1998

Dame Ethel Smyth's Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra: A Performance Guide for the Hornist.

Janiece Marie Luedeke

Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses

Recommended Citation


This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at LSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in LSU Historical Dissertations and Theses by an authorized administrator of LSU Digital Commons. For more information, please contact gradetd@lsu.edu.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6” x 9” black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.
DAME ETHEL SMYTH'S CONCERTO FOR VIOLIN, HORN, AND ORCHESTRA: A PERFORMANCE GUIDE FOR THE HORNIST

A Monograph

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the Louisiana State University and Agricultural and Mechanical College in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts

in

The School of Music

by

Janiece Marie Luedke
B.M.E., Lawrence University, 1987
M.M., University of Akron, 1989
August, 1998
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to my professors, friends, and family for all their support throughout the course of this degree. I have had the fortunate pleasure of working with an exceptional committee. I would especially like to thank Professors Bruce Heim, Jennifer Brown, and Richard Kaplan for sharing their insight as well as providing me with hours of help. My gratitude also extends to my friends who have helped me maintain my perspective and have encouraged me to be persistent.

Through the years, my greatest source of support has come from my family. They are my foundation and have given me more love than I could have ever dreamed of receiving. I would especially like to thank my parents, Carlton and Elizabeth and my sisters, Mary, Beverly, and Laura. This monograph is dedicated to the loving memory of Jacek Ilnicki.
NOTATIONAL CONVENTIONS

The octave designation system used in this monograph is U.S.A. Standard notation, the octave notation system adopted by the Acoustical Society of America. See Robert W. Young, “Terminology for Logarithmic Frequency Units,” *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America* 11 (1939): 134-139. It is as follows:

\[ \begin{array}{cccccc}
\text{C}_1 & \text{C}_2 & \text{C}_3 & \text{C}_4 & \text{C}_5 & \text{C}_6 & \text{C}_7 \\
\end{array} \]

In the Smyth Double Concerto, measure numbers were not provided by the publishers. This author has chosen to begin with the first complete measure.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ......................................................................................................................... iii  
NOTATIONAL CONVENTIONS ............................................................................................................ iv 
LIST OF EXAMPLES ........................................................................................................................ vi  
ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................................ vii 
INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................................. 1  

## CHAPTER

1  IMPRESSIONS OF ETHEL SMYTH ................................................................................... 5  
2  ANALYTICAL OBSERVATIONS ON THE CONCERTO FOR VIOLIN, HORN, AND ORCHESTRA ........................................................................................................................................... 24  
   First Movement ............................................................................................................................. 24  
   Second Movement ......................................................................................................................... 28  
   Third Movement ........................................................................................................................... 32  
3  A TEACHING GUIDE FOR THE HORNIST ........................................................................ 36  
   Horn Chords .................................................................................................................................... 36  
   Balance .......................................................................................................................................... 46  
   Con Sordino ..................................................................................................................................... 49  

CONCLUSION ................................................................................................................................... 54  
REFERENCES .................................................................................................................................... 56  

APPENDIX A: REHEARSAL NUMBERS CORRESPONDING TO MEASURE NUMBERS OF SMYTH’S CONCERTO ......................................................................................................................... 61  
APPENDIX B: CONSENT FORMS ................................................................................................. 64  
VITA .................................................................................................................................................. 68
LIST OF EXAMPLES

2.1. Brahms and Smyth Comparison ................................................................. 28
2.2. Transitional Figure in Smyth’s Concerto ......................................................... 31
3.1. B-flat Harmonic Series Notated for Horn in F .................................................. 38
3.2. The Horn Chords Found in Smyth’s Concerto ................................................. 39
3.3. Voice Range ................................................................................................. 42
3.4. Sounding Pitches .......................................................................................... 43
3.5. Pitches Played and Sung Simultaneously ...................................................... 44
3.6. Pitches Played at Different Dynamics ............................................................ 44
3.7. Moving by Half Steps .................................................................................. 44
3.8. Vocalizing Above the Sustaining Note .......................................................... 45
3.9. Vocalizing Below the Sustaining Note ........................................................... 45
3.10. Other Combinations of Pitches .................................................................. 45
3.11. Con Sord. Passages in the Third Movement of Bartók’s Concerto for Orchestra 51
3.12a. Con Sord. Passage in Second Movement of Smyth’s Concerto ...................... 52
3.12b. Con Sord. Passage in Third Movement of Smyth’s Concerto ....................... 52

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
ABSTRACT

Dame Ethel Smyth's Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra (1927) is a welcome addition to the horn concerto repertory. Moreover, Smyth's "Double Concerto" has the added distinction of being the first significant piece for horn by a female composer. The Double Concerto was first performed May 5, 1927, in the Queens Hall, London by the renowned Aubrey Brain, horn, and Jelly d'Aranyi, violin, with Sir Henry Wood conducting. The Concerto consists of three movements, each featuring beautiful thematic material that is expanded and exchanged between the two soloists and within the orchestra. The Finale is a heroic movement that makes use of hunting motives, a style of horn writing popular since at least the time of Georg Philipp Telemann.

This monograph will focus on preparation strategies for performing the horn part of Smyth's Concerto. The first chapter will provide biographical and historical information on Ethel Smyth and her Double Concerto. The second chapter will provide an analysis to help assist the performer in understanding the piece. It will include a discussion of topics such as form, harmony, motives, and rhythms. The third chapter will be a practical guide for the horn player. It will provide teaching methods and exercises for developing multiphonic techniques, suggestions for coping with the awkward passages marked con sordino, as well as a variety of alternate fingerings for stopping. A description of Aubrey Brain's instrument and sound will suggest an appropriate timbre for this piece and a discussion of seating arrangements will address issues of balance.
INTRODUCTION

Despite the fact that the horn is prominently featured in countless nineteenth and twentieth century orchestral works, relatively few concerti for horn have been written during this period; those of Carl Maria von Weber, Franz Strauss, and Richard Strauss are the most obvious exceptions. Thus, Dame Ethel Smyth’s Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra (1927) is a welcome addition to the horn concerto repertory. Moreover, Smyth’s “Double Concerto” has the added distinction of being the first significant piece for horn by a female composer. Throughout the history of music, works by women composers have generally been ignored by performers and audiences alike; consequently Smyth’s Concerto has long languished in oblivion. In the last few years, however, interest in Ethel Smyth’s Concerto has grown, resulting in two recordings: the 1992 issue of the piano reduction featuring Renate Eggebrecht-Kupsa, violin, Franz Draxinger, horn, and Céline Dutilly, piano; and the 1995 issue of the orchestral version by Sophie Langdon, violin, Richard Watkins, horn, and the BBC Philharmonic Orchestra conducted by Odaline de la Martinez. Yet the Concerto has received only cursory attention in the scholarly press. The purpose of this study is to present performing strategies for the horn player after providing historical and analytical background for this work.

Ethel Smyth was born in Marylebone, England, on April 22, 1858, and died in Woking, May 9, 1944. Born into a prosperous military family, she defied convention and fought hard to achieve her musical ambitions. At the age of 17, she began her formal musical training with Alexander Ewing. In 1877 she entered the Leipzig Conservatory where she studied with Carl Reinecke, Salomon Jadassohn, and Louis Maas. She was, however, dissatisfied and left after one year to study privately with the Austrian composer Heinrich von Herzogenberg. Through him she met Brahms, Clara Schumann, Grieg,
Tchaikovsky, and Dvorák. Her first major success as a serious composer was the performance of her *Mass in D for Solo Voices, Chorus, and Orchestra* at the Albert Hall, January 18, 1893. The German conductor Hermann Levi, impressed with her dramatic ability, insisted that she write an opera. From that time forward most of her energy was devoted to dramatic musical works. Unfortunately, there was little opportunity for performance of new operas in England. Consequently, her first opera, *Fantasio*, was performed in Weimar in 1898 and revived at Karlsruhe in 1901. Her second opera, *Der Wald*, a one-act work, was produced in Berlin on April 21, 1902. Three months later at Covent Garden, it became the first opera performance in her native country. The following year on March 11 *Der Wald* made history as the first opera by a female composer to be performed at the Metropolitan Opera House in New York. Her most successful work, *The Wreckers*, was originally written in French with the title *Les Naufrageurs*. However, the French version was never presented to the public; the opera was premiered in German at Leipzig and Prague (1906) under the title *Strandrecht*. Smyth then translated the libretto into English. On June 22, 1909, this version was presented at Her Majesty’s Theater under the baton of Thomas Beecham.

It was during the following years, 1910-1912 that Smyth became a militant leader for women's suffrage in England. She is perhaps best remembered today for the anthem “The March of the Women,” the battle song of the Women’s Social and Political Union (WSPU). Hints of her political feelings appear in her next opera, *The Boatswain’s Mate*, a comedy after W.W. Jacobs, produced by Beecham in 1916. In 1922 she was honored by King George VI with the title Dame Commander of the Order of the British Empire. Her later dramatic compositions consist of two two-act operas: *Fête galant*, performed at the Birmingham Repertory Theater, 1923; and *Entente cordiale*, performed in Bristol.
October 20, 1926. Because of increasing deafness, Smyth’s composing declined; her last major work was *The Prison*, performed in 1931 at the Queen’s Hall. After this point she continued to write prose. A two-volume autobiography, *Impressions that Remained*, 1919, was followed by ten more books, four of them autobiographical. The Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra was thus one of Smyth’s last works; written at the peak of her fame as a composer, the Concerto was first performed May 5, 1927, in the Queen's Hall, London by the renowned Aubrey Brain, horn, and Jelly d’Aranyi, violin, with Sir Henry Wood conducting.

While many composers of the early twentieth century were experimenting with radical new forms and harmonic language, Smyth’s works can be seen as a continuation of nineteenth century musical tradition. The Concerto consists of three movements, each featuring beautiful thematic material that is expanded and exchanged between the two soloists and within the orchestra. The Finale is a heroic movement that makes use of hunting motives, a style of horn writing popular at least since the time of Georg Philipp Telemann. The solo violin and horn parts are virtuosic and demand considerable control of range and dynamics.

Even though Smyth’s style grows out of that of the nineteenth century, she could be considered a pioneer in the use of multiphonics for horn. Though occasionally used by earlier composers such as Weber, this technique is more common in the works of later twentieth century composers such as Walter Hartley (*Sonorities II* for horn and piano), Douglas Hill (*Jazz Sets* for horn solo), Mark Schultz (*T. Rex* for horn and piano), and Norman Del Mar (*Sonatina for Two Horns*). Though the appearance of multiphonics in compositions is more common today, detailed guidelines for learning this technique are still needed.
This paper will focus on preparation strategies for performing the horn part of Smyth’s Double Concerto. The first chapter will provide biographical and historical information on Ethel Smyth and her Concerto. The second chapter will provide an analysis to help assist the performer in understanding the piece, including a discussion of topics such as form, harmony, motives, and rhythms. The third chapter will be a practical guide for the horn player. It will introduce guidelines for intonation and balance, as well as teaching methods and exercises for multiphonics.

Dame Ethel Smyth was a courageous person who broke the traditional boundaries that kept women from receiving opportunities and realizing their potential. She fought hard for women’s rights both in the suffrage movement and in the music industry. In her Double Concerto she eloquently combined the sounds and unique techniques of horn and violin. The revival of this work through recent recordings has made this an opportune time for performers to explore this piece. With the twentieth century about to end, horn players should welcome this concerto as a standard piece in the horn repertoire.
CHAPTER 1: IMPRESSIONS OF ETHEL SMYTH

Ethel Smyth was a remarkable woman and a role model for women of her time. She managed to achieve considerable success as a composer in a male-dominated field; she was also an important leader of the women's suffrage movement. Her boldness and determination helped her to achieve goals that were unheard of during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Her personality would at times overwhelm and frustrate her peers, but eventually these traits would endear her to many of her colleagues. Not only was Smyth a talented composer, but she was also an astute businesswoman. She worked aggressively to get as many performances of her compositions as possible and also to receive the recognition that she sorely deserved. Her skills as a composer won the respect of many prominent musicians, such as Sir Thomas Beecham, Sir Henry Wood, Bruno Walter, Gustav Holst, and Percy Grainger. Her talent and personality also won support and friendship from members of the upper classes, including the British royal family. Smyth's skill as a composer covers many different genres, including vocal works, chamber works, orchestral works, and operas.

As a child Smyth's exposure to music was limited. Early in her development the music she heard was mostly from her mother, who sang and played the piano. At twelve years of age, Smyth was introduced to classical music by her new governess who had studied music in Leipzig. For Smyth, the notion of studying in Leipzig developed into a passionate goal. In 1875 she met the composer Alexander Ewing, who became her first true mentor in music. He proclaimed that Ethel was a “born musician and must at once be educated.”\(^1\) Her studies with him included harmony, composition, and a survey of

musical repertory. Some of the compositions she studied were scores to Wagner’s operas, including The Flying Dutchman and Lohengrin. She recalled later, “I remember that Beethoven appealed to me more than Wagner or anyone else; nevertheless I was bitten by the operatic form of Art.”² Smyth also found much delight in studying Berlioz’s book on orchestration. Although her studies were going well, her father strongly disapproved of Ewing and eventually terminated the lessons.

Smyth’s desire to study in Leipzig was further stimulated after first hearing the music of Brahms. At a “Saturday Popular Concert” in London, Smyth heard a performance of Brahms’s Liebeslieder Walzer. She at once was intrigued and inspired by the compositional style of Brahms. As she recalled, “more important works of his were to kindle fresh fires later on, but his genius possessed me then and there in a flash.”³ After the performance, Smyth made an important decision. That night, during a discussion concerning her forthcoming presentation to London Society, she suddenly announced “that it was useless to present me at all, since I intended to go to Leipzig, even if I had to run away from home and starve when I got there.”⁴ Her father was adamantly opposed to this idea and so began a battle of wills between father and daughter. To achieve her goal, Smyth used a political tactic that would later prove useful in her pursuit of women’s rights. She made life so intolerable at home that her family had her leave for their own sake.⁵ She refused to participate in all social engagements, including parties, church and riding. She spoke to no one and spent most of her days in her bedroom with

²Ibid., 99.
³Ibid., 108.
⁴Ibid., 109.
⁵Ibid., 109.
the door locked. After she had successfully disgraced the family socially, her father grudgingly agreed to let her go to Leipzig.

In July of 1877, at the age of nineteen, Smyth began her studies at Leipzig. There she studied composition with Carl Reinecke, counterpoint and theory with Salomon Jadassohn, and piano with Joseph Maas. Yet after one year, Smyth's enthusiasm for the conservatory waned. She considered her lessons with Reinecke "rather a farce," and Maas a "conscientious, but dull teacher." Classes with Jadassohn were at least amusing, "but equally a farce."7

Even though her studies proved to be a disappointment, Smyth acquired many friends in Leipzig who were sympathetic towards her musical aspirations: Livia Frege, a celebrated concert singer; Lili Wach, daughter of Felix Mendelssohn; and Elisabeth (Lisl) von Herzogenberg, wife of the composer Heinrich von Herzogenberg. It was through Lisl that Smyth began lessons in compositions with Herr Herzogenberg. For the next five years, Smyth resided in the home of the Herzogenbergs and became acquainted with the foremost musicians of the day. The most notable of these was Brahms, who was a particular friend of Lisl's. During his visits to Leipzig, Brahms would stay with the Herzogenbergs and would often ask Lisl for criticism of his compositions.

Upon Smyth's arrival in Leipzig in 1877, she immediately began promoting her compositions. Her earliest compositions include two sets of German Lieder. Smyth had played the Songs for George Henschel, a singer she had met in London after the performance of the Liebeslieder Walzer. Impressed with Smyth's songs, Henschel played them for Brahms who reportedly believed Henschel had written them himself.8

---

8Ibid., 159.
Smyth then took the songs to the famous music publishing house, Breitkopf and Härtel. She described her experience in a letter to her mother dated April, 1878:

Well, he [Dr. Hase, the nephew who conducts the business] began by telling me that songs had as a rule a bad sale— but that no composeress had ever succeeded, barring Frau Schumann and Fräulein Mendelssohn, whose songs had been published together with those of their husband and brother respectively. . . . I played him mine, many of which he had already heard me perform in various Leipzig houses, and he expressed himself very willing to take the risk and print them. . . . Having listened to all he said about women composers... I asked for no fee! 9

Apparently Breitkopf and Härtel had second thoughts and did not publish them. The two sets were in fact published by C. F. Peters in 1886 as op. 3 and op. 4. Smyth wrote other vocal music early in her career, including a four-part song, We Watched Her Breathing Through the Night and Fünf Geistliche Lieder, 1880, a collection of five sacred partsongs based on chorale tunes.

Once Smyth had secured her position as a composer of songs, she then decided to focus her energy on instrumental and chamber music. She had composed many works during her apprenticeship, but only one was published: the String Quintet in E Major, op. 1, which was also published as an arrangement for piano duet (op. 1a). According to Kathleen Dale, although it is numbered op. 1, the quintet could have been written much later than her German Lieder, since it is dedicated “to the memory of Rhoda Garrette,” who did not die until 1882. 10 Performed on January 26, 1884, this quintet marked Smyth’s public debut as a composer of chamber music. 11

---

9 Ibid., 211-212.
During Smyth’s student days, 1877-1884, she wrote a number of string chamber pieces. Of the eight string quartets she began, only three were completed: those in D Minor, E-flat Major, and C Minor. In 1880 she wrote a Trio in D Minor and a Cello Sonata in C Minor. Smyth also wrote a number of works for keyboard. According to Edith Copley’s monograph, the completed piano works include:

- Sonata No. 1 in C
- Sonata No. 2 in C-sharp Minor
- Five Four-Part Dances
- Two-Part Invention in D
- Two-Part Suite in E
- Aus der Jugendzeit (study) in E Minor
- Variations on an Original Theme in D-flat (theme with eight variations)
- Prelude and Fugue in C
- Prelude and Fugue in F-sharp
- Prelude and Fugue for Thin People (dedicated to Clara Schumann)

Copley also lists Smyth’s organ compositions:

- Fugue à 5
- Study on “Wie selig seid Ihr Frommen”
- Five Short Chorale Preludes (later arr. in 1913 as Short and Solemn Interludes for Sectional Orchestra)

The struggle for acceptance as a “woman composer” continued to be a recurring theme. This is revealed in another of her early works, the Sonata in A Minor for Violin and Piano, op. 7 written in 1887. The Sonata received bad press after a concert in Leipzig, performed by Adolph Brodsky and Fanny Davies. The critics felt it was “deficient in the feminine charm that might have been expected of a woman composer.”13 Written that same year was her Sonata in A Minor for Cello and Piano, op. 5. Kathleen Dale states:

---

13Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 54.
Smyth’s inborn feeling for musical construction was not yet acute. Her compositions in sonata form make the impression that she had to force herself into following accepted traditions. The two sonatas are not free from structural uncertainty, but they atone for it by melodic and rhythmic expressiveness, by beautiful color-effects and interesting give-and-take between the soloists.\(^{14}\)

Although Smyth’s education was detailed in counterpoint, it lacked other important aspects of composition. This was pointed out by her friend Tchaikovsky who “deplored the indifference to instrumentation” taught in Leipzig. He urged her to study and focus on the orchestra. His advice was “What happens in ordinary conversation? If you [are listening to live people], listen to the inflections in the voice, there’s instrumentation for you!”\(^{15}\) From that moment on, Smyth went to concerts with the objective of studying orchestration. She filled notebooks of impressions and started two compositions for orchestra.\(^{16}\)

The completion of the first of these two orchestral works, Serenade in D, led to Smyth’s debut as a composer in England. Sir August Mann, conductor of the celebrated Crystal Palace Concerts, was already familiar with one of Smyth’s earlier string quartets. Impressed with the work, he asked Smyth to send him an orchestral piece in the hopes of performing it in the spring of 1890. The Serenade in four movements was thus performed April 26, 1890. Mann at once accepted another work, Overture to Antony and Cleopatra, which was performed six months later.\(^{17}\)

In the Autumn of 1891, Smyth became friends with Sir Alfred Trevelyn and his family. Among his three daughters, Ethel greatly admired Pauline and her devotion to the Catholic faith. Ethel was intrigued by the great traditions and ceremonies that were


\(^{15}\)Ethel Smyth, Impressions, 402.

\(^{16}\)Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 54.

\(^{17}\)Ibid., 63.
practiced in this religion. As she writes, “Oh what a Mass I will write some day! Agnus Dei qui tollis peccata mundi. What words! What words!”

Although the Mass in D was completed in the summer of 1891, securing a performance proved to be a difficult task. Smyth took the Mass to several choral music societies, but was rejected. Finally she took the Mass to Munich to consult with Hermann Levi about a performance in Germany. Even though he was unable to help, Levi was so impressed with her dramatic ability that he urged Smyth to “sit down at once and write an opera.” Thus, while still trying to obtain a performance of the Mass, Ethel began work on her first opera, Fantasio.

Through the intervention of her friend, the exiled Empress Eugene of France, Smyth was able to perform parts of her Mass for Queen Victoria. The success of this event led her to be recommended to Sir Joseph Barnby, conductor of the Royal Choral Society. The Mass was finally premiered January 18, 1893 at Royal Albert Hall. A review from the music critic of the Times, J. A. Fuller-Maitland, states:

This work definitely places the composer among the most eminent composers of her time, and easily at the head of all those of her own sex. The most striking thing about it is the entire absence of the qualities that are usually associated with feminine productions: throughout it is virile, masterly in construction and workmanship and particularly remarkable for the excellence and rich colour of the orchestration.

The famous critic Sir Donald Tovey included an analysis of the Mass in his Essays in Musical Analysis, written in 1937, alongside choral works by Bach, Beethoven, and Brahms. He refers to Smyth’s Mass as a “locus classicus of choral orchestration.”

---

18Ibid., 58.
19Ibid., 83.
20Ibid., 86.
21Donald Tovey, Essays in Musical Analysis, vol. 5 (London: Oxford University Press, 1938), 236.
Smyth continued work on her first opera, Fantasio. The libretto was by her very dear friend Henry Brewster, based on a comedy by Alfred de Musset. Even before the opera was completed, Hermann Levi urged her to enter the opera anonymously in an international competition in 1895. Out of the 110 works submitted, Fantasio placed seventh and was highly commended by the judges.22

Due to the fact that England had only one opera house, Covent Garden, obtaining a performance was quite difficult. Covent Garden, which had a short season during the summer months, was primarily devoted to well-known operatic works that included a star cast from abroad. To secure a first performance, Smyth instead approached the opera houses in Germany. Through her hard work and determination the opera was premiered at the Hoftheater in Weimar on May 20, 1898. The opera was not well received, but was praised for its rich orchestration. However three years later, Felix Mottl conducted a successful performance by the court opera in Karlsruhe.23 Unfortunately, Smyth was dissatisfied with her work: she felt there was discrepancy between the music and the libretto, far too much passion and violence for such a subject.24 Thus, in 1916, Smyth made a bonfire of most of her copies of Fantasio. She had learned from a famous gardener, “the ash of well-inked manuscript is even a better manure for flowers than soot.”25 She states that, “except for a few beautifully printed musical scores and the two volumes of full score, the rest of the material was ruthlessly put out of its pain: and to this

22Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 90.
25Ibid., 175
day, glancing at my solitary flower-bed, I sometimes think tenderly and gratefully of my operatic first-born.”

After the first performance of Fantasio, Smyth was already anxiously working on her next opera, Der Wald. This was a one-act opera based on a libretto she had written with Henry Brewster. The opera premiered April 21, 1902 at the Royal Opera in Berlin. Unfortunately after the first performance, there was an organized outburst of hissing and booing from the front row of the hall. Smyth’s frustrations in Berlin was compounded when the conductor, Karl Muck, decided to cut parts of the opera for the next performance. The following morning at the cut rehearsal Muck failed to show, and Smyth, who had never handled a baton before, was forced to conduct the orchestra. To her astonishment the orchestra was very receptive. At the end of the rehearsal they called out, “We all think your opera is simply magnificent.” This feeling was shared by the audiences who responded enthusiastically to the remaining performances in Berlin. On July 18, 1902 the opera was performed at Covent Garden. Henry Wood, founder and promoter of the Promenade Concerts, commented that, “It was indeed an event of importance for a British composer to get an opera performed both in Berlin and England... and a woman at that!” On March 11, 1903, Smyth received more recognition when Der Wald made history as the first opera by a woman to be performed at the Metropolitan Opera House in New York. Smyth had an ovation that lasted ten minutes and she was almost buried in flowers. A reviewer of the New York Times wrote, “Miss Smyth is very serious, and the opera sounds the note of sincerity and

---

26 Ibid., 175.
27 Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 97.
resolute endeavor. She uses the vocal and orchestral resources with masculine energy, and is not afraid of employing the most drastic means of modern expression."  

Smyth’s third opera and perhaps best known is The Wreckers. Different from her first two operas that expressed German symbolic art, this opera brought forth her British origins with the evocation of the sea and characterization of an isolated sea town. Smyth again collaborated with her friend Brewster on the libretto. There was a rumor in London that André Messager of the Opera Comique would be the new director at Covent Garden. In hopes of securing a performance, Smyth wrote the libretto in French as Les Naufrageurs. Ironically the French version was never performed. 

In September of 1904 Smyth traveled throughout Europe to promote her opera, as she had done with other works before. She finally secured performances in Leipzig and Prague. Unfortunately the performances were of low quality. Smyth then tried Vienna and Munich. Gustav Mahler, who was in charge of the Vienna Opera, left his second in command, Bruno Walter, to listen to the opera. In his autobiography, Theme and Variations, Walter describes their first meeting:

I sighed inwardly at what I presumed was in store for me, but she had hardly played ten minutes, singing the vocal parts in an unattractive voice, when I made her stop, rushed over to Mahler’s office and implored him to come back with me; the Englishwoman was a true composer. Mahler was unfortunately unable to spare the time, so I had to go back alone. We spent the whole morning on her opera, and when we parted I was wholly captivated by her work and her personality.

---

Circumstances prevented him from performing the complete work in Vienna or Munich, but he was able to perform the second act at a number of concerts. In 1910 he conducted the opera in its entirety in London. Walter remained a loyal friend and admirer of her music.

Smyth was determined to procure a performance of the opera in London. In 1908, she made a bold decision to perform the first two acts of *The Wreckers* at the Queen’s Hall. The concert came off remarkably well and its orchestration and choral writing were praised by critics. Yet all of this meant nothing to Smyth since her very dear friend Henry Brewster died of cancer shortly after the performance.32

Despite the sadness of losing her friend, the success of the concert led to an important performance of the opera. Smyth’s friend Mary Dodge, an American millionaire who had settled in England, suggested that the opera be performed at a West End Theater with Thomas Beecham conducting. This was the very opportunity Beecham had been looking for to introduce himself to London as an opera conductor. The production took place June 22, 1909 at His Majesty’s Theater. Beecham included the opera a year later in his debut season at Covent Garden. He called *The Wreckers* “one of the three or four English operas of real musical merit and vitality.”33

Although Smyth was busy composing and trying to produce her operas during this period, she still found time to write chamber music. Her *Four Songs* for mezzo-soprano and chamber orchestra were composed in 1907. The first three songs “Odeletta,” “La Danse,” and “Chrysilla” are based on poems by Henri de Regnier. The last of the *Four Songs*, “Ode Anacreontique” is based on the poetry of Leconte de Lisle. The

accompaniment is arranged for flute, harp, string trio, and percussion. At the time Smyth was exploring new possibilities for harp. She remarks, “thanks to recent mechanical contrivances the harpist’s activities were no longer limited to the seasick arpeggios on the tonic and the dominant... it is now possible to play F natural and sharp at the same time.” In a chamber music concert in Paris in 1908, the French critic wrote rave reviews of the Songs and her String Quartet in E Minor. He states, “the revelation of a real musical personality of the English race, is all the more remarkable, in that up to now, the compatriots of Purcell have shown nothing but eminent gifts of assimilation.” A performance of the Songs was given at the home of Sir Edgar and Lady Speyer in honor of Debussy. Debussy warmly congratulated Smyth, saying that her Songs were “tout à fait remarquables.”

Another work composed during this period is Hey Nonny No for chorus and orchestra. The work was performed on October 26, 1910 with the London Choral Society and Symphony Orchestra conducted by Arthur Fagge. The following year on April 1, 1911 Smyth conducted this work with the Crystal Palace Choir and London Symphony Orchestra at the Queen’s Hall. After a performance of Hey Nonny No in Vienna (1911) it was praised by all the leading Viennese critics. A critic of the Neue Freie Presse wrote, “In its vastness, its overwhelming strength, this amazing work sums up all the intoxication of life, all the contemptuous braving of death characteristic of the Elizabethan epoch.” Percy Grainger referred to the composition as “... one of the

---

34Ethel Smyth, What Happened Next, 278.
35Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 111-112.
36Ibid., 112.
38Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 111.
most attractive things I have ever heard, original, moving and full of subtle grace and power.\textsuperscript{39} Gustav Holst asks, "Why, oh why can't my choir sing well enough to do it! You really have made it a bit stiff! If it wasn't so jolly, I wouldn't mind. But the annoying part is that it is such good fun."\textsuperscript{40}

By 1910 Smyth's struggle for musical recognition was finally achieved. She was admired by the press and the public for her operatic and orchestral works. She was awarded an honorary doctorate by the University of Durham. Smyth had worked hard to free herself from the social norms. Indeed, over the years, the difficulties of working in the male-dominated field of composition had persuaded her to adopt feminist ideals.\textsuperscript{41} It was during this time in her life, the height of her career, that Smyth was drawn into the women's suffrage movement. At first she was reluctant about joining: "as a composer I wanted to keep out of it. It seemed to me incompatible with artistic creation." The Women's Social and Political Union, or W.S.P.U., was formed in 1903 under the leadership of Emmeline Pankhurst. Smyth finally joined in 1910 and decided to abandon her musical activities and devote two years to the suffrage cause.\textsuperscript{42}

Smyth lent her skills as a composer to the suffrage movement. Her most important composition was the "March of the Women," the third song from the collection \textit{Three Songs of Sunrise}. The other two are "Lagged Dawn" and "1910," all of which were dedicated to the W.S.P.U. members. The march is derived from an Italian song she had heard in Abruzzi, with new words written by Cicely Hamilton. The members sang

\footnotesize

\textsuperscript{39} Ibid., 153.
\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 152.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 204-205.
the song in the streets, at meetings, at rallies and even in prison. Smyth also conducted these songs plus extracts from other works in a concert for the suffragettes in 1911.

In a speech Beecham made commemorating the centenary of the birth of Ethel Smyth he spoke of her time with the suffrage movement:

She threw herself with the same excitement, vigor and industry as she did into all things of an artistic nature. She led processions, she made speeches, she thumped many tubs here and there, and finally distinguished herself by throwing bricks through the dining-room and drawing-room windows of Cabinet Ministers. . . . She was arrested, tried, convicted and sent to Holloway prison to reflect and, if possible, repent. Well, she neither reflected nor repented. She pursued a joyously rowdy line of activity. Accompanying her were about a dozen other Suffragettes, for whom Ethel wrote a stirring march, ‘Song of Freedom’, and on one occasion I went to see her. Well, as a matter of fact I went to see her several times. But on this particular occasion when I arrived, the warden of the prison, who was a very amiable fellow, was bubbling with laughter. He said, 'Come into the quadrangle’. There were the ladies, a dozen ladies, marching up and down, singing hard. He pointed up to a window where Ethel appeared; she was leaning out, conducting with a toothbrush, also with immense vigor, and joining in the chorus of her own song.4

During Smyth’s suffrage years, she completed several collections of songs. One collection was Three Songs (“The Clown,” “Possession,” and “On the Road”), written for mezzo-soprano or baritone with optional orchestral setting. They were first performed by Herbert Heyner and the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Arthur Nikisch in the Queen’s Hall on June 23, 1913.4 In her song “On the Road,” a marching song, Smyth uses a recycling process that she referred to as “recooking.” Fragments of the “March of the Women” are inserted in the composition so that a fellow suffragists could immediately “recognize and greet with appropriate hilarity, mockery, or delight.”46

---

46Ibid., 625.
Another song cycle completed in 1913 is *Three Moods of the Sea* for mezzo-soprano or baritone and orchestra.

After her two years devoted to the suffrage movement, Smyth’s dedication to opera was renewed. Her energy was now focused on her fourth opera, *The Boatswain’s Mate*, with libretto based on a play by W.W. Jacobs. This two-act comic opera is probably Smyth’s most popular work. Inspired by the suffrage movement, Smyth incorporated her “recooking” technique by inserting both the “March of Women” and “1910” in the overture. The two compositions are used as first and second subjects, appearing nowhere else in the opera.47 The first act is written in the spoken dialogue form of a British ballad opera. The second act is sung throughout and resembles that of a heroic romantic opera. Although these contrasting styles may seem shocking, as Martha Mockus put it, “If one perceives the opera as a symbol of the contrast between convention and reality, or traditional and rebellion (or even the male view and the female view) then the change in musical style (from traditional ballad-opera to unconventional music-drama) is completely appropriate.”48 The opera was first performed at the Shaftesbury Theatre, January 28, 1916, by the Beecham opera company.

The following years proved to be very difficult for Smyth. In 1913, she started noticing a ringing sound in her ear. She consulted with specialists in England and throughout Europe, but none could help stop the actual sound nor the deterioration it eventually caused to her hearing. Another difficulty was the out-break of World War I, which caused contracts for productions of her operas in Germany, which she worked so hard to achieve, to be canceled.

47Ibid., 628.
It was during this period in Smyth's life that she withdrew from composing. From 1915-1918, Smyth was a radiographer in a large hospital near Vichy, France. The horrors that she witnessed made it difficult for her to concentrate on her compositions. She instead found comfort in writing prose. Her first book was *Impressions That Remained*, which was published in 1919. The book focuses on recollections of her childhood up to the time of her mother's death when Smyth was thirty years of age. *The Times Literary Supplements* gave it a rave review, calling it, "one of the most remarkable books of memoirs that has appeared in recent times." Nine more books of "recollections" were written during the course of her life.

In 1919, Smyth returned to the concert stage with full vigor, both as a composer and a conductor. Henry Wood had advised Smyth to conduct her own compositions whenever possible in order to help promote herself as a serious composer. Smyth took his advice as she had done with everything in life, with great "gusto". Wood recalls in his autobiography *My Life of Music* a situation in which Smyth conducted her own work at a Promenade Concert at the Queen's Hall:

She went up to my rostrum, took up my baton and surveyed its length critically. Deciding that it was more than she could manage, she calmly snapped it in two, threw away one half and conducted with the other.49

At the age of sixty-five, Smyth was motivated to write two more operas. Smyth's fifth opera, *Fête galant*, premiered in 1923 at the Birmingham Repertory Theater. This one-act opera is based on a short story by her good friend, Maurice Baring. At the time neoclassicism was becoming popular especially through the works of Igor Stravinsky. Smyth experimented with this style by adding such features as baroque dances and an a

---

a cappella madrigal set to a poem by John Donne. However, this was only an “isolated experiment” and was not repeated in later works.50

Her final opera was Entente Cordiale, a one-act comedy that deals with the language difficulties of the British soldiers in a northern French town.51 The opera was first performed at the Royal College of Music on July 25, 1925 and later produced on October 20, 1926 in Bristol. Maurice Baring wrote after the first performance: “I think it contains some of the most delicate and charming orchestral passages you have ever written, apart from the enchanting tunes.”52

The Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra was one of Smyth’s last works, written at the peak of her fame as a composer. The Concerto was first performed March 5, 1927, at a Henry Wood concert in the Queens Hall, London with the renowned Aubrey Brain, horn, and Jelly d’Aranyi, violin. The critic from Musical Opinion states: “Miss Smyth’s determination not to write ‘young lady’s music’ gives her a certain vigor; and some of her work is really remarkable.”53 The Concerto was again performed on December 19, 1928 with the Berlin Philharmonic Orchestra in a concert of Ethel Smyth’s works. The conducting was shared between Smyth and Walter. Aubrey Brain was joined by violinist Marjorie Haywood. This performance helped further enhance Brain’s career, for he was the first British horn-player to perform a solo concerto abroad.54 In the third movement of the Concerto, Smyth writes horn chords, also known as multiphonics, in the cadenza. The only documentation of horn chords in a method book prior to the

51Ibid., 317.
52Christopher St John, Ethel Smyth: A Biography, 190.
twentieth century was J. R. Lewy's studies no. 2 and no. 4, found in *Douze etudes pour le cor chromatique et le cor simple, avec accompagnement de piano* (c. 1850). One of the earliest composers who actually wrote horn chords was Carl Maria von Weber in his *Concertino* (1815). Although earlier performers used this technique freely in their own playing, composers rarely wrote horn chords in their compositions. It was not until the mid-twentieth century that chords were commonly notated in compositions. However, as early as 1926, Smyth included horn chords in the cadenza of the third movement of her Double Concerto. In many ways she could be considered a pioneer of this reintroduced technique. Two noteworthy articles about horn chords appeared in the *Musical Times* in September of 1925 and February of 1926, a year prior to the completion of Smyth's Double Concerto. Both articles focus on the acoustical problems of the horn chords. It is possible that Smyth was influenced by these articles. The harmonic ratios found in the Smyth Concerto are the same ratios used to demonstrate the acoustics of horn chords found in Percival R. Kirby's article in *The Musical Times* (1925). Another piece Smyth wrote during this time was *Variations on Bonny Sweet Robin* for flute, oboe, and piano, written in 1927.

Smyth's compositions became fewer, due to her increasing deafness. Her last major composition was *The Prison*, performed in 1931 at the Queen's Hall. The work is scored for soprano and bass soloists, chorus, and orchestra. It is based on a philosophical work by Henry Brewster and composed in his memory.

---

After this point, Smyth composed only two more works: a fanfare entitled *Hot Potatoes*, for brass and percussion for the Musicians Benevolent Fund (1930) and *Prelude on a Traditional Irish Air* for organ (1938). This work was dedicated to her dear friend and novelist, Edith Somerville.\(^5\)\(^7\)

Ethel Smyth was a courageous woman who succeeded in a male-dominated field. During her earlier days in Leipzig, Smyth had a naive view about why there were not more women composers. She had believed, ". . . women have married, and then, very properly, made their husband and children the first consideration."\(^5\)\(^8\) She thus began her career assuming everything would be fine if she simply decided to devote enough time to the profession of music. She soon realized the difficulties were more profound: many people were unwilling to take her seriously as a composer because she was a woman. Seeing her career in a new light, she still persisted. Eventually this battle for recognition led her to campaign for the rights of women in the suffrage movement.

Throughout her career, Smyth desperately sought approval as a composer from her homeland, England. Her compositions included a variety of different genres, yet Smyth went to great lengths to promote her operas. She felt that if she succeeded as an opera composer in a foreign country, her native land would finally accept her. In time, her country did acknowledge her work, both as a composer and as a suffrage leader. In 1922, she was awarded the title Dame of the British Empire. She also received an honorary doctorate from Oxford University in 1926. Smyth’s outspoken personality gave her the distinction she deserved, but most importantly, gave other women the courage to pursue their goals.

Smyth’s Concerto for Violin and Horn, written in 1926, reflects many stylistic traits typical of post-Romantic music. The forms and instrumentation used in this Concerto are considered standard for the late Romantic period; however, Smyth varies the approach to these traditional elements. The forms of the movements are as follows: first movement, sonata; second movement, ternary; and third movement, sonata. Despite the use of standard form types, identifying the sections within each movement is difficult due to the ambiguous definition of key areas and sections. Although the instrumentation is typical of nineteenth-century orchestral music, Smyth adds a part for xylophone in the percussion section; which is found in some nineteenth century orchestras, but is not standard in the symphonic repertory. The analysis given here represents an attempt to understand Smyth’s compositional style, and its departure from traditional practices.1

First Movement

The standard form of the first movement of a concerto derives from the classical period, and assimilates the structure of the sonata form with elements drawn from Baroque concerto practice. The concerto-sonata form includes a double exposition, as opposed to the repeated exposition of standard sonata form. In the classical concerto, the solo and tutti parts alternate and, along with the tonal structure, define the sections of the sonata.2 This form is illustrated in the graph below:

Tutti Exposition Solo Exposition Development Recapitulation (tutti / solo) Coda
Theme 1 / Theme 2 Theme 1 / Theme 2 (retr.) Theme 1 / Theme 2

1Readers will benefit with the aid of an orchestral or piano reduction score.
Like so many composers of the post-Romantic period, Smyth found creative ways of expressing her music within the boundaries of the classical sonata model. Traditionally, the orchestra first states the themes, followed by a soloist either restating the themes or presenting new ones. Smyth's Concerto features a single exposition in which the orchestra and soloists share the statement of thematic material (see form chart below). The exposition of the first movement consists of two groups; within the first group are two themes, labeled 1a and 1b. Theme 1a is introduced by the full orchestra; the lyrical theme 1b is expressed by the soloists. When the themes are reintroduced in the recapitulation, they both feature the soloists. Theme 1a is now stated by the solo violin: the horn and orchestra provide accompanying roles. This creates the same intensity as the opening exposition, but with a different tonal color and texture.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure number</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - 21</td>
<td>Theme 1a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 - 62</td>
<td>Theme 1b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63 - 73</td>
<td>transition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74 - 104</td>
<td>Theme 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105 - 107</td>
<td>transition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure number</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>108 - 136</td>
<td>retransition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>137 - 147</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recapitulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure number</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>148 - 168</td>
<td>Theme 1a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169 - 179</td>
<td>Theme 1b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>180 - 190</td>
<td>transition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>191 - 221</td>
<td>Theme 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>222 - 229</td>
<td>transition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Coda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure number</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>230 - 247</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The transition into the second group alludes to the thematic material of theme 2. This compositional device is occasionally found in the works of Brahms. In the beginning of the transition, Smyth continues the lyrical character of theme 1b. However,
the articulation changes and becomes more detached with the entrance of the solo horn in m. 66. In m. 69 the horn and orchestra enter with a motive that forms the basis of theme 2.

In attempting to determine where the development begins, one is presented with an example of the ambiguity that is characteristic of Smyth’s compositional style. Since a chromatic progression leads with a crescendo to the cadence in m. 95, it could be argued that the exposition closes here. The materials in m. 96 and m. 105 are those of theme 2; however, it is difficult to discern whether this is part of group two or part of the development. The development could begin in m. 101 or 105, indicated by the arrival of the minor dominant, e. Yet another possibility would be m. 108: the material in the recapitulation is identical to that in the exposition up to that point; therefore, it is possible to argue that the development begins here. To further support this argument, theme 1b is restated in m. 108, but in a new key. The restatement of the opening theme at the opening of the development is typical of earlier composers, such as Mozart, Beethoven, and Brahms.

Theme 1b is the source for important motivic material in the development as well as in the closing section. In the development, the theme is used in an ascending sequence starting on F-sharp₄ and leading to G₆. The horn first has this theme in m. 108, beginning on an F-sharp₄. Smyth alters the first interval of this motive from a perfect fourth to a tritone. Continuing this rising progression, the horn repeats theme 1b on D₅ in m. 116 (continued in the orchestra in m. 118), imitating the violin’s statement of the opening motive in m. 114, beginning on D₆. To intensify this sequence, the violin plays the motive in octaves on E₅ and E₆ in m. 121. In m. 125, the climax of this sequential passage is reached by the violin in octaves on G₆. As in the beginning of this sequence,
the first two intervals of the statement in the solo violin form a tritone. The actual arrival of the dominant does not occur until m. 147, the measure before the arrival of the recapitulation.

In the coda, only the opening bars of theme 1b are employed. This motive is used as sequential material that progresses from G₄ (m. 230) to A-flat₄ (m. 232) to B₆ (m. 237) and finally to the tonic key of A major in the solo violin in m. 241. A constant ritardando occurs beginning in the transition to the coda. By playing more sustained notes at a softer dynamic level, the texture of the orchestra becomes more subdued. The harp and the string tremolos add to the atmospheric effects, and the movement ends pianissimo in A major.

Early into the Concerto, Smyth already alters the traditional nineteenth-century form. She avoids the double exposition and writes two themes within the first group. As a result of this compositional device, there is a single exposition in which the orchestra states theme 1a and the soloists are presented early with theme 1b. Smyth also blurs the tonal centers that help delineate the sections of the sonata form. The second theme is stated in E minor; however, tonality is difficult to discern throughout this section. This ambiguity continues and causes difficulty in determining where the development actually begins. The only arrival on the minor dominant is found in m. 101. Characteristic of the compositional style of Smyth, the tonality is briefly stated and quickly shifts to uncertain key areas. Since the key areas are unstable, questions arise as to other possibilities of where the development could begin. The only tonal area in the movement that is stable for any duration is the tonic key of A major. Even within theme 1b, though, the tonality shifts away from A major, but it returns, through a progression of thirds found in the solo violin bridge (mm. 42-47).
Second Movement

The title of the second movement, *Elegy (In Memoriam)*, raises questions as to whose memory this movement is dedicated. Although Smyth wrote ten books, little comment about her orchestral music can be found in these collections. Thus we can only speculate as to the object of this dedication, but there are several clues that suggest that it might be Johannes Brahms. Brahms was one of Smyth’s greatest musical inspirations. Her admiration for his music only continued to grow as she developed her own musical talents. The Concerto was first performed in 1927, thirty years after the death of Brahms. The instrumentation is strikingly reminiscent of that of the Brahms Horn Trio. Further reference to Brahms is hinted at in the second theme of the second movement. Though in a different key, it resembles the opening bars of Brahms’s Piano Concerto No. 2 in B-flat as shown in Example 2.1.

\[\text{Horn in Bb basso}\]

\[\text{mp}\]

Brahms’s Concerto I: mm.1-2\(^3\)

Example 2.1 (ex. con’d.)

\(^3\)Copyright © 1981 (renewed) by Dover Publications, Inc. Reprinted by permission of Dover Publication.
The theme in the Brahms Concerto is first presented by the horn, as is that of Smyth’s. A parallel in the structure of the line also exists: quarter notes ascending by step, followed by descending triplets. The harmonic structure also resembles that of the Brahms Concerto.

An excerpt from Smyth’s book *The Final Burning of Boats*, 1928, in which she reflects on visits made to Germany in the summers of 1922 and 1924, suggests another possible subject of the “In Memoriam” inscription. She comments, “The greatest tragedy of the war [World War I] is the destruction of a musical civilization... German opera cannot afford to pay for first-class artists nor maintain the tradition of perfection, including limitless rehearsals, which giants of the past, von Bülow, Levi, Richter, and Mottl, established, and which men like Schuch, Mahler, and Walter carried on.” She was also distressed at the loss of her friends, especially Adolf and Lili Wach and Heinrich and Lisl von Herzogenberg, who were her closest companions while she lived in Leipzig. Smyth deeply admired the love and conviction for music that was instilled in the souls of the German people. This suggests that this movement is perhaps not solely dedicated to Brahms, but rather to an era of musical tradition that Brahms exemplified. This era is further suggested by an enharmonically spelled “Tristan chord” found in m. 15: the pitch

---

4 Copyright © 1928 (renewed) by J. Curwen and Sons Ltd. International Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved. Reprinted by permission of G. Schirmer, Inc.

level is identical to that of the opening of Tristan und Isolde. In her memoirs, Smyth mentioned more than once that Tristan was her favorite Wagner opera.⁶

Due to the ambiguity of the tonal areas, the form of the second movement is difficult to determine. Sections of this movement are defined, however, by prominent dominant-tonic cadences that delineate a ternary form leading from D minor to C major and the return of D minor.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure number</th>
<th>Key Areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>m. 1-21</td>
<td>D minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m. 22-38</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m. 39-59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m. 60-65</td>
<td>D minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m. 66-71</td>
<td>D minor / D major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Continuity in this movement is created by the recurrence of two themes. Smyth presents the theme 1 in both the horn and violin and uses the theme in a chromatic progression moving downward by half steps to the key center of the theme 2: the solo horn first has this theme in D minor; it is then played by the solo violin in C-sharp minor at m. 12, eventually leading to the arrival of C major and the theme 2 in m. 22. A pedal point on C stabilizes the tonality within the B section. The return to the A section is alluded to by motives of theme 1 played by the solo violin and orchestra; however, the tonality of D minor is not re-established until m. 60. The late and highly condensed reprise of the A section is unusual for a standard ternary form. As is common in post-Romantic works, the reprise of the A section is also different in texture compared to the opening A section. The final A section in this movement is highly decorated in the solo violin part as well as in the orchestral accompaniment.

⁶Ibid., 117.
In this movement, Smyth introduces a recurring motive that acts as a transitional figure. First occurring in mm. 7-8, this motive moves in contrary motion by half step in the horn and basses, and is accompanied by a triplet note figure in the orchestra (see Example 2.2).

Characteristic for Smyth, this motive is altered each time it is presented. In m. 7, the motive acts as a transition to the second statement of theme 1 in the A section. The first two times it is played, it is written as a four-note whole-tone chord to a major six-four. This motive recurs as a transition from the A section to the B section in m. 17. However, the actual chords differ with each occurrence; in m. 18 the goal is a minor six-

---

Footnote: Copyright © 1928 (renewed) by J. Curwen and Sons Ltd. International Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved. Reprinted by permission of G. Schirmer, Inc.
four. In m. 39, the motive appears as a false reprise of the A section. Since the key area of D minor has not been established, this motive is instead transitional, leading to a partial statement of the A theme.

The A theme, first presented by the horn, plays an important role in shaping and unifying this movement. Only in the opening and closing measures of section A is this theme completely stated and in the key of D minor. However, its motivic content recurs throughout the movement. Even in the coda, the violin, which is the most expressive line, plays the triplet motive found in this theme.

**Third Movement**

The driving force behind the Finale is the predominance of triplet figures or hunting calls. Smyth had a great passion for sports, especially for the hunt. Regarding a hunting experience in France, she wrote, "I was entranced by the exquisite calls on the big curly French horns carried by the master and the hunt servants." Much of the continuity of this movement is derived from its rhythmic components; these, along with the complex but distinct tonal design, help to outline a sonata form. Within the exposition there are two groups. The first group is defined by the triplet rhythm found in hunting-calls. The second group is distinguished by characteristic duple rhythms.

---

The first twenty measures introduce several motives that feature "hunting-call" rhythms; these motives recur throughout this movement. The movement’s principal theme, introduced in m. 21, actually enters in D, and does not appear in the tonic key until m. 45.

The second group also features a peculiar rhythmic pattern. In m. 83, the meter changes to 9/8 and it is difficult to know how to treat the pulse. There are two possibilities: either the dotted quarter equals the quarter of the previous 2/4 bar, thus maintaining the same pulse, or the eighth note of the 9/8 bar equals the eighth note of the previous 2/4 bar. In the orchestral score, no direction is given to indicate how this section is to be played. In the piano reduction the latter of the two alternatives is specifically indicated. Some uncertainty remains, since an editor could have been responsible for this direction; however Smyth produced the reduction, and it is copyrighted in her name.

Smyth’s treatment of tonal structure is irregular, particularly in the exposition. Not only does the first group enter in the subdominant, as stated above, but the second group—in C-sharp, the mediant, rather than the dominant—enters on its dominant, G-
sharp. In the recapitulation, this material enters on E (m. 222), so that it will eventually arrive clearly in the tonic.

The cadenza and coda include the hunting motives of the introduction and materials from both the first and the second groups. Yet in each section Smyth changes the harmonies or intervals or varies the rhythms. In the cadenza, Smyth stresses the intervals of a perfect fourth, tritone, and sixth, found in both the accompanying and motivic material of the first group. The gradual entrance of the orchestral instruments beginning in m. 386, along with the frequent changes in tempo, give the effect of a gradual transition from the cadenza to the coda.

Smyth uses many inventive techniques in the third movement. She presents a series of hunting calls to form the introduction and first group. The traditional calls of the hunting horn are limited to the pitches found in the overtone series. However, Smyth emphasizes tritones and whole-tone passages. Other inventive techniques include the metric distinction between the two groups and the unusual rhythmic ambiguity of the 9/8 bars. Still another inventive technique is the use of multiphonics in the cadenza; this will be discussed in Chapter 3.

Throughout the Concerto, it is often difficult to discern tonal centers; however, the overall tonal structure of the Concerto displays a careful strategy. The first movement begins majestically in A major; it ends in A major as expected, but the mood is more somber, preparing for the character of the second movement. The second movement in D minor, ends on a D major triad. In the third movement, the principal theme is stated first in D and only then in the main key of A. The Concerto has thus completed the perfect-fourth motion from A to D and back to A. The interval of a perfect fourth is also found as
an important motivic element, for example in theme 1b of the first movement and in the hunting calls of the third movement.

A further characteristic technique found in each movement is the altered reprise. In the first movement, Smyth varies the instrumentation of theme 1a, giving it to the orchestra in the exposition and the solo violin in the recapitulation. The second movement presents a late, condensed reprise of the A section that is highly decorated by the violin and orchestra. In the final movement, the motives are presented in a different order and the tonal structure of the recapitulation differs from that of the exposition.

In her Double Concerto, Smyth uses forms, tonal language, and instrumentation that are common to the post-Romantic period. These characteristics reflect the Germanic influences of her education. Still, Smyth found ways to alter the traditional elements. She blurs formal outlines and stretches the boundaries of tonalities. Smyth is inventive in her use of multiphonics and also in composing a series of hunting calls. It is this tension between tradition and innovation that makes this music so interesting and challenging.
CHAPTER 3: A TEACHING GUIDE FOR THE HORNIST

The final chapter of this monograph focuses on resolving three main problems in preparing the hornist to perform the Smyth Concerto. The first problem is that of "horn chords," a type of multiphonics. This extended technique for horn is difficult to perfect. In this chapter, scientific data and exercises will be given to help improve the hornist's ability to play chords on the horn. The second main challenge for the performer in the Smyth Concerto is the balance of sound between the horn and violin. To help attain this balance, a suggested arrangement for seating will be given and the concept of horn sound will be discussed. The third main problem is the interpretation of the term con sordino in the second and third movement: the changes from open to mute are quick, and at times it is impossible to insert a mute within the short time span. Another possibility will be suggested, along with evidence supporting this conclusion.

Horn Chords

The use of horn chords, also known as multiphonics, is a phenomenon that has challenged performers for several centuries. In general, the term multiphonics refers to any technique of producing more than one note simultaneously. There are two main ways to achieve this goal on the horn. The first is what Douglas Hill refers to as "half-valved harmonics," which are multiphonics produced by fingerings.\(^1\) The second is often called "horn chords," which are produced by vocalizing while buzzing. The latter type is the one used in Smyth's Concerto, as we can see from this review of the first performance:

The soloists (Jelly d'Aranyi and Aubrey Brain) did ample justice to the work, the latter having difficult nuts to crack in the last movement . . . . Where the horn has

to produce a succession of pianissimo chords and low notes, which is seldom heard in the concert hall.²

In the London circle of musicians, Aubrey Brain was known for his skill in producing horn chords.³

Acoustically, horn chords are a scientific peculiarity as well as an interesting aural effect. When a player produces one tone in the usual fashion, overtones are present in varying degrees and strengths, but rarely audible to the audience. However, when a player plays one note and sings another, according to Percival R. Kirby's theory on horn chords, two additional pitches become quite audible, resulting in the creation of a four-part chord. These other two pitches are referred to as the difference tone and the summational or sum tone: together they are known as combination tones (or resultant tones). The pitches played and sung are called the generators. When the generators are perfectly in tune, the combination tones will sound pitches found in the harmonic series.⁴

The discovery of combination tones occurred long before the twentieth century. Difference tones were apparently first observed by the famous Italian violinist, Guiseppe Tartini in 1714. His findings are summarized in his Trattato di musica secondo la vera scienza dell'armonia (Padua, 1754); the difference tone is thus sometimes referred to as Tartini's tone or "terzo suono."⁵ Summation tones were detected in the middle of the

---


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
nineteenth century by Hermann L. F. von Helmholtz who discussed them first in 1856.\(^6\) He applied his theories to a peculiar instrument referred to as the siren. It was constructed to determine the vibrational frequency of the tones produced.\(^7\)

To aid the reader in understanding how this works in the Smyth Concerto, a chart illustrating the concert B-flat harmonic series is provided, notated for horn in F. The lowest note on this staff is the fundamental note of the series. It is represented by the number 1. The remaining notes of the series are the overtones, or upper harmonics, represented by the numbers 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, etc. These numbers indicate actual frequency ratios to the fundamental. The total number of harmonics is infinite (see Example 3.1).

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccc}
1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 & 7 & 8 & 9 & 10 & 11 & 12
\end{array}
\]

Example 3.1
(B-flat Harmonic Series Notated for F Horn)

Difference tones get their name from the fact that the pitch generated (\(f_{ct}\), i.e. the first combination tone) represents the mathematical difference between the frequency of the upper generator (\(f_2\)) and that of the lower generator (\(f_1\)): \(f_2 - f_1 = f_{ct}\). In the above chart, for example, the upper generator [A] (harmonic 5, or h5) sounded with the lower

---


\(^{7}\) Ibid., 11.
generator [C] (harmonic 3. or h3) would yield a difference tone of [F] (harmonic 2. or h2): h5 - h3 = h2. Together the three tones produce a [F] major chord. The sum tone, following Kirby, is accordingly the sum of the frequency of the two generators: h5 + h3 = h8.

Of the two combination tones, the difference tone is much more audible than the sum tone, a fact on which all the major writers agree (Tartini, Kirby, Hindemith, and Roederer). This fact is reflected in the way Smyth notates these chords, since she has only given three pitches (see Example 3.2).

Smyth's Concerto III: mm. 360-383
Example 3.2
(The Horn Chords Found in Smyth's Concerto)
One of the main problems with performing the horn chords in Smyth’s Double Concerto is that the composer has not specified which of these notes are to be played, which sung, and which produced as a result. In the two currently available recordings--those by Franz Draxinger and Richard Watkins--each performer produces the chord somewhat differently (see Table 3.1).

Table 3.1
Recent Interpretations of Smyth’s Horn Chords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Harmonic 5 (h5)</th>
<th>Franz Draxinger</th>
<th>Richard Watkins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harmonics (hS)</td>
<td>sing (f2)</td>
<td>sing (f2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic 3 (h3)</td>
<td>play (f1)</td>
<td>difference tone (f_cl)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic 2 (h2)</td>
<td>difference tone (f_cl)</td>
<td>play (f1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Draxinger sings harmonic 5 and plays harmonic 3; the difference tone is thus harmonic 2. Watkins also sings harmonic 5, but plays harmonic 2: the difference tone is then harmonic 3. Both of these realizations produce the three pitches specified by Smyth: the problem is that they produce different sum tones, according to Kirby’s theory: Draxinger’s version yields harmonic 8, which is a member of the triad Smyth has notated, but Watkin’s version yields harmonic 7, which is outside the triad.

Much controversy exists over whether or not sum tones are actually heard. In Paul Hindemith’s The Craft of Musical Composition and Juan G. Roederer’s The Physics and Psychophysics of Music both authors disagree with Kirby’s theory that sum tones exist. Hindemith and Roederer focus on difference tones as being the predominating type combination tones, leaving out the mention of sum tones. Both agree with Kirby that the first difference tone or combination tone no. 1 (f_cl) can be calculated by subtracting the
upper generator from the lower generator. However, Hindemith believes that the second combination tone \( f_{c2} \) is derived by subtracting the lower generator \( f_1 \) from the first combination tone \( f_{c1} \). Roederer, whose research is based on the work of the acoustician Reinier Plomp, believes that this second combination tone \( f_{c2} \) is derived by subtracting the upper generator \( f_2 \) from the octave harmonic of the lower generator \( 2f_1 \). Table 3.2 applies both Hindemith’s and Roederer’s concepts concerning second combination tones to the horn chords played by both Draxinger and Watkins.

Table 3.2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Combination Tone #2 Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( f_1 = ) lower generator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( f_2 = ) upper generator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( f_{c1} = ) combination tone #1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( f_{c2} = ) combination tone #2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( 2f_1 = ) octave harmonic of lower generator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( h = ) harmonic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Draxinger</th>
<th>Watkins</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hindemith</td>
<td>( f_{c2} = h_2 - h_3 = -1 )</td>
<td>( f_{c2} = h_3 - h_2 = h_1 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( f_{c2} = f_{c1} - f_1 )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roederer</td>
<td>( f_{c2} = h_6 - h_5 = h_1 )</td>
<td>( f_{c2} = h_4 - h_5 = -1 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( f_{c2} = 2f_1 - f_2 )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Hindemith’s theory, the second combination tone is inaudible when played by Draxinger, and the fundamental of the series when played by Watkins. When Roederer’s theory is applied, the results are the reverse: Draxinger produces the fundamental and Watkin’s note is inaudible. Thus, under both theories, both players
produce tones that are either inaudible or lower than the generators, but still a member of the chord indicated by Smyth.

Be this as it may, most horn players clearly hear sum tones that sound higher than the generators, and thus agree with Kirby’s assessment of the phenomenon. The remainder of this discussion will therefore follow Kirby’s theories concerning sum tones.

To produce effective horn chords, the performer must practice certain fundamentals of playing. According to Birchard Coar, one must first find a range in one’s voice that resonates and creates a full sound. Second, one must balance the sound of the singing voice with the tone produced by the horn. Third, one must produce true intervals that are perfectly in tune. Fourth, one must maintain a steady stream of air so that a constant tone between the horn and the voice is produced.\(^9\)

**Exercises for Producing Horn Chords:**

Select a pitch for the horn and the voice that can easily be produced from the harmonic series. It is vital to find a pitch for the voice that can be sung without any straining. From the two examples displayed below choose the one which best suits your vocal range:

---


\(^{10}\)All the examples in this chapter are notated for horn in F unless further indicated.
When producing horn chords the column of air is made to vibrate twice, first by the vocal chords, then by the lips. Maintain a full steady stream of air and focus on pitches that are to be heard. In Steve Vacchi's monograph which discusses contemporary techniques for bassoon, he suggests that the player does the following:

First sing in a comfortable range and in a normal manner. Singing the syllable "oo" and consciously forcing a larger airstream out of the mouth is the next step. The addition of the bassoon reed logically follows, though without vibration; merely singing (humming) with the reed perched between the lips is sufficient. Now, focusing on a larger exiting airstream may be added.11

This same approach is applicable for the horn. Sing the upper pitch on an 'oo', then produce the lower pitch by buzzing with or without the mouthpiece. It may be easier to first buzz the horn pitch, then sing the upper pitch. Once this skill is established, try it with the horn. Whether playing with the mouthpiece alone or with the horn, do not have a set embouchure for the note that is played. Instead begin with a relaxed embouchure and slowly set the embouchure while singing the upper pitch. Practice the following series of exercises by buzzing without the mouthpiece, as well as on the mouthpiece and on the horn (Example 3.4):

Example 3.4
(Sounding Pitches)

---

11 Steve Vacchi, "An Examination of Two Contemporary Techniques in Five Works for Solo Bassoon: Descriptions and Performance Suggestions" (DMA monograph, Louisiana State University, 1997), 30.
When both pitches have been obtained individually, try to produce both pitches simultaneously (Example 3.5):

Example 3.5
(Pitches Played and Sung Simultaneously)

Once the pitches sound together with ease and can be played perfectly in tune, experiment with making one pitch louder than the other (Example 3.6):

Example 3.6
(Pitches Played at Different Dynamics)

Sustain both pitches and move down and up by half steps (Example 3.7):

Example 3.7
(Moving by Half Steps)

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Experiment with sustaining the horn pitch and vocalizing a series of pitches above the sustained note (Example 3.8):

![Example 3.8](image)

**Example 3.8**  
(Vocalizing Above the Sustaining Note)

In the horn literature, there are far more examples in which the top note is sung and the bottom note played than vice versa. However, examples of the reverse also exist, for instance, “Laid Back” (1978-1980) by Douglas Hill. Therefore, practice the procedure by singing the bottom note and playing the top note (Example 3.9):

![Example 3.9](image)

**Example 3.9**  
(Vocalizing Below the Sustaining Note)

Try other combinations using the same exercise (Example 3.10):

![Example 3.10](image)

**Example 3.10**  
(Other Combinations of Pitches)

---

Daniel Kohut refers to this systematic approach to teaching as the "recipe-cookbook" approach. He states "if you use all of the right ingredients and add them in proper sequence, then certain predictable and consistent results should emerge each time the recipe is used." This method of teaching is useful to some students. However, as individuals we all have a unique way of learning. Another teaching approach that may be applicable is one that Kohut describes as the synthesis-analysis-synthesis, or "from the whole to the part to the whole." Kohut states, "(1) tell the students what you are going to tell them. (2) then give them the information and, finally, (3) tell them what you told them." When applying this method to teaching multiphonics, introduce the concept or sound of multiphonics. Then divide the steps into parts so that the student can analyze each step. In the final process, have the student focus on the end result or sound of the multiphonics.

Balance

To execute a fine performance of this Concerto, it is of the utmost importance to achieve balance between the solo instruments, as well as between the soloists and accompaniment, whether piano or full orchestra. The piano version of the Smyth Double Concerto uses the same instruments as the Brahms's Horn Trio (1865), about which several articles have been written. Edward Pease's article makes suggestions which seem particularly relevant to Smyth's Double Concerto. Pease makes the following recommendations: 1) The violin f-hole face outward towards the audience. 2) The bell of the horn should be away from the audience towards the back of the stage or into the crook of the piano. 3) Experiment with different positions of the piano lid to find the best

---

14Ibid., 81.
quality of balance. 4) The violinist must play with a full robust sound while the hornist should use a smaller sound since the horn can easily over-power the violin. 5) A fairly closed hand position and possibly a smaller instrument might be practical for the horn. 6) The pianist generally needs to use a light touch, bringing forth more sound at the climaxes.\textsuperscript{15} If performing the Smyth Double Concerto with an orchestra, the violinist needs to play with an even more robust sound. The hornist on the other hand, will not need to compromise as much with the softer playing. For the best projection, I recommend that the soloists stand.

The horn that Aubrey Brain played for the premiere performance of Smyth's Concerto reflects the smaller, more focused sound of the natural horn. The horn he used was a Raoux French Horn with an F crook.\textsuperscript{16} In 1781, the Parisian makers Joseph and Lucien-Joseph Raoux designed a new type of natural horn referred to as the \textit{cor solo}.\textsuperscript{17} With the invention of valves in the nineteenth century, these horns were redesigned by replacing the crooks with a piston-valve mechanism.\textsuperscript{18} During Aubrey Brain's lifetime, the British continued to use the French style of instruments. The sound that was generated from the French Raoux was focused and pure.

During the first half of the twentieth century, a controversy developed over the use of the German horn versus the French horn. The German horn had a larger bore and was able to produce a greater volume of sound. The German-style instrument had rotary valves and the French-style instrument had piston valves. The rotary valves gave this

\textsuperscript{15}Edward Pease, "Performing the Brahms Horn Trio," \textit{The Horn Call} 4, no. 1 (1973): 45.
\textsuperscript{17}Ibid., 31.
\textsuperscript{18}Kurt Janetzky and Brüchle Bernhard, \textit{The Horn}, translated by James Chater (Portland, Or.: Amedeus Press, 1988), 76.
type of horn a greater ease in execution of passage work. Although the demands placed on the horn player became easier to meet with the German-style horn, many observers felt that the purity of sound generally heard on the French-style horn was lost. Aubrey Brain was adamant about continuing to play on the French Raoux and his famous son, Dennis Brain, used a Raoux in F. Dennis Brain later modified his Raoux by shortening the instrument to the B-flat length. Due to the demands of modern music however, Dennis Brain changed to a German horn, an Alexander in B-flat, in 1951.

Most performers today play on the German-style double horn in F and the shorter B-flat. The addition of the B-flat tubing has helped hornists with accuracy of notes and production of a greater range of notes with much more ease. Yet it is difficult to balance the sound of this instrument with a solo violin. As a performer, it is important to have an aural concept of the French-style instruments. A reference to Aubrey Brain’s sound can be obtained by listening to his performance of the Brahms Horn Trio. Joining him are violinist, Adolph Busch and pianist, Rudolph Serkin. The recording dates to 1933 and it is available as an EMI Classic compact disc (CDH-64495). Other listening sources are the early recordings of Dennis Brain, since he also played a Raoux horn in F. In 1996, Carlton Classics recorded The Planets by Gustav Holst on original instruments. The horn section uses a Raoux instrument and British horns modeled after the French. It was recorded by the New Queen’s Hall Orchestra, and conducted by Roy Goodman. The first public performance of The Planets was November 15, 1920 with the London Symphony, conducted by Albert Coates. This new recording attempts to duplicate the sounds of the London Symphony heard in the early twentieth century.

Farquharson Cousins, former principal horn of the Scottish National Orchestra, advocates the use of the F horn. In his early training, he studied with Aubrey Brain at the Royal Academy and bought a Joseph-Lucien Raoux horn in F from Professor W.F.H. Blandford. He believes:

Everything goes in circle. Come 2050 AD, if not earlier, the F horns will be as obligatory in orchestras as is the B flat tube of today. (Hooray! Musical ‘gold’ will have replaced ‘lead.’) 20

Con sordino

In the second and third movements of the Smyth Concerto, there are several measures that indicate con sordino in the horn part. The problematic change from open to muted is quick and gives little time for the player to insert a mute. In such passages, most players prefer to use the right hand instead of an actual mute for convenience. Although many composers indicate the use of a mute in the horn part, in reality there are many situations in the horn repertory that do not allow enough time to insert the mute. In Nicholas Smith’s article on “The History of the Mute,” he states that J. J. Hampl produced the first non-transposing mute. This invention took place in the mid-eighteenth century. The mute is designed to have “a simple cone made of sheet brass covered with leather, and having an opening at the upper end.” 21 Several varieties of the mute soon appeared and became popular with soloists and duettists during the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century. However, the valveless horns of the era were problematic in that the hand was unable to produce stopped notes or chromatic pitches when the mute was inserted in the bell. The celebrated hornist Carl Türrschmidt (1753-1797) is said to

have invented a mute with which chromatic intervals could be played. Fröhlich describes it as:

... a hollow papiér mache ball, about six inches across, with an open neck to be inserted into the bell of the horn. Inside this ball was another covered with leather and with a cord attached to it which hung down from the bell. With this the neck could be more or less fully occluded at will, in the same way as by hand stopping.

In the classical era, this type of mute was most often used by soloists. Only a few composers, such as Beethoven and Weber, began writing for the effects of the mute in orchestral compositions in the early nineteenth century. By 1840, the compositional use of the mute and interest in its effect had declined in both France and Germany. It was not until nearly 1860 that Richard Wagner revived the use of the mute. Both Richard Strauss and Gustav Mahler wrote numerous muted passages for the horn. Other early twentieth century composers who incorporated the mute in many of their compositions were Schoenberg, Berg, Webern, and Bartók. Although the mute became a popular device for a change in color, hand stopping was also still used. Examples occur in the works of Berlioz, Wagner, and Debussy.

---

22 Muted passages from Beethoven include: Sixth Symphony, end of last movement; Concerto for Violin, op. 61, end of second movement; Rondino in E-flat Major for Eight Instruments. Muted passage from Weber include: Concerto in E-flat Major for Clarinet.
24 Smith, "Mute," 84.
Other well-known composers besides Smyth, also wrote quick changes from open to mute and vice versa. Two famous examples occur in the third movement of Bartók’s *Concerto for Orchestra* (1944) (see Example 3.11).

Bartók’s Concerto III: mm. 22-29

Example 3.11

*(Con Sord. Passages in the Third Movement of Bartók’s *Concerto for Orchestra*)

25 Copyright © 1946 (Renewed) Bartók’s *Concerto for Orchestra* by Hawks and Son (London) Ltd. Reprinted by permission of Boosey and Hawkes, Inc.
For practicality, I suggest that the passages in the Smyth Concerto be played stopped (see Example 3.12a and 3.12b).

Smyth’s Concerto II: mm. 66-71

Example 3.12a
(Con Sord. Passage in Second Movement of Smyth’s Concerto)

Smyth’s Concerto III: mm. 192-202

Example 3.12b
(Con Sord. Passage in Third Movement of Smyth’s Concerto)

---

Copyright © 1928 (renewed) by J. Curwen and Sons Ltd. International Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved. Reprinted by permission of G. Schirmer, Inc.
It is customary for the hand to close the bell and the player to transpose the fingerings down a half-step which are played on the F side of the horn. For two of the con sordino passages found in Smyth's Concerto. Example 3.12a and 3.12b, fingerings are given on the F side of the horn as well as alternative fingerings to help improve intonation. Sometimes the customary fingerings do not work for everyone. I recommend that the performer experiment with a variety of fingerings to find the best results. Thus I suggest that all con sordino notes in this Concerto can be stopped, even though the mute can be used with some of the notes. I recommend hand stopping for the sake of consistency of sound.
CONCLUSION

The Double Concerto by Ethel Smyth challenges the technical and musical abilities of the hornist. The most problematic issues are balance, the execution of \textit{con sordino} passages, and horn chords. In the monograph I have explained clearly the acoustical phenomenon called horn chords, evaluated different means of achieving the effect, and provided exercises for developing the technique. As for balance, I have provided suggestions for seating arrangement and described Aubrey Brain's instrument and sound in order to suggest the timbre appropriate for this piece. To give added perspective to the \textit{con sordino} passages I have identified similar passages from other composers and the solutions often adopted by hornists. I have also provided a variety of alternate fingerings for stopping, which will allow the hornist to avoid the awkward mute changes altogether. In addition to this information, I have provided historical background on Smyth's accomplishments, including the different genres in which she wrote and the recognition she received during her lifetime. I have discussed some of Smyth's possible influences and prepared an analysis addressing issues of form, harmony, motives, and rhythms to increase the performer's understanding of the piece.

In the past decade alone, attention to Smyth's music has grown. Articles about Smyth's music have appeared in distinguished journals such as \textit{The Musical Quarterly}, \textit{The Diapason}, \textit{Women of Note Quarterly}, \textit{The Horn Call}, and \textit{The American Organist}. Recent recordings includes her \textit{Mass in D}, an array of vocal and string chamber music and two recent recording of the Double Concerto.

Smyth's courage, perseverance, and unwavering focus are qualities that today's musicians most admire about her. Smyth's determination and outspoken personality are...
the traits that were needed to overcome the obstacles she had encountered during her life. In time, Smyth will be remembered for her many passions in life, including her music.
REFERENCES

Articles


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


**Books**


__________. *Female Pipings In Eden.* London: Peter Davis Limited, 1933.


**Dissertations**


**Musical Scores**


________________. *Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra*, full score. London: J. Curwen and Sons Ltd., 1928.

**Recordings**


———. *Mass in D; Boatswain's Mate* — Mrs. Waters arias; *March of the Women*, Eiddwen Harrhy, Janis Hardy, Dan Dressen, James Bohn, Plymouth Festival, Philip Brunelle, cond. (1991) Virgin 91188.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
APPENDIX A

REHEARSAL NUMBERS CORRESPONDING TO MEASURE NUMBERS OF SMYTH'S CONCERTO
REHEARSAL NUMBERS CORRESPONDING TO MEASURE NUMBERS OF SMYTH’S CONCERTO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rehearsal Numbers</th>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rehearsal Numbers</th>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rehearsal Numbers</td>
<td>Measure Numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rehearsal Numbers</th>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92</td>
<td>518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td>522</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B
CONSENT FORMS
May 11, 1998

Janiece Luedeke
1810 Cherokee Blvd.
Baton rouge, LA 70802

Re: CONCERTO FOR VIOLIN AND HORN by Ethel Smyth

Dear Ms. Luedeke:

This letter is to confirm our agreement for the nonexclusive right to reprint several measures from the work referenced above for inclusion in your thesis/dissertation, subject to the following conditions:

1. The following copyright credit is to appear on each copy made:

"Copyright © 1928 (Renewed) by J. Curwen & Sons Ltd.
International Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved.
Reprinted by Permission of G. Schirmer, Inc."

2. Copies are for your personal use only in connection with your thesis/dissertation, and may not be sold or further duplicated without our written consent. This in no way is meant to prevent your depositing three copies in an interlibrary system, such as the microfilm collection of the university you attend, or with University Microfilms, Inc.

3. Permission is granted to University Microfilms, Inc. to make single copies of your thesis/dissertation, upon demand.

4. A one-time permission fee of twenty-five ($25.00) dollars, to be paid by you within thirty (30) days from the date of this letter.

5. If your thesis/dissertation is accepted for commercial publication, further written permission must be sought.

Sincerely,

Zoraya Mendez
Print Licensing Manager
Dover Publications, Inc.
Attn: Mr. John Riess
31 East 2nd Street
Mineola, New York 11501
Fax: (516)573-1401

May 25, 1998

Dear Mr. John Riess,

I am writing a dissertation and would like to apply for permission to use several measures from the following score as examples in my paper:

Brahms’s Piano Concerto in B-Flat page 93 measures 1-5.

Thank you for your time. Permission to use this excerpt would be greatly appreciated. Please fax response to : (504) 386-2362.

Sincerely,

Janiece Lucchesi
1810 Cherokee Blvd.
Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Ph: (504) 336-1059
Fax: (504) 386-2562
May 6, 1998

Ms. Janiece Luedske
1810 Cherokee B'vd.
Baton Rouge, LA 70802

Dear Ms. Luedske:

RE: CONCERTO FOR ORCHESTRA (Bela Bartok);

We hereby grant permission for you to include excerpts from the above referenced work in your dissertation. As we assume you will not distribute your paper beyond that which is required for the degree no fee is payable. We do ask that you include the following copyright notice and credit in your paper either following the musical example(s) or on a separate acknowledgment page:

© Copyright 1946 by Hawkes & Son (London) Ltd. Copyright Renewed
Reprinted by permission of Boosey & Hawkes, Inc.

With kind regards,

BOOSEY & HAWKES, INC.

Frank Korach
Business Affairs Assistant
VITA

Janiece Luedeke holds degrees from Lawrence University (Bachelor of Music Education), the University of Akron (Master of Music), and Louisiana State University (Doctor of Musical Arts). Her teachers include Bruce Heim, Richard Norem, William Hoyt, Cynthia Carr, and Linda Kimbal. She has participated in master classes given by Froydis Ree Wekre, Barry Tuckwell, Dale Clevenger, and Paul Basler. Some of the professional organizations Miss Luedeke has performed with include the Natchez Summer Opera, Ohio Light Opera, Akron Symphony, and Ohio Ballet. Currently she is a member of the Baton Rouge Symphony Orchestra, the Acadiana Symphony Orchestra and Louisiana Brass.
DOCTORAL EXAMINATION AND DISSERTATION REPORT

Candidate: Janiece Marie Luedeke

Major Field: Music

Title of Dissertation: Dame Ethel Smyth's Concerto for Violin, Horn, and Orchestra: A Performance Guide for the Hornist

Approved:

[Signature]
Major Professor and Chairman

[Signature]
Dean of the Graduate School

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

[Signature]
[Signature]
[Signature]

Date of Examination: May 21, 1998