Reconstruction of Gustav Mahler's Symphony No. 5, "Adagietto" for Trombone and Piano.

Yuri Murata
Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses/7216
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

Bell & Howell Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600

UMI®
RECONSTRUCTION OF GUSTAV MAHLER’S SYMPHONY
NO.5, ADAGIETTO
FOR TROMBONE AND PIANO

A Monograph

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Louisiana State University and
Agricultural and Mechanical College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Musical Arts

in

The School of Music

by

Yuri Murata
B.M., Wichita State University, 1994
M.M., University of New Mexico, 1996
May 2000
# Table of Contents

List of Musical Examples ----------------------------------------------- iii
Abstract --------------------------------------------------------------- viii
Introductory Materials -------------------------------------------------- 1
Sources of Adagietto ----------------------------------------------------- 11
Technique of Reconstructing Orchestral Music for Piano ------------------ 23
Issues of Reconstructing the Adagietto for Trombone and Piano --------- 51
Summary and Conclusion -------------------------------------------------- 85
Bibliography ------------------------------------------------------------- 87
Appendix A: Adagietto (The Piano Score) ---------------------------------- 90
Appendix B: Adagietto (The Trombone Part) ----------------------------- 108
Appendix C: Letters of Permission --------------------------------------- 112
Vita -------------------------------------------------------------------- 118
## List of Musical Examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Wagner, <em>Tristan and Isolde</em>, Prelude to Act I, mm.45-48</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.61-71</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, ms. 60 and 63, manuscript and 1904 edition</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, ms. 60 and 63, 1964 edition</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.27, violins and violas, manuscript</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.27, violins and violas, 1904 edition</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.28, manuscript</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.28, 1904 edition</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.54, 1st violins, manuscript</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.54, 1st violins, 1904 edition</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.29, manuscript</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.29, 1904 edition</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.30, celli, manuscript</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.30, celli, 1904 edition</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.16, celli, manuscript</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.16, celli, 1904 edition</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.89, 1st violins, manuscript</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.89, 1st violins, 1904 edition</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.44-46, 1st violins, manuscript</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.44-46, 1st violins, 1904 edition</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 11 | a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.57, 2nd violins, manuscript.  
   | b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.57, 2nd violins, 1904 edition. |
| 12 | a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.22, manuscript.  
   | b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.22, 1904 edition. |
| 13 | a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.25-26, manuscript.  
   | b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.25-26, 1904 edition. |
| 14 | a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.28-29, harp manuscript.  
   | b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.28-29, harp 1904 edition. |
| 15 | a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.142.  
   | b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.143. |
| 16 | a) Wagner, Tannhauser, ms. 41, 44, 45, trombones.  
   | b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, ms. 41, 44, 45. |
| 17 | a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.54-58, 2nd violins and violas.  
   | b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.54-58. |
| 18 | a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, m.85.  
   | b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, m.159. |
| 19 | a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.205-210, solo violin.  
   | b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.317-322. |
| 20 | a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.213-217, flutes and horns.  
   | b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.325-359. |
| 21 | a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.1-24.  
   | b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.1-24. |
| 22 | a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.25-32, solo violin.  
   | b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.39-46. |
23  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.38 ................................................................. 36
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.38 ..................................................... 36

24  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.142-145, strings ....................................... 37
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.143-146 ......................................... 37

25  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.126-127 ..................................................... 38
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.126-127 ......................................... 38

26  a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, solo flute, mm.33-35 .............................. 39
    b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.79-81 .................................. 39

27  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.273-78, percussion .................................... 39
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.273-78 .......................................... 40

28  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.303-305, percussion .................................... 40
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.303-305 ......................................... 41

29  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.88-89, strings ......................................... 42
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.88-89 ............................................ 42

30  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.105, violins ............................................. 42
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.105 .................................................. 43

31  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, ms. 92 and 94 .............................................. 43
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, ms 92 and 94 ...................................... 44

32  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.258 .............................................................. 44
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.258 .................................................. 44

33  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.159 .............................................................. 45
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.160 .................................................. 45

34  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.69 ............................................................... 46
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.69 ................................................... 46

35  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.96, strings ................................................... 47
    b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.96 .................................................... 47
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>a) Saint-Saens, <em>Danse Macabre</em>, mm.33-36, solo flute</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Saint-Saens, <em>Danse Macabre</em>, mm.102-104</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c) Saint-Saens-Liszt, <em>Danse Macabre</em>, mm.177-179</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>a) Saint-Saens, <em>Danse Macabre</em>, m.413, strings</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, <em>Danse Macabre</em>, m.566</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.10-12, strings</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.10-12</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.33-35</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.33-35</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.42-46</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.42-46</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Mahler-Murata, mm.74-76</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Mahler-Murata, mm.91-93</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.1-9</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.1-9</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.30</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, m.30</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.98-103</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.98-103</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.94</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, m.94</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, mm.47-53, 1st violins</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, mm.47-53</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.61, strings</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, m.61</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, <em>Adagietto</em>, m.27, violins and violas</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b) Mahler-Murata, m.27</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
50 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.57 .................................................. 72  
b) Mahler-Murata, m.57 ........................................................................ 72

51 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.5 .................................................. 73  
b) Mahler-Murata, m.5 ........................................................................... 73

52 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.79-80, viola ................................ 74  
b) Mahler-Murata, mm.79-80 .................................................................. 75

53 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.25-27, celli ................................ 75  
b) Mahler-Murata, mm.25-27, piano ....................................................... 75

54 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.19-22, strings ............................ 76  
b) Mahler-Murata, mm.19-22 .................................................................. 77

55 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.16, celli ........................................ 78  
b) Mahler-Murata, m.16 .......................................................................... 78

56 Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.10-11, violas and celli .................... 79

57 Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.47-51 ............................................ 80

58 Mahler-Murata, m.75, piano ................................................................. 80

59 Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.9, strings .......................................... 82

60 Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.2-9, 1st violin ............................... 83

61 Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.11-12 ............................................. 84
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to reconstruct Gustave Mahler's Symphony No.5, Adagietto, for trombone and piano and to discuss the procedure of the reconstruction. This paper is divided into four chapters.

In the first chapter, there are three main introductory materials. First, definitions taken from different sources of the musical terms arrangement and transcription are given to show how inconsistently those two terms are used and to show why the writer decided to use a third term reconstruction. Second, a brief background on Mahler and his fifth symphony is provided. Third, the importance of comparing sources is discussed.

In the second chapter, different sources of Adagietto are compared and contrasted. The main sources discussed in this chapter are the autograph manuscript, the first edition published in 1904, and the 1964 edition of Symphony No.5.

In the third chapter, examples of reconstruction of orchestral music for piano are presented using Franz Liszt's works. Two pieces studied were Liszt's reconstructions of Wagner's Overture to Tannhauser and Saint-Saens' Danse Macabre. The following points were examined: articulation, dynamics, phrasing, expression marks, meters, pedaling indications, added measures, and notes and rhythm.
In the final chapter, the procedures of reconstructing the *Adagietto* for trombone and piano are discussed. The five main sections of this chapter are discussion of orchestration, counterpoint, dynamics, creativity, and elements that should be retained.

The piano score and the trombone part of the reconstruction are given at the end of the written document.
Introductory Materials

I. Introduction

The purpose of this study is to discuss the procedure of the reconstruction of Adagietto from Mahler's Symphony no.5 for trombone and piano. This paper is divided into four chapters: introductory materials, sources of Adagietto, technique of reconstructing orchestral music for piano, and issues of reconstructing the Adagietto for trombone and piano.

The following are brief overviews of each chapter.

The first chapter: presentation of introductory materials including the definitions of terms, Mahler and his fifth symphony, and comparison of sources.

The second chapter: comparison and constrast of the different sources of the Adagietto.

The third chapter: discussion regarding Franz Liszt's reconstructions of orchestral works for piano.

The final chapter: discussion regarding the reconstruction of the Adagietto for trombone and piano.

II. Definitions

The reason the terms "arrangement" or "transcription" are not used is that there is no universally accepted distinction between the two terms as seen in the following definitions found in music dictionaries and in an article in Music and Letters.
Arrangement: "The reworking of a musical composition, usually for a different medium from that of the original."—Malcolm Boyd in New Grove Dictionary

"The adaption of a composition for a medium different from that for which it was originally composed, usually with the intention of preserving the essentials of the musical substance; also the result of such a process of adaptation."—New Harvard Dictionary

"A playing of the notes in another medium,"—E. Howard Jones

Transcription: "An arrangement, especially one involving a change of medium (e.g. from orchestra to piano)."—New Grove Dictionary

"The adaptation of a composition for a medium other than its original one, e.g., of vocal music for instruments or of a piano work for orchestra, a practice that began in Western music by the 14th century; also the resulting work"—New Harvard Dictionary

"A recreation or making-over with regard to their imaginative and creative content,"—E. Howard-Jones

The New Harvard Dictionary states that terms arrangement and transcription are interchangeable although the latter often implies works

---

5 New Harvard Dictionary of Music, "transcription."
6 Howard-Jones, 305.
that are closer to the original than the former. This statement is the opposite of what Howard-Jones writes in his article where he defined transcription as "A recreation or making-over with regard to their imaginative and creative content."*

Malcolm Boyd, in *New Grove Dictionary*, mentions two types of arrangement: ".....The purely practical arrangement, in which there is little or no artistic involvement on the arranger's part, and the more creative arrangement, in which the original composition is, as it were, filtered through the musical imagination of the arranger."* He also states that there is no universally accepted distinctions between arrangement and transcription.10

From the definitions above, one can state that there is no definitive way to distinguish the musical terms arrangements and transcriptions from one another. What seems more important than the distinction of the two terms is that the act of arranging/transcribing in music falls into two categories. The first category involves very little creativity on the part of the arranger/transcriber. The arranger/transcriber changes the medium but keeps the content of the piece as close as possible to the original. Examples can be found in many arrangements/transcriptions of solo pieces for strings or woodwinds for brass instruments. The second

---

7 *New Harvard Dictionary of Music,* "arrangement."
8 Howard-Jones.
10 Ibid.
category involves more creative input on the part of the
arranger/transcriber than the first category. This category involves more
of the reworking of the piece than mere changing of the medium. Examples
can be seen in many of Franz Liszt's transcriptions of operatic and
orchestral pieces for the piano.

What Liszt did with preexisting orchestral music was not just piano
reductions of the original pieces. Although he based his musical materials
on the original pieces, he elaborated the original pieces using his own
musical language and made those pieces into something of his own. More
detailed discussion of his transcriptions are found in a later chapter.

Instead of deciding which one of the two terms to use, I have
decided to use a different term, reconstruction, which implies that the
procedure of my work involves some reworking of Mahler's original
construction of the piece. I reconstructed the Adagietto in a setting just
for trombone and piano, keeping musical materials of Mahler's original work
but with appropriate elaborations and simplifications of my own.

When a musical work is reconstructed, an issue of authenticity
might be addressed. Malcolm Boyd observes, "Every arrangement creates
its own historical authenticity."

In the discussion of Webern's
transcription, for violin, flute/second violin, clarinet/viola, cello, and
piano, of Schoenberg's First Chamber Symphony, Hans Keller wrote, ".....The
problem of authenticity is nakedly exposed--stripped of all considerations

---


4
of principle, of truth to the letter, or rather to its color: both Schoenberg and Webern were too sure-footed (with both feet) to worry about it. If and when the composer's authenticity went, the arranger's replaced it.\textsuperscript{12} For Schoenberg and Webern, authenticity was not even an issue when a work was reconstructed. In this reconstruction of \textit{Adagietto}, Mahler's authenticity has been replaced by my own since this reconstruction is not a work by Mahler but is my work based on Mahler's \textit{Adagietto}.

\section*{III. Gustav Mahler and His Fifth Symphony}

Gustav Mahler (1860-1911), an Austrian composer/conductor, is known for his conducting careers at the Vienna Opera, New York Metropolitan Opera, and New York Philharmonic, and for his various compositions especially his nine symphonies (the 10th was unfinished) and orchestral songs. Significant works before he composed the Fifth Symphony include the \textit{Wunderhorn} works, settings of poems from the Arnim and Brentano anthology. His \textit{Wunderhorn} works include orchestral songs, \textit{Das klangende Lied}, \textit{Das knaben Wunderhorn}, \textit{Kindertotenlieder}, and his second, third, and the forth symphonies.\textsuperscript{13}

The Fifth Symphony, made up of three parts and five movements, was composed during the summers of 1901 and 1902 at Mahler's summer cabin in

\begin{multicols}{1}
\textsuperscript{12} Hans Keller, "Arrangement for or against?" \textit{The Musical Times} 110 (January 1969): 25.

\textsuperscript{13} Donald Mitchell, "Mahler, Gustav" in \textit{New Grove Dictionary}.\end{multicols}
Maiernigg.\textsuperscript{14} Between the two summers, Mahler met Alma Schindler for whom he dedicated the Adagietto and whom he married in 1902.\textsuperscript{15}

Two aspects of the Fifth Symphony make the work a new beginning of Mahler's symphonic writing: 1) it is a purely instrumental work, 2) there is no use of Wunderhorn songs in this symphony although the influence of it is apparent throughout the symphony. For example, the narrative nature of Mahler's previous symphonies still remains in this work.\textsuperscript{16} Also, there are similarities between the second song of the Kindertotenlieder and the Adagietto of the Fifth Symphony in two aspects:\textsuperscript{17} 1) They both have the harp playing arpeggios in the background, 2) The opening themes are very similar.

His own Wunderhorn settings are not the only influence on the Fifth Symphony. J.S. Bach's influence on Mahler is apparent in the contrapuntal structuring of this Symphony\textsuperscript{18} as seen in fugal writings in the third and the last movements. Moreover, Constantin Floros reports that Mahler modifies the "gaze motif" from Wagner's Tristan and Isolde and uses in the Adagietto as seen in example 1.\textsuperscript{19}

\textsuperscript{14} Karl Heinz Fussl, preface and editorial notes to Symphony No.5 in C\textsuperscript{#} Minor by Gustav Mahler, edited by Erwin Ratz, revised by Fussl (Frankfurt/M: C.F. Peters, 1989, reprint, London: Ernst Eulenburg, Ltd., 1992), iii.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{16} Mitchell, "Mahler, Gustav" in New Grove Dictionary.
\textsuperscript{17} Ibid.
The fourth movement, Adagietto, a love song for Alma Schindler, is for the harp and the strings. This movement is in an ABA form, is coupled with the finale to form the last part of the symphony, and goes straight into the finale without a break acting as the slow introduction to the finale.

Example 1  

a) Wagner, Tristan and Isolde, Prelude to Act I, mm.45-48

\[ \text{Example 1 a) Wagner, Tristan and Isolde, Prelude to Act I, mm.45-48} \]

b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.61-71

\[ \text{Example 1 b) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.61-71} \]

Mahler's writing for harp is unique. As Parks Grant says, Mahler's harp-writing makes the harp sound as a part of the music instead of an ornamental addition to the music.\(^\text{20}\)

\(^{20}\) Parks Grant, "Mahler's Fifth Symphony," Chord and Discord 2, no.10 (1963), 134-135.
IV. Comparing Different Sources

Before starting arranging any piece, one should consult reliable sources of the piece, compare the differences among them, and make necessary editorial choices. There are many discrepancies even among reliable sources due to many factors such as the performance practice of the time the edition was made, editorial intervention, or mere mistakes by the editor, the copyist, or the composer. One's task is to compare and contrast different sources and make educated choices when encountering those discrepancies.

In order to understand the cause of differences among sources, one must understand the nature of each source by finding answers to the following questions: Where and when was the source made? Who made it? What was it made for? How was it made? What is the relationship to other sources? The answers to what it was made for could be a sketch, a fair copy to be sent out to the publisher by the composer or by his/her copyist, a study score, a conducting score, performing parts, etc. Issues of how the source was made and the relationship to other sources are related to each other. For example, is the source the first edition made from the composer's own manuscript, or is it a later edition made from the composer's sketch, the composer's manuscript, or the first edition with some corrections by the composer?

Once the questions above have been answered, one is now ready to examine the differences among sources in detail and solve editorial
problems. The following principles should be kept in mind. First of all, James Grier states that editing is an act of evaluation and interpretation which involves making educated and critically informed choices.\textsuperscript{21} He further states that "the editor's critical understanding of musical style, in its historical context, provides the final criterion for the determination of the musical text."\textsuperscript{22}

Second of all, as Grier observes, editorial intervention is by comparing different sources, it is the editor's task to choose one reading over the others. The following issues should be considered when making the choices: musical idioms that make up a piece, historical conditions under which it was composed or the social and economic factors that influenced its performance, and an aesthetic sensitivity for the composer's or repertory's style.\textsuperscript{23}

Possible sources one can use for purposes above are sketches, manuscripts, early editions, contemporary theoretical treatises, writings of the composers, and sound recordings, and others.\textsuperscript{24}

James Grier warns his readers about the Urtext editions. Since Urtext means "original text," we tend to trust Urtext editions to be the most authentic editions that have no editorial interventions. As mentioned above, however, editorial intervention is unavoidable in any edition since

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{22} Grier, 36.
\textsuperscript{23} Grier, 5.
\textsuperscript{24} Grier, 60-61.
\end{flushleft}
the autograph and the first edition frequently differ and the editor must reconstruct the text using his/her own interpretation. Therefore, no matter how scholarly the edition is, there is no true Urtext edition. The bigger problem occurs when the editor fails to explain how the editorial decisions have been reached. Urtext editions are nevertheless useful as a reference tool since editors of Urtext editions discuss differences among sources in the commentary or in the footnotes/end notes.

Sources of musical works can be found in thematic catalogues, dictionaries and encyclopedias such as New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart (MGG), Repertoire International des Source Musicales (RISM) (only for works before 1800), library catalogues, Music Index, Dissertation Abstracts, and Repertoire International de Litterature Musicale (RILM) Abstracts. RISM and many library catalogues are now available online. RILM, Dissertation Abstracts, and Music Index are now available in CD-Roms. One should also consult Eitner's Biographisch-Bibliographisches Quellen-Lexikon, web-sources such as American Musicological Society, Royal Holloway Golden Page.

---

25 Grier, 11.
26 Grier, 11.
27 Grier, 214-218.
Sources of Adagietto

I. Aim of Editing

The aim of comparing different sources is to reproduce Mahler's intention with the best accuracy. When there were differences among sources, an investigation of how the information was transmitted and changed from one source to another was made. It is only when Mahler's intentions were not found by examining different sources that editorial decisions based on my own knowledge of the style of Mahler's symphonic writing were made.

II. Sources

Sources used in this study are described below.

A. Facsimile of the Autograph Manuscript

This manuscript and the facsimile are kept in Pierpont Morgan Library in New York. A library staff of the Pierpont Library sent me the photocopy of the facsimile. This manuscript was also used as the engraver's copy-text for the first edition.¹

B. A Copy of the First Edition by C.F. Peters Originally Published in September, 1904 (plate number 9015)

The reprint of the same edition by Dover was used in this study.

This edition already shows some changes from the source A.²

¹ Fussl, iv.
C. Gustav Mahler: Sämtliche Werke, Kritische Gesamtausgabe, Band V (plate number 8951)

This is from the fifth volume of the critical edition of the complete works by Gustav Mahler edited by Erwin Ratz. Mahler kept revising this symphony until a few years before his death.³ Mahler's more than 270 corrections were incorporated by Ratz to make this revised edition, published in 1964.

D. A copy of the Revised Version Published by C.F. Peters in 1964, Published in the Philharmonia edition (W.Ph.V.458)

Since this score had been based on the format of the source C', it was used only as a reference in this study.

E. A Critical Edition by C.F. Peters Published in 1989 (Plate Number EE 6793)

This edition was edited by Erwin Ratz and revised by Karl Heinz Fussl, who wrote resourceful editorial notes. This edition was used only as a reference in this study since it went through two different editors after the publication of the first edition.

There are more existing sources of this symphony. The following materials should be consulted: 1) Karl Heinz Fussl's Preface to the 1989 edition by C.F. Peters, 2) Erwin Ratz's critical remarks in Gustav Mahler, Sämtliche Werke, Kritische Gesamtausgabe, Band V.

³Ibid.
⁴F.S., viii.
III. Comparison of the Three Sources

Since the sources D and E are going to be used only as a reference, the main comparison in this section of this study is going to focus on the sources A, B, and C above.

A. Comparison of 1904 and 1964 Editions

Mahler revised this symphony so many times that there were at least three versions of this symphony known; however, there is very little change made in the Adagietto after the publication of the first edition in 1904. The evidence of that is seen below.

First, Erwin Ratz compared seven different sources and made 270 changes from the 1919 edition known as the "Neue Ausgabe" (=new version) to make his revised edition in 1964. In the movement Adagietto, however, there were only two instances where the 1904 edition and his 1964 edition differ. Secondly, Karl Heinz Fussl gives detailed comparisons of sources in his preface to the 1989 edition; however, the only comments he makes regarding the Adagietto is about measures 60 and 63.

The only differences between the 1904 edition and the 1964 edition are in measures 60 and 63 in the first violin part. Both the manuscript and the 1904 edition have two grace notes on the first beat of measures 60 and 63. The 1964 edition, however, has only one grace note, which is also seen in Fussl's 1989 edition. Since Mahler's intention could not be found

\[^5\] F.S., viii.

\[^6\] Ratz, critical remarks.
using the available sources, and I preferred the musical effect of one
grace note in the first violins while having two grace notes in the second
violins and the celli, I decided to follow the 1964 edition.

Example 2  a) Mahler, Sym. no. 5, Adagietto, ms. 60 and 63, Manuscript
and 1904 edition

\[ \text{Example 2 (continued)} \]

\[ \text{b) 1964 edition} \]

B. Comparison of the Manuscript and the 1904 Edition

There are many differences between the manuscript and the 1904
dition. Whenever there are differences between the two, the 1964 edition
agrees with the 1904 edition with the exception of measures 60 and 63 as
mentioned above. When there were differences between the manuscript and
the 1904 edition, the 1904 edition was followed because Mahler himself
made the corrections on the engraver's plate upon publication of the 1904
dition.\(^7\)

\(^7\) Fussl, V.
Examples of the differences between the manuscript and the 1904 edition are discussed below. This discussion is divided into six categories: 1. pitch and rhythm, 2. articulation, 3. dynamic markings, 4. tempo markings, 5. orchestration, and 6. others.

1. Pitch and Rhythm: There were three different kinds of changes Mahler made before the publication of the 1904 edition regarding pitch and rhythm:
   a) grace notes, b) specific duration values, and c) complete alteration of pitch and rhythm. Some examples are shown below.

a) Grace Notes

Example 3  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.27, violins and violas, manuscript

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{\textbf{manuscript}} & \\
\text{\textbf{b) 1904 edition}} & \\
\end{align*}
\]

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Example 4  

a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, m.28, manuscript

\[\text{\textit{Example 4 a} Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, m.28, manuscript} \]

\[\text{\textit{Example 4 a} Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, m.28, manuscript} \]

b) 1904 edition

\[\text{\textit{Example 4 b} 1904 edition} \]

b) Specific Duration Values

Example 5  

a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, m.54, 1st violins, manuscript

\[\text{\textit{Example 5 a} Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, m.54, 1st violins, manuscript} \]

b) 1904 edition

\[\text{\textit{Example 5 b} 1904 edition} \]

\[\text{\textit{Example 5 b} 1904 edition} \]

16

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
c) Complete Alteration of Pitch and Rhythm

Example 6  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.29, manuscript

b) 1904 edition
Example 7  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.30, celli, manuscript

2. Articulation: Mahler was very precise in notating articulation even in his manuscript. There were not many differences between the manuscript and the 1904 edition with regard to articulation. Two examples are shown below.

Example 8  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.16, celli, manuscript
Example 9  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.89, 1st violins, manuscript  

Example 10  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.44-46, 1st violins, manuscript

3. Dynamic Markings: Mahler changed many of these indications before the publication of the first edition in 1904. Many were simply additions to what he had in the manuscript; however, others were completely changed from the manuscript. For example, the following dynamic markings are found in the 1904 and 1964 editions but not in the manuscript: m.20, violin.II, m.20, cello; m.86, violin.I. The following dynamic markings have been changed from the manuscript to the 1904 edition.
4. Tempo Markings: Mahler added and changed several tempo markings before the publication of the 1904 edition. For example, *Sehr langsam* (=very slowly) in m.3 did not exist in the manuscript but was added in the 1904 edition which the 1964 edition also followed. In m. 96, Mahler wrote *Sehr Zurichhaltend!* (=hold back!) in the manuscript but changed to *Drangent* (=push forward) in the 1904 edition.

5. Orchestration: Mahler changed some of his orchestration from the manuscript in most cases regarding the coloring effect, as seen in the following examples.
Example 12
a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.22, manuscript

Example 13  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm. 25-26, manuscript

b) 1904 edition

Example 14  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, ms. 28 and 29, harp, manuscript
b) 1904 edition

6. Others: The manuscript and the 1904 edition differ slightly with regard to some string techniques and some expression markings. For example, the following markings are in the 1904 and 1964 editions but not in the manuscript: *mit Empfindung* (=with delicacy) in m. 23, violin I; *Griffbrett* (=on the fingerboard) in m.33, violin II; and *D-Saite* (=on the D-string) in m.72, violin I.
Technique of Reconstructing Orchestral Music for Piano

This section examines the technique of reconstructing orchestral music for piano that Franz Liszt used in his reconstructions of Wagner's, Overture to Tannhauser, and Saint-Saens', Danse Macabre for piano. The details of this discussion are divided into several different categories: I. Articulation, II. Dynamics, III. Phrasing, IV. Expression Marks, V. Meters, VI. Pedaling Indications, VII. Added Measures, and VIII. Notes and Rhythm.

Since Liszt added measures to the original works, two measure numbers are given for each example when necessary. The first one is the measure number in the original work while the one in parenthesis is the measure number in Liszt's work.

I. Articulation

In the Overture to Tannhauser, Liszt seemed to follow Wagner's articulations except when it was necessary to modify them. The reasons for the modification seem to fall into three categories: A. For presenting the Effect of Wagner's Orchestration, B. For Technical Reasons for the Pianist, and C. For the Clarity of the Sound. Examples of each case are given below.
A. For Presenting the Effect of Wagner's Orchestration

On the down beat of measure 142 (143), Wagner has normal accents (>) in the woodwinds, horns, and the strings but has the trumpet, tuba, and the timpani added on those beats to give stronger attacks. Liszt, however, having no choice of adding other instruments, gives the wedge accent (\^) on the beat instead of the normal one to give the effect of Wagner's added instruments.

Example 15  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.142
B. For Technical Reasons for the Pianist

In measures 41, 44, and 45, Liszt omitted the slurs which were originally in the trombones because it would not be possible for the pianist to play the slurs due to other notes in the piano part (see example 16).

C. For the Clarity of the Sound

On the down beats of measures 54, 56, and 58, in the second violins and the violas, Wagner gives the bow change whereas Liszt gives accents (°) on those notes. Liszt probably added the accents for the melody to be heard well (see example 17).

Example 16  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, ms.41, 44, and 45, trombones
b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhäuser, ms.41, 44, and 45

Example 17  a) Wagner, Tannhäuser, mm.54-58, 2nd violins and violas
b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.54-58

II. Dynamics

There seem to be two reasons Liszt changed the dynamic markings from the original in his work of *Danse Macabre*: A. Consideration of the orchestration, B. Liszt's own creativity. Examples of each category are given below.

A. Consideration of the Orchestration

In measure 5, the original has *ppp* while Liszt has *pp*. The reason is probably that since all the violins are playing in the original, the actual effect is slightly louder than *ppp*. It is also true that the dynamic range in the orchestral music is usually wider than the piano music; therefore, a
very soft dynamic might be written as *ppp* in orchestral music but written as *pp* in piano music.

**B. Liszt’s Own Creativity**

The original dynamic level in measure 85 (159) is *f*, but Liszt has *ff*. What is modified in this section is not only the dynamic level but also the writing of the melody: register shift, change of articulation, etc. The difference of the dynamic level is, therefore, a part of the big change that Liszt made in this section.

Example 18  a) Saint-Saens, *Danse Macabre*, m.85
b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, m.159

III. Phrasing

Liszt followed the original phrasing in most cases except when the original slur markings in the strings meant bowings rather than phrasings. For example, in measures 205-210 (317-322) of Danse Macabre in the solo violin part, Saint-Saens' slurs are shorter than Liszt's because the violin needs to change the bowing frequently because of the loud volume.

Example 19 a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.205-210, solo violin

b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.317-322
When the same melody is restated immediately after the violin solo by flutes and a horn in measures 213-217 (325-329), the original score now has longer slurs, which Liszt followed exactly, than in the example above.

Example 20  a) Saint-Saens, *Danse Macabre*, mm.213-217, flutes and horns

b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, *Danse Macabre*, mm.325-329

**IV. Expression Marks**

Liszt inserted or changed some expression marks. Listed below are examples from *Overture to Tannhäuser*.  

30
Inserted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure numbers</th>
<th>Expression Marks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>accentato espressivo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(bring out expressively)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>marcatissimo la melodia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sempre maestoso e senza agitatione</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(marcato on the melody, always stately with no agitation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>(p) ma sempre marcato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(piano but always marcato)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td>delicamente ma marcato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(delicately but marcato)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>leggiero (lightly)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Changed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure numbers</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Liszt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>124</td>
<td>molto espress</td>
<td>appassionato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(much expression)</td>
<td>(passionately)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220 (219)</td>
<td>molto espressivo</td>
<td>appassionato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(very expressively)</td>
<td>espressivo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(passionately, expressively)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
V. Meter

In his transcription of Danse Macabre, Liszt changed the meter of the first 24 measures (30 measures in the transcription) from the original 3/4 to 2/4. He also changed the held notes in the strings in mm. 5-8 and mm. 13-16 (13-24) to trills, which can be played more easily in 2/4 than in 3/4, and added six measures in this section. Since the original in this section has just held notes and pizzicato on down beats, it works well either in 3/4 or 2/4.

Example 21  a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.1-24
VI. Pedaling Indications

Liszt inserted pedal markings in *Danse Macabre* freely. Since the detailed discussion of pedaling itself would take too long for the purpose of this study, it will not be included here. It should be kept in mind that even when pedaling markings are written, the player should modify the pedaling depending on the piano, the acoustics of the room, and the player's own musical taste. Liszt wrote that "An intelligent use of the pedal is implied" in his work of Overture to *Tannhauser*.¹

VII. Added Materials

Liszt freely added measures to the original compositions. The original Danse Macabre has 477 measures but Liszt's reconstruction of the same piece has 670 measures. This is many more than needed to compensate for the beats and measures lost in the beginning changing the meter from 3/4 to 2/4. The materials added in Liszt's works are never his original; instead, they are always taken from the themes and motives of the original by Saint-Saens. For example, the materials in measures 39-46 in the reconstruction are taken from the violin solo in measures 25-32.

Example 22  a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.25-32, solo violin

\[ \text{Example 22 b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, Danse Macabre, mm.39-46} \]
VIII. Notes and Rhythm

Liszt’s reconstructions are not merely a restatements of the originals on a different instrument. Oftentimes, the notes and the rhythms of the original materials were changed. This section discusses the reasons for these changes, and is divided into three categories: A. Orchestration, B. Pianistic writing, and C. Others.

A. Orchestration

Many of the changes Liszt made were for the purpose of creative re-orchestration. The following are the points of discussion of Liszt’s re-orchestration: 1. Octave doublings, 2. Melody supported by chords in the original, 3. Register shift, and 4. Percussion parts.

1. Octave Doublings

Octave doublings in orchestra parts sometimes have to be simplified to be playable on piano. For example, in measure 38 of *Tannhauser*, Liszt omitted the upper octave of the triplet figures (see example 23).

On the other hand, octave doublings that do not exist in the original can also be added for increased power. Examples can be seen in measures 142-145 (143-146) of *Tannhauser*. Liszt doubled the cello lines with the lower octave (see example 24).
Example 23  

a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.38

b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.38
Example 24  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.142-145, strings

b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.143-146

2. Melody Supported by Chords in the Original

In measures 126-127 of Tannhauser, the melody in the violins are supported by the chords in the bassoons, horns, violas, and the double basses. Since Liszt needed to have the left hand available to play the runs in the cellos rather than playing the chords, he changed the right-hand melody to be chordal.
Example 25  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, mm.126-127

b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.126-127

3. Register Shift

Liszt oftentimes kept the pitch content of the original but shifted the register up or down because the tone color of a register on a particular orchestral instrument is not necessarily achieved by the same register on piano. For example, in measures 33-35 (79-81) of Danse Macabre, the dark and soft sound of the low register of the solo flute is better imitated in the register two octaves below the original than in the original register on piano.
Example 26  a) Saint-Saens, *Danse Macabre*, solo flute, mm.33-35

```
\begin{music}
33
solo fl. \flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe\flefe
p
\end{music}
```

b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, *Danse Macabre*, mm.79-81

```
\begin{music}
79
\end{music}
```

4. Percussion Parts

When non-pitched percussion instruments are used in both *Tannhauser* and *Danse Macabre*, they are used to add power or extra color to the orchestra. In measures 273-78 of *Tannhauser*, the tremolos on the triangle and the timpani are alternated every two measures. Liszt added the sixteenth-note figures in the right hand in measures where timpani rolls are to make the distinction of the two.

Example 27  a) Wagner, *Tannhauser*, mm.273-78, percussion

```
\begin{music}
\end{music}
```
There are also places Liszt gave no consideration of the percussion parts. In measure 303, timpani, triangle, suspended cymbals, and tambourine start the tremolos. When the triangle and the tambourine drop out in measure 305, Liszt makes no difference in his piano score.

Example 28  a) Wagner, *Tannhauser*, mm.303-305, percussion
b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, mm.303-305

B. Pianistic Writing

Liszt freely added pianistic writing that did not exist in the original. The following discussion is divided into five areas of pianistic writing Liszt frequently used: 1. String trills and repeated notes changed to arpeggios and trills, 2. Sustained chords changed to runs or arpeggios, 3. Other runs on piano, 4. Broken octaves on piano, and 5. Modification of the original to be playable on piano. All examples in this section are taken from Tannhauser.

1. String Trills and Repeated Notes Changed to Arpeggios and Trills

In measures 88-89, string tremolos and repeated notes are changed to arpeggios on piano (see example 29).

In measures 105, the repeated notes in the violins are changed to trills on the piano (see example 30).

2. Sustained Chords Changed to Runs or Arpeggios

Liszt changed the sustained chords in measures 92 and 94 to chromatic runs (measures 92), and arpeggios (measure 94) (see example 31).
Example 29  

a) Wagner, *Tannhauser*, mm.88-89, strings

b) Wagner-Liszt, *Tannhauser*, mm.88-89

Example 30  

a) Wagner, *Tannhauser*, m.105, violins
Example 31  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, ms.92 and 94
3. Other Runs on Piano

Liszt changed the triplet runs in the strings in measure 258 to sextuplets in the piano.

Example 32  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.258

b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.258
4. Broken Octaves on Piano

Liszt added broken octaves in measure 159 (160) on the third and the fourth beat.

Example 33  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.159

\[\text{Example Image}\]

b) Wagner-Liszt, Tannhauser, m.160

\[\text{Example Image}\]
5. Modification of the Original to Be Playable on Piano

When the notes of the original melody and accompaniment overlap, Liszt either shifted the register or changed the structure of the materials to be playable on piano. In measure 69, Liszt simplified the material in the second violins and transposed it down two octaves.

Example 34  a) Wagner, Tannhauser, m.69

In measure 96, Liszt changed the structure of the arpeggios in the strings.
Example 35  a) Wagner, *Tannhauser*, m.96, strings

b) Wagner-Liszt, *Tannhauser*, m.96

C. Others

There are changes Liszt made in terms of notes and rhythm other than those mentioned above. This discussion is divided into two topics: 1. Elaboration and 2. Rhythmic changes. All examples in this section are taken from *Danse Macabre*.

1. Elaboration

There are two kinds of elaborations Liszt did. The first is elaboration without adding measures. In many of these cases Liszt took full advantage of the piano's versatility. For example, in measures 102-104
(177-179), Liszt took the thematic material from measures 33-36 of the original, modified it, and inserted it into the left hand.

Example 36  a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.33-36, solo flute

\[ \text{Example 36 a) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.33-36, solo flute} \]

b) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.102-104

\[ \text{Example 36 b) Saint-Saens, Danse Macabre, mm.102-104} \]
The other kind of elaboration Liszt did was to expand the original materials. For example, measures 1-24 in the reconstruction is both modified and expanded from the original. The chords played by strings are changed to trills on piano. The trills are expanded for an extra eight measures before the next material occurs (see example 21, page 32).

2. Rhythmic Changes

Liszt frequently changed the rhythm while keeping the pitch content to make the passage sound more interesting on piano. For example, Liszt changed the eighth-note patterns in the violins in measure 413 (566) to triplets.
Example 37  
a) Saint-Saens, *Danse Macabre*, m.413, strings

b) Saint-Saens-Liszt, *Danse Macabre*, m.566
Issues of Reconstructing the *Adagietto* for Trombone and Piano

In this chapter, details of the reconstruction of the *Adagietto* for trombone and piano are discussed. One should keep in mind that the purpose of reconstructing is not to imitate the sound of the original piece but to translate the sound of the original to the new instrumentation so that the reconstructed piece sounds as if the composer originally wrote the piece for those instruments.

I. Orchestration

The act of orchestration requires imagination and creativity to come up with the best possible sound.

The first section of this chapter is divided into five different categories: A. momentum, B. range, C. color, D. Mahler’s grace notes on string instruments, and E. voicing.

A. Momentum: Use of Moving Notes and Rolled Chords

One of the hardest issues one has to deal with when reconstructing orchestral music for piano is how to make the piano part sound as sustained as the orchestral instruments. Most orchestral instruments are capable of sustaining notes which keep the momentum of the music even in slow pieces where notes move slowly.

The most common solution to the problem above is to add moving notes to the piano part. The best effect can be achieved when the moving
notes are in the same register as the melody. There are several issues to be considered when adding moving notes. First of all, the rhythmic value of the moving notes should be decided by how much forward motion is needed at any given moment. In a very slow piece like the Adagietto, 16th notes are needed in most cases to keep the momentum of the music. However, sometimes the triplets and eighth-notes are sufficient when the music requires less momentum. In this reconstruction, less moving notes are needed in the piano part when the trombone plays because the trombone helps to sustain the sound.

When the notes of the moving part were chosen, Mahler's original harmony, voicing, and voice leading were observed and preserved. The register in the original was shifted in many cases because it sounded good on string instruments but did not necessarily sound good on piano.

The following are some examples of the usage of moving notes. In the following example, the sixteenth notes are used in place of the chordal accompaniment of long sustained notes (see example 38).

In the next example, the moving eighth notes in the harp part were kept in the reconstruction because the music in this section did not require anything faster than eighth notes to keep flowing (see example 39).
Example 39  
a) Mahler, Sym. no. 5, Adagietto, mm. 33-35

b) Mahler-Murata, mm. 33-35
In the example below, Mahler indicated strong forward motion by indicating *Etwas drängend* (somewhat speeding up) and the louder dynamics. Since sixteenth notes were not sufficient to fulfill the momentum required, the wide range of the piano was used to create the motion.

Example 40  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, *Adagietto*, mm.42-46
b) Mahler-Murata, mm. 42-46
As mentioned above, putting the melody and accompanying moving
notes in the same register is a very effective way of writing for piano.
Without adding occasional chordal writing to the basic structure of melody
and moving notes, however, the music loses resonance. In example 38, some
chordal writings are added on the down beat of m.11 and the third beat of
m.12 to add resonance in the piano writing.

Moving notes are not the only way to add motion in piano writing.
Chords may be rolled to add some motion even though their effect is not as
strong as that of moving notes. In example 40, rolled chords are added
throughout.

When the register of the moving notes is separated from the melody,
the effect of the forward motion diminishes. In the next example, the
rolled chords help the momentum which was diminished by the separation of
the register (see example 41).

One problem with rolled chords is that they do not give the power
needed in big fortissimo sections. In the example below, rolled chords were
used in measure 91 but were avoided in the next two measures as the
dynamic level went up (see example 42).

B. Range

When different instruments play in the orchestra, one hears
different color of various instruments. In order to make trombone and
piano music as colorful as orchestral music, full range of both trombone
and piano must be used.
Original materials were often transposed to different octaves in this work for different purposes. In the example below, the melody in the violins are transposed down an octave. The trombone could play in the original register; the warm sound of mid-range violins, however, can be achieved better in the middle register than in the upper register on the trombone (see example 43).

Example 41 Mahler-Murata, mm.74-76
Example 42 Mahler-Murata, mm.91-93

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Example 43 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.1-9

III. 4. Adagietto

Sehr langsam  molto rit.  a tempo (molto Adagio)
In the same example, I transposed the chordal accompaniment up an octave so that all three parts (the trombone, right hand of the piano, left hand of the piano) would not be in the same register.

In measure 9 of the example 43, there is a note exchange, which Mahler used frequently, between the second violins and the violas to give different colors on the same note. It is not possible to achieve the same effect on the piano unless different registers are used, which is the reason there is a register shift on the third beat of measure 9 in the piano part.

Low register on piano gives a heavy and powerful sound. The lower octave was added in measure 30 to give extra power.

Example 44  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.30
b) Mahler-Murata, m.30

The low range of the piano is fully used in the next example.

Example 45  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.98-103
b) Mahler-Murata, mm.98-103
Octave doublings on piano also give more power. In measure 94, the cello line on beat four was not included in the reconstruction because octave doublings of the harp and the second violin parts give the power which is needed here. It would not have been possible to add the octave doublings if the cello line on beat four was included.

Example 46  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.94
C. Color

I have previously mentioned that full range of both the piano and trombone needs to be used to accommodate different colors of orchestral sound. There are several other things that add different colors to the sound of trombone and piano. On trombone, there are different kinds of mutes available. Most trombone players own the straight mute, cup mute, plunger, and the harmon mute. The cup mute was used in measures 47 to 53 to convey the singing quality of upper-range violins.

Example 47  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.47-53, 1st violins
b) Mahler-Murata, mm. 47-53

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Trombone mutes should not be used just for the purpose of playing softly. They are to be used to produce different color. Trombone players are capable of playing very loudly with mutes, as well as playing very softly without the mutes.

Players can also adjust the quality of their sound when they see simple instructions on the page such as, "with lots of vibrato," "warmly," "aggressively," etc. Mahler indicated detailed instructions in his string parts such as breiter Strich (long bowing) in ms. 17 and 93, and viel Bogen wechseln (lots of bow changes) in ms 30 and 94. I translated those instructions to "full sound" and "big sound" respectively in the trombone part.

The piano also has its own mute which is the soft pedal. Unlike the trombone mutes, pianists cannot play very loudly with the soft pedal on. At the same time, pianists are capable of playing very softly without the soft pedal. The purpose of the soft pedal is to change the quality of sound while making it easier for the pianist to play softly. In the second violin part in measure 33, Mahler indicated Griffbrett (on the fingerboard) which was translated well into soft pedal on the piano (see example 39).

D. Mahler's Grace Notes on String Instruments

The effect of Mahler's grace notes are very different from traditional grace notes which are usually only a second or a third below or above the main note. Mahler's grace notes in this movement are usually at least a perfect fifth below the main note. Such grace notes on string
instruments give slight portamento which pianists cannot imitate. Also, the quality of portamento on string instruments is different from that of trombone. Therefore, such grace notes had to be changed to something else.

I have changed many of those grace notes to rolled chords on piano as in the example below.

Example 48  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.61, strings
b) Mahler-Murata, m.61

Trombone players can execute grace notes with small intervals of either seconds or thirds easily. Grace notes with large intervals as in this Adagietto sound rather disruptive on trombone. In such cases, I either omitted the grace notes altogether, or had the piano roll the chord while the trombone played the melody without the grace notes.

Example 49 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.27, violins and violas
Some notes Mahler uses on the grace notes do not exist among the main notes and they should not be omitted. For example, the grace note in the violins in measure 57 is an A-natural which is not found anywhere else in the measure. Such a big leap from the grace note to the main note as in either of the violin part does not sound as effective on piano as on violins. I have changed the notes of the grace notes without omitting the A-natural (see example 50).

E. Voicing

Voicing is a part of the creative act of the composer and therefore is as important as every other musical element of the piece. Mahler's voicing was kept whenever possible in this work; however, there were places Mahler's voicing was modified to make the part playable on the piano. In measure 5, for example, the chordal accompaniment in the second violins, violas, and the celli was first taken up an octave. Then, the A on the first beat and the A-flat on the third beat in the celli were moved to
between the F in the second violin and the C in the violas so the pianist can play the chords without rolling them. (Rolled chords are effective on piano but should not be overused) This does not change the inversion of the chord because the left hand is still playing the A on the first beat and A-flat on the third beat (see example 51).

Example 50 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.57

![Example 50a]

b) Mahler-Murata, m.57

![Example 50b]
Example 51  

a) Mahler, Sym. no. 5, Adagietto, m. 5

\[ \text{Example 51 a) Mahler, Sym. no. 5, Adagietto, m. 5} \]

\begin{align*}
\text{vln. I} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{vln. II} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{vla.} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{v.c.} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{d.b.} & \quad \text{f} \\
\text{pizz.} & \quad \text{f} \\
\end{align*}

b) Mahler-Murata, m. 5

\[ \text{Example 51 b) Mahler-Murata, m. 5} \]
II. Counterpoint

Since the Adagietto consists of more than the melody and the accompaniment, one of the issues of this reconstruction is how to incorporate Mahler's contrapuntal lines in the reduced instrumentation of trombone and piano. Various ways were used to preserve the contrapuntal lines in the reconstruction as seen in the following examples.

In order to have all the contrapuntal lines played by just two instruments, some of the contrapuntal lines had to be modified. The viola line in measures 79-80 is obviously important since Mahler indicated espress. In order to integrate the line in the piano part, the line was taken up an octave along with the melody. Since it is not possible for the piano to sustain the D for three beats in this tempo, the piano restrikes the D on the third beat so the listener can hear the D going to C-sharp.

Example 52  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.79-80, viola
Some contrapuntal lines had to be hidden in less obvious places. For example, the chromatic line of the cello in measures 25-27 is hidden among the moving notes of the right hand.

Example 53  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.25-27, celli

b) Mahler-Murata, mm.25-27, piano
Mahler often broke up a line, even a very short statement, and had the line played by several different instruments. For example, the beginning of the line played in measures 19-20 by celli is broken up and restated by the violas (playing the first note) and the second violins (playing the rest) in measures 21-22. Since the effect achieved by violas and violins cannot be imitated by the trombone and the piano because of the differences of the sound of the two instruments, the entire line was given to the piano.

Example 54  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.19-22, strings
b) Mahler-Murata, mm.19-22
III. Dynamics

Mahler indicated dynamic markings in detail to show which voices need to be brought out and to show exactly how he wanted the passage to be played. They were all an important parts of his music and were observed carefully and copied precisely to the reconstruction. The addition of moving notes takes on an important role in transferring Mahler's dynamic shades on string instruments to the piano part.

In measure 16, there is a crescendo-diminuendo marked on the half note in the upper celli. In order for the pianist to play the crescendo-diminuendo, the half note in the celli was changed to moving notes in the piano as seen in the example below.

Example 55  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, m.16, celli

\[\text{Example 55 a)}\]

\[\begin{align*}
\text{Example 55 b)} &\text{ Mahler-Murata, m.16} \\
\end{align*}\]

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
In measure 11, there is another set of crescendo-diminuendo on the first half note in the violas. The melody is in the celli, and Mahler wanted to bring out the counterpoint in the viola. Once again, the half note was changed to the moving notes so the crescendo-diminuendo can be played on the piano.

Example 56  a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.10-11, violas and celli

![Example 56 a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.10-11, violas and celli](image)

b) Mahler-Murata, m.11 (see example 38, page 52)

IV. Creativity

The subject of orchestration is one area creativity and imagination take important roles. One can also use their creativity in other areas as mentioned below.

What is essential in measure 30 is the held note in the melody and arpeggiations flowing up and down in the accompaniment. Instead of copying the exact notes from the string parts to the piano part, unmeasured arpeggios were added to the piano part. The harmony was retained as was the feeling of free flowing notes (see example 44, page 62).
The accompaniment part in measures 47-49 and 50-51 was taken up one and two octaves, respectively. The melody in these measures is played in upper-range trombone with a cup mute.

Example 57  

a) Mahler, Sym. no.5, Adagietto, mm.47-51

b) Mahler-Murata, mm.47-51 (see example 47, page 66)

The rolls in measure 75 do not exist in the original but were added in the piano part.

Example 58  

Mahler-Murata, m.75, piano
In measure 102, the rhythmic value gets longer and longer towards the end of the measure to help the effect of the morendo that Mahler has at the end (see example 45, page 63).

V. Elements That Should Be Retained

Some elements of music are very important for the expression of the piece in a very fundamental way. Therefore, they should be observed in detail and should not be modified when reconstructing the piece for another medium. There were four elements of music in the original that were not modified in this work. Those four elements are: A. expressive words, B. dynamic markings, C. articulation, and D. tied notes on the down beat.

A. Expressive Words

Mahler frequently used expressive words such as Zogernd (lingering), and vibrato mit innigster Empfindung (vibrato with most heartfelt feeling). All of Mahler's expressive words are important for the execution of the passage. Since many of his expressive words are in German, I translated all of Mahler's expressive words either into English or common Italian musical terms.

B. Dynamic Markings

As mentioned previously, Mahler notated dynamic markings in detail. All of them are very important for two reasons. First, they change the way the melody is played. The cello melody in example 55 has crescendo-diminuendo in measure 16 on the half note. The players would most likely not do the crescendo-diminuendo if there were none written.
Second, Mahler's dynamic markings tell you which line in the accompaniment needs to be brought out as does the second violin part in measure 9.

Example 59  Mahler, Symphony No.5, Adagietto, m.9, strings

C. Articulation

As in dynamic markings, Mahler was very particular about notating and executing articulation. There is one important element to consider when reconstructing string music to non-string instruments. Slur markings in the strings parts are bowings and not phrases. Instead of using slur markings, Mahler marked phrases using breath marks as in measures 2-9 in the first violin part.
In places where Mahler did not notate breath marks, musical judgment was used to determine where phrases end.

D. Tied Notes on Down Beats

Adding ties from the previous measure or putting rests on the down beat of a measure are used by composers to avoid the monotony of the time feel. When adding moving notes and other materials that do not exist in the original, care has to be taken not to add anything at the beginning of those down beats. For example, since no instrument articulates the down beat of measure 12 in the original, the moving notes in the piano part should be tied.
Example 61  a) Mahler, Sym. no. 5, Adagietto, mm. 11-12

b) Mahler-Murata, mm. 11-12 (see example 38, page 53)
Summary and Conclusion

I. Summary

Before reconstructing a piece of music for a different instrumentation, one should compare and contrast different sources of the original piece. Three main sources of Mahler's Symphony No.5 were examined in this study: autograph manuscript, 1904 edition, and 1964 edition.

As far as the Adagietto movement was concerned, 1904 and 1964 editions were almost identical except for measures 60 and 63.

There were many discrepancies between the manuscript and the 1904 edition. In those instances, the 1904 edition was followed because Mahler made the corrections on the engraver's plate upon publication of the 1904 edition.¹

Franz Liszt's piano transcriptions of various operatic and orchestral works show creative ways to reconstruct orchestral pieces for piano. His transcriptions of Wagner's Overture to Tannhauser and Saint-Saens' Danse Macabre were examined in this study.

There were many issues used in reconstructing the Adagietto for Trombone and piano. The biggest issue was the orchestration. Other issues were counterpoint, dynamics, expressive words, and articulation.

II. Conclusion

What Franz Liszt did in many of his reconstructions of operatic and orchestral pieces were more like fantasias rather than transcriptions. The reason his reconstructions sound as if they were meant to be played originally on the piano is his total command of writing for piano and his superb imagination of how these pieces would have sounded upon hearing them performed.

The aim of this project has been to reconstruct the Adagietto movement for trombone and piano and make it sound as good as the original. I hope that the aim has been achieved and that trombone players will enjoy playing this piece.
Bibliography


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Appendix A:
Adagietto (The Piano Score)
Do not Drag
(more flowing than the beginning)
molto Adagio

sempre pp

molto Adagio

with feeling

PP

PP
morendo

Tempo I (molto Adagio)

D

Tempo I (molto Adagio)
vibrato with most heartfelt feeling

Still Slower

Still Slower

poco a poco cresc.

poco a poco cresc.

full sound

105
Appendix B:
Adagietto (The Trombone Part)
Adagietto

Adagio molto rit. a tempo (molto Adagio)

Do not Drag (more flowing than the beginning)

A molto Adagio sempre pp

poco accel.

Big sound cresc.

ritenuto
dim.

109
Appendix C:  
Letters of Permission
Dear Sir or Madam:

I would like to obtain permission to use the following material for my dissertation, the details of which are as follows. Kindly grant my request for the aforementioned rights by signing and returning to me a signed copy of this letter.

Proposed Usage: For a dissertation
Name of my School: Louisiana State University
Tentative Title of Work: Reconstruction of Adagietto from Mahler’s Symphony V for trombone and piano
Author: Yuri Murata

Material Requested:
Title: Complete Piano Transcriptions from Wagner’s Operas
Author: Franz Liszt
Published in 1981

Thank you.
Sincerely yours,
Yuri Murata
847 Azalea #27 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Phone: 225/336-9795
Email: ymurat@attglobal.net

Agreed and Accepted

By __________________________ (please sign)
Name: ________________________ (please print)
Dear Sir or Madam:

I would like to obtain permission to use the following material for my dissertation, the details of which are as follows. Kindly grant my request for the aforementioned rights by signing and returning to me a signed copy of this letter.

Proposed Usage: For a dissertation

Name of my School: Louisiana State University
Tentative Title of Work: Reconstruction of Adagietto from Mahler's Symphony V for trombone and piano
Author: Yuri Murata

Material Requested:
Title: Symphony No. 5
Author: Gustav Mahler
Published in 1998
ISBN: 0-486-40115-4
Adagietto measures 16, 22, 27-30, 44-46, 54, 56-57, 60-63, 89

Thank you.
Sincerely yours,

Yuri Murata
847 Azalea #27 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Phone: 225/336-9795
Email: ymurat@attglobal.net

Agreed and Accepted

By (please sign)
Name (please print)
Dear Sir or Madam:

I would like to obtain permission to use the following material for my dissertation, the details of which are as follows. Kindly grant my request for the aforementioned rights by signing and returning to me a signed copy of this letter.

Proposed Usage: For a dissertation

Name of my School: Louisiana State University
Tentative Title of Work: Reconstruction of Adagietto from Mahler's Symphony V for trombone and piano
Author: Yuri Murata
Expected date of completion: April, 2000

Material Requested:
Title: Danse Macabre, Op.40, transcription pour Piano a2 Mains par Franz Liszt
Author: Camille Saint-Saens
D.&F. 2282
Published in 1921
Measures 39-77, 79-87, 159, 317-332

Thank you.

Sincerely yours,

Yuri Murata
847 Azalea #27 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Phone: 225/336-9795
Email: ymurat7@attglobal.net

Agreed and Accepted
By (please sign)
Name: (please print)
Dear Yuri Murata,

Thank you for your letter of January 20, in which you asked for permission to include measures 60-63 of Mahler's *ADAGIETTO* from *SYMPHONY V* for trombone and piano in your dissertation.

We are pleased to grant you this permission, gratis. In your acknowledgements you must include the following credit line:


Our permission extends to University Microfilms international to distribute copies of your dissertation upon request.

With all best wishes for success, I am

Sincerely,

C.F. PETERS CORPORATION

Ruth von Mengersen, Assistant Rights Clearance Division
Dear Sir or Madam:

I would like to obtain permission to use the following material for my dissertation, the details of which are as follows. Kindly grant my request for the aforementioned rights by signing and returning to me a signed copy of this letter.

Proposed Usage: For a dissertation

Name of my School: Louisiana State University
Tentative Title of Work: Reconstruction of Adagietto from Mahler's Symphony V for trombone and piano
Author: Yuri Murata

Material Requested:

Title: Adagietto from Symphony No. 5
Author: Gustav Mahler
Copyright in 1992, Kaplan Foundation
ISBN: 0-486-40115-4
Measures 16 22 27-30 44-46 56-57 89

Thank you.
Sincerely yours,

Yuri Murata
847 Azalea #27 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Phone: 225/336-9795
Email: ymurat@attglobal.net

Agreed and Accepted

By ___________________________ (please sign)
Name: ________________________ (please print)
Vita

Yuri Murata, born in Tokyo, Japan, earned her undergraduate degree in trombone performance from Wichita State University. She then attended the University of New Mexico where she received a master’s degree in music composition. Her terminal degree is at the doctoral level in trombone performance minoring in music composition. She has played in various ensembles around the areas of Wichita, Kansas, Albuquerque, New Mexico, and Baton Rouge, Louisiana. One of her compositions, Fantasia for 10 Winds and Percussion, was published by Cimarron Music. She will receive the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts in May 2000.
Candidate: Yuri Murata

Major Field: Music

Title of Dissertation: Reconstruction of Gustav Mahler's Symphony No. 5, Adagietto for Trombone and Piano

Approved:

[Signatures]

Dean of the Graduate School

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

[Signatures]

Date of Examination:

April 5, 2000