phrasing may often be thought of in terms of vocal phrasing as well. Vocal phrases are obviously limited by text and punctuation. Wind players as well as vocalists are also limited by the ability of the performer to sustain a melodic line, and string players must contend with changing the direction of the bow. Listeners are often disturbed in performances of Baroque music by an organist who grinds relentlessly through endless pages of unphrased contrapuntal music. The organist, must, therefore, go to the music itself and determine what are the component parts of the phrase. Musical patterns such as change of direction of the melodic line, melodic sequences, rhythmic sequences, chorale phrases, and numerous other considerations must be examined to determine the end of one phrase and the beginning of another. Baroque keyboard music was generally less smoothly articulated because of the excessive use of the second, third, and fourth fingers with little reliance on the thumb or fifth finger. Agogic accent, that is, shortening the value of the preceding note in order to give sufficient stress to the note receiving the accent, was also an important consideration in determining the phrase structure of a composition. These devices will be discussed in detail in Chapter One.

Bukofzer states that "as to bowing and tonguing the general rule can be stated that all notes were separately
bowed or tongued unless the opposite was expressly indicated by slurs . . . ."11 From this it is obvious that Baroque performers were extremely articulate in their performances. Certainly the lack of articulation indications does not prohibit the performer from adding his own markings when none are provided. To articulate only those notes which are so written would be to rob the music of the rhythmic verve that was prominent in the performance of Baroque music.

The motive was the basic structural unit of composition present in much of the music of the late Baroque. This motive often consisted of a number of figures, or groups of notes that together formed the entire motive. Further clarity of phrasing was often accomplished through the use of "beat-marking devices," whereby these figures were divided into single beats or parts of a measure. Quantz, in his Versuch, generally "limits slurring to groups of notes that do not exceed two beats of a measure, and his most frequent articulations normally confine themselves within single beats."12 This procedure becomes important when performers attempt to reconstruct tasteful articulations that conform to the performance practice of the late Baroque. It was not until the Classic period that the musical ideas became more extended and began to be made up of larger segments consisting of

two- and four-bar phrases. Articulation also followed this trend by being expanded into larger groups and thus de-emphasizing the beat-marking devices prominent in the late Baroque.

The chart found in Figure 1 on the following two pages presents a summary of the various slur combinations that were commonly used in the late Baroque. 13

---

13Ibid., pp. 94-95.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articulation</th>
<th>1600-1735</th>
<th>1735-1780</th>
<th>Melodic Contour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>very common</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2)</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>common</td>
<td>stepwise; occasionally for leaps; descending two-note figures in which the second note of one group is the same pitch as the first note of the next</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4)</td>
<td>very rare</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>stepwise (for notes connected by the slur)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps; three stepwise followed by a leap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps; a leap followed by three stepwise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>common</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8)</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>leap followed by seven stepwise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>stepwise (often scalar)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Chart Summarizing Slur Combinations, 1600-1780
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articulation</th>
<th>1600-1735</th>
<th>1735-1780</th>
<th>Melodic Contour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>very common</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11)</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>stepwise; leap followed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>by step</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12)</td>
<td>very rare</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>stepwise (often scalar)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>very common</td>
<td>stepwise; leaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14)</td>
<td>very rare</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>leap followed by five</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>stepwise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15)</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>occasional</td>
<td>stepwise (often scalar)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16)</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>rare</td>
<td>stepwise (often scalar)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>slurred extending more than two beats</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Chart Summarizing Slur Combinations, 1600-1780 (continued)
CHAPTER I

THE SIX SCHÜBLER CHORALES FOR ORGAN

After the completion of his last church cantata in 1741 and until his death in 1750, Bach devoted much of his time to rewriting many of his compositions, perhaps hoping to have more of his works published. The number of compositions published during his lifetime was relatively few. They include the following: an early cantata entitled "Gott ist mein Künig," the four sections of the "Clavierübung," the Canonie Variations on "Vom Himmel hoch da komm ich her," the "Musical Offering," and the "Schübler Chorales." All of these published works, except the cantata, were instrumental, and all but portions of the "Musical Offering" were for keyboard.

Between 1746 and 1750 Bach submitted six chorale preludes to his friend and former pupil, Johann Georg Schübler, for publication. The exact date of publication is not known, but the title page of the original edition gives us information for estimating this date. The title page translates as follows:

Six Chorales
of Various Sorts
to be performed
on an
Organ
with 2 Manuals and Pedal
composed by
Johann Sebastian Bach
Royal Polish and Electoral Saxon Court Composer
Published by Joh. Georg Schübler
at Zella at the Thuringian Forest.
To be had in Leipzig of the Capellmeister Bach, of his
Sons in Berlin and Halle, and of the Publisher in Zella. 14

Johann Sebastian Bach continued business relations with
Schübler until his death. In the papers concerning Bach's
business affairs and bequests one finds, among "other nec-
essary payments," paid to "Herr Schübler 2 thlr. 16 gr."
Spitta concludes that this sum "may very well relate to the
six chorales, and we may infer that these either were not
published till 1750, or that some new copies were at that
time printed off." 15 Wilhelm Friedemann Bach was appointed
Director of Music in Halle on April 16, 1746. Therefore,
with this information we may conclude from the title page
that the Six Chorales were published after April of 1746, and
it is possible that they were published as late as 1750.

The reason behind the publication of these six chorale
preludes is as mysterious as the exact date of their publica-
tion. It has been suggested that Schübler encouraged Bach
to make these arrangements of certain cantata movements that
had become popular in his day. Ervin J. Dunham further

14 Hans T. David and Arthur Mendel, The Bach Reader

15 Philipp Spitta, Johann Sebastian Bach, 3 vols.,
trans. Clara Bell and J. A. Fuller-Maitland (London:
suggests that

Bach may have seen this as an opportunity to give
wider circulation to samples of his church cantatas,
for it undoubtedly seemed unlikely to him that they
would ever be published in their original form.
These may have been among Bach's own favorite move­
ments.16

Karl Geiringer suggests that these works were meant
to be popular works directed toward relatively amateur organ­
ists. These six pieces would certainly have been a useful
addition to the service music repertoire of most church
organists who were required to provide chorale preludes on
various hymn tunes and yet were unable to improvise or
write as well for the organ as Bach. Points in favor of
this argument are the "rather elementary hints for suggest­
ing register stops which the professional organist might
have resented."17

Macomber offers some new insight as to the possible
reason behind the publication of the Six Schübler Chorales:

If we view the texts of the original cantata
movements in the five extant cantatas, and the order
in which the chorale preludes are set (presumably by
Bach himself) in the published version, we find that
they are tied together by an inner unity--that of the
celebration of Communion. . . . in so many places through­
out the original text settings in the cantata movements,
reference is made to specific aspects of the Communion,
and we cannot escape the conclusion that Bach may have
put them together as organ pieces toward this end. The
fact that the Communion service called for hymns

16Ervin J. Dunham, "The Schübler Chorale Preludes of
J. S. Bach," Journal of Church Music 6 (September 1964),
p. 15.

17Karl Geiringer, Johann Sebastian Bach (New York:
alternately to be sung and played in improvised fashion meant that other organists might welcome a collection that could be used during this time in the service.\textsuperscript{18}

Macomber also stresses the fact that these chorale preludes are particularly set for the Advent and Christmas seasons of the church year. After studying the lessons, collects, and gospels of the four Sundays in Advent and looking at the function of each of the chorale tunes in this collection, it is evident why Macomber concludes that these works not only fit the season, but are also published in a chronological order, one for each of the four Sundays in Advent and one each for the morning and evening services on Christmas day.

The original manuscript of this collection does not exist, and there are at present only five known copies of the first edition. Bach's own copy containing more than sixty changes and corrections is now lost, but was used for an edition published in 1847. This has been the source upon which subsequent editions have been prepared.

\textit{Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme}

The first of the Six Chorales is "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," usually translated as "Sleeper's Wake! A Voice is Calling." Cantata No. 140 was the basis for Bach's organ transcription. The chorale prelude was transcribed from the fourth movement of this cantata and was originally

scored for the tenor section of the chorus, violins and violas in unison, and continuo. A comparison of the organ version with that of the parts in the cantata movement is shown below in Figure 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cantata</th>
<th>Chorale Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Violins I, II, Violas</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenor section</td>
<td>Left hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuo</td>
<td>Pedal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2. Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude

The chorale melody, originally sung by the tenor section of the chorus, is now found in the left hand and remains unchanged throughout, except for the addition of passing tones, appoggiaturas, and cadential trills. Slight rhythmic changes also occur at measures 18 and 21. These changes result in added crispness in the solo line as shown in Examples 1 and 2.

In measure 18 one finds the symbol for a trill.\(^{19}\) Donington defines a trill as a "more or less free and rapid alternation of the main note with an upper accessory note a tone or semitone above it."\(^{20}\) In Bach's indications for the trill, he makes no distinction between the symbols: (t), (tr), a short wavy line (\(\approx\)), or a longer wavy line (\(\Leftrightarrow\)).

\(^{19}\) Ornamentation in the music of Bach frequently presents problems to many performers. Specific ornaments found in the Six Schübler Chorales are isolated and discussed as they appear.

This is illustrated in Example 1b, where a longer wavy line is found and in Example 2b where (tr) is used.

(a) Cantata (b) Chorale Prelude

Example 1. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," m. 18

Example 2. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," m. 21

The cadential trill found in measure 18 is one of two obligatory ornaments found in Baroque music. The other essential ornament is the long appoggiatura.\(^{21}\) Both the

\(^{21}\)Robert Donington (Interpretation) cites Jean Rousseau (Traité de la viole, 1687), Jacques Martin Hotteterre (Principes de la flute, 1707), and others who concur that the cadential trill and the long appoggiatura were two obligatory ornaments found in the music of the Baroque era.
cadential trill and the long appoggiatura are necessarily harmonic ornaments designed to bring out the dissonances involved in these progressions. Because they are obligatory primarily for harmonic reasons, these ornaments usually begin on the upper accessory note and are always played on the beat. Donington concludes, concerning the cadential trill, that "few cadences apart from plagal cadences are complete without the conventional trill at least in one of the parts."\(^\text{22}\)

Putnam Aldrich, writing on trills in the music of Bach (with reference to Baroque theorists Bacilly, Couperin, and Montéclair), says that trills of fairly long duration were regarded as being made up of three separate components which, in performance, are merged into a single entity (see Ex. 3): 1) the "appuy," or "preparation," a dwelling on the upper accessory, 2) the "battements," repercussions of the two notes, and 3) the "point d'arrêt," stopping point on the main note, or the "liaison," a connection with the next note. This "liaison" may take the form of an anticipation of the following note (Ex. 3b) or of a turn around the main note produced by substituting the lower neighbor for the last appearance of the upper accessory (Ex. 3c).\(^\text{23}\)

\(^{22}\) Donington, Interpretation, p. 236.

Example 3. Components of the Trill according to Putnam Aldrich

Musicians today think of standard Baroque trills as being prepared trills because they begin on their upper accessory notes. This upper-note beginning was taken for granted in the Baroque period, and the trill was called prepared only if the upper note was sufficiently stressed. Without this stress on the initial upper note the trill was called an unprepared trill.²⁴

Further evidence of this preparation of the trill by emphasizing the upper accessory note is found in Étienne Loulié's Elements ou principes de musique written in 1696. Loulié writes "'when the Voice remains appreciably on the little sound of the first Appoggiatura, this is called preparing the Trill.'"²⁵

The fact that this upper accessory note is sufficiently stressed gives evidence of the similarity between the trill and the appoggiatura. Some Baroque authorities actually

²⁴Donington, Interpretation, p. 241.
²⁵Étienne Loulié, Elements ou principes de musique, p. 70. Quoted in Donington, Interpretation, p. 242.
define the trill as a series of reiterated appoggiaturas from above the main note. The actual musical effect of this prolonged upper note is that of an appoggiatura.

A stylistically valid interpretation of the trill involves playing the repercussions or the body of the trill in a free manner, with the number of repercussions being left to the discretion of the performer. Such factors as tempo, acoustics of the hall, and the overall mood of the piece should be taken into consideration when deciding on the speed of each individual trill.

In discussing the speed of trills, Quantz writes:

All shakes do not have to be struck with the same speed; in this matter you must be governed by the place in which you are playing, as well as by the piece to be performed. If playing in a large place which reverberates strongly, a somewhat slower shake will be more effective than a quicker one; . . . In addition, you must be able to distinguish the character of each piece you play, so that you do not confuse those of one sort with those of another, as many do. In melancholy pieces the shake must be struck more slowly, in gay ones, more quickly.26

There were two standard endings to cadential trills in the Baroque period, one of which was supplied whether or not any indication was found on the printed page. These two endings were the turned ending and the ending with an anticipation. One must remember that the value of the terminating notes is not to be taken literally when the termination is written out. It is more stylistically correct to treat the termination as a continuation of the trill and not as a separate entity.

It is preferable to connect the termination to the trill without a break if a trill ends with a turn. This termination should also be the same speed as that of the repercussions of the trill, as illustrated in Example 4.

Example 4. Trill with a turned ending

The second kind of termination popular in the Baroque period was the anticipation. Often composers wrote out the note of anticipation, although the note value is often misleading. The note of anticipation occurs after the dotted note. The value of the dotted note may be prolonged and the note of anticipation shortened, usually resulting in a brief silence of articulation taken from part of the value of the dotted note, as shown in Example 5.27

---

27Donington, Interpretation, p. 249.
Example 5. Trill with an anticipation

Drawn up by Putnam Aldrich and reproduced as Example 6 on page 27 is a chart which illustrates various interpretations for the cadential trill involving this particular type of cadential trill.\textsuperscript{28} All of these may be considered valid according to the performance practice of Bach's time. They should serve only as models to performers, since all ornaments must be performed with spontaneity, giving the impression that the ornament was improvised rather than contrived.

The fact that Bach was one of the most meticulous composers of his time is evidenced by the famous quotation of Adolf Scheibe, a personal enemy of the master. Scheibe said, "'All embellishments, all little ornaments, and almost everything that belongs to the method of playing are written out by him in real notes.'"\textsuperscript{29} Bach often indicates the termination he desires to many of his ornaments rather than


leaving the final formula to the discretion of the performer. However, he often writes down an ornament only at its first appearance and leaves it to the performer to supply the formula whenever the same pattern reappears. Therefore, it is the opinion of the writer that the aforementioned criticism seems unjustified.

At measure 18 of "Wachet auf," one finds an example of a cadential trill preferred by Bach. In this trill, illustrated in Example 7a on the following page, the ending, a turn, is written out. At measure 21 Bach prefers to allow the performer to complete the trill, as illustrated in
Example 7b. Since a turn was suggested three measures earlier, it also seems appropriate here and in similar patterns, namely in measures 31, 34, 46, and 49. As mentioned earlier, these trills will all begin on their upper accessory note.

(a) m. 18, Chorale Prelude  (b) m. 21, Chorale Prelude

Example 7. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme"

In the chorale melody, at measure 20, one finds the symbol for an appoggiatura. Taken from the Italian verb appoggiare, meaning "to lean," it is an "auxiliary note, more or less stressed, and commonly although not necessarily dissonant to the harmony on to which it resolves."30

Numerous authorities writing in the mid-eighteenth century offer guidelines for the length which the appoggiatura must be held. C. P. E. Bach, writing in 1753, tells us "the usual rule of duration for appoggiaturas is that they take from a following tone of duple length one-half of its

value, and two-thirds from one of triple length."\textsuperscript{31} Quantz sheds light on the correct interpretation for these ornaments when he writes:

It is a general rule that there must be a slight separation between the appoggiatura and the note that precedes it, particularly if both are on the same pitch, so that the appoggiatura can be heard distinctly.\textsuperscript{32}

The size of these notes on the printed score should not lead to confusion concerning the length each note should be held. The symbol for the appoggiatura should not be confused with the present-day "grace note." These notes were traditionally smaller in size to show that they did not correspond to the harmony as represented in the figured bass.

The following examples illustrate the length of appoggiaturas for plain and dotted notes. In Example 8 the correct interpretation of the appoggiatura found in measure 20 is given, and Example 9 illustrates a possible interpretation for an appoggiatura occurring on a dotted note.


\textsuperscript{32}Quantz, pp. 73-74.
The only other change in the tenor line of the cantata movement when transcribed to the chorale prelude occurs in measure 45. Here a passing tone, $F^\#$, is inserted between the $E^b$ and $G^b$, as shown in Example 10.

(a) m. 65, Cantata  (b) m. 45, Chorale Prelude
The right hand of this work is the only one of the Six Chorales in which Bach indicated phrasing and articulation throughout. These suggestions occur only in the right hand and were originally intended as bowing indications for the string players. After comparing the indications in the chorale prelude with those found in the cantata movement, one is aware of a few subtle differences between the two.

Example 11a shows the phrasing found at measure 5 as it appears in the Gesellschaft edition of the chorale prelude. In the cantata movement this phrasing extends to include the eighth note at the beginning of beat four as shown in Example 11b. Similar changes in the phrasing of this pattern are found in measures 20, 23, 32, 37, and 47 of the chorale prelude. We may assume that Bach had a specific reason for changing these indications, since he was consistent in both the cantata movement and the chorale prelude.

Example 11. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," m. 5
At measure 6 one finds the first appearance of a rhythmic pattern involving two groups of four sixteenth notes phrased two, plus two, plus four. Each time this pattern occurs in the cantata movement it is phrased as shown in Example 12a. With two exceptions, the figure also appears this way in the chorale prelude. At measures 33 and 37 the pattern is notated as in Example 12b. It seems unlikely that Bach would have suddenly changed these indications and then have reverted back to the original idea in measure 47. Therefore, there is a possibility that the phrasing of measures 33 and 37 could have been a printer's error. These groups should perhaps be performed as shown in measure 6, Example 12a, throughout.

(a) m. 6, Chorale Prelude  (b) m. 33, Chorale Prelude

Example 12. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme"

Bach also added ornamental figures to the organ transcription, and the first example of these additions is the appoggiatura in measure 7, illustrated in Example 13a on page 33. The phrasing of this pattern has also been changed
from that found in the cantata movement. In Example 13b, taken from the cantata movement, one does not find an appoggiatura, but rather a three-note pattern which is taken in one stroke of the bow. With the addition of this ornamental device Bach preferred to change this figure to two sixteenth notes grouped together followed by a separated eighth note. Bach was consistent throughout the chorale prelude.

\begin{figure}[h]
\begin{center}
\begin{tikzpicture}
\begin{scope}[every node/.style={ midway, anchor=mid, sloped}]
\draw[thick] (0,0) -- (1,0);
\draw[thick] (1,0) -- (2,0);
\draw[thick] (2,0) -- (3,0);
\draw[thick] (3,0) -- (4,0);
\draw[thick] (4,0) -- (5,0);
\draw[thick] (5,0) -- (6,0);
\draw[thick] (6,0) -- (7,0);
\end{scope}
\end{tikzpicture}
\end{center}
\caption{Chorale Prelude \hspace{2cm} Cantata Movement}
\end{figure}

Example 13. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," m. 7

In the performance of the appoggiatura found in measure 7, and in similar examples, the ornament is held for half the length of the main note. In this case the main note, the \(E_b\), is a sixteenth note; therefore, the appoggiatura is a thirty-second note, and the value of the notes remaining does not change. The appoggiatura is played on the beat, that is, on beat three.

In measure 8 of the right hand one finds the symbol for a slide, (\(\sqrt{}\)), an ornament which is defined by the fact that it "slides rapidly and smoothly through its two conjunct
accessory notes to its main note—whence its alternative description as a conjunct double appoggiatura. This ornament is often written out in full for the performer and is also played on the beat. The speed of this ornament, as in other cases, depends on the context. It is quicker in allegro and slower in adagio. Example 14a shows this ornament as it appears in measure 8 of the chorale prelude, and Example 14b shows a possible interpretation for this ornament.

(a) Chorale Prelude

(b) Possible Interpretation

Example 14. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," m. 8

At measure 9, in the right hand, one finds the symbol for a trill on beat two. It is with this pattern that one finds the largest number of discrepancies in both the chorale prelude and the cantata movement. This pattern occurs eight times in the chorale prelude. Of these eight occurrences, all appear in connection with an ornament, either an appoggiatura or a trill. Four of these ornaments have no tie used in connection with the passage, these being found in

Donington, Interpretation, p. 217.
measures 9, 10, 27, and 28. Two such patterns, found in measures 9 and 10, are reproduced below in Example 15a. The remaining four instances, occurring in measures 40, 41, 50, and 51, all have ties connecting the third and the fourth beats of these measures, as illustrated in Example 15b.

(a) mm. 9-10, Chorale Prelude

(b) mm. 40-41, Chorale Prelude

Example 15. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme"

Because of the written-out repeat in the cantata movement, this same pattern is found ten times, seven of which appear in connection with ties. Trills are found on two of the seven tied examples, in measures 30 and 71. The three examples which are not tied all have trills, namely, measures 10, 31, and 48. Figure 3 on page 36 provides a chart summarizing
these findings. Those measures underlined in the chart are the examples which occur in connection with either an appoggiatura or a trill.

| Chorale Prelude       | Tied         | mm. 40, 41, 50, 51 |
|                       | Not tied     | mm. 9, 10, 27, 28 |

| Cantata Movement      | Tied         | mm. 9, 30, 47, 60, 61, 70, 71 |
|                       | Not tied     | mm. 10, 31, 48 |

Figure 3. Comparison of tied and untied notes

Since Bach was not consistent with his indication in either the cantata movement or the chorale prelude, we may assume that he was content with leaving a number of options open to the performer. The first of these options would be that of a half-trill, indicated in measure 9 of the organ transcription and illustrated in Example 15a on page 35. The half-trill begins on the upper accessory note, which is accented and prolonged if time permits. This ornament consists of two repercussions, or four notes, and is played on the beat. The last of the four notes is the main note and is not terminated with one of the standard endings found on trills of longer duration or cadential trills. Example 16 shows an approximate representation of this ornament.

---

The second option available to the performer for the interpretation of the passage in question is the use of the appoggiatura as shown in measure 10 of Example 15a. This ornament would be performed in the same manner as that of the appoggiatura found in measure 7 as previously discussed (See Ex. 8, p. 30).

The final option available to the performer, and the one preferred by this writer, is the interpretation of this ornament shown in Example 17. The main note, G^\#, which is dissonant with the bass note, F^#, is tied to the preceding note, G^\#. In this instance the trill must begin on the main note, on the beat, and the repercussion must involve the upper auxiliary note, A^\#.
The bass line of the cantata movement was placed in the pedal of the organ transcription. We have already noted that the organ was customarily used for the accompaniments in Bach's church music and that the bass line was doubled by either a woodwind or string instrument. The specific instrument which doubled the bass line in this cantata movement is not listed.

No articulation suggestions are given to the continuo player in this cantata and none are present in the transcription. We have already found that Baroque performers were extremely precise in their interpretations and that the organ continuo was played in a light and detached manner in order to punctuate rather than obscure the texture of the composition. Taking into account these considerations, and knowing that Bukofzer states that "all notes were separately bowed or tongued unless expressly indicated by slurs. . . .,"\textsuperscript{35} the pedal line could be played in a slightly detached manner throughout.

The final consideration regarding the chorale prelude on "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme" involves those basic registration suggestions that are provided for this piece. These suggestions and their translations are as follows:

| Dextra 8 Fuss. | Right hand 8 foot |
| Sinistra 8 Fuss. | Left hand 8 foot |
| Pedal 16 Fuss. | Pedal 16 foot |

\textsuperscript{35}Bukofzer, p. 377. (Refer to footnote No. 11, p. 12.)
The pedal is to be based on a sixteen-foot stop, but this does not prevent the addition of higher sounding ranks for more precise pipe speech. Bach suggests an eight-foot stop for the left hand, placing the chorale melody, originally sung by the tenor section of the chorus, into the proper range for these voices. He also indicated that the right hand should be based on an eight-foot stop. Again, higher sounding ranks can be added for clarity. This dance-like pattern was originally assigned to the violins and violas, both of which are rich in the higher partials of the overtone series.

**Wo soll ich fliehen hin**

The second of the Schübler Chorales is "Wo soll ich fliehen hin" ("O Whither Shall I Flee"). This chorale prelude is also given the alternative title "Auf meinen lieben Gott," or "In God, My Faithful God."

This work is the only one of the Six Chorales for which no cantata movement exists, but the piece displays many of the characteristics exhibited in the five other chorale preludes. Therefore, most scholars conclude that this work was probably transcribed from one of the approximately one hundred lost cantatas of Bach.

Bach evidently had the words to "O Whither Shall I Flee" in mind when he composed this piece. The first two measures in the right hand are immediately imitated in the left hand two beats later and form the basic melodic pattern found throughout the entire work. An eight-note pattern of
sixteenth notes, shown in Example 18, appears either in its original form or in inversion in all thirty-three measures.

Example 18. Basic Motive used throughout "Wo soll ich fliehen hin"

Bach has also provided basic registration suggestions for this piece. The suggestions and their translations are as follows:

1. Clav. 8 Fuss First manual 8 foot
2. Clav. 16 Fuss Second manual 16 foot
Ped. 4 Fuss Pedal 4 foot

The upper line is to be based on an eight-foot stop, but higher sounding ranks may be added again for clarity. The second manual is to include a sixteen-foot stop. It is from this indication that the greatest evidence is found supporting the theory that this work was indeed transcribed from a cantata movement. This sixteen-foot stop would place this line in the correct range for the basso continuo of a vocal movement. The four-foot stop indicated for the pedal would bring this line into the proper range for the alto section of a chorus.

No articulation suggestions are provided in the Gesellschaft edition of this chorale prelude. The lack of
such indications certainly does not prohibit the performer from adding his own tasteful articulation markings. When adding such indications one must remember that "the sense of line comes first; and that good articulation, like good phrasing, is an element in good line." 36

Albert Riemenschneider has reconstructed a very convincing cantata movement from this chorale prelude in which the melody is sung by the alto section of the chorus, the upper line is presented by violins and violas in unison, with the bass line of the continuo being played by the violoncello. After studying the original orchestration of the various cantata movements, this reconstructed work follows closely the instrumentation present in most of the cantata movements under consideration. When comparing this reconstructed movement to the chorale prelude, one finds the distribution of the lines as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reconstructed Movement</th>
<th>Chorale Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Violins I, II, Violas</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuo</td>
<td>Left hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alto section</td>
<td>Pedal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Comparison of Voice distribution between Reconstructed Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude

Riemenschneider suggests that the upper line of the piece was played by violins and violas in unison. With no articulation markings provided, this would mean that all notes were to be separately bowed by the members of the

string family, resulting in a slight silence with each change of bow. This sort of articulation on the organ, that is, a slight separation of all notes, would result in a rather choppy and disjointed performance and would add nothing to the element of a good musical line. Therefore, these suggestions must be slightly modified when adapting this work to the organ.

One finds that when attempting to create a sense of movement to a line in Baroque literature

the most natural articulation is to bind together in legato the intervals of seconds, to separate slightly the notes of the middle-sized intervals by means of portato, and to separate distinctly the large, intervals (those that we commonly designate as leaps).^37

This offers valid suggestions for the interpretation of the second of the Six Chorales. One must also be aware of several nuances that Baroque performers used to add to the beat-marking structure inherent in the literature of this period. Two such nuances have to do with legato touch and agogic accent.

Although Keller suggests that a legato touch be given to the intervals of a second, performers today must consciously strive for a clean legato. The style of legato playing demanded by the Romantic organ composers, that of a heavy legato characterized by almost overlapping each individual note, was not typical of Baroque performances.

---

Baroque playing was very clean and controlled, with even legato passages being performed with a touch which seemed almost slightly detached by modern standards. Marpurg confirms this principle of a slight separation between the notes when he writes:

Opposed to legato as well as to staccato is the ordinary movement which consists in lifting the finger from the last key shortly before touching the next note. This ordinary movement, which is always understood is never indicated.38

In keeping with this principle, the lines given to the manuals of "Wo soll ich fliehen hin" should be performed with a lighter touch throughout.

Baroque performers also tended to emphasize notes through accent which reinforced the beat-marking structure. The downbeat was normally stressed in Baroque literature, as were syncopated notes. In organ playing these notes may be stressed only through agogic accent, that is, by shortening the value of the preceding note in order to give sufficient stress to the note receiving the accent. The syncopated notes in measures 1 and 2 and in similar examples may, therefore, be accented through a slight separation before their execution in order to bring out this characteristic rhythmic pattern.

An example of these principles as applied to "Wo soll ich fliehen hin" is shown in Example 19.

---

38 F. W. Marpurg, Anleitung zum Clavierspielen, 2nd ed., p. 29. Quoted in Donington, Interpretation, p. 479.

Wer nur den lieben Gott läßst walten

The third chorale prelude of the set is "Wer nur den lieben Gott läßst walten," or "If Thou But Suffer God to Guide Thee." This work was transcribed from the fourth movement of Cantata No. 93 of the same name and was originally scored for soprano and alto duet, violins and violas in unison, and continuo. The transcription divides the voices as shown in Figure 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cantata</th>
<th>Chorale Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soprano</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alto</td>
<td>Right and left hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuo</td>
<td>Left hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violins I, II, Violas</td>
<td>Pedal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5. Comparison of voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude

In this piece the chorale melody is presented by the violins and violas in unison while the soprano and alto
weave beautiful contrapuntal lines above it, beginning with a decorated version of this chorale melody imitated in both voices. This may be seen in Example 20.

Example 20. Bach, "Wer nur den lieben Gott lâsst walten," mm. 1-6, Chorale Prelude

When transferring this work to the organ, Bach made two slight changes in notation. In measure 5 the soprano was changed from an eighth note followed by two sixteenth notes to a dotted-eighth note followed by two thirty-second notes, as shown in Example 21.

Example 21. Bach, "Wer nur den lieben Gott lâsst walten," m. 5
At measure 23 of the chorale melody, a whole note tied to a quarter note was changed to a half note, as shown in Example 22.

\[\text{(a) Cantata}\]
\[\text{(b) Chorale Prelude}\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\begin{array}{cccc}
\text{Cantata} & & & \\
\text{Chorale Prelude} & & & \\
\end{array}
\end{array}
\]

Example 22. Bach, "Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten," mm. 22-24

The only phrasing Bach provided, aside from the vocal slurring of multiple notes on one syllable of a word, appears in the continuo line of the cantata movement at measure 30. This is the only place throughout the entire movement where four sixteenth notes are found together in the continuo line. Bach phrased these notes in groups of two to correspond to the phrasing of the text found in the soprano voice, as shown in Example 23. This phrasing was not transferred to the chorale prelude.
Riemenschneider has suggested that the upper parts of the chorale prelude be played on two manuals, one for the alto and soprano duet and another for the continuo line. He has also suggested that each voice be played on a separate manual, enabling the performer "to bring out more clearly the characteristic qualities of the soprano and alto voices of the original duet." This procedure would also involve rearranging the work, requiring three manuals and pedal. The instructions for this rather complicated procedure are as follows:

Transfer the present left-hand part (Continuo) to the pedals. Distribute the two upper voices between the two hands upon the Swell and Choir manuals with good contrast and balance. Play the choral melody one octave higher than written on the Great manual with an 8' reed stop. This chorale melody will have to be "thumbed" on the Great manual and divided between the two hands, which are meanwhile playing upon the Swell and Choir manuals.

---

40Ibid.
Both of these editorial suggestions seem questionable due to the extreme range involved between the voices in this chorale prelude. Also, Bach was careful to indicate the use of two manuals when he intended them elsewhere in the Six Chorales, and no such indication is given here. Therefore, this writer suggests that the use of one manual and pedal is the correct manner of performance for this piece.

Several varieties of phrasing and articulation may be applied to this chorale prelude. The upper two voices were originally sung as a soprano and alto duet; therefore, the phrasing of the voice parts in the original cantata movement should be taken into consideration. The phrasing which seems to follow most closely the original intent of the composer, and the one preferred by this writer, is that phrasing suggested by Albert Riemenschneider who edited the two upper voices "exactly as Bach himself suggests it in connection with the original words."41 A portion of this phrasing is shown in Example 24 on the following page.

---

41 Ibid.
A new theme enters after the double bar in measure 17 and is the most important melodic idea in the second part. This idea involves syncopated notes, and it may receive added emphasis through the use of agogic accents, as illustrated in Example 25.
One finds several places in this work where cadential trills seem appropriate but are not indicated by the composer. The rhythmic notation involved in these progressions shows the termination desired by the composer. These trills may or may not have been added by vocalists in the original cantata movement but should be included, when possible, by the organist performing this transcription. It is not always possible to add trills to the upper lines of the organ transcription because of the extreme range of the upper voices. Example 26 shows the range involved between the voice parts and continuo line at measure 14.

Example 26. Bach, "Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten," m. 14, Chorale Prelude

A trill in the soprano voice on the third beat of measure 14 would result in rather awkward fingering problems for the organist if he retained the phrasing which was true to the original words. In measure 16, however, a trill is possible
on the B in the soprano voice because the lines are closer together, thus, permitting an ornament while still preserving the phrasing true to the words of the cantata movement. Cadential trills may also be added in the soprano voice at measure 28 and the alto voice at measure 33.

The continuo makes use of the rhythmic pattern which Schweitzer lists as Bach's "joy motive." This motive consists of an eighth note followed by two sixteenth notes. Again, Bach lists no preference as to which instrument should double the bass line in the cantata movement.

The articulation presented in the left hand, the original bass line, should reinforce each statement of the "joy motive." One possible interpretation for this bass line is shown in Example 27. The articulation presented in this example can be used consistently throughout, adding to the rhythmic and melodic flow of the work. This is in keeping with the lighter style present in many of the continuo parts of Bach.

Example 27. Bach, "Wer nur den lieben Gott lüst walten," mm. 1-2, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation

---

"Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," translated as "My Soul doth magnify the Lord," is the fourth of the Six Schübler Chorales and was transcribed from the fifth movement of Cantata No. 10. The cantata, composed in 1724 for the Feast of the Visitation of the Blessed Virgin Mary, uses as its chorale melody a unique psalm tone, the "Tonus Perigrinus." This chant, traditionally used for chanting the Magnificat, has been referred to as the "Wandering Tone," since it uses a different recitation note, or dominant, for its first and second halves, as shown in Example 28.


In the cantata movement, the plainchant is played in unison by two oboes and a trumpet against an alto and tenor duet. Continuo is also used, again with no specific instrument designated to double the bass line. This is the only one of these five extant cantata movements in which instruments other than members of the string family are specified.
for the instrumental ensemble. In the organ version the parts are divided as shown in Figure 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cantata</th>
<th>Chorale Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oboe I, II, Trumpet</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alto</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenor</td>
<td>Right and left hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuo</td>
<td>Pedal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 6. Comparison of Voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude

In transcribing this work for the organ, Bach gave the bass line to the pedal, while the alto and tenor duet, along with the chorale melody, was presented in the manuals. No registration suggestions are provided for this piece; however, one finds the word *sinistra* (left hand) at measure 5, and at measure 9 *dextra forte* (right hand loud) is found. From these indications one may conclude that Bach intended this work to be performed on two manuals with the chorale melody being taken by the right hand as a solo on a separate manual. In measures 13, 24, and 26 one finds the need for momentary use of the right hand on two manuals at once. An example of this may be seen in Example 29 on the following page.
Example 29. Bach, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," m. 13, Chorale Prelude

The dotted-half note of the chorale melody must be held for three full beats, yet the accompanying voices, originally sung as an alto and tenor duet, continue their contrapuntal movement. The extreme range involved prohibits a smooth performance of these lines without the use of the thumb on the second manual.

When transferring this work to the organ, Bach made several slight changes in notation. The first of these changes occurs in measures 7 and 8. Here the D₄ on beat six in the tenor is not tied in the cantata movement because of text changes as reflected in Example 30a, but this note is tied in the chorale prelude, as shown in Example 30b.
In measure 13 the alto line in the cantata movement is tied, resulting in a syncopation from beat three to beat four (Ex. 31a). This tie is not found in the chorale prelude (Ex. 31b).

In measures 18 through 22 Bach changes the three eighth notes on the second half of each of those measures in the cantata movement to a dotted-eighth note, a sixteenth note, and an eighth note. These changes are shown in Example 32 on the following page.
Constant eighth-note motion in one or more of the voices is found throughout the entire work, and Bach could have changed these measures in the chorale prelude in order to supply more rhythmic variety to the organ version.

Bach also added ornamentation to the chorale prelude, the first instance of which is the cadential trill in the alto voice of measure 14 found in Example 33a on the following page. The preferred termination to this ornament is also provided by the composer and takes the form of an
anticipation. This anticipation may be played as an eighth note in order to preserve the rhythmic pulse which is characteristic of the alto and tenor voices. This suggested interpretation is shown in Example 33b.

(a) Chorale Prelude  (b) Suggested Interpretation

Example 33. Bach, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," mm. 14-15

Bach also added ornamentation to the tenor voice in the second half of measure 23. Again, the symbol for the appoggiatura is found, this time filling in the intervals of a third. An appoggiatura of this kind, also called the Nachschlag, is discussed by various writers on Baroque performance practice, many of whom regard this as a "passing appoggiatura."

Quantz discusses two kinds of appoggiaturas: the accent appoggiatura (Anschlagende Vorschlag) and the passing appoggiatura (Durchgehende Vorschlag). Passing appoggiaturas, according to Quantz, "occur when several notes of the
same value descend in leaps of thirds," as shown in the example below.

Example 34. Notation of Passing Appoggiaturas

When performed they are executed as shown in Example 35.

Example 35. Interpretation of Passing Appoggiaturas

One form of the Nachschlag discussed by Walter Emery is that which moves by step and is indicated by either a small note or a hook. This ornament either forms part of a descending scale or is found between tied or repeated notes. It is often difficult to identify this type of Nachschlag since

\[43\text{Quantz, p. 93.}\]
so far as notation goes, they are indistinguishable from appoggiaturas. There are two hints that may be useful. If a hook or small note resolves upwards, it is certainly an appoggiatura. On the other hand, if in a series of falling thirds there are two or more hooks or small notes, there is a fair chance that they are Nachschlags.\textsuperscript{44}

Emery clarifies this statement in a footnote when he writes:

A fair chance, but nothing more. It must be clearly understood that Nachschlags are not obligatory in this context. Compare bars 12 and 23 in the Schübler chorale prelude on "Meine Seele." The context is that of Ex. 36; but the small notes are appoggiaturas.\textsuperscript{45}

\begin{example}
\begin{music}
\begin{notation}
\end{notation}
\end{music}
\end{example}

Example 36. Notation of Nachschlags according to Walter Emery

This writer concurs with Emery that the ornaments found in measure 23 are in fact true accented appoggiaturas rather than a form of the Nachschlag. When the ornaments in measure 23 are performed as appoggiaturas, the context is the same as that found in measure 12. Even the chorale melody and the pedal line are similar in both measures, as seen in Example 37.

\begin{footnotes}
\footnote{Walter Emery, \textit{Bach's Ornaments} (London: Novello and Co., Ltd., 1953), p. 94.}
\footnote{Ibid.}
\end{footnotes}
Example 37. Comparison of mm. 12 and 23 of Bach, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren"

Several varieties of phrasing and articulation may be applied to this chorale prelude. This work, like the preceding chorale prelude, was originally a vocal duet with the chorale melody played by instrumentalists. No phrasing suggestions were provided in the previous work; however, Bach did give numerous suggestions for the interpretation of the chorale prelude currently under discussion. No suggestions were provided in the cantata movement from which this piece was transcribed; thus, this work is the only one of the Six Chorales for which markings were provided in the chorale prelude and were not present in the original cantata movement. The opening measures of the pedal line are shown in Example 38 as they appear with the phrasing suggested by the composer.
Example 38. Bach, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," mm. 1-5, Chorale Prelude, as phrased by the Composer

In measures 5 and 15 Bach slurs the descending second in the tenor and alto lines as it is found in the opening measure of the pedal line. If one is to remain consistent with the slur provided in the three parts containing this imitative idea, that is, the pedal, the tenor, and the alto line, recurring figures of this type should also be given similar treatment.

Since most of this chorale prelude displays no articulation suggestions, the phrasing of the remainder of the work presents several problems. Keller writes concerning works which exhibit both marked and unmarked passages:

When unmarked passages occur in otherwise marked works, Bach requires non-legato, that is a change of bow after every note, but with little separation. Not all unmarked parts, however, should be performed in this fashion, for often, especially in the bass parts of the church works, the articulation signs are omitted only because of haste. 46

It is important for performers to conform to the wishes of a composer by observing the indicated dots and slurs. The lack of such indications should not be

46 Keller, p. 77.
interpreted as prohibiting the addition of tasteful articulations by the performer. If all notes not specifically phrased in this composition were played slightly detached, the effect would be quite unmusical since there would be no feeling of movement to the line. Therefore, the rule of separate bowing and tonguing for each note must be modified for the sake of retaining a clear contrapuntal line.

One possible interpretation for the opening measures of this chorale prelude is presented in Example 39. The slurring of the descending second always occurs on the second half of the measure, and the slurring of the stepwise passage in measure 4 occurs on the first half of the measure. One will notice that the phrasing provided by this editor corresponds to that found in the opening pedal line wherever similar passages are found. Other additions follow the customary procedures present in the music of the Baroque period. (See Ex. 39, p. 63. Unbroken slurs are those provided by the composer; broken lines have been added by this writer.)
Example 39. Bach, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," mm. 1-9, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation

Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ

The fifth chorale prelude of the set, "Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ" ("Lord Jesus Christ with us abide"), was transcribed from the third movement of Cantata No. 6. The cantata is entitled "Bleib bei uns, denn es will Abend werden" ("Abide with us for evening comes") and was written for Easter Monday in 1725. The original scoring called for
soprano, violoncello piccolo, and continuo. The organ transcription divides the voices as shown in Figure 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cantata</th>
<th>Chorale Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soprano</td>
<td>Right hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violoncello piccolo</td>
<td>Left hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuo</td>
<td>Pedal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7. Comparison of Voice distribution between Cantata Movement and Chorale Prelude

When transferring this cantata movement to the organ, Bach gave the chorale melody, originally sung by a soprano, to the right hand. In both the cantata movement and the chorale prelude, this melody is present in augmentation. The violoncello piccolo is assigned to the left hand, and the bass line of the continuo is once again found in the pedal.

No changes in notation occur when the cantata movement is transferred to the organ. In the original cantata movement Bach makes use of two verses of the chorale for the soloist; for the organ transcription he uses only one. This eliminates forty-one measures of the cantata movement when the work is transferred to the organ. In the cantata movement Bach places the tempo indication Allegro at the beginning of the work; this is not found in the chorale prelude. No registration suggestions are provided for this piece.

47 The violoncello piccolo was a five-stringed instrument used quite frequently by Bach in his cantatas for florid obbligato lines that would have been difficult to perform on the cello. The instrument was approximately thirty-six to thirty-eight inches long and was capable of executing high and rapid passages with greater ease than the cello of that time, which was used primarily as a continuo instrument.
The first eighteen measures of the cantata movement are shown in Example 40 with articulations indicated by Bach. The entire obbligato line is based on the melodic ideas presented in these opening measures. Therefore, the indications provided for these measures may be applied throughout the remainder of the work.

Example 40. Bach, "Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ," mm. 1-18, Articulation Indications by the Composer, Cantata Movement
The instrumental character of the left hand in the chorale prelude, originally presented by the violoncello piccolo, is readily apparent in the rapid alternation of the sixteenth-note figures and its extended range. These dance-like patterns move about, encompassing a range of more than two octaves, and they are frequently written lower than the bass line, as seen in measures 3 through 15 of Example 40 on page 65.

Bach provided articulation suggestions in the cantata movement, but most of these indications were not carried over to the Gesellschaft edition of the chorale prelude. Articulation suggestions are found in only four measures of the organ version of this work, namely, measures 6 through 9. This is shown below in Example 41. The slurring of these measures is identical to that found in the corresponding measures of the cantata movement (Ex. 40). The cantata movement from which this organ chorale was transcribed must, therefore, be consulted for Bach's own indications for the performance of this work.

Example 41. Bach, "Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ," mm. 6-9, Chorale Prelude Phrasing Indications by the Composer
The notes that are phrased in measures 1, 6, and 7 are similarly marked throughout the rest of the cantata movement. The staccato indications found in the second measure, however, are marked only in this measure. This pattern, which outlines a triad, serves as a prominent motive throughout the work and may be articulated in the same manner each time this pattern is found. The tremolo-like passages found in measures 9 through 14 are not slurred by the composer, so it may be assumed that Bach intended a change of bow on every note.

A more legato execution of this line is preferable to the separation of each note when transferring this work to the organ. The line may be divided into two-beat groupings in order to emphasize the strong beats of the measure. A separation of each note would be technically difficult on the keyboard and would result in a rather choppy performance of this dance-like pattern.

No articulation suggestions are provided for the continuo player in the cantata movement, and none are present in the organ transcription. Composers of the Baroque period often left many elements of musical interpretation to the discretion of the performer. Various methods of articulation may be presented, and all contain solid ideas that follow customary Baroque performance practices. Slurring found in orchestral and chamber music of this period was, for the most part, rather short. The slurring often falls into groups of two, three, or four notes, and is not, as a rule, against the beat.
The pedal line of this chorale prelude presents a clear opportunity for various methods of interpretation. One such method is that of a slightly detached performance for each note, thus emphasizing the separate bowing and tonguing procedures and the style of detached continuo playing previously discussed. A second possibility is that of emphasizing the two- and four-beat grouping which tends to stress the beat-marking structure inherent in the music of this period.

One possible interpretation for the opening measures of this work is shown in Example 42 on page 69.
Example 42. Bach, "Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu Christ," mm. 1-16, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation
Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter

The last of the Six Schübler Chorales is "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter" ("Comest Thou, Jesu, from Heaven to Earth now descending"). The organ version was transcribed from the second movement of Cantata No. 137, "Lobe den Herren, den mächtigen König der Ehren" ("Praise to the Lord, the Almighty, the King of Creation"), where it was originally entitled "Lobe den Herren" or "Praise to the Lord." This cantata movement was scored for alto, solo violin, and continuo and was written in 1725.

After studying the five extant cantata movements from which these chorale preludes were transcribed, one notices that this work is the only one of the set in which Bach changed the title of the work in transcription. The work, originally entitled "Lobe den Herren," is now presented under the new title "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter."

Macomber offers the following suggestion for this change:

It is only in the light of the six chorale preludes as Advent-Christmas compositions that this title becomes meaningful. Scholars have questioned for years the reason for dropping "Lobe den Herrn" as it was originally, to substitute the name of this obscure hymn. Nothing could have been simpler than to change a title and gain a Christmas composition, exactly Bach's procedure.48

In the original edition the voices were divided as illustrated in Figure 8 on page 71.

48 Macomber, p. 21.
In this edition the violin solo was assigned to the right hand, the chorale melody to the left hand, while the bass line of the continuo was once again found in the pedal. In his own printed copy, containing more than sixty changes and corrections, Bach redistributed the parts as shown below in Figure 9.

In this version the violin solo was still given to the right hand, but the lower two parts were changed so that the chorale melody was assigned to the pedal and the bass line of the continuo was presented by the left hand. This bass line moves rather quickly and is full of awkward skips and leaps, as illustrated in Example 43 on the following page.
Example 43. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter mm. 6-9, Bass line of Cantata Movement

When transferring this work to the organ, Bach made several changes in notation, the first of which is found in the right hand of measure 2, originally played by the solo violin. This is illustrated in Example 44. Here, the notes on the second beat are changed from the dominant seventh chord \( (D^\#, F^\#, A^\#, C^\flat) \) to the tonic chord in G Major \( (G^\#, B^\#, D^\#) \). The last two sixteenth notes in measure 2 are also different from those in the cantata movement. The same melodic pattern is found in measures 15 and 25 of the chorale prelude, but these notes were not changed due to the harmonies dictated by the chorale melody.

(a) Cantata

(b) Chorale Prelude

Example 44. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," m. 2
In measure 4 of the violin solo, Bach indicates the symbol for an appoggiatura on the first beat. The rhythmic pattern involved here, a quarter note followed by an eighth note, played an important role in terminating phrases throughout the entire work. An ornament is found on the quarter note each time this pattern occurs in the cantata movement. The ornament used most frequently is the trill. An appoggiatura, however, is found in measure 4, and Bach provides the symbol for both an appoggiatura and a trill in measure 29. Since Bach was not consistent in his indications for these ornaments in the cantata movement, there is a possibility that either the appoggiatura or the trill may be used.

The symbol for an ornament is found only twice in the chorale prelude, namely, in measure 4 and measure 30. The symbol for a trill is used in both places. The ornament may perhaps also be safely added each time similar rhythmic patterns are found in the right hand of the chorale prelude, namely, measures 5, 7, 17, 27, 29, 46, and 50.

In measure 32 of the violin solo in the cantata movement, the composer adds a trill to the second of three eighth notes on the final beat of the measure, as represented in Example 45a. No such indication is found in the chorale prelude (Ex. 45b), but the ornament may be inserted here for added variety in the right-hand part.
The bass line of the continuo is now found in the left hand. When transferring this work to the organ, Bach made one slight change in notation. In measure 43 of the chorale prelude, the G in the last beat of the measure is tied to the first eighth note of measure 44 (Ex. 46a). This note is not tied in the cantata movement (Ex. 46b).

Slight rhythmic changes are also found in the chorale melody when it is transferred to the organ. The first such change occurs in measure 13 where an eighth note followed by
two sixteenth notes is changed to a dotted-eighth note followed by two thirty-second notes, as shown in Example 47.

(a) Cantata

(b) Chorale Prelude

Exampel 47. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," mm. 13-14

This rhythmic alteration is also found in measure 23 when the first phrase of the chorale melody is repeated. Similar changes were made in two previous chorale preludes and resulted in added crispness in the lines involved. 49 The only other change in notation of the chorale melody occurs in measure 52 when Bach changes an eighth note followed by two sixteenth notes to three eighth notes, as shown in Example 48.

---

49 Refer to Ex. 1 and 2 on p. 21 for changes in the chorale melody of "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," and to Ex. 21 and 22 on pp. 45 and 46 for a change in the melody of "Wer nur den lieben Gott lassst walten."
Some cadential trills were present in the original alto solo in the cantata movement, but Bach preferred a more highly decorated chorale melody in the organ version. The additional trills were given to the pedal line in measures 15 and 53. The ornaments found in the first phrase of the chorale melody (Ex. 49a) may also be added to the second phrase (Ex. 49b) since it is a repetition of the first phrase.
The trills on the dotted-quarter notes in measure 15 and 25 may be regarded as half-trills and thus stop on the second beat of these measures.\(^{50}\) The trills in measures 17, 27, and 53 are cadential trills and occur on notes of longer length. Cadential trills in the Baroque period were supplied with either a turned ending or a note of anticipation.\(^{51}\) This writer suggests the note of anticipation for the termination of these trills. Here the repercussions may end on the third beat, with the note of anticipation coming on the last eighth note of the measure. Stopping the ornament on beat three also permits the trill in the right hand to be performed without interfering with the ornament in the pedal. The termination of the cadential trill in the pedal will occur simultaneously with the eighth notes in both hands.

In measures 16, 26, 38, and 42 one finds dotted-eighth notes followed by sixteenth notes occurring against three equal eighth notes in the left hand, as shown in Example 50a. Donington writes concerning these measures: "the dotted rhythm should be reduced to 'triplet' rhythm, with the dotted quavers \[\text{eighths}\] made into crotchets \[\text{quarters}\] and their semi-quavers \[\text{sixteenths}\] made into quavers \[\text{eighths}\]."\(^{52}\) This may be seen in Example 50b.

\(^{50}\) Refer to p. 36 for an explanation of the half-trill.

\(^{51}\) Refer to pp. 24-27 for a discussion of the two standard endings to trills in the Baroque period.

\(^{52}\) Donington, *Tempo*, p. 49.
In the late Baroque the normal meaning of this notation was not the same as it is today. In triplet patterns against dotted-note values, the dotted notes were made to conform to the triplet pattern.

(a) Chorale Prelude

(b) Chorale Prelude,
Possible Interpretation

Example 50. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," mm. 16-17

No registration suggestions were found in the original edition. Bach, however, later moved the bass line of the continuo to the left hand, and then assigned the chorale
melody to the pedal. The registration suggestion "Pedal 4 Fuss" was provided for the pedal line. This indicated that the pedal was to be played on a four-foot stop, thus bringing it into the proper range for the original alto solo.

Though Bach offers no suggestions for the interpretation of the chorale prelude, he is very precise in his indications for the cantata movement. Both the violin solo and the continuo are provided with phrasing and articulation indications, thus constituting the only one of the five extant cantata movements under consideration for which indications are provided in both parts. As in the previous chorale preludes, the performer must consult the original cantata movement in order to determine Bach's indications for its performance. Articulation and phrasing, as indicated by the composer and found in the opening measures of the cantata movement, are shown in Example 51.
Example 51. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," mm. 1-14, Cantata Movement

The basic rhythmic unit here, in 9/8 time, is the dotted-eighth note. This unit is divided into sixteenth-note patterns throughout the entire piece. In the opening measures (mm. 1-3), the composer groups these sixteenth notes
into three slurred and three broken notes. In measure 5 the pattern is divided differently with the slur being found on the last part of the first beat moving to beat two. Still another change is made in this group in measures 6 through 8. In measure 9 Bach divides the beat into one broken note, three slurred notes, followed by two broken notes. This displaces the original grouping by one sixteenth note.

Consistent use of the staccato mark is not found in this cantata movement. It is used rather consistently through the first phrase but then is found again only in measures 37 and 50. It should, however, be added throughout the piece whenever passages similar to those found in the opening measures appear. When passages different from those indicated by the composer are found, as in measures 5 through 8, the performer must use his own discretion in adding articulations to the lines. The notes may be slightly separated, thus, conforming to the suggestion of Hermann Keller concerning unmarked passages appearing in otherwise marked works.\(^{53}\) This writer, however, prefers a more connected approach, though still observing the articulation suggestions provided by the composer. This method of interpretation gives the line a sense of movement and direction and, at the same time, preserves Bach's original indications, as illustrated in Example 52.

\(^{53}\)Refer to footnote no. 46 on p. 61.
Example 52. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," mm. 5-9, Chorale Prelude, Possible Interpretation
CHAPTER II

EVALUATION OF PRESENT-DAY EDITIONS

The original manuscript of the Six Schübler Chorales does not exist, and there are at present only five known copies of the first edition. Bach's own copy containing more than sixty changes and corrections is now lost but was used as the basis of the Peters edition published in 1847. This edition was prepared under the direction of Friederich K. Griepenkerl.

The Staatsbibliothek at Berlin for many years contained two copies of the first edition of these chorale preludes. One of these copies was sold to Anthony von Hoboken of Vienna; the second copy has disappeared or has been misplaced. Other copies of these works are held in the library of Edition Peters at Leipzig, the British Museum, and the Gemeente Museum in The Hague, Holland.

The copy owned by Herr von Hoboken displays the signature of "Joh. Chr. Oley, Bernburg," a man known for copies he made of Bach's works. This copy carries many of the corrections made by Bach in the original edition of the Six Schübler Chorales. Albert Riemenschneider, whose edition includes a study of the Hoboken copy, therefore, suggests
that since Oley made changes in this copy, there is a possibility that "he must have been close to Bach or perhaps had access to Bach's own copy."\textsuperscript{54}

In 1852 Wilhelm Rust, one of the editors of the \textit{Bach-Gesellschaft} edition of Bach's works, reported that he borrowed a copy of the Six Chorales from S. W. Dehn. This copy, containing Bach's own changes and corrections, has an interesting history. From Bach, the copy passed into the possession of his son, Carl Phillip Emmanuel, who sold it to Johann Nikolaus Forkel, Bach's original biographer, in 1774. G. Pölchau, a Bach collector, later received the copy from Forkel. It then came into the possession of Griepenkerl, who used this copy as the basis for the Peters Edition of the Six Chorales in 1847. Dehn received the copy from Griepenkerl. Rust then borrowed the manuscript from Dehn for use in the preparation of the \textit{Bach-Gesellschaft} edition of Bach's works. Since this manuscript contained Bach's own changes and corrections, one may assume that this copy presents a valid source for the study of the Six Schübler Chorales. Unfortunately, no trace of this copy can now be found.

Six present-day editions of the Six Schübler Chorales have been examined by this writer in order to determine which edition comes closest to the interpretation of these chorale preludes as presented in the \textit{Bach-Gesellschaft}

\textsuperscript{54}Riemenschneider, p. v.
edition of both the organ works and the cantata movements. A brief summary of each edition follows.

**Peters Edition**

The Peters edition of Bach's Organ Works was first published in eight volumes between 1844 and 1852. Along with the Bach-Gesellschaft edition, it serves as a basic source for later editions of Bach's organ works. The first seven volumes were edited by Friederich K. Griepenkerl. Ferdinand Roitzsch prepared the eighth volume of the set after the death of Griepenkerl in 1849. A ninth volume containing works later attributed to Bach was also edited by Roitzsch and was issued in 1881.

The Peters edition lists the chorale preludes alphabetically rather than by set and presents the works in an "urtext" or unedited form. Consequently, there are very few changes between this edition and the Gesellschaft edition of Bach's works. The Six Schübler Chorales are divided between volumes six and seven, published in 1847, and prepared "after corrections and interpretation-marks in Bach's own hand."\(^{55}\)

Tenor and alto clefs were used for the chorale preludes on "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," and "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ" in both the Peters edition and the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of

---

the Six Chorales. The only difference in the clefs found in these two editions is that the alto clef used for the right hand of the first chorale prelude in the Peters edition is replaced with the treble clef in the Gesellschaft edition. No fingering or pedalling suggestions are found in the Peters edition, and the only registration suggestions provided are those found in the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of the chorale preludes.

A separate volume containing the Six Chorales and the so-called Great Eighteen Chorales was published by the Peters Corporation in 1951. No significant changes were found between this edition of the Schübler Chorales and the edition of these works published by the same company in 1847. The Kalmus edition of Bach's organ works is a reprint of the Peters edition.

**Novello Edition**

The Six Schübler Chorales are found together with Part III of the ClavierÜbung in volume sixteen of the Novello edition of Bach's organ works. The editors for this volume, issued in 1916, were John E. West and John Pointer.

Articulation markings are found throughout each chorale prelude, though the markings of each editor are never separated from Bach's own indications. These additions include tenuto marks (−) found above the chorale melodies in five of the chorale preludes thus suggesting a very slight separation of each note in these melodies. Dynamic markings, tempo
indications, and suggested metronomic speeds are also found in each of these chorale preludes.

Bach's registration suggestions have been altered or omitted in the Novello edition, and this is reflected in the fact that Pointer provided no registration suggestions for the manuals in the second chorale prelude, "Wo soll ich fliehen hin." This is contrary to Bach's indications that the first manual be based on an eight-foot stop and the second manual be registered to include a sixteen-foot stop. Pointer also indicates the use of two manuals and pedal for the performance of the sixth chorale prelude, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter." The only suggestion for registration of this work provided by the composer is the indication "Pedal 4 Fuss," implying that the pedal line is to be played on a four-foot stop. The indications sinistra (left hand) and dextra forte (right hand loud) have also been omitted in the fourth chorale prelude, "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," of the Novello edition.

While some of the editorial suggestions provided in this edition offer strong points for a valid interpretation according to Baroque performance practices, many of these suggestions are in opposition to the wishes of the composer. For example, Bach provided bowing indications for the violoncello piccolo in the cantata movement from which the fifth chorale prelude, "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ," was transcribed. While some indications must be slightly modified when transferring these markings to the organ, the majority
of the indications can be successfully transferred. The first nine measures of the work as edited by West are reproduced below in Example 53a. The same measures as found in the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of this chorale prelude are shown in Example 53b. The phrasing and articulation

(a) Novello edition

(b) Bach-Gesellschaft edition

suggestions are those found in the violoncello piccolo part of the cantata movement. Slurring across the bar line is found in each measure of Example 53a. Notice that no such slurring is found in Example 53b. The staccato notes in measures 2 through 9 are all slurred in the Novello edition, and the slurring of the stepwise pattern of sixteenth notes in measures 6 through 9 has also been extended to include two additional eighth notes on either side of the sixteenth-note pattern. This interpretation adds to the complexity of the line and often distorts the rhythm which is so clear and transparent in the overall texture.

Changes were also found in the phrasing and articulation of the sixth chorale prelude, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter." One will remember that this work is the only one of the five extant cantata movements under consideration for which indications were provided in both the violin part and the continuo part. These lines are now found as the right hand and left hand parts in the organ transcription. West has changed the markings in both of these parts. These indications do not follow the suggestions of the composer found in the instrumental parts of the cantata movement from which this chorale prelude was transcribed. The opening measures of this work as edited by West are presented in Example 54a. The same phrasing and articulation as indicated by Bach in the cantata movement are to be found in the corresponding measures of the chorale prelude illustrated in Example 54b.
(a) Novello edition

Allegro grazioso. \( \frac{7}{10} \) or \( \frac{1}{10} \)

(b) Bach-Gesellschaft edition
(b) Bach-Gesellschaft edition, continued

Example 54. Bach, "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter," Opening measures

These examples reflect the fact that the phrasing in both hands was changed considerably from those indications provided by the composer. The slurring of each six-note pattern found in the right hand was changed in favor of a more legato interpretation of the line. The interpretation of the left hand in the Novello edition also exhibits marked differences from the original indications found in the cantata movement. These are particularly evident in the second measure where the slurring is extended throughout the entire measure rather than the groups of three eighth notes suggested by Bach.
The Novello edition was, by far, the most highly edited edition examined by this writer and reflects many of the ideas concerning the interpretation of Bach's music exhibited by performers in the early part of the twentieth century. The ideas reflect a rather dated approach and, as such, should be approached cautiously by performers desiring a more stylistically valid interpretation of these works.

Riemenschneider Edition

The Six Organ Chorals, edited by Albert Riemenschneider and published by the Oliver Ditson Company in 1942, represent the most thorough and the most extensive study of the Six Schübler Chorales examined by this writer. Riemenschneider used photostatic copies of the chorale preludes belonging to Herr Anthony von Hoboken of Vienna, along with the Bach-Gesellschaft edition of Bach's works in the preparation of this edition. The five extant cantata movements were also examined and were of primary importance in the preparation of Riemenschneider's edition of the Six Chorales. This edition, then, represents the first such study to utilize the original cantata movements as the basis for phrasing and articulation. This edition also includes the following: the original form of the harmonized chorale, an edition based upon the first edition of these chorale preludes, an edition of each chorale prelude prepared after Bach's own suggestions in the cantata movements, and full scores of the original cantata movements. Changes made by Bach in his personal copy of the first edition are plainly indicated by the editor.
A concise table of ornamentation is also provided in the Preface of this edition.

Riemenschneider adds the dynamic indications found in the original cantata movement to his edition of the first chorale prelude, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme." The editor justifies the addition of these indications by writing: "there can be no questions about Bach's use of them if they would have been practical upon the organ of his time." Although these indications were present in the original cantata movement, these effects would have been impossible to produce on the organ in Germany during the mid-eighteenth century. This organ was not equipped with a Swell box, and was thus not capable of crescendti and decrescendti except through the addition and subtraction of stops and through manual changes. Neither are practical in this instance.

The original source for the second chorale prelude, "Wo soll ich fliehen hin," does not exist. Riemenschneider has, however, reconstructed a very convincing cantata movement which was prepared after "a comparison of the methods which Bach used in arranging the other five numbers of this set."7

For his edition of the third chorale prelude, "Wer nur den lieben Gott l̊sst walten," Riemenschneider used the phrasing suggested by the composer in connection with the

56 Riemenschneider, p. 3.
57 Ibid., p. 21.
words of the original cantata movement, a lovely duet between soprano and alto. This writer has followed these suggestions in the preparation of the present edition of the Six Chorales.\(^58\)

Riemenschneider has also provided a version of this chorale prelude which makes use of three manuals and pedal in order to "bring out more clearly the characteristic qualities of the soprano and alto voices of the original duet, . . ."\(^59\) This is a complicated procedure and seems unwarranted since Bach does not specify this work to be performed on separate manuals. Bach was careful to indicate the use of two manuals when he intended them elsewhere in the Six Chorales, and no such indication is given here.

"Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," like the preceding work, was originally a vocal duet. No articulation suggestions were found in the cantata movement from which the chorale prelude was transcribed; however, Bach provided several suggestions for the organ version of this work. The fact that suggestions for phrasing the predominating rhythmic figure, \(\text{\textcopyright} \), were provided by the composer in each of the three parts of this composition suggests that this idea be treated in a similar manner throughout the entire chorale prelude. The interpretation of this rhythmic figure, however, is not found in the edition of this organ transcription

\(^{58}\)Refer to pp. 48-51 for a discussion of the phrasing and articulation of this chorale prelude.

\(^{59}\)Riemenschneider, p. 36.
prepared by Riemenschneider, one in which the lines are again phrased according to the words of the original cantata movement. An example of the indications found in the opening measures of the Bach-Gesellschaft edition is shown below in Example 55a. An example of the phrasing of the same measures in the Riemenschneider edition is found in Example 55b on page 96. After a comparison of the two examples, one notices that the interpretation offered by Riemenschneider does not follow the phrasing suggested by the composer in the Gesellschaft edition of the chorale prelude.

(a) Bach-Gesellschaft edition
An alternate version provided by Riemenschneider makes use of three manuals and pedal and does not seem to have been the original intent of the composer. Two manuals rather than three are suggested by Bach's designation *dextra forte* (right hand loud). This second version is actually a rearrangement of this transcription and hardly seems justified.

The edition prepared by Riemenschneider of the last two chorale preludes makes use of the original phrasing and articulation suggestions provided by the composer in the cantata movements. The editor has provided markings which correspond to marked passages where similar, though unmarked passages are found.
Some suggestions which follow typical Baroque performance practices are found in the dance-like passages of the fifth chorale prelude of the set. Phrasing and articulation suggestions are also provided for the pedal line. These suggestions offer a valid interpretation of this line, originally the bass line of the continuo in the cantata movement.

Very little editing was required for the sixth and final chorale prelude of the set. This work is the only one of the set in which articulation was indicated throughout in both the original violin and continuo parts of the cantata movement. Riemenschneider has also included the version of this work which was found in the first edition of these Six Chorales. In this edition the bass line of the continuo was found in the pedal, with the chorale melody placed in the left hand. Bach suggested interchanging these two parts, thus, making the pedal line less complicated than in the original edition. After comparing these two versions of the same work, it is easy to understand Bach's suggestions for improvement. The bass line involves too many awkward skips and leaps to be comfortably played in the pedal.

The Riemenschneider edition of the Six Schübler Chorales is, by far, the most informative of all editions examined by this writer. With some slight modifications in each work, this edition could prove to be extremely useful to performers today.
The Bornemann edition of Bach's Organ Works, edited by Marcel Dupré, has long been a favorite of teachers and students alike for its pedagogical approach. The ideas presented in all ten volumes are based upon years of teaching and performing experience by this well-known French teacher, recitalist, and composer. The Six Schübler Chorales appear in volume ten of this edition, published in 1941.

Dupré has devised a set of conventional signs which is used throughout all ten volumes in order to secure accurate playing in the music of Bach. The signs are explained in the Preface to each volume and deal with such technical procedures as the amount of time each repeated note should receive and problems encountered in rhythmic notation. Dupré has also provided both fingering and pedalling throughout each work, a procedure which is especially helpful for the beginning organ student.

The ornamentation table provided in the Preface to each volume is sometimes unreliable. For example, the following are listed in Dupre's ornamentation table:

Mordent \[\text{\textbullet \textbullet \textbullet} \] to be performed thus: \[\text{\textbullet \textbullet \textbullet \textbullet} \]

Ex. \[\text{\textbullet \textbullet \textbullet} \] to be performed thus: \[\text{\textbullet \textbullet \textbullet \textbullet} \]
The first ornament listed above is not a mordent as shown in Dupré's table, but rather a trill. The trill does not start on the note as shown in the table, but starts from the note above. Similarly, the second trill does not begin on the main note, it begins on its upper accessory note.

Tenor and alto clefs are again used in "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren," and "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ." This might prove to be a source of problems for many organists untrained in the reading of C clefs.

In the first chorale prelude, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," the editor has added staccato marks over the final notes of those groups designated by Bach to be taken with one stroke of the bow, as shown in Example 56. Dupré makes no effort to distinguish his marks in this chorale prelude from those provided by the composer.

Example 56. Bach, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," Bornemann edition, mm. 1-4
The Bornemann edition also suggests the tying of repeated notes when moving from one voice to another as shown in Example 57. In this example the $C^4$ in the alto voice on beat two becomes the soprano voice on the second part of that beat, and Dupré suggests tying this note. This is a French tradition and is, therefore, not applicable to the music of Bach.


The editor has retained Bach's original registration suggestions for each of the Six Chorales; however, he has also provided his own suggestions in the margins of each work. Suggested metronomic speeds have also been added. The words to each chorale have been given in German, French, and English.
**Schirmer Edition**

The Schirmer edition of Bach's organ works, referred to as "A Critico-Practical Edition,"\(^60\) was prepared by Albert Schweitzer, Charles-Marie Widor, and Edouard Nies-Berger. The *Bach-Gesellschaft* edition of the organ works served as the primary source for the Schirmer edition. The Six Schübler Chorales are found in the eighth and final volume of this series, edited by Schweitzer and Nies-Berger, and published in 1967.

Valuable material concerning ornamentation, organ specifications of some of the instruments available to Bach during his lifetime, background information on each piece, along with suggestions for the interpretation of each composition are found at the beginning of each volume. Some of these comments, however, must be weighed for their validity. One such example, concerning the first chorale prelude, "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," follows:

> The editors have taken the "forte" and "piano" from the cantata and have added them in parenthesis to the transcription for organ. . . . It will be best to bring out the contrasts with the help of the Swell-box. However, it should not be used for crescendi and decrescendi as this would destroy the primitive character of this marvellous work.\(^61\)

The organ in Germany in Bach's time was not equipped with an expression pedal. Therefore, the "forte" and "piano"


\(^{61}\)Ibid., p. xxxii.
markings present in the original cantata movement could not have been performed in the organ transcription.

Another editorial comment which seems unjustified concerns the fifth chorale prelude, "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ:"

The absence of the chord sequences of the continuo is the main disturbing factor, causing an unfavorable effect on the organ. The piece, rich as it is in rhythmical and harmonic harshness, becomes unsteady. Furthermore, the typical cello phraseology of the middlepart with the wide leaps of its figuration does not come out very well on the keyboard instrument.  

Although originally written for soprano, violoncello piccolo, and continuo, this piece does not have to lose its appeal during transcription. It is true that the dance-like figuration presented in the left hand is not always organis-tic, but the lines can come across beautifully when performed with a well-planned interpretation.

The only editorial markings found in the Schirmer edition of the Schübler Chorales appear in connection with the fifth chorale prelude, "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ." Phrasing is added in measures 9 through 14, 23 through 25, 27 through 30, 34 through 38, 42 through 46, and 53 through 58. The slurring of this pattern, originally played by a violoncello piccolo, is not found in the Gesellschaft edition of either the cantata movement or the chorale prelude. The markings provided by the editors are not shown as editorial suggestions.

62Ibid., pp. xxxiii-xxxiv.
The chorale melody, along with both the German and English translations of the chorale text, precedes each chorale prelude. Tenor and alto clefs are not used in this edition of the Six Chorales. The registration suggestions provided by the composer are also found here, with additional suggestions for the registration of each chorale prelude presented in the Preface.

**Breitkopf and Härtel Edition**

The edition of the Six Schübler Chorales, edited by Heinz Lohmann and published by Breitkopf and Härtel in 1971, is part of the *Neue Bach Ausgabe*. Begun in 1954, the *Neue Bach Ausgabe* represents the latest edition of Bach's complete works and is published as both a performing edition and a critical edition. Each volume contains selected facsimilie s of autographs and copies of some pieces along with valuable comments about each work. The Six Chorales, along with the ClavierÜbung, Part III, and the Canonic Variations on "Vom Himmel hoch" are found in volume eight.

This edition was prepared after a study of the original edition published between 1746 and 1750 and is similar to the edition of the Six Chorales presented in the *Bach-Gesellschaft* edition of Bach's works. Changes in notes, note values, ties, ornamentation, and other editorial suggestions are clearly indicated through the use of brackets.

A photostatic copy of the title page of the Six Chorales together with pages from "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme"
and "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter" are found in the Preface. One notices that the copy of the sixth chorale prelude reproduced in the Preface presents the bass line of the continuo in the pedal. The version found in volume eight, however, takes Bach's suggestions of moving the bass line to the left hand and transferring the chorale melody from the left hand to the pedal.

No fingering or pedalling suggestions are indicated in the Neue Bach Ausgabe edition since none were present in the original edition. Phrasing is also limited to that presented in the first edition. Tenor and alto clefs have been changed in this edition so that organists are not required to read clefs which are not frequently found in the literature for their instrument.
CHAPTER III

PERFORMING EDITION
Chorale Prelude: "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme"

Date: c. 1746-1750

Key: E-flat Major

Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 64-65

BWV No.: 645

Cantata: "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme," No. 4, Choral

Date: c. 1731

Key: E-flat Major

Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 28, pp. 274-277

BWV No.: 140

Scored for:

Soprano
Alto
Violins I
Violins II
Violas
Continuo

Unison

Scripture reference:

Epistle: II Corinthians 5:1-10
Gospel: Matthew 25:1-13

Occasion: Twenty-seventh Sunday after Trinity
Chorale Prelude: "Wo soll ich fliehen hin"
Date: c. 1746-1750
Key: E Minor
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 66-67
BWV No.: 646

Cantata: Unknown
Date:
Key:
Bach-Gesellschaft:
BWV No.:
Scored for:
Scripture reference:
Occasion:
Chorale Prelude: "Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten"
Date: c. 1746-1750
Key: C Minor
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 68-69
BWV No.: 647

Cantata: "Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt-walten"
No. 4, Soprano and Alto duet
Date: 1724
Key: C Minor
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 22, pp. 87-89
BWV No.: 93
Scored for:
Soprano
Alto
Violins I
Violins II
Violas
Continuo

Scripture reference:
Epistle: I Peter 3:8-15
Occasion: Fifth Sunday after Trinity
Chorale Prelude: "Meine Seele erhebet den Herren"
Date: c. 1746-1750
Key: D Minor
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 70-71
BWV No.: 648

Cantata: "Meine Seel' erhebt den Herren" No. 5, Duet
Date: 1724
Key: D Minor
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 1, pp. 299-300
BWV No.: 10

Scored for:
\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Oboe I} & \\
\text{Oboe II} & \\
\text{Trumpet} & \\
\text{Alto} & \\
\text{Tenor} & \\
\text{Continuo} &
\end{align*}
\]

Scripture reference:
Epistle: Isaiah 11:1-5

Occasion: Feast of the Visitation of the Blessed Virgin Mary
Chorale Prelude: "Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ"
Date: c. 1746-1750
Key: B-flat Major
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 71-73
BWV No.: 649

Cantata: "Bleib bei uns, den es will Abend werden"
No. 3, Choral
Date: 1725
Key: B-flat Major
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 1, pp. 168-170
BWV No.: 6
Scored for:
Soprano
Violoncello piccolo
Continuo

Scripture reference:
Epistle: Acts 10:34-41
Occasion: Easter Monday
Chorale Prelude: "Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter"
Date: c. 1746-1750
Key: G Major
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 25b, pp. 74-76
BWV No.: 650

Cantata: "Lobe den Herren, den mächtigen König der Ehren"
Date: 1725
Key: G Major
Bach-Gesellschaft: Vol. 28, pp. 186-188
BWV No.: 137
Scored for:
  Alto
  Violin solo
  Continuo

Scripture reference:
  Epistle: II Corinthians 3:4-11
  Gospel: Mark 7:31-37

Occasion: Twelfth Sunday after Trinity
APPENDIX A

BACH-GESELLSCHAFT EDITION
OF THE CHORALE PRELUDES
II.

Säbhs Choräle

nun verschiedener Art

auf einer

Orgel

mit 2 Claviereu und Pedal

unzuspielen,

versetzt von

Johann Sebastian Bach.

Königl. Poln. und Churf. Sächs. Hof-Compositeur,


In Verlelung Joh. Georg Schühlers zu Jella am Thüringer Mald.
Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme."
Canto fermo in Tenore.

* Vergleiche den Tenor-Satz in der Cantate: "Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme".
Wo soll ich fliehen hin
oder:
Auf meinen lieben Gott.

1. Clav. 8 Fuss.
2. Clav. 16 Fuss.
Ped. 4 Fuss.
Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten.\textsuperscript{3}

\footnote{Vergleiche Jahrgang XXII Seite 87.}
Meine Seele erhebt den Herrn.  

a 2 Clav. e Pedale.

*) Vergleiche Jahrgang I Seite 299.
Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ. *)

a 2 Clav. o Pedale.

*) Vergleiche Jahrgang I Seite 184.
Dal Segno.
Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter. *)

a 2 Clav. e Pedale.

*) Ursprünglich Vers 2 der Cantate: „Lobe den Herren, den mächtigen König der Ehren“.
Da Capo.
APPENDIX B

BACH-GESELLSCHAFT EDITION

OF THE CANTATA MOVEMENTS
Vers 2. CHORAL.

(Melodie: "Wacht auf, ruft uns die Stimme!")

Violino I.

Violino II.

Viola.

Tenore.

Continuo.

\(^{3}\) Vergleiche Jahrgang XXVI. Seite 63.
hörst die Wächter singen, das Herzthut ihr vor Freuden springen, sie wacht, und steht eilend auf.
Ihr Freund kommt von Him. mel prächtig,

von Gna.-den stark, von Wahr. heit mächtig,

ihr Licht wird hell, ihr Stern geht auf.

Nun komm, du wer. the Kron, Herr Je. u.
ARIÉ (DUETT) und CHORAL.

Violino I. II.
Viola.

Soprano.

Alto.

Continuo.

(Melodie: Wer nur den lieben Gott lässt walten.)

Er kennt die rechten Freuden, er weiß wohl, wenn es nützlich sei, er kennt die rechten Freuden, er weiß wohl, wenn er uns nur hat treu gefunden und merket.
DUETTO.

Oboe I. II.
Tromba.
Alto.
Tenore.
Continuo.

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]

\[\text{Er denket der Harmer. zig.}\]
und hilft sei. nem Diener, hilft sei. nem

Die - ner Is -rael auf, und hilft sei. nem

Die - ner Is -rael auf, hilft sei. nem

Die - ner Is -rael auf,


Diener, hilft sei. nem Die - ner Is -rael auf.
CHORAL.
Allegro.

Violoncello piccolo.

Soprano.

Continuo.

Ach bleib bei uns Herr Jesu
In dieser letzten betäubten

Christ, Zeit
weil es nun uns.

Soprano: Allegro.
Herr, Be- 

wur- 

den - 

ist, 

heit, 


dass 

dass 

oun 

nder 

ich 

ich 

icht.

End.
der dich er hüllt,
wie es dir selber gefällt;
hast du nicht dieses ver...
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Periodicals


Unpublished Materials


Scores and Editions


VITA

Paul Edward Dunbar, the son of Mr. and Mrs. Charles Edward Dunbar, was born on March 31, 1952, in Gasville, Arkansas. He attended elementary school in Altheimer, Arkansas, and, in 1970, graduated from Altheimer High School. He holds the Bachelor of Music degree from Henderson State University (1974) in Arkadelphia, Arkansas, and the Master of Music degree from Louisiana State University (1975), in Baton Rouge, Louisiana. He currently serves as Chairman of the Organ Department and as University Organist at Bob Jones University in Greenville, South Carolina. He is married to the former Pamela Jill Sowers.
EXAMINATION AND THESIS REPORT

Candidate: Paul Edward Dunbar

Major Field: Performance (organ)

Title of Thesis: THE SIX SCHUBLER CHORALES: A PERFORMING EDITION
A Comparative Study of the Cantatas from Which They Were Transcribed

Approved:

[Signatures and titles]

Major Professor and Chairman

Dean of the Graduate School

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

[Signatures]

Date of Examination:

July 16, 1930