Dilemmas of Utopian Commitment in a Contemporary Religious Sect.

Ronald Edward Roberts
Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses/1616

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at LSU Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in LSU Historical Dissertations and Theses by an authorized administrator of LSU Digital Commons. For more information, please contact gradetd@lsu.edu.
This dissertation has been microfilmed exactly as received

ROBERTS, Ronald Edward, 1939-
DILEMMAS OF UTOPIAN COMMITMENT IN A CONTEMPORARY RELIGIOUS SECT.
The Louisiana State University and Agricultural and Mechanical College, Ph.D., 1969
Sociology, socialism, communism, anarchism

University Microfilms, Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan
DILEMMAS OF UTOPIAN COMMITMENT IN A
CONTEMPORARY RELIGIOUS SECT

A Dissertation

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Louisiana State University and
Agricultural and Mechanical College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

in

The Department of Sociology

by

Ronald Edward Roberts
B.A., Drake University, 1961
M.A., Louisiana State University, 1964
May, 1969
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A number of individuals were instrumental in the development of this study, but none more than Dr. Vernon Parenton, the author's major professor at Louisiana State University. Professor Parenton has not only directed the preparation of this study, he has been a constant source of encouragement and "Sociological Imagination" for the writer. Dr. Rex Enoch has also been of great aid in the development of the basic research design of this study. Moreover, he has assisted the author in "sculpting" and refining the text.

Others helpful in the preparation of this manuscript were Dr. Alvin Bertrand, who had aided the writer in prior research ventures, Dr. W.J. Jokinen, Chairman of the Sociology Department, Louisiana State University, and Dr. Virginia Glad of the Department of Psychology. Professor Rudolf Heberle has also assisted the author by providing him with valuable source material.

Moreover, the writer is greatly indebted to his wife Patricia Roberts who took time from her own educational goals to aid in the editing and shaping of the text. The author's mother, Mrs. Mae Roberts, was also a source of aid and encouragement in the preparation of this work.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS                          | ii  |
| LIST OF TABLES                           | vi  |
| ABSTRACT                                 | viii|
| CHAPTER                                  |
| I. INTRODUCTION                          | 1   |
| Rationale for the Study                  | 1   |
| Structure and Design of the Study        | 3   |
| II. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON UTOPIA   | 6   |
| Marx and Marxism                         | 7   |
| Emile Durkheim                           | 9   |
| Karl Mannheim                            | 12  |
| Frank Manuel                             | 16  |
| Lewis Mumford - Judith Shklar            | 21  |
| Summation of Perspectives                | 25  |
| III. PREINDUSTRIAL UTOPISTS              | 28  |
| The Beginnings                           | 28  |
| Plato - The Ideal Polis                  | 32  |
| Medieval Utopists                        | 38  |
| Anabaptists - The New Jerusalem          | 42  |
| IV. EUROPEAN UTOPIST THOUGHT             | 49  |
| Fourierism                               | 50  |
| Saint-Simon and His Followers            | 55  |
| Robert Owen - New Lanark                 | 61  |
| V. COMMUNITARIANISM IN AMERICA           | 67  |
| Shaker Societies                         | 68  |
| Germanic Utopists in the New World       | 73  |
| Rappites                                 | 73  |
| Inspirationists                          | 76  |
| Mennonites                               | 78  |
| Owenism in America - The New Harmony     | 80  |
| Experience                               | 80  |
| Fourierism in America                    | 85  |
| Icaria - Etienne Cabet                    | 92  |
| Oneida - John Humphrey Noyes             | 97  |
| Summation and Perspectives               | 100 |

iii
VI. THE STRUCTURE AND GENESIS OF THE LATTER DAY SAINT MOVEMENT ........................................... 105
   Early History of the Movement ............................................. 105
   Charisma, its Routinization and Rebirth ..................................... 115
   Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints (Mormons) ............... 118
   Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints (Strangites) ........... 121
   Church of Christ (Rigdonites) ........................................... 122
   Jehovah's Presbytery of Zion (Thompsonites) .......................... 123
   The Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints ......... 124

VII. THE EVOLUTION OF LATTER DAY SAINT UTOPIAN CONCEPTS ........... 132
   Pre 1844 Concepts .......................................................... 132
   Post 1844 Concepts in the Reorganized Church ............................ 145

VIII. RESEARCH DESIGN ........................................................... 154
   Hypotheses ................................................................. 154
   The Instrument ............................................................. 160
      Conservatism Scale ...................................................... 160
      Dogmatism Scale ......................................................... 161
      Conceptualization of Zion ............................................... 162
      Religious Orthodoxy Scale ............................................ 162
      Sectarian Utopian Commitment Scale .................................. 163
   Other Attitudinal Items Concerning Utopian Beliefs ..................... 164
   Sample and Population ...................................................... 165

IX. FINDINGS, ANALYSIS ............................................................ 168
   General Characteristics of Student Sample .................................. 168
   Students Definitions of the Concept of Zion ................................ 170
   Academic Status and Utopian Beliefs ..................................... 173
   Parental Church Activities and Students Utopian Commitment .......... 181
   Conservatism and Sectarian Utopian Commitment ......................... 183
   Dogmatism and Sectarian Utopian Commitment ................................ 185
   Religious Orthodoxy and Sectarian Utopian Commitment ................ 190
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Place of Home Residence of Student Sample</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Responses of Student Sample to the Question &quot;Where Have You Lived Most of Your Life?&quot;</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Academic Majors of Student Sample</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Analysis of Responses to the Statement: &quot;Define the Concept of Zion as You Understand It&quot;, by Academic Standing</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Political Orientation of Student Sample by Academic Standing</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Extent of Religious Activity in Student Sample by Academic Standing</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Student Sample's Concept of Zion by Academic Status</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Students Academic Status: Its Relationship to Conservatism, Dogmatism, Religious Orthodoxy, Commitment to Utopianism, and Number of Cognitive Elements in Utopian Belief System</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Mother and Father's Church Activity and Importance of Utopian Convent to Student</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Zero Order Scale Score Correlations for Conservatism, Religious Orthodoxy, Utopian Commitment and Number of Concepts Seen &quot;Essential&quot; to Belief in Zion</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Responses to the Question: &quot;Which of the Following Ideas do you Consider Absolutely Essential to your Conception of Zion?&quot;, by Academic Status</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Difference in Mean Number of Elements Held &quot;Essential&quot; to Belief in Zion and Degree of Dogmatism of Students</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

Utopian thought and movements have been characteristic of the Western World from post medieval times to the present. This study attempts to explicate the concept through historical analysis and further to explore the dynamics of utopian commitment in a contemporary religious sect.

The first section of the study explores the comparative morphologies of utopian movements developed by Karl Marx, Louis Mumford, Karl Mannheim, Frank Manuel, and others. A brief analysis of preindustrial utopian thought (i.e., the Anabaptist movement) follows. Next the author explores the thought of three secular European Utopists, Henri de Saint Simon, Charles Fourier, and Robert Owen. The study then focuses more specifically on American Communitarian developments of the eighteenth and nineteenth century. The social organization, the sectarian tendencies of the groups, and the probable causes of the demise of the isolated utopian community in America are explored.

One example of an American group holding to utopian and millenarian views is the Latter Day Saint Movement. The genesis and sectarian tendencies of this movement are noted and the utopian thought of one of the organizations in the
movement, the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, is described. The author distributed Questionnaires to approximately one third of all the Reorganized Latter Day Saint students in attendance at their church college in southern Iowa. It was the author's basic proposition that individuals holding to sectarian utopian thought in the sixth decade of the twentieth century in America would feel pressured to reject or modify those beliefs due to the secular nature of industrial society. To explore the possible variables in the maintenance or rejection of sectarian utopian thought held by the students, several attitudinal scales were used. Among these were McClosky's "Conservatism" scale, Rokeach's "Dogmatism" scale, Putney and Middleton's "Religious Orthodoxy" scale, and a Sectarian-Utopian Commitment scale developed by the author.

Generally, the seniors in the sample group were judged as less conservative, less dogmatic, less orthodox in religion, and less committed to the traditional utopian beliefs of their church. A positive and significant relationship was noted between Utopian Commitment scale scores and scores on the Religious Orthodoxy, Conservatism, and Dogmatism scales. Further, students who scored in the "high" range on the Dogmatism scale were shown to consider a greater number of cognitive elements as "essential" or "non-negotiable" with regard to their utopian belief system.
A large majority of the students stated that they accepted the concept of "Zion" (the utopian goal of their church) as highly desirable. Yet an equally large majority stated they saw their church making little or no progress toward its utopian goals. This is a situation productive of a good deal of cognitive dissonance. The author postulates four modes used by the students to reduce the tension and dissonance of this situation. First, some students may become advocates of "resectarianism", the belief that their church must purge itself of dissent, and modernity, and follow more closely the "letter of the law". Second, some students may "translate" their sectarian utopian beliefs into liberal reform which "partializes" and "politicizes" their religious beliefs. A third possibility for students is "sublimation" or the transferral of utopian beliefs from the material world (such as the creation of a "perfect city" on earth) to the ideal sphere (i.e., Zion is the ultimate in spiritual experiences) where it is no longer threatened by the buffetings of the "real" world. A last reaction to the dissonant situation is partial disaffection from, or complete rejection of the religious utopian belief system.
INTRODUCTION

Rationale for the Study

Many historians and social scientists are prone to dismiss utopian ventures as esoteric footnotes in 18th and 19th century Western history. Since the Marxian attack on utopian socialism and the failure of communitarian ventures in the United States, the word "utopia" has become a term of derision connoting unrealistic goals and political naivete. Indeed, Kenneth Keniston speaks of the "transvaluation of utopia" which he attributes to "the decline of cultural morale of cooperation based on the acceptance of some common vision of the desired future." Yet it is this writer's contention that the study of utopian thought and the experiments resultant from that thought have more than intrinsic worth. The utopian dream, especially as conceived in the nineteenth century, has for better or worse shaped to a degree the direction of social change in first the Western and later the underdeveloped world. It has manifest itself in both political and religious structures, libertarian and totalist movements and generally has made impact

on almost every art form at man's disposal. The study of utopian thought may at times reveal rather surprising "latent functions" stemming from utopian experimentation. For example, Nell Eurich attributes a good deal of the genesis of experimental science to the post-Baconian utopian experience.

Both the form and content of the traditional utopia have been basically revised, and the feeling of a utopian dream is gone. The new utopians no longer portray the final absolute ideal. That is impossible because they are committed to the evolutionary principle; their knowledge of the universe was to grow, accumulate, and change with counterfacts discovered.

...evolutionary logic, starting from the fact of thinking and inquiring...through a process of selection, rejection, and survival, is an inherent part of the new method.2

Moreover, W.H.G. Armytage in his book, Heavens Below; Utopian Experiments in England, sees utopian thought as contributing greatly to educational innovation in England and points out further that, "community experiments...are among the most important and universal ways in which societies the world over have maintained their vitality and advanced in type."3

Here one can readily see that while the utopian experiment may have a short life expectancy, it produces waves which


permeate many aspects of the larger society. This is a basic reason for the concern of the social scientist in looking toward this mode of thought today.

**Structure and Design of the Study**

This research will use both an historical comparative methodology and a field technique to accomplish its purpose. The structure of the study consists of four stages of research, each more specific than the one before.

1) First, the utopian idea is investigated in both an historical and theoretical framework. This entails the description of pre-industrial utopian thought (as epitomized by Sir Thomas More) and a representative pre-industrial utopian movement, the Anabaptists. It further follows the lines of utopian thought into the French Revolution with an analysis of the utopian ideals of Henri de Saint Simon (1760-1825), Charles Fourier (1772-1837) and Robert Owen (1771-1858). After this general view of European utopian thought, typologies of utopian thought are reviewed as they are reflected in the thought of Karl Kautsky, Emile Durkheim, Karl Mannheim, Lewis Mumford, Glen Negley, and Frank Manuel. Here a comparative morphology of utopias is attempted relating historical sequences and variants in social organization of various utopian schemes.
2) Second, this research reviews a representative spectrum of communitarian groups in America from the eighteenth through the nineteenth centuries. Fortunately, a wealth of information is currently available on such groups as the Shakers, the Fourierists, Perfectionists, Icarians and others. Two rather encyclopedic and excellent sources here are Nordhoff's *The Communistic Societies of the United States*, and John Humphrey Noyes' *History of American Socialisms*. While neither of these books were written by social scientists, they are, nevertheless, perceptive and cogent works. This is especially true since they were written on the basis of personal experience and travel during the great period of utopian booms during the mid-nineteenth century.

3) Third, this research focuses more specifically on the Latter Day Saint Movement in the United States, its structure and genesis, and its utopian ideals and practices. Special attention is given the sectarian, schismatic and millenarian aspects of the movement. Its authority patterns are analyzed according to Weber's ideal types. Historical documents demonstrating the evolution of the Saints' utopian ideals, such as the *Doctrine and Covenants* (revelations given by Joseph Smith) and selections from nineteenth-century editions of *The Saints' Herald*, the official church newspaper of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church, are used. The millenarianistic aspects of the
movement are considered as they are related to the utopian constructions of the "Saints."

4) Finally, the investigator measures to a limited extent the utopian beliefs and attitudes of college students in attendance at Graceland College in Lamoni, Iowa, an institution of higher learning sponsored by a sect of the Latter Day Saint Movement, the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. Using a quota sample of both freshmen and senior church members at the college, the research focuses on correlates of utopian attitudinal change and stability within the college community. Some of the possible factors investigated in this light are ideological, such as the effect of a conservative political belief system on the maintenance of utopian beliefs, the effect of a dogmatic cognitive style on the holding of utopian beliefs, and the relationship between attitudes of "religious orthodoxy" and the espousal of utopian beliefs.

Status variables are also of some import in the analysis of utopian thought. For example, differences in educational level, sex, and the occupancy of church offices can effect the perceptions of the student toward the utopian system as proposed by his church.
THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES ON UTOPIA

It is not quite true that only the Western world has nourished the utopian dream. Yet two basically Western ideas, "human perfectability" and "progress" have without doubt found their greatest exponents in European peoples. Further, most critical analyses of utopian thought were fashioned by Europeans and later, Americans. A goodly number of the early writings concerning utopian thought stemmed from the feeling by the Christian orthodox who perceived the utopian movements of their day as heretical. Thomas More's Utopia, for example, caused a furor notwithstanding the fact that he considered himself a faithful Catholic.

Later, of course, utopian thought gained many advocates and some were able to articulate apologias for their work. By the beginning of the twentieth century, historians and social scientists attempted to place utopian concepts within the social context of their time. This represented a great breakthrough since it separated polemic from objective reporting. It would be improper to assume that all twentieth century works concerning utopian thought are particularly insightful, however. Thomas Molnar, an historian, wrote Utopia: The Perennial Heresy in 1967

1Thomas Molnar, Utopia: The Perennial Heresy (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1967)
which as one could surmise was a religiously based attack on utopian thought. On the other side of the coin, Joyce Hertzler's *The History of Utopian Thought* written in 1923 is of limited theoretical value since it too is polemical (with a favorable bias toward utopias in this case) and descriptive in a rather cursory way (despite the fact that Hertzler was in other areas a resourceful and insightful sociologist).

In the main, this study explicates the work of those thinkers who, using a historical or sociological approach, attempted to develop a morphology of utopian thought and practice. An understanding of the history of ideas and social settings which nurtured these ideas seems to be a desirable goal in this case.

The following thinkers concern themselves with placing the utopian scene in its historical and social setting with varying degrees of success.

**Marx and Marxism**

The Marxian approach to "utopianism" has been a curious mixture of admiration and disdain. The admiration was undoubtedly resolved by the Marxian position that utopian groups were an historically determined stage necessary prior to "scientific socialism." In fact, Karl Kautsky, a revisionist.

---

Marxist, conceives of Thomas More's *Utopia* rather differently than most historians. He comments that

we see how revolutionary utopia was: revolutionary not only in reference to a remote future, but also in relation to the burning questions of its time. It attacks not only private property, not only the policy of princes, not only the ignorance and laziness of the monks, but even the doctrines of religions.  

Engels discussed the work of Saint Simon, Fourier, Owen and Cabet

who despite all their fantasticalness and all their utopianism must be counted among the most significant brains of all time, who anticipated with genius countless truths whose validity we can now prove scientifically.  

However, utopists could be obscuratists as well as forerunners of socialism. Proudhon, for example, is labeled a utopian in a clearly pejorative way by Marx. Martin Buber states that, "Originally Marx and Engels called those people utopians whose thinking had preceded the critical development of industry, the proletariat and the class-war, and who, therefore, could not take this development into account."  

---


However, Buber finds that later

the term was levelled indiscriminately at all those who, in the estimation of Marx and Engels, did not in fact take account of it, ... The epithet 'Utopian Marxism' became the most potent missile in the fight of Marxism against non-Marxian socialism.  

Emile Durkheim

While Durkheim has not concerned himself greatly about utopian thought, his classic work on Saint-Simon, Socialism, has a real contribution to utopia. In this work, Durkheim finds that eighteenth century "communism" (communitarianism) could be distinguished from other similar and prior theories.

First, these theories are no longer sporadic. While, up until then they appeared at long intervals, separated from one another by rather considerable periods, in the eighteenth century we are in the presence of a veritable efflorescence of communist systems... More's Utopia is translated, and all the ancient and foreign works which express similar thoughts. And Frelon was able to write: 'We have almost as many novels on morality, philosophy and politics as we have in the light vein.'

Durkheim, like others, finds a difference between the competing varieties of utopian thought labeled "communism" and "socialism". With "socialism" the political decision makers

---

6 Ibid.

7 Emile Durkheim, Socialism (New York: Collier Books, 1962) p. 84.
are dominant over economic life. Communism, as represented by the isolated utopian community, seeks to do away entirely with the political.

So to equate communism and socialism is to equate contrary things... For communists, the state can fulfill its role only if it is completely insulated from industrial life; for socialists, this role is essentially industrial and the connection could not be too complete.

In other words, Durkheim sees only the isolated communitarian group as representing true communism. Industrialized society may be amenable to socialization; however, communism forbids the development of the division of labor which is necessary to the technological specialties of modern life. Durkheim goes on to say that,

According to socialism, strictly economic functions, that is to say, activities productive of services (commercial and industrial) must be socially organized, but consumption is to remain private. There is, as we have seen, no socialist doctrine which refuses the individual the right of possession and the use (in his own way) of what he has legitimately acquired.

Quite to the contrary, in communism, there is consumption that is communal and production which remains private. In utopia each works in his own way, as he thinks proper and is simply obligated not to be idle.

---

8Ibid., p. 70.

9Ibid.
Although it is not quite true that in the early American communisms "each worked in his own way," it is not subject to argument that consumption was in many cases communal.

Durkheim's distinction between socialism and communism is quite helpful to this research because it points out a polarity which American utopian groups tend toward. Later it will be shown that groups such as the Shakers and early Latter Day Saints tended toward communism. Later groups, such as the Fourierists and the Latter Day Saints of the more modern era, have tended toward a modified form of Durkheim's socialism.

Glen Negley and J.M. Patrick, in their monograph, The Quest for Utopia, support Durkheim's idea and cast it in an historical perspective. "Utopists," they believe, were in the vanguard of the great march of individualism in the seventeenth, eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. [Here Negley and Patrick disagree with Manuel's concepts of individualism and utopia.] This was the era of the communitarian ideal, with emphasis on the individual as the only source of value; the better society of utopia was better because individual men and women were better.

However, in the second half of the nineteenth century, a move toward Durkheim's concept of "socialism" became evident.

---

New utopias of highly centralized structure began to emerge, and it is significant to note that what the utopists generally thought to be the principle for the centralization of the social structure. In the modern period... it was not religion or education /but/ the centralization and organization of economic activity.  

Karl Mannheim

Perhaps the classic statement of the analysis of utopian thought comes with Karl Mannheim in his *Ideology and Utopia*.  

Mannheim's work may be justly criticized for its oceanic scope and for his attempt to create an extreme and total epistemological relativism. Yet no one would deny that certain modes of thought (or perhaps all if Mannheim is correct) are shaped by social position. It is obvious also that ideological thought plays an important role in legitimatizing power. Those in power, however, are challenged to produce ideological thought only when confronted by the utopianist. 

Mannheim reviews the Anabaptist movement and concludes that, The decisive turning point in modern history was from the point of view of our problem the moment in which 'chiliasm' joined forces with the active demands of the oppressed strata of

11 Ibid., p. 8.

society. The very idea of the 'dawn of a millennial kingdom on earth' always contained a revolutionizing tendency.\(^{13}\)

Mannheim then comments further upon what he calls the "spiritualization of politics." Once again the determining factor in the development of utopian thought revolves around a group's access to power as he finds that, "The source of spiritual tension...was the emergence of the utopian mentality which originated in the oppressed strata of society."\(^{14}\)

The revolutionary potential of sectarian religious groups is confirmed by Mannheim. Here he diverges from his revisionist Marxist position. Mannheim does see the ideological position of established religious groups, however.

As long as the clerically and feudally organized medieval order was able to locate its paradise outside of society, in some other worldly sphere which transcended history and dulled its revolutionary edge, the idea of paradise was still an integral part of medieval society. Not until certain social groups embodied these wish images into their actual conduct and tried to realize them, did these ideologies become utopian.\(^{15}\)

Mannheim's classification of modes of utopian thought can be seen as somewhat inadequate due to the fact that he leaves implicit, and somewhat nebulous, his method of classification.

\(^{13}\) Ibid., p. 211.  
\(^{14}\) Ibid., p. 212.  
\(^{15}\) Ibid., p. 193.
He considers the "orgiastic chiliasm" of the Anabaptist movement, liberal humanitarianism, the conservative (anti-utopian) position and the socialist-communist utopia. These modes of thought vary in terms of their organizational structure or lack of it. Moreover, some are extrapitalitical, some reformist, some limited to a party organization and some diffuse. One, therefore, cannot regard Mannheim's typology as exhaustive or as stemming from any one typological principle.

Mannheim's perception of the lineage of utopian thought is somewhat Hegelian as can be seen in the following quotation:

...the relationship between utopia and the existing order turns out to be a 'dialectical' one. By this is meant that every age allows to arise...those ideas and values in which are contained in condensed form the unrealized and unfulfilled tendencies which represent the needs of each age. These intellectual elements then become the explosive material for bursting the limits of this existing order. The existing order gives birth to utopians which in turn break the bonds of the existing order, leaving it free to develop in the direction of the next order of existence.\(^6\)

No simplistic, progressive principle can account for the profusion of utopian communities. Once again a dialectic principle is at work.

The peculiarities of the individual forms of successively emerging utopias become in fact most nearly intelligible not merely by

\(^{16}\) \textit{Ibid.}, p. 199.
regarding them as a unilinear filiation of one from the other, but also by taking account of the fact that they came into existence and maintained themselves as mutually antagonistic counter-utopias.\textsuperscript{17}

Here Mannheim points to the fact that ideas in themselves do not necessarily carry the stuff of utopian desire. A utopian dream reaching partial fulfillment becomes ideological and conservative because Mannheim understands a state of mind to be utopian "when it is incongruous with the state of reality within which it occurs."\textsuperscript{18} Therefore, it would seem that fulfillment and disintegration are inextricably related. Further he believes that

groups which have recently gained power and which, by participating in and sharing responsibility for the existing order, become wedded to things as they are, come to exert a retarding influence through their espousal of orderly evolutionary change.\textsuperscript{19}

Mannheim's articulation of the class related nature of utopian movements is his key contribution to this analysis. No less important, however, is his realization of the transitive nature of utopian social organization. His position is, in the end, somewhat discouraging for the proponents of the stable, changeless social structure. The rapid demise of nineteenth

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., p. 192. \\
\textsuperscript{18} Ibid. \\
\textsuperscript{19} Ibid., p. 208.
\end{flushright}
century utopian communities and the fact that revolutionary utopian movements become ideological and defensive in power seem to confirm his position.

Mannheim's basic position has been challenged by Judith Shklar who, after reviewing early utopian thought expressed by Swift, Diderot and others, finds that:

This...review of classical utopia should suffice to show how little activism or revolutionary optimism or future directed hope there is in this literature. It is neither ideology nor utopia in Mannheim's sense, but then neither is most of the great critical political literature before the end of the eighteenth century. Machiavelli, Bodin, Hobbes, Rousseau: were they 'reactionary ideologues' because they were not 'revolutionary utopists'?20

The criticism leveled here at Mannheim is doubtless well taken and refers only to the danger of over extension of an otherwise sound idea.

Frank Manuel

Frank Manuel, a more recent student of utopian thought, agrees with Mannheim's basic tenants. He comments that:

Most utopias can be significantly illuminated by a study of the economic and social conditions of the periods in which they were composed...

Scholars have shown that Thomas More's communist utopia reflects the problems of the disinherited during the English enclosure movement of the sixteenth century. Similarly the historical context of French eighteenth and nineteenth century utopias is readily definable. In the eighteenth century, an extraordinary preoccupation with uniform regulations expresses a wish that the chaotic legal and institutional structure of the ancient regime might be simplified, normalized, so that bewildering feudal and customary laws would cease interfering with the achievement of elementary rational goals of production and consumption. The regulated character of work in the eighteenth century utopias is largely an extensive to the whole society of certain prevailing corporate practices in the compulsory organization of artisans.²¹

Manuel here accepts Mannheim's idea of social position determining the need for a utopian rationale but implicitly adds a psychological need - that of order or "intolerance of ambiguity."

In another source, Manuel creates historical ideal types which differ in psychological texture as well as social structure. The first he terms "utopias of calm felicity." He describes their tenants in this manner:

In most pre-revolutionary utopias in the Morean tradition unbridled acquisition of property is identified as the chief, if not the sole, source of all dissension. There is a presumption that with the abolition of monopolies of property and with the establish of some sort of communism or commonality,

the antagonistic spirit, the cause of evil no longer would find significant expression in society. It would simply vanish.  

Manuel goes on to find that in these pre-industrial utopias, tranquillity is the highest good. Since only moderate pleasures are deemed to be pleasures at all, there is nothing to disrupt the order of calm felicity, once it has been instituted, as long as the world endures. More's utopia is not even subject to the natural decay that Plato considered inevitable for his Republic.  

An infinite equilibrium is suggested, then, by Manuel as the goal of these advocates of moderation. He then comments on the motivational speculation advocated by the "premoderns."

The psychological assumptions of the pre-nineteenth century utopias were that man normally sought sensate happiness, that this state of pleasurableness was easily definable, that the condition was derivative from the establishment of an appropriate institutional order, and that this order was not difficult to achieve once its virtues were made known. Man required food, clothing, sexual gratification, some means of protection against his enemies, and an educational system to guarantee the transmission of utopia from one generation to another.  

---


23 Ibid., p. 75.

24 Ibid., p. 76.
In short, Manuel finds these utopian thinkers without great need for aesthetic or innovative goals. This utopian variety was not long to last, however, because about the time of the French revolution, or shortly thereafter,...trouble came to the utopia of calm felicity. These disturbing elements were so numerous and varied that the transformation seems overdetermined; a reorganization of industry...in the eyes of contemporaries a revolutionary upheaval that posed unprecedented problems for urban life; a growing awareness among some of the misery of the new industrial working classes, generating a pathos as intense as More's reaction to the first impact of the enclosure movement; a new historical consciousness epitomized in a theory of inevitable endless progressions, a conception of the past... biological metamorphosis of the species; a new definition...of human nature that cast doubt upon the hither to unchallenged Greco-Christian belief in the superiority of man's rational over his passionate and manual-administrative capacities; a further reconsideration of monogamy as the absolute sexual institution; a reappraisal of the need for equality; and last but not least, the birth of a romantic cult of personality, self-expression and individualism.\(^{25}\)

These, then, are the pressures and impacts changing the style and goals of the nineteenth century utopia. Manuel goes on to catalogue three basic differences between the utopias of calm felicity and the "open-ended utopias" of the nineteenth century. The first revolves around the conception of time held by the utopian thinker.

Whereas before the nineteenth century utopias are invariably stable and ahistorical, ideals out of time, they now become dynamic and

\(^{25}\text{Ibid.}, \text{p. 79.}\)
bound to a long prior historical series. They should henceforth be called euchronias - good place becomes good time... In time we shall have utopia. The early utopia was usually restricted to an island or a similarly isolated environment, and there was a steady counterpart between the tiny haven of happiness and the greater world outside. By the end of the eighteenth century, historical utopias, typified by Condorcet's canonical depiction of the future of mankind in the tenth epoch of his *Esquisse*, can be confined to no narrower limits than the whole globe.  

More than existing in a future time, the new utopia also begins to show a plasticity of boundary as well. Manuel states that:

pre-revolutionary utopias are physically immobile. The Saint-Simonians in utopia, on the other hand, are continually building roads, railways, and canals, the great arteries for the unification of mankind, and occasional overnight stops as well furnished motels. The Fourierist may have a home base in a small phanastery, but there are armies of bayadera and their male counterparts who are always touring, vast programs of cultural interchange, and great itinerant battalions of young workers for public projects.  

Manuel implies that the division of labor and "dynamic density" of the industrialized populace make isolation not only difficult for utopias but impractical as well.

A final difference between these two utopian varieties revolves around the ideal of equality. According to Manuel,


Many nineteenth century utopias are organismic and hierarchical, rooted in 'scientific' theories of popular writers like Bichat, whose ideas both Saint-Simon and Comte took over, dwelt on the fundamental ineradicable differences among men, the egalitarianism of the old utopias was abandoned. Equality, no longer a psychic need, was decried as egalité turque by Saint-Simon and condemned... creating social chaos. French nineteenth century utopians were in quest of an order that emphasized individualism, self-expression and self-fulfillment.28

While it may be true that Manuel finds a change from equalitarianism to individualism in nineteenth century utopian thought, he still finds the compulsive need to order as a keystone of utopian style.

If they are examined as a body of psychological rather than historical documents, many utopias appear to be expressions of the obsessive, somewhat paranoid. How else shall one interpret the regulatory minutiae of Restif and Fourier, the repetitive details, the reduction of reality to a symmetrical uniform structure, the autarchy and isolation of most ideal commonwealths, the piling up of restrictions, the artificiality of relationships.29

Lewis Mumford - Judith Shklar

Lewis Mumford, in his classic The Story of Utopia, and Judith Shklar, in her more recent article "The Political Theory of Utopia," draw some of the same conclusions about


29 Manuel, "Toward a Psychological....." *op. cit.*, p. 10.
utopian varieties, notwithstanding the fact that they use differing terminology. Shklar sees true utopias as being isolated in time and space. For this reason she proposes that

The form of such works as Cabet's *Voyage to Icaria* and Bellamy's *Looking Backward* should not lead one to think that these perfected societies are in any sense utopias. Precisely because they affect the external format of the classical utopia they demonstrate most effectively the enormous differences between the old and new ways of thought.  

According to Shklar, these differences are due to the fact that

The nineteenth century imaginary society is not 'nowhere' historically. It is a future society. And, it too is a summons to action. The purpose of Cabet's expedition to set up Icaria in America was not simply to establish a small island of perfection; it was to be a nucleus from which a world of Icarians would eventually spring.  

Shklar adds that classical utopias were a method of rejecting the idea of "original sin." "Utopia is always a picture and a measure of the moral heights man could attain using only his 'natural power' purely by the natural light." Later Shklar finds that original sin became a less viable point of interest and the decline of the classical

---


utopia became imminent. Shklar does find that religious utopianism is tied to current political positions.

It has of late been suggested that the radicalism of the last century was a form of the 'messianism' or 'millennialism' of a transplanted eschatological consciousness. Psychologically this may be quite true in the sense that for many of the people who participated in radical movements social ideologies fed religious longings that traditional religions could not satisfy. These people may even have been responding to the same urges as the members of the medieval revolutionary millennialist sects. In this sense one may well regard radical ideology as a surrogate for unconventional 'religiosity.'

She does caution, however, that "One ought not to forget the rational element, the effort of intellectual understanding that is perfectly evident in the writings of Saint-Simon, Marx, Comte and all the rest."34

Lewis Mumford, an avowed utopist, agrees in essence with Shklar in his book, The Story of Utopias. Mumford describes what he calls the "idolum" which is an imaginary environment created by man as an escape.

...it is a sort of house of refuge to which we flee when our contacts with 'hard facts' become too complicated to carry through or too rough to face. On the other hand, it is by means of the idolum that the facts of the everyday world are brought together and

---

33 Ibid., p. 110.

34 Ibid., p. 111.
sorted and sifted, and a new sort of reality is projected back again upon the external world. One of these functions is escape or compensation; it seeks an immediate release from the difficulties or frustrations of our lot. The other attempts to provide a condition for our release in the future. The utopias that correspond to these two functions I shall call the utopias of escape and the utopias of reconstruction. The first leaves the external world the way it is; the second seeks to change it so that one may have intercourse with it on one's own terms.  

The first variety of utopia seen by Mumford as a kind of regression phenomenon. In fact, he goes so far as to say that "it carries with it the deep longing to return to and remain at rest in the mother's womb - the one perfect environment which all the machinery and legislation has never been able to reproduce."  

These utopias are in their essence correspondent to Shklar's pre-nineteenth century utopia. Moreover, the later utopias which Shklar sees concerned with future society are greatly similar to Mumford's "utopias of reconstruction."

It is, in Mumford's words, what its name implies: a vision of a reconstituted environment which is better adapted to the nature and aims of the human beings who dwell within it than the actual one; and

36 Ibid., p. 19.
not merely better adapted to their actual nature, but better fitted to their possible developments. If the first utopia leads backward into the utopian's ego, the second leads outward - outward into the world.37

Summation of Perspectives: Their Relationship to the Research

Certain themes permeate the writings of the preceding analysts. Most are content that society is in some way perceived inadequate by members of a given social position. The need to actualize the wish for improving one's status, stability or economic position may or may not be realized. Literary utopias for the most part are unacted upon. Among those utopists who do stimulate a structured social movement certain eminent differences appear.

First, the utopists must make decisions as to the "scale" of the ideal state. Typically classical utopists used the polis or city as the ideal size for the maintenance of ideal social relations. Post-industrial utopists were prone to use the nation state or perhaps even a world wide commonwealth. As one can see later, the Latter Day Saint movements have varied in the scale of their utopist concepts. It may be that personality variables such as the desire for "concreteness" may influence the desire for grandiose or limited utopian systems.

37 Ibid., p. 21.
Second, utopian constructs may vary according to the degree of "openness" or "closure" within the proposed social system. This relative desire for closure may manifest itself in several ways. One question relating to this problem has to do with the limitations on the growth of the community. Is growth to be encouraged or discouraged? Further, is the society open to all (in Parsons's terms, a universalistic position) or to a select status group (particularism)? Moreover, utopian groups may vary in their openness to dissent within their own organization, falling along a line of extreme openness as represented by the Brook Farm experiment to the rigorous conformity of the Shakers. Once again, the question occurs as to the degree of openness allowed by the Latter-Day Saint utopists. This study will attempt an answer to this question, in part at least.

A third "variable" in utopian constructs relates to the degree of industrialization foreseen by the utopist. Most American communitarian experiments were agricultural and isolated; only a few attempted industrial functions. This was primarily because they developed with European peasants as their "carrying class." With regard to the present study, it is shown that the "Mormon" utopists started with basically agrarian values but proceeded at a later date to take cognizance of the impact of industrialization.

Another aspect which manifests itself differently in each utopian writer and follower has to deal with his concept of
"time." The term "temporocentrism" has been applied to individuals' attitudes who consider the time of their life span the crucial epoch of world history. The degree of historical naivete' varies greatly from group to group. A group may be considered historically naive if it sees no relationship between itself and past events and movements. Messianic groups such as the early Latter Day Saint organization perceive of themselves as living in the "fullness of time" and therefore conceive of utopian ideals as a necessary prelude to a cataclysmic end of the earth. A great deal of historical evidence suggests that the Saints have in later years paid less homage to this belief.
It is difficult to place a beginning to Western utopian thought. Indeed, the very delineation of Western thought, as opposed to that stemming from Eastern sources, is a difficult feat. One may without fear of contradiction, however, point to the philosophical, ethical, and religious concepts of the ancient Hebrews and Greeks as producing the superstructure of Western thought.

Don Martindale in his Social Life and Cultural Change points to a period of time in varying societies which culminates in community building activity. Intellectuals are given comparatively free reign during this time. New ideas are embraced readily and generally a belief in a tentative variety of progress is held by elites in the society. For

---


2J B. Bury conceives of the idea of progress in this way "" is a theory which involves a synthesis of the past and a prophecy of the future. It is based on an interpretation of history which regards men as slowly advancing...in a definite and desirable direction and infers that this progress will continue indefinitely." From The Idea of Progress (New York: Dover, 1932) p. 5.

the ancient Israelites, this "axial period" probably occurred sometime after the exodus from Egypt under Moses during the thirteenth century B.C. It was at this time that the ethical code of the Decalogue was created. More importantly, the idea of the Promised Land, "flowing with milk and honey" was a kind of dream held by the children of Yahweh during the exodus. For Israel was, at this point in time, a group of clans and tribes held together only by the fact that they were surrounded by hostile aliens. The ancient Hebrews were without territory or a state.

At that critical juncture arose a man who through his supreme genius in statesmanship and religion resolved these conflicts into a new religious expression, an historical monotheism centering in the history of God's own, the chosen, people. Through his religious adeptness he created a unifying social force, with the capacity of developing beyond the desert or Palestine, beyond all natural boundaries, beyond state and territory.3

This man was, of course, Moses, and his utopian mission was continually frustrated by divisions among his people, idolatry, and constant threat of annihilation.

only from the skulls of his fallen enemies. But at least, it is progress, and it will cease to inflict torture after the industrial apocalypse when the day of reconciliation comes."

Possibly Israel came closest to the fruition of its utopian dreams about 1000 B.C. during the monarchies of Saul, David, and Solomon. The city of Zion, Jerusalem, was completed and its temple finished. Only a few generations later, however, the monarchy was, in effect, destroyed by the division of the kingdom into the Northern and Southern fragments. By 586 B.C. Jerusalem had fallen and the dream was severely tested.

Ezekiel was a prophet who functioned during the time of the Babylonian exile in 597 B.C. His apocalyptic teaching forecast the doom of Jerusalem.

Yahweh would annihilate them with hail, fire and brimstone from heaven. The corpses would be so numerous that it would require seven years to clear the land of their pollution. Eventually a golden age shared by both northern and southern kingdoms (fused into one) would arrive.4

The ethnic period of Judaism began as the Hebrews were unable to regain control of their sacred city. The messianic dream was, henceforth, sublimated into prophecy.

Meanwhile according to Martindale the positive core of beliefs which served as an integrating philosophy within the ethnic community was the conception of the Jews as God's chosen people...and the prophetic vision of Messiah who at sometime would bring about the socio-religious fulfillment of the religious promise.5

4Martindale, op. cit., p. 279.
5Ibid., p. 305.
Walter Rauschenbusch, a Christian socialist, speaks of the prophets in this way:

With the older prophets, their social ideal was not a utopian dream detached from present conditions, not a fair mirage floating in the air. It was within realizable distance. Its feet were planted on the actual social and political situation. However individualistic religion became, it never abandoned the collective hope as the real consummation of religion. ... The Book of Daniel is an interpretation of international relations and events, a programme for history to follow.6

Erich Fromm sees a change in the direction of the messianic dream of the Hebrews as an emphasis on social reform gives way to eschatological attitudes.

In the prophetic literature, the messianic vision rested upon the tension between what existed or was still there and that which was becoming and was yet to be. In the postprophetic period, a change took place in the meaning of the messianic idea, making its first appearance in the Book of Daniel around 164 B.C. and in pseudo-epigraphical literature... This literature has a vertical idea of salvation as against the 'horizontal' historical idea of the prophets. The emphasis is largely on the transformation of the individual and largely on a catastrophic end of history, occurring in a final cataclysm.7

---


The messianic faith was transformed and conceived symbolically in a myriad of ways, yet it was without a doubt a utopian complex of thought. Its reformist, revolutionary and even reactionary tendencies appear later in a host of religious groups, many of whom actually used the "Zionist" vocabulary as a set of symbols in their own systems of thought. The "New Jerusalem" has been sought by many divergent peoples. The messianic concept concerns a new union of men with men...

but they shall sit every man under his vine and under his fig tree, and none shall make them afraid; for the mouth of the Lord of hosts has spoken. For all the peoples walk each in the name of its god, but we will walk in the name of the Lord our God for ever and ever.®

The messianic peace is also a state of harmony of man with nature. "The wolf shall dwell with the lamb, and the leopard shall lie down with the kid, and the calf and the lion and the fatling together, and a little child shall lead them."®

Plato - The Ideal Polis

The true utopian is constant in his desire to create, in Voltaire's words, "the best of all possible worlds."

This creation is of necessity a negation of the extant world. Plato's *Republic* is often hailed as the first truly utopist document, yet it represents only partially a rejection of the Athenian and Spartan social order. Moreover, Plato was unrelenting in his antipathy toward anarchist or revolutionary solutions to the contemporary issues of his day.

"The Republic is based on the assumption that there is a strict parallelism between the city and the soul. Accordingly Socrates asserts that, just as there are five kinds of regimes, so there are five kinds of characters of men..."¹⁰ In its essence, *The Republic* concerns the right order of man and society, an adequate physiological and spiritual substance for a well-ordered polis and finally, the genesis and decline of the "just city."

The "just city" or the creation of justice through the city is the central moral question of Plato's work. Justice, as used by Plato, has a specific meaning. It refers to the rulership of wisdom over the inclinations of the appetites and desires of the human soul. Carried to the level of the polis, it refers to a proper division of labor. "One man cannot practice with success many arts."¹¹

---


"Shameful it is to meddle with others' business, and not to know one's own." Therefore, excessive dilettantism and the attempts to govern by those untrained or unfit to govern are in their end unjust.

Justice and health are parallel concepts according to Voegelin. "Health is defined as the establishment of an order by nature among the parts of the body; disease as a disturbance of the natural order of rule and subordination among the parts." Even more important than justice and health is Plato's distinction between **aletheia** (truth) and **pseudos** (falsehood).

True humanity requires true theology; the man with false theology is an untrue man. 'To be deceived or uninformed in the soul about true being means that the lie itself has taken possession of the highest part of himself and steeped it into ignorance of the soul...' If order is to be restored, the restoration must begin at the strategic point of the ignorance of the soul by setting aright the relation between man and God... This is the problem which dominates the Republic as a whole, and it dominates in particular the social critique. The attack on the corrupt society is not directed against this or that political abuse but against a disease of the soul.

12 Ibid., p. 65.
13 Ibid., p. 64.
14 Ibid., p. 68.
The Republic is frankly an elitist document. The philosopher king is developed by a rigorous educational and eugenics program. As long as the commoners stay within their assigned order their lives are comparatively unregulated. As for the "Guardians," a community of wives, an absence of personal property, and a regimented and lengthy education shape them for rule.

Ernest Barker comments that:

Under the whole scheme of communism, whether in respect of property or in respect of marriage, there lies the assumption that much can be done to abolish spiritual evils by the abolition of those material conditions in connection with which they are found. Spiritual dieting, it must always be remembered, is the first and primary cure in Plato's therapeutics; but a ruthless surgery of material things is also one of his means.15

If the ideal polis was limited as to social mobility and structure, it was also limited in size. Plato set the ideal city at 5,040 individuals or about the number that can be conveniently addressed by a single orator. The premise of Platonic thought here was that solidarity and common interest were inverse to numbers of citizens. An optimal size then limited the growth of the polis to that necessary to fulfill the demands of the division of labor.

The just and healthy city is dependent upon a class structure which has its roots in basic differences in human potential; wisdom, for example, is a necessary component of the philosophic Guardians. Valor is a needed characteristic of the military class called "auxiliaries." The laborers and farmers must be guided by temperance, as indeed must all other classes.

Plato's utopian thought followed realistic lines. First, the ideal Republic can only be approximated by a given people.

The just city is not a self-subsisting being like the idea of justice, located ... in a superheavenly place. Its status is rather like that of a painting of a perfectly beautiful human being, i.e., it is only by virtue of the painter's painting; more precisely, the just city is only 'in speech;' it 'is' only by virtue of having been figured out with a view to justice itself or to what is by nature right on the one hand and the human all-to-human on the other. Although the just city is decidedly of lower rank than justice itself, even the just city as a pattern is not capable of coming into being as it has been blueprinted; only approximations to it can be expected in cities which are in deed and not merely in speech.16

Further, if the ideal state came into being, it would not exhaust history of its possibilities, for as Voegelin points out:

16 Strauss, op. cit., p. 29.
The good polis is not exempt from the cosmic mystery of Being and Becoming. The Form that has been embodied will be disembodied; it is beyond the powers of man to overcome the transitoriness of the flux and to create eternal Being... Timocracy, oligarchy, democracy and tyranny are the stages through which the good polis passes on its way of decline to the ultimate malady of the polis.17

The Republic was, in a literal sense, a lost book for the thousand year period between the fifth and the fifteenth centuries. It was not, however, without influence during this time nor was the utopian dream totally dead at this period. Some have derived the three medieval estates - the oratores, bellatores, laboratores, from the three classes of men described in The Republic.

According to Barker,

the analogies between Platonic doctrine and medieval theory and practice go still deeper. The communism of the Republic had not only its parallel in the communism of the monastic system, under which a farming class of villeins paid part of their produce for the common consumption of monks who protected them by their prayers; it was part of the doctrine of the Church, and affected the canonical theory of property.18

17 Voegelin, op. cit., pp. 122, 123.

18 Barker, op. cit., p. 446.
Medieval Utopists

With the end of the Greek and Roman eras, "reason" became little more than a mode of restating traditional Christian orthodoxies. Augustine's City of God contains some utopian ideas but is, in essence, an attack on the old order of Rome.

By the fifth century A.D., however, monasticism had come into Europe in a large way.

As Benedictine abbeys came gradually to be established more and more... in the midst of the wild Teutonic populations that were settling throughout Western Europe, they became object lessons in disciplined and well ordered life, in organized work, in all the arts of peace, that could not but impress powerfully the minds of the surrounding barbarians, and bring home to them the ideals of peace and order and work, no less than religion.

Christian asceticism, in a sense, has its roots in a rejection of the existing order of things and, therefore, in a restricted sense is utopist. The self-sufficiency and "closure" of the monastic community does, in many ways, mirror the utopian schemes of later retreatist communal thinkers. A true social movement, however, is dependent

---

upon a "carrying class."²⁰ It was only later than deprived social classes brought European utopian thought to its full fruition.

No account of medieval utopian thought can ignore the literary work of Sir Thomas More and Thomas Companella.

More was born in London in 1478 and died on the scaffold in 1535 due to the intolerance and despotism of Henry VIII. The *Utopia* was first published in French in 1516. More had structured his text into two books. The first concerned the alarming increase of poverty and crime which More saw as due to the unjust abrogation of peasant proprietorship within the enclosure movement. Further, More attacked the idleness and self-indulgence of the nobles and the spiritual degeneration of the clergy.

The second book conveys More's thoughts on Utopia (literally translated as "nowhere").

In Utopia there are no rich or poor, but all share; and no severe laws are required, because there are no inducements to crime... The Utopians are all equal and their government elective. One man, called the philarch, is chosen as their patriarchal chief by every group of thirty families... and over every ten of these philarchs presides a person called the proto-philarch... There are fifty four large and beautiful cities in the Island of Utopia... The

²⁰ This term is taken from Rudolf Heberle's *Social Movements* (New York: Appleton Century Crofts, 1951).
hours of labour are reduced as all share in the work, and the leisure hours of the utopians are employed in the cultivation of the arts and sciences, specially music, since intellectual pleasures are considered as the highest source of enjoyment. Finery in dress and vulgar display of grand furniture and equipage are out of the question, and wealth is held in utter contempt, gold being considered inferior to iron, as being less useful. Private property, movable or real, is abolished, as being a constant standing danger of reintroducing the evils attending upon inequality.21

Although More's Utopia was based to an extent on The Republic, More did not, as did Plato, insist on a rigid division of labor.

Yea, and any person after he hath learned one craft be desirous to learn another he is likewise suffered and permitted. When hath learned both, he occupieth whether he will unless the city hath more need of one than another.22

While the Utopia produced no groups to actualize its concepts, it stands as a classic of intellectual utopian craftsmanship.

Thomas Campanella, an Italian Jesuit, created a work which, while not as influential as The Utopia, was a work of great significance as medieval times were brought


22 Ibid.
to close. His *City of the Sun* opposed slavery and opted for a system of free labor. All men would be required to labor; the work day was to be shortened to no more than four hours, however. Citizens of the City of the Sun are affluent: "They are rich because they want nothing, poor because they possess nothing; and consequently they are not slaves to circumstances, but circumstances serve them." Campanella, like Plato, advocated a eugenics program. Moreover, he, like the author of *The Republic*, advocated a kind of ascetic, barracks life for males in the community.

The core of Campanella's idea lay in the concept of "idleness" as the grounding of all vice. Excessive wealth produces the idle rich; poverty produces a class of beggars.

William Gutherie notes that Campanella follows Plato in his theory of social unity.

> When discussing the family and its place in the state, Plato condemns the family as an obstacle to the perfect devotion of the citizen to the state. Banish family life and the citizen has no cause for pride, no object of devotion, no stimulus to effort and sacrifice except the state. The state, as an institution is then without a rival.\(^2^4\)


Anabaptists - The New Jerusalem

One of the truly revolutionary medieval utopian movements was the Anabaptist schism of the sixteenth century in northern Europe. H. Richard Niebuhr writes in his, *The Social Sources of Denominationalism*, that

The failure of the Reformation to meet the religious needs of peasants and other disfranchised groups is a chapter writ large in history. With all of its native religious fervor it remained the religion of the middle classes and the nobility. The Peasants War and the Anabaptist Movement were the result... Thomas Muenzer, the arch-enemy of Luther, was Anabaptist as well as revolutionary leader.25

Further, Neibuhr quotes Luther as exhorting the peasants:

Ye shall not resist evil, but whosoever shall compel thee to go one mile, go with him two...and whosoever smiteth thee thy right cheek turn to him the other also.

A different kind of message was given by Luther to the peasants' masters in his pamphlet, *Against the Thieving and Murderous Hordes of Peasants*,

Here let whoever can give blows, strangle, stab - secretly or openly - and remember that nothing can be more poisonous, harmful, and devilish than a revolutionary; just as one must kill a mad dog, for if you do not slay him he will slay you and a whole land with you.26

---

25 H. Richard Niebuhr, *The Social Sources of Denominationalism* (Cleveland: World, 1929) p. 34.

Thus, official Lutheranism had become an established church with a predominantly aristocratic set of interests according to Neibuhr. It was in this milieu that Muenzer and those who followed after him protested against the established order of things. Other apocalyptic movements, such as the German and Italian Flagellants, had convulsed Europe during the middle of the fourteenth century. They arose basically within the structure of the Catholic Church and were, in part, reactions to the plague which had destroyed almost one third of the European population sometime before. The Anabaptist Movement demonstrated strains of utopian thought hitherto unborn, however.

Thomas Muenzer was born in Thuringia in 1488 some five or six years later than Martin Luther. After his theological and scriptural study, Muenzer became a follower of Luther and broke away from Catholic orthodoxy. Muenzer became attracted to the chiliastic doctrines being preached at this time in Bohemia. The "last days" he felt were at hand. "First the Turks must conquer the world and AntiChrist must rule over it; but then - and it would be very soon - the Elect would rise up and annihilate all godless, so that the Second Coming could take place and the Millenium begin."27 The Book of Revelation was

increasingly quoted by Muenzer in an attempt to gain followers. He was finally expelled from Prague and began to wander about in central Germany preaching concerning the end of time and of the new order of things. Essentially, his was the notion of a community of the elect surrounded by a wicked world. The elect were to be the poor, and in this sense, the "last were to be first." As Belfort Bax comments in his *Rise and Fall of the Anabaptists*, "the original strain of ecclesiastical radicalism...received an accession of strength from the sentiment of an oppressed class in which political and economic considerations mixed themselves up with religious enthusiasm."28

Princes, according to Muenzer, had forfeit all claims to obedience on the part of the peasants. The nobility was in its essence ungodly and opposed to the will of Christ, and, thus, part and parcel of the Anti-Christ of the Book of Revelation. The "cleansing" Muenzer spoke of frequently was not a nonviolent proposal.

If the holy Church is to be renewed through the bitter truth, a servant of God must stand forth...and set things in motion. In truth, many of them will have to be roused, so that with the greatest possible zeal and with passionate earnestness they may sweep Christendom clean of ungodly rulers.29


By 1525 Muenzer felt his eschatological phantasies were approaching reality. He led a large but unorganized army of peasants near Frankenhausen. His army was immediately sought out and soon destroyed by his princely opponents. The peasants scattered as they panicked, and Muenzer was later found in a cellar and beheaded on the twenty-seventh of May.

His ideas did not die with him, however. One reason for this was the extreme diversity of the Anabaptist sects. The theological issues which held the Sects together were vague but revolved around rebaptism of believers, a rejection of infant baptism and a rather meticulous observance of literal precepts found in the New Testament. For the most part,

Their values were primarily ethical; for them religion was above all a matter of active brotherly love. Their communities were modelled on what they supposed to have been the practice of the early Church and were intended to realize the ethical ideal propounded by Christ.  

Like later utopists, they sought to isolate their communities from nonbelievers, because of their self concept as the "Elect." After the death of Muenzer they suffered

30 Almost 8,000 peasants participated in this uprising, more than half were later killed.

31 Cohn, op. cit., p. 273-4.
a great deal of persecution which, of course, reinforced their faith and their need for withdrawal.

By 1534 the power of the Anabaptists in the City of Muntzer increased greatly. Most of the Lutheran populace left at this point. According to Cohn,

The majority of the remaining population was Anabaptist; and messengers and manifests were sent out urging the Anabaptists in nearby towns to come with their families to Muntzer. The rest of the earth, it was announced, was doomed to be destroyed before Easter; but Muntzer would be saved and would become the New Jerusalem.32

True communization of property was also affirmed at Muntzer.

All I.O.U.'s, account books and contracts were destroyed. All clothing, bedding, furniture, hardware, weapons and stocks of food were removed and placed in central depots. It was announced that true Christians should possess no money of their own but should hold all money in common.33

This radical revision of the economic system was, in fact, a reversion to earlier modes of communal peasant life. It gave a kind of stability to the chaotic economic system of feudal Germany.

An even more revolutionary change in the social life of the faithful Anabaptist was to follow. Finding that

32 Ibid., p. 284.

33 Ibid., pp. 286-7.
the Old Testament sanctioned polygamy, the Believers were asked to accept the principle of "plural wifery" as an article of faith. All unmarried women of marriageable age were required to marry a male member of the community. No marriage was valid if it had been contracted with a nonbeliever. This broke several nuptial bonds and placed many women in the marriageable category. According to Cohn, "refusal to comply with the new law was made a capital offense and some women were, in fact, executed."\footnote{35}

Finally, Cohn states,

\begin{quote}

divorce had to be permitted and this in turn changed polygamy into something not very different from free love...it seems certain that norms of sexual behavior in the Kingdom of the Saints traversed the whole arc from a rigorous puritanism to sheer promiscuity.\footnote{36}
\end{quote}

At the height of its power, the Anabaptist leaders were able to control almost completely the lives of its membership. Bax describes the articles of the constitution of the Anabaptists in this way, "They were regulating the victualling of the New Israel, the fabrication of clothes and other details affecting the industrial and economic life of the community."\footnote{37}

\footnote{34 The more correct term is "polygyny."}

\footnote{35 Ibid., p. 293.}

\footnote{36 Ibid., p. 294.}

\footnote{37 Bax, op. cit., p. 200.}
The year 1535 saw a blockade thrown around the "New Jerusalem" of the Anabaptists. A series of surprise attacks by the nobility and the capture of the Anabaptist "prophet," John of Leyden, produced the end of the sacred community. While the formal structure of the group was effectively rooted out by the authorities, the Anabaptist Movement later gave birth to the Mennonite and Brethren Utopist sects.\(^{38}\)

In retrospect, Belford Bax comments:

> In such wise did the disinherited classes of that age envisage their social revaluation... The aspirations \textit{au fond} legitimate as they were, of the medieval working classes of the 16th century, were historically retrograde in their form both as regards the end conceived, and the means by which it was believed that end would come to pass - and hence they were foredoomed to failure.\(^{39}\)

---

\(^{38}\) It also influenced the Baptists and Quakers to a degree.

\(^{39}\) Bax, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 389.
Henri de Saint Simon, Charles Fourier, and Robert Owen represent in differing ways the changing mode of thought called "utopian" at the beginning of the nineteenth century. Fourier's *Traite d'Association Domestique Agricole*, appeared in Paris in 1822. Saint Simon's work, *Le System Industrial*, had appeared one year earlier in the same city. Robert Owen's *Report to the County of Lanark*, was published in 1820 in London. Earlier works by Saint Simon and Fourier had paved the way for more elaborate schemes of societal reorganization. Martin Buber points out that "Saint Simon was born twelve years before Fourier and died twelve years before him, and yet both belong to the generation which was born before the French Revolution and perished before 1848..."¹ Buber believes, however, that Fourier belongs by nature and outlook to the eighteenth century and the older, Saint Simon, to the nineteenth century.²

Each in his own way contributed, nevertheless, to the general tenor and optimism of the times. Moreover, each


² Ibid.
saw history as fulfilled and ultimately rational due to their own work.

Fourierism

Charles Fourier has been called a fantastic and extravagant writer. His passion for order can even be seen as pathological. Yet, it is true that Fourier, as much as any European utopist, developed an almost complete and systematic theoretical grounding for his ideas.

Man, according to Fourier, is a creature of "passions" or "drives." The need for change and variety, the need for bodily and mental satisfaction, the need for rivalry and self-interest are not in themselves destructive. "The passions believed to be the enemies of concord in reality conduce to that unity from which we deem them so far removed." If these passions were directed into constructive and useful channels, an environment of harmonious cooperation could be achieved.

...men must he says unite into harmonious associations which will give play to all their activities, and which, by erecting common institutions, will do away with the waste arising in the individual's attempts to do for himself all the things which would be done by a complete community.


Capitalism and its product, "civilization," are ill suited to provide for the basic needs of man. Competition, the greatest evil of capitalism, leads to blind struggles for wealth and power. Waste produces poverty and a generalized sense of misery.

Thus,

...c'est par l'exces de ses vices que la civilisation marchait à sa ruine. L'esprit mercantile, ne depuis un siècle etant la forme plus hideuse que puisse prendre la civilisation, devait devenir le principe de la chute.  

Fourier was no friend of moderation as a solution to the problem of avarice either.

Si vous voulez entrer dans les vues de la nature, soyez plutôt de grands criminels que de médiocres scélérats qui se font sufflicier. Le plus grand vice aux yeux de la nature, c'est la lenteur, la lethargie du mouvement social, si elle se trouve dans les routes des la perfidie, c'est-a-dire de la civilisation, elle favorise les plus perfides, et de même les plus féroces dans l'état barbare. La triomphe de la moderation qui tiendrait en équilibre les vices et les vertus éterniseraït l'ordre subversif.

---


In short, Fourier saw capitalism "as a hierarchy of industrial feudalism with two ladders: an ascending scale of hatred and a descending scale of contempt."\(^7\)

The solution to the problem was, of course, the creation of a new society. Fourier favored the creation of self sufficient communities termed "phalansteries." The scale of the community was somewhat smaller than Plato's concept of the polis. Sixteen hundred persons were to occupy a district of about 5,000 acres. Lewis Mumford describes the organization in this way:

> The principle of the association is concretely embodied in a vast edifice in the center of the domain: a palace complete in all its appointments serving as the residence of the association. In this palace there are three wings, corresponding to the material, the social and the intellectual domains. In one wing are the workshops and the halls of industry. In another are the library, the scientific collections, museums, artists studios and the like. In the center, devoted to the social element, are banquet halls, a hall of reception and grand salons.\(^8\)

Private property was not to be abolished. Men would work, according to Fourier, because work would lose its image as an onerous set of tasks and would become a new

---

\(^7\) Schapiro, *op. cit.*, p. 27.

\(^8\) Mumford, *op. cit.*, p. 120.
means of expressing one's creativity and developing one's own creativity. A joint stock company was to be created which would assure justice to the individual. The phalanx or self-governing body of the group was to act as a unit in commercial exchange, however, and would trade surplus goods with similar groups.

Since man's nature was not seen by Fourier as essentially equalitarian, hierarchies were inevitable. He railed at the Simonians' commitment to the abolition of property. However, Frank Manuel points to Fourier's idea that

with the prevalence of such real luxury everywhere there could be no class alignments on the basis of wealth. While the differences existed, they did not matter. Moreover, there was great social mobility, and men and women would shift easily from one economic category to another because passions, not money, would dictate amorous alliances. Fourier's preservation of a rudimentary economic hierarchy at times seems a mere strategem to win rich adherents in a blended world of civilization where men do not recognize true values - their own desires.9

The passions relating to the amorous side of man were recognized by Fourier to be varied and complex. Purely physical sexual relationships were not seen as evil, nor were relationships of a transitory nature. When a man or

woman with a diverse passionate nature was constricted within the bonds of monogamous marriage, he was forced to seek other sexual pleasures clandestinely. This contributes to the hypocrisy of the civilized man.\(^{10}\)

Fourier confronted the society of his time with a basic challenge: "The scene is changing and truth, which you feigned to seek, will appear to confound you. It remains for you, as for the dying gladiator, to fall with honor...seize the torch, throw on the pyres the rubbish of your philosophical libraries."\(^{11}\)

Fourier died without persuading any rich benefactor to provide resources for his scheme. Yet later, as this paper will show, Fourier's doctrines inspired the establishment of numerous experimental communities\(^{12}\) including the famous Brook Farm venture in America in 1841.

Fourier's later years were spent in writing bitter polemics against the disciples of Saint Simon and Robert Owen because they sought to change the basics of human nature instead of creating a society which would complement and expand

\(^{10}\) It is interesting to note that the Mormon argument against monogamy follows the same line of thought.

\(^{11}\) As quoted in Frank and Fritzie Manuel, French Utopias (New York: Free Press, 1966) p. 327.

\(^{12}\) Most of which ignored his rigid requirements for the establishment of the phalanstery, however.
the "system of passionate attraction." Instead of erecting a standard for men to live up to," writes Lewis Mumford,

and rejecting mankind as unfit for utopia because the standard is far beyond its height, the standard itself is founded upon the utmost capacity which a community might be able to exhibit. Fourier meets human nature half way; he endeavors to project a society which will give regular channels to all its divergent impulses, and prevent them from spilling unsocially all over the landscape... He remains, I believe, the first man who had a plan for colonizing the wilderness of industrial barbarism that existed at the beginning of the nineteenth century, and redeeming that wilderness to civilization.13

Saint-Simon and His Followers

Perhaps the most unique and certainly the most colorful of the European utopists was Henri de Saint Simon whose personal life intertwined with the great historical events of revolutionary and post-revolutionary France. He was born to an aristocratic family but renounced his title as he perceived the tide of revolution approaching France. Saint Simon, after his many military and economic adventures, found himself without income or resources and was supported by his former valet. It was at this point in his career that he began to completely turn toward social reorganization

13 Mumford, op. cit., p. 123.
and philosophy. His first work, *Lettres d'un Habitant de Geneve*, in 1803 and his last, *Nouveau Christianism*, in 1825 carried the same moral tone. Society was in disorder. It was irrationally conceived and its morality was banal and superstitious.

The task of the nineteenth century, as seen by Saint Simon, was to rebuild an organic society by utilizing the new forces created by man - industrialism and science. "The philosophy of the eighteenth century," he says, "has been critical and revolutionary; that of the nineteenth century will be inventive and constructive."[^14]

The leadership of the new society was to be the scientists, technicians, businessmen and bankers. They were to have as their goal the amelioration of the lot of the poorest and most numerous classes. Saint Simon did not advocate a classless society, however. Quite the contrary, he comments that, "The preservation of property is the main object of politics. The only barrier which the property-owners can put up against the proletariat is a system of ethics."[^15]

In another work, he postulates that "Society cannot exist


[^15]: Ibid., p. xxvii.
without inequality of wealth, and inequality cannot exist without religion."\(^{16}\)

What Saint Simon proposed, then, was a kind of benevolent autocracy which would alleviate the new problems created by democratization and industrialization.

Saint Simon, unlike many who dreamed of a new world without conflict or injustice, failed to limit the scale of his proposed enterprise. He wished his ethic to be universal and unlimited by national boundaries. In 1814 his De La Reorganisation de la Societe Europeenne proposed a kind of United States of Europe as an initial step in the unification of mankind.

There will come a time \((\text{he says})\) ...when all the peoples of Europe will feel that questions of common interest must be dealt with before coming down to national interests; then evils will begin to lessen, troubles abate, wars die out. That is the ultimate direction in which we are steadily progressing...
The Golden Age of the human race is not behind us but before us; it lies in the perfection of the social order. Our ancestors never saw it; our children will one day arrive there; it is for us to clear the way.\(^{17}\)

Science was the key to the future. Yet, scientists, Saint Simon believed, were not yet aware of their historic

\(^{16}\text{Ibid.}, \ p. \ xviii.\)

\(^{17}\text{Ibid.}, \ p. \ 68.\)
role. In 1813 he wrote an epistle to the scientific community which cried out that, "All Europe is in a death struggle, what are you doing to stop this butchery? Nothing. It is you who perfect the means of destruction."  

Science may well promote the end of poverty and facilitate rationality, but it was not the sole answer according to Saint Simon. Social cohesion is an organic sense and an end to extreme egotism could be accomplished only by a religious ethic. The needed religious posture of mankind could be established by "the new Christianity."

New Christianity is called upon to achieve the triumph of the principles of universal morality in the struggle which is going on with the forces aiming at the individual instead of public interests. This rejuvenated religion is called upon to organize all peoples in a state of perpetual peace... It is called upon to link together the scientists, artists, and industrialists, as of the particular interests of each individual people... Finally, New Christianity is called upon to pronounce anathema upon theology, and to condemn as unholy any doctrine trying to teach men that there is any other way of obtaining eternal life, except that of working with all their might for the improvement of the conditions of life of their fellowmen.  

---

18 Ibid., p. xivi. This is strikingly similar to more current critics of the scientific community, such as Bertrand Russell and others.

19 Ibid., p. 105.
The Golden Rule was the essence of Christianity. Since orthodox Christianity had sanctioned violence, nationalism, and corruption, Saint Simon believed that it had lost its ethical raison d'être.

Frank Manuel comments on Saint Simon's ethical position in this way:

The industrial society with the New Christianity as its moral principle with a capitalist society working under a profit system. Saint Simon saw no inconsistency between entrepreneurial activity and the moral ideal of the New Christianity. In this sense, he was one of the great ideologists of modern philanthropic capitalism.20

Saint Simon's utopian ideals did not die with him. They were, in fact, systematized and espoused with great enthusiasm by his pupils, Rodrigues, Bayard, and Enfantin. By 1828 the positivistic aspects of Saint Simon were neglected by his followers. In their place, a vaguely humanistic cult dominated by hysteria grew. "The noisy debates among the apostles transpired in an atmosphere of general hysteria which induced seizures and fainting spells. Men saw visions of Christ and Enfantin."21


21 Ibid., p. 152.
In the third decade a quarrel between two of Saint Simon's heirs apparent, Bayard and Enfantin, developed over the proper relationship between the sexes. In 1832 Enfantin wrote,

We may see men and women united by a love unknown before, since it will neither grow cold, nor bring jealousy in its train; men and women giving themselves to several without ceasing to be united as a couple; whose love on the contrary, will be like a divine banquet increasing in magnificence, in proportion to the number and choice of guests.22

Needless to say, this kind of language and the action resultant therefrom, created a great deal of ridicule and gossip by the less "enlightened" citizenry of Paris. Yet Manuel believes that Saint Simonian thought was not without value.

Simultaneously the Saint Simonians, Fourier, and Auguste Comte made a momentous discovery. They came to realize that women, one half of humanity, with their unique capacity for feeling, tenderness and passion, had been suppressed for centuries because the Judeo-Christian tradition had identified them with evil, with the flesh, and with the grosser parts of human nature. The Saint-Simonian proclamation of the emancipation of women, Fourier's masterful depictions of their real needs and wants, and Comte's idealization of his beloved angel broke not only with Catholicism but with the eighteenth-century

22 Saint Simon, op. cit., p. xxxviii.
tradition of many philosophers who even in their most expansive moods had regarded women as either frivolous or lesser human beings. The demise of the Saint Simonian sect was unspectacular. Enfantin attempted in 1833 to construct a canal from Cairo to Suez but failed three years later. Many ex-Saint Simonians, including Enfantin, were instrumental in the creation of railways and banks.

The essential paradox in the Saint Simonian utopian system lies in his attempt to fuse science and technology with an authoritarian "love of humanity." Science which has its roots in free inquiry is often at odds with the dominant myths of a given society and, for this reason, it is always potentially subversive to the social order. In the end, his followers resolved the tension between the two systems by rejecting science and opting for a mystical, but emotionally satisfying ritual.

Robert Owen - New Lâmark

It is perhaps characteristic of his bourgeois English background that Robert Owen led a less quixotic and colorful existence than his two French contemporaries. He was born in North Wales, May 14, 1771. As an extraordinarily precocious

and ambitious young man, he borrowed one hundred pounds from a brother and flung himself into the cotton spinning business with no little success. For the next four years he managed a large mill at Manchester where he had authority over five hundred men, women and children. Owen had become a Freethinker at this point in his career and was vitally interested in the literary and philosophical discussions of his day.  

By his twenty-eighth year he was married and part proprietor of the New Lanark Mills. As one writer says,

_This event forms the turning point in Owen's career... He had heard of the diseases and other terrible evils that were caused by the herding of pauper apprentices in insanitary dens in the neighborhood of the mills... Children were made to work night and day, in heated rooms, uncleansed and unventilated, with little or no provision for teaching, care or education. In the worst cases, there were beatings and other brutal punishments._

Owen was moved by what he saw. In his autobiography,  

Owen leads one to believe that he rapidly organized a

---

24 For example, see G.D.H. Cole, _Robert Owen_ (Boston: Little Brown, 1925); Rowland Hill Harvey, _Robert Owen, Social Idealist_ (Berkeley: University Press, 1949); or Frank Podmore, _Robert Owen a Biography_ (New York: Appleton, 1907).


systematic plan for the social redemption of his people; however, according to a recent writer, "It seems more probable that as he worked to eliminate the grosser abuses, the idea took shape in his mind that he might make the town a model one."\textsuperscript{27}

Owen became determined to end the pauper labor arrangements, also. Later he attempted to clean the streets of refuse at the expense of the company. He did manage to accomplish a great many significant changes at Lanark. Nevertheless, his business partners and many of the townsfolk were unconvinced by his efforts. By 1813 he had secured the aid of several rather remarkable philanthropes, including Jeremy Bentham, the philosopher.

Owen's gradually formulated utopian message came to Europe at a time when the Napoleonic struggles were in full bloom. "The misery of the working classes passed beyond all bounds. Hunger-driven mobs smashed machines, burned barns, and threatened the very existence of government."\textsuperscript{28}

It was at this point that Owen published a kind of manifesto which was in part a forerunner of "cultural determinism."

\textsuperscript{27} Harvey, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 31.

\textsuperscript{28} Ibid., p. 31.
Facts prove: \(\text{He wrote in 1817}\) First - that character is universally formed for, and not by, the individual. Second - that any habits and sentiments may be given to mankind. Third - that the affections are not under the control of the individual. Fourth - that every individual may be trained to produce far more than he can consume... Fifth - that nature has provided means by which population may be at all times maintained in the proper state to give the greatest happiness to every individual, without one check of vice or misery. \(\text{He explicitly rejects Malthus here}\) Sixth - that any community may be arranged... to place every individual under circumstances in which he shall enjoy more permanent happiness than can be given to any individual under the principles which have hitherto regulated society... \(\text{This may be } 29\) effected without the slightest injury to any human being.

Owen's premise here was that behavior is learned and, further, that the "correct" modes of societal adjustment are learned in precisely the same way as nonadaptive means.

"Correct" modes of existence lead to the Benthamite dictum that the proper end of government is the greatest happiness for the greatest number. Owen then proposed a national system of education for the poor:

Either give the poor a rational and useful training, or mock not their ignorance, their poverty, and their misery, by merely instructing them to be conscious of the extent of the degradation under which they exist. And, therefore...either keep the poor, if you now can, in the state of the most abject

ignorance, as near as possible to animal life, or at once determine to form them into rational beings, into useful and effective members of the state.\textsuperscript{30}

Owen was also in the vanguard of the newly awakening birth control movement. Contraceptives, he believed, could be used rationally to limit and plan family size.

By 1820 Owen had fashioned a fairly coherent set of economic doctrines. He formulated a theory of "value" much like that of his friend, David Ricardo. "Manual labour, properly directed, is the source of all wealth, and of national prosperity."\textsuperscript{31} Currency, Owen felt, should, therefore, be based solely upon labor. Cooperative villages were to be formed, some by the middle class, some by the lower class. Common dining rooms were to be furnished, while private apartments would be set up for all adults.

With the absence of selfishness and egotism, surplus would be achieved rather easily. Waste would be avoided. Surpluses could be exchanged between associations, and this division of labor would result in a relatively high standard of living for all.

Owen, like all utopists who attempt to act out their schemes, drew a great deal of abuse from the stalwart defenders

\textsuperscript{30} As quoted in Harvey, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 35.

\textsuperscript{31} \textit{Ibid.}, p. 85.
of the status quo. For example, the clergy bitterly disputed his ideals. One Reverend Singer called on all who heard Owen "not to sacrifice their Bible to Mr. Owen's pamphlet, nor their Redeemer to Mr. Owen's metaphysics."\(^{32}\)

By 1824 Owen, although he still maintained belief in the ultimate perfectibility of all men, began to believe that a strategic retreat from Britain and Ireland was advantageous. It was thus that he began with many others the several decades of community building in nineteenth century America.

---

32 Ibid., p. 91.
COMMUNITARIANISM IN AMERICA

A map of the United States showing the existence of utopists communities extant during the 18th and 19th centuries would point to the pervasive nature of communal life in early American society. John Humphrey Noyes, for example, in investigating the Owenite and Fourierist colonies in existence from 1824 to 1850 cites four Owenite groups in Indiana, three in New York, two in Ohio and Pennsylvania and one in Tennessee. 1 Fourierist groups were found in this number: eight in Ohio, six in New York, six in Pennsylvania, three in Massachusetts, three in Illinois, two in New Jersey, two in Wisconsin, two in Indiana and one in Iowa. The number of individuals living in these communal arrangements at this period he estimates at about 8,640. The amount of land reported is over 135,000 acres. Again, it must be reiterated that this number does not include the numerous Mennonite groups, Spiritualist associations, Moravians, Zoarites, Icarians, Shakers, and Latter Day Saints. It is, in reality, impossible to account for all the groups in the New World who sought heaven on earth. One can be certain that the image many Europeans had of

America as a land innocent and unspoiled added to its attraction as a seedbed for community building.

**Shaker Societies**

One of the earliest and most notable of the American utopian movements was the United Society of Believers in Christ's Second Appearing - usually known as the Shakers. Ann Lee, its founder and prophetess, was born in Manchester, England, in 1736. She was given to vision as were many religious nonconformists of her day and was frequently imprisoned for her heretical views. While in prison in 1770 she was granted a vision of Christ which showed her

> a full and clear view of the mystery of iniquity, of the root and foundation of human depravity, and of the very act of transgression committed by the first man and woman in the Garden of Eden. The sexual act itself.

Mother Ann, as she was now called, left England in 1774 for New York. Her husband William was said to have revolted somewhat from her newly imposed rule of celibacy; at any rate he soon eloped with another woman.

---

2 Many of her religious ideas were taken from the "Camisards," a French Protestant group which had fled to England to protect itself from religious persecution.

Mother Ann's movement was clearly millenarianist.

A typical prophetic utterance by the "Shaking Quakers" or "Shakers" as they were often called is as follows:

... Amend your lives. Repent. For the Kingdom of God is at hand. The new heaven and new earth prophesied of old is about to come. The marriage of the lamb, the first resurrection, the new Jerusalem descending from above, these are even now at the door. And when Christ appears again, and the true church rises in full and transcendent glory, then all anti-Christian denominations - the priests, the church, the pope - will all be swept away.4

The religious revivals sweeping the burned-over districts of New York were not without their effect on the Shakers. Shakerism became more ritualistic in the new world and from all accounts, even more dionysian in technique as well.

In the best part of their worship everyone acts for himself, and almost everyone different from the other: one will stand with his arms extended, acting over odd postures, which they call signs; another will be dancing, and sometimes hopping on one leg about the floor...; another will be prostrate on the floor... some groaning most dismally; some trembling extremely; others acting as though all their nerves were convulsed; others swinging their arms with all vigor ... They have several such exercises in a day, especially on the Sabbath.5

---

5 Ibid., p. 28.
The Shakers, like the early Christians, were convinced that the return of Christ would take place in their generation. Their task then was to withdraw from the world and to live in harmony until the cosmic event occurred. This was to be coupled with an intensive missionary effort through the eastern states. Between 1781 and 1783 the Shakers' campaign gained them many converts and much persecution as well.\(^6\) Mother Ann died in 1784 and was succeeded by Joseph Meacham or "Father Joseph" as he was called.

Father Joseph began to establish communities on the basis of a common charter. He also drew up the code and principles which were to govern the first eleven societies. The Covenant stated that

\begin{quote}
All members might have an equal right and privilege, according to their calling and needs, in things spiritual and temporal. And in which we have a greater privilege and opportunity, of doing good to each other, and the rest of mankind and receiving according to our needs, jointly and equally, one with another, in one joint union and interest.\(^7\)
\end{quote}

Communism was a spiritual answer to the evils of unrestrained egoism, just as celibacy was the answer to

\(^6\)This was due in part to their refusal to bear arms in the Revolutionary War.

\(^7\)Andrews, op. cit., p. 62.
unrestrained lust. All were to dress in plain and modest apparel; all were to live in a common dwelling and in "consecrated labor."

Hand labor was an integral part of the process if only to avoid poverty... But manual work was glorified from higher motives. It was good for both the individual soul and the collective welfare, mortifying lust, teaching humility, creating order and convenience, supplying a surplus for charity supporting the structure of fraternity, protecting it from the world, and strengthening it for increasing service.

The structure of the movement had as its basic unit "the family" which was composed of "brother" and "sister" celibates living in the same buildings. "Brothers" and "sisters" were not allowed to pass each other on the stairs, speak to each other alone, eat together or the like. Usually about four families constituted a "society" which might contain as many as eighty persons.

Each family was administered by two elders and two elderesses, who formed the ministry responsible for both the temporal and spiritual welfare of the societies... The authority of this self-perpetuating ministry was absolute, with appeal. It appointed its own successors, without election and exacted implicit obedience. The leading elders... heard all confessions, knew the whereabouts and occupations of every shaker in their family, conducted the initiation of novices, controlled

---

8 Ibid., p. 104.
the movements of trustees in their dealings with the world, and exercised their power in numerous other ways.\textsuperscript{9}

By 1830 the Shaker Church had reached a membership of about 5,000, in about eighteen large societies. Nordhoff's census of the Shaker communities in 1874 found less than half that number (2,415) active. The last community to fall, in New Lebanon, New York, was founded in 1787 and lasted until the last family moved in 1947.\textsuperscript{10}

What were the causes of the eventual demise of the order? According to Andrews, economic problems were crucial.

Economic factors, which played an important role in the success of the movement were involved in its decline. Outstanding were (1) the expense of maintaining the order, (2) the Shaker policy regarding land ownership, (3) the mismanagement which followed in the wake of prosperity, and (4) the impact of the industrial age.\textsuperscript{11}

Further, the enforced celibacy of the group precluded their natural increase. By 1840 an ideological split weakened the organization also, as a "liberal versus conservative" schism threatened. Elder Frederick Evans of New Lebanon represented the liberal forces, who advocated closer relations with the world and active social reform.


\textsuperscript{11}Andrews, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 226.
He corresponded with Henry George on the single tax and with Tolstoy on cooperation and non-resistance. He was, of course, violently attacked by traditionalists who feared the contamination of the world. This conflict could only injure the dynamics of the societies' "outreach."

In retrospect, the Shaker community was much more successful than many of its later utopian counterparts. John Humphrey Noyes credits the Shakers for far-reaching influence.

France had also heard of Shakerism before Saint Simon or Fourier began to meditate and write Socialism. These men were nearly contemporaneous with Owen, and all three evidently obeyed a common impulse... It is very doubtful whether Owenism or Fourierism would have ever existed, or if they had, whether they would have ever moved the practical American nation if the facts of Shakerism had not existed before them and had gone along with them.¹²

Equally important is the relationship and parallel of Shakerism to the Latter Day Saint Movement and its utopian believers. This will be delineated in some detail later in this paper.

Germanic Utopists in the New World

A. Rappites. The results of the Anabaptist and of other schismatic protestant movements in Germany became

¹²Noyes, op. cit., p. 670.
apparent in the American communal scene in the 18th and 19th centuries. Many Germanic separatists came to the North American continent with a rigidly ascetic desire to build the good society.

One of the earliest movements of this variety was led by George Rapp, who sailed from Wurttemburg, Germany, in 1803 for Pennsylvania. He bought 5,000 acres of virgin land north of Pittsburg the next year and immediately sent for his followers, who numbered about 750.13

Like other pietistic sects, the Rappites believed in a "return to the Bible" and a retreat from an incurably evil world. They adopted celibacy soon after their voyage to the New World and "discovering that they included among their number many who were too old, too infirm, or too poor to be able to maintain themselves, the Society resolved to adopt communism."14

Their community of Harmony in Pennsylvania was relatively prosperous but lacked water and was unsuitable for vine growing. In 1814 the group bought 30,000 acres in the Wabash Valley of Indiana and sold their original settlement. Since their neighbors were unfriendly in Indiana, and several

13 Holloway, op. cit., p. 89. Vide also Phebe E. Earle, Pennsylvania Dutch and Other Essays (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1874)

14 Ibid., p. 90.
members of the community were stricken with malaria, they sold their New Harmony to Robert Owen for $150,000 and moved back to Pennsylvania to found the new community of Economy.

In 1875 Nordhoff found that, "the society is now reported to be worth from two to three millions of dollars. Because the community had been held together by the charisma and executive abilities of Father Rapp, it declined severely with his death. Nordhoff comments that:

They hold that the coming of Christ and the renovation of the world are near at hand... Father Rapp firmly believed that he would live to see the wished for reappearance of Christ in the heavens. So vivid was this belief in him that it led some of his followers to fondly fancy that Father Rapp would not die before Christ's coming; and there is a touching story of the old man, that when he felt death upon him, at the age of ninety, he said, 'If I did not know that the dear Lord meant I should present you all to him, I should think my last moments come.'

The Rappites had passed the zenith of their power at Nordhoff's visit to them and had been recently shaken by schisms. When asked how they expected to carry on another decade by Nordhoff, the aged leadership replied, "The Lord will show us a way... We have not trusted him

15 Nordhoff, op. cit., p. 93.
16 Ibid., p. 86.
in vain so far. We trust him still. He will give us a sign."¹⁷ The community was to disintegrate by the beginnings of the twentieth century.

B. Inspirationists - The Amana Colonies. A later migration to America was made by another group of German pietists, the Inspirationists. Christian Metz, a carpenter, founded several cooperative settlements near Herrnhaag, Arnsburg, and Marienborn in Germany.¹⁸ Life in Germany became impossible for the sect, however, due to the group's refusal to take oaths or submit to military service. On October 26th, 1842, Metz and companions landed in New York. They bought about 5,000 acres of land near Buffalo but later traded this for 20,000 acres of excellent land in eastern Iowa. The Inspirationists, unlike the Shakers or Rappites, were urban craftsmen. According to Holloway,

They found that communism, which had not been envisaged when they left Germany, was the only practical means of providing industrial, as opposed to agricultural employment for those members who were artisans; and they were once again commanded by inspiration to adopt a course of action that was essential to their survival.¹⁹

¹⁷Ibid., p. 95.

¹⁸Holloway, op. cit., p. 169.

¹⁹Ibid., p. 170.
Some of the "Rules for Daily Life" printed by those living in the Amana (Iowa) Colonies were as follows:

To obey without reasoning God and through God our superiors; to abandon self, with all its desires, knowledge, and power; have no intercourse with worldly minded men; never seek their society; speak little with them, and never without need; and then not without fear and trembling.20

Women in the colonies were subjegated to a large extent. Like the Shakers, unrestricted social contacts between the sexes were forbidden by the Inspirationists. Formal education was seen as leading to worldly concerns and finally heresy. At least once in every year an untersuchung or inquisition of the community was held. Each member was expected to make a confession of all his sins, transgressions, and shortcomings to the "inspired person" or elder.

The inevitable confrontation with the modern world was to await the Separatists. By the turn of the nineteenth century the full scale communism of the group had caused disaffection by the young. In order to adjust to the new circumstances, the group in 1932 formed a joint stock cooperative society which became even more successful in an economic sense.21 Education became less the mark of

20 Nordhoff, op. cit., p. 51.

21 Holloway, op. cit., p. 219.
heresy, and by the middle of the twentieth century, many young men were attending college at their own expense. The population of the colonies remained stable at about 1,400.

C. **Mennonites.** The German Protestant group having the most direct connection to the Anabaptists was the Mennonite or Evangelical Anabaptists. Menno Simmons, a Dutch Roman Catholic priest, left his orthodox faith in 1540 for the Anabaptist sect. He was driven out of the Netherlands due to his beliefs and settled in Northwest Germany. Simmons drew great followings with him because of his teachings. His missionary work took him to Poland, Flanders and West Prussia. By the time of his death, his followers, the Mennonites, had become a powerful utopist force in Northwestern Europe. They were constantly at odds with secular authorities in Prussia due to their pacifism and because in 1787 they were required to pay tithes to the established Lutheran Church.  

In 1788 the Russian minister offered to grant special privileges and concessions to the Mennonites to induce them to move their communities to his country. Ten years later 18,000 believers formed colonies on the Volga.  

---

22 E.K. Francis, In Search of Utopia: The Mennonites in Manitoba (Altona, Manitoba: Friesen, 1955)  
Village communes were formed and the Mennonite societies became economically well-balanced and prosperous. Once again, however, the demand that they bear arms set the pietists looking for new lands which would respect their nonviolent attitudes. The elders of the group negotiated unsuccessfully with the United States, but successfully with the Canadian government and arrived in the latter country in 1873. The migration involved 1,336 families with an estimated 7,500 members who settled for the most part in Manitoba.  

Since the Mennonites had done a great deal of colonizing in the past, they had little trouble in adapting themselves to their new environs.

The settlement pattern of the Mennonite village was that of the northeast German colonial Gewanndorf characterized by a combination of line village with open-field economy... The open-field system is closely associated with the practice of crop rotation... The village organization... may be called the solidaristic type of settlement for it pre-supposes and fosters strong coherence, intensive interaction on a face-to-face level, readiness to cooperate and offer mutual aid... and which is enforced by strict social control based on both inner and external sanctions.  

---

24 Ibid., p. 50.
25 Ibid., p. 64.
The Mennonite community based on cooperative agriculture was one of the most successful utopian ventures on the American continent. It had survived in various forms and in a variety of areas for over 250 years. Yet, it was not totally immune to social change which confronted it. By the 1920's certain signs of deterioration within the community became evident. Some of the young, resentful of their restricted lives, left the faith. Moreover, theological schisms split the organization. By the 1940's several groups had abandoned the last vestiges of the old Mennonite ritual. About 45,000 descendants of the original community lived in Midwestern Canada in the 1950's. As E.K. Francis states,

Utopia is farther beyond the horizon than ever. But Manitoba's Mennonites have found social and psychological security in their well organized communities, and sufficient wealth to give them a sense of satisfaction and contentedness.26

Owenism in America - The New Harmony Experience

Robert Owen came to the United States in 1824. "I am come to this country," he said a year later, "to introduce an entirely new system of society; to change it from an

26 Ibid., p. 278.
ignorant, selfish system to an enlightened social system which shall gradually unite all individuals into one and remove all causes for contest between individuals."  

Owen had convinced himself and several others that the way in which man was to be changed was through a change initially in man's physical environs. An ideal community began with new buildings. They were to be shaped in a hollow square 1,000 feet long and would contain lecture halls, a school, kitchens and apartments.

John Humphrey Noyes lists eleven societies of the Owen epoch founded in 1826. They included Forrestville community in Indiana with sixty members, Haverstraw community, New York, with eighty members, Kendal Community, Ohio, with two hundred members, Yellow Springs in Ohio, with four hundred members and Nashoba, Tennessee, with only fifteen members. Most failed within a period of less than three years.

Owen's greatest challenge at community building came, however, with the founding of the "New Harmony Community." He had contacted Father Rapp for the sale of the Indiana community in 1825. His son, Dale, reported that by January of the next year,

27 Holloway, op. cit., p. 104.

28 Noyes, op. cit., p. 15.
my father must have been as well pleased with the condition of things at New Harmony, on his arrival, as I myself was. At all events, some three weeks afterwards, he disclosed to me his intention to propose to the Harmonites that they should at once form themselves into a Community of Equality, based on the principle of common property.  

The community was, in fact, to be called the "New Harmony Community of Equality." Owen assumed executive control of the group for one year to alleviate possible dissension. One factor which did exacerbate other problems in the community was Owen's liberal position on religion. New Harmony rapidly gained the reputation of being a hotbed of atheism. By the end of the first year, nonetheless, the community had gained 1,000 members. Moreover, several of the greatest scientific minds of Owen's time including zoologists, botanists and geologists had aided the venture - by giving books to the library, collecting money and propagandizing for the cause.  

Several chronic problems faced the Owenite communists at this point. First and foremost was Owen's impetuosity itself. He was a teetotaler and did not tolerate strong drinks in the community. He baited those in the group who professed orthodox religious convictions. Class cleavages were evident also. The middle class intellectuals were prone to resent the difficult physical labor expected of them and

tended not to intermingle with those of humbler origin. A letter sent by one of the communitarians to the New Harmony Gazette of January 31, 1827, complained of the "slow progress of education in the community - the heavy labor, and no recompense but cold water and inferior provisions." Another proclaimed, "We had bread but once a week...on Saturdays. I thought if I ever got out, I would kill myself eating sugar and cake." Moreover, many parents began to resent Owen's educational ideas which included separating children from parents for extended periods of time. Owen commented at one point that:

You also know, that the chief difficulty at this time arose from the difference of opinion among the professors and teachers brought here by Mr. Maclure, relative to the education of the children, and to the consequent delay in putting any one of their systems into practice.

Owen finally admitted defeat in March, 1827, and commenced a series of lectures and debates against prominent religious figures. William Maclure immediately took control of the community. As an eminent scientist and educator, he hoped to continue educational innovations within the organization. He created a School of Industry which foresaw

---

30 Noyes, op. cit., p. 49.
31 Harvey, op. cit., p. 128.
32 Ibid., p. 129.
the pragmatism of twentieth century "progressive education."

He wrote "On the possibility of Improving Practical Education, by Separating the Useful from the Ornamental, and thereby Reducing the Labour and Fatigue of Instructing Youth..."33

Maclure was foredoomed to failure, however, and by 1835 donated the remains of his New Harmony Library to the Academy of Natural Sciences at Philadelphia. This is sometimes referred to as the first truly public library in the United States.34

Noyes comments on the reasons for the failure of New Harmony:

Owen's method of getting together the material of his community seems to us the most obvious external cause of his failure... A public invitation to 'the industrious and well-disposed of all nations' to come on and take possession of 30,000 acres of land and a ready-made village, leaving each one to judge as to his own industry and disposition, would insure a prompt gathering - and also a speedy scattering... Judging from all our experience and observation, we should say that the two most essential requisites for the formation of successful communities, are religious principle and previous acquaintance of the members. Both of these were lacking in Owen's experiment.35


34 Ibid., p. 136.

35 Noyes, op. cit., p. 57.
The Owen experiments in other parts of the country failed also; yet they had in several instances been the progenitors of such modern ideas as racial and sexual equality. 36

Fourierism in America

It was perhaps kind of fate not to permit Fourier to live to see the legion of Fourierist experiments in the United States. They seldom followed the rules laid down by their ideological founder and floundered hopelessly on American soil, for the most part. John Humphrey Noyes cites thirty-one Fourierist communities in the United States, located in Massachusetts, Michigan, Iowa, Ohio, Illinois, Pennsylvania, Indiana, New York and New Jersey. 37

By the time of his death in October, 1837, Fourier had accomplished little in giving reality to his utopian vision. He had, however, converted two important men to his cause, M. Baudet-Dulary and Albert Brisbane. Monsieur Baudet-Dulary founded a newspaper with Fourierist ideas, Le Phalanstere in 1832, which later failed, and created the first Fourierist community in France which was also foredoomed.

36 Ibid., pp. 71, 86.

37 Noyes, op. cit.
Albert Brisbane was a brilliant young man who came to Europe to study social philosophy under Hegel. After showing interest in Saint-Simonianism and other utopian writings, he came across Fourier's *L'Association Domestique-Agricole* which he saw as the solution to his philosophical quandries. After intensive study under the master himself, Brisbane returned to America intent on realizing the rather fantastic goals of Fourierism.

By 1840 Brisbane was ready to begin. He published in that same year *The Social Destiny of Man* which distilled Fourierism into a language more suitable for attracting converts to the message than had been Fourier's rather ominous and massive works.

It is very probable that the excitement propagated by this book turned the thoughts of Dr. Channing and the Transcendentalists toward association... Other influences prepared the way. Religious liberalism and antislavery were revolutionizing the world of thought, and predisposing all lively minds to the boldest innovations. But it is evident that the positive scheme of reconstructing society came from France through Brisbane. Brook Farm, Hopedale, the Northampton Community and the Skaneateles Community struck out, each on an independent theory of social architecture; but they all obeyed a common impulse; and that impulse, so far as it came by literature, is
traceable to Brisbane's importation and translation of the writings of Charles Fourier. 38

Another major breakthrough for Brisbane was his contact with Horace Greeley, famous and influential editor of the New York Tribune. Brisbane purchased a twice weekly column in the paper and wrote effective prose concerning "Association, or principles of a true organization of society." 39

Brook Farm in Massachusetts was founded by intellectual and literary giants, such as Ralph Waldo Emerson and Nathaniel Hawthorne, 40 as a communal venture. Charles Dana wrote in 1841,

At Brook Farm they [laborers] are all servants to each other; no man is master. We do freely from the love of it, with joy and thankfulness, those duties which are usually discharged by domestics... Again, we are able already, not only to assign to manual labor its just rank and dignity in the scale of human occupation, but to insure it its just reward. And here also, I think, we may humbly claim that we have made some advance upon civilized society. 41

38 Ibid., p. 201.

39 Ibid.


41 Noyes, op. cit., p. 223.
Brisbane moved his propaganda machinery from New York to Brook Farm and so influenced the Brook Farm membership that in 1844 they changed their name from The Brook Farm Association to the Brook Farm Phalanx. In a true Fourierist manner, a joint stock company was formed. Many members took shares by paying money; others held shares by their labor. An old house on the place was enlarged and three new houses built. The Brook Farm group did not attempt to revolutionize the family structure; however, it did develop a common school and a common nursery. Ralph Waldo Emerson commented on the division of labor in the community in this way:

In Brook Farm was this peculiarity, that there was no head. In every family is the father; in every factory, a foreman; in a shop, a master; in a boat, the skipper; but in this Farm, no authority; each was master or mistress of his or her actions; happy, hapless, anarchists.42

Several of the intellectuals tired of the monotonous days spent in hard labor, notwithstanding their comments concerning the dignity of hand labor. Defections in the ranks began as financial problems increased. In March, 1846, the hopes of the community were dealt an almost fatal blow as the central building on the farm was demolished by fire.

George Ripley commented on the possible future of the group two weeks after the fire:

We cannot now calculate its ultimate effect. It may prove more than we are able to bear or...it may serve to bind us more closely to each other, and to the holy cause to which we are devoted...we have every reason to rejoice in the internal condition of our Association. For the few last months, it has more nearly than ever approached the idea of a true social order.43

Within a year the society had dissolved and the farm was disposed of. The farm had lasted three years which were seen as a valuable time by its membership. Yet the attempt to receive the industrial age in an agricultural setting with intellectuals as laborers seems doomed from the start.

Brook Farm was only one of a profusion of Fourierist groups, nonetheless; and several others were somewhat more successful in a temporal sense. The North American Phalanx in New Jersey, for example, lasted no less than twelve years. Its location near New York City and its active support by Brisbane and Horace Greeley aided it greatly. The Phalanx was begun in 1843 with almost $8,000 in cash; by 1852 its property was estimated at ten times that value.44

43 Ibid., p. 174.
44 Noyes, op. cit., p. 461.
was paid at six cents per hour\textsuperscript{45} and meals were bought for various prices in the dining rooms. The North American also attempted to diversify its economic resources by brick-making, milling, and the like. The North American Phalanx also gave great support to social equality for women and other radical ideas of the day.

The religious form of the community followed the same lines as the Brook Farm Phalanx. As one visitor to the colony put it in 1847:

\begin{quote}
There is religious worship here every Sunday, in which all those who feel disposed may join. The members of the society adhere to different religious persuasions, but do not seem to care much for the outward forms of religion.\textsuperscript{46}
\end{quote}

Fire was the nemesis of the North American group just as it had been at Brook Farm. Eleven years after the founding of the society, the members of the North American Phalanx watched their mill burn down. After lengthy discussion concerning their future, some suggested that they dissolve, and surprisingly to many, a vote was taken indicating that they should dissolve. Investors in the community settled for sixty-six cents on the dollar.

\textsuperscript{45} The Phalanx Doctor was, of course, paid the same wage, six cents per hour.

\textsuperscript{46} Noyes, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 473.
Thus, by the beginning of the Civil War Fourierism, along with Owenist experiments, had passed into history. Noyes sums up the movements in this way:

Owen's plan was based on communism; Fourier's plan was based on the joint stock principle. Both of these modes of combination exist abundantly in common society. Every family is a little example of communism, and every working partnership is an example of joint stockism. Communism creates homes, joint stockism manages business.\(^47\)

In this case, the Owenite families in the end were basically incompatible; the Fourierist businesses au bout du compte without profit.

Redelia Brisbane, daughter of the American Fourierist Albert Brisbane, comments on the demise of her father's utopian community.

The organization was not adopted to the natural and manifold wants of its members; the legitimate aspirations and ambitions of individuals found no satisfying field of action... It was inevitable, finally, that individual members, perceiving that there existed outside of their little community a field of action more in harmony with personal requirements and ambitions, should turn their backs on the ideals of youth to mingle again with the outside world in broader and more complex spheres of action.\(^48\)

\(^{47}\)Ibid., p. 194.

\(^{48}\)Redelia Brisbane, *Albert Brisbane* (Boston: Area Publishing, 1893)
Charles Fourier was not the only French utopist to have an impact upon the American continent. In 1788 a few years after the birth of Fourier, Etienne Cabet was born in Dijon. He was educated for the law; however, by temperament he was a revolutionary and later a community builder. He was a member of the Insurrection Committee of 1830 and was finally condemned to prison for radical articles he had published. He escaped to London but returned to Paris later to publish a four volume work on the French Revolution. Later the same year, he was to construct his noteworthy Voyage En Icarie. Cabet's book contained a scathing criticism of the society of his day.

Quand on considère les richesse dont la bienfaisante Nature a comblé le Genre humain, et l'intelligence ou la raison dont elle la gratifie pour lui servier d'instrument et de guide, il est impossible d'admettre que la destinée de la homme soit d'être malheureux sur la terre; et quand on considère qu'il est essentiellement sociable, par consequent sympathique et affectueux, il n'est pas possible d'admettre qu'il soit naturellement mechant.

Cependant, dans tous les temps et dans tous les pays l'Histoire ne nous montre que troubles et desordres, vices et crimes, querres et revolutions,

---

supplices et massacres, catastrophes et calamites.
Mais si ces vices et ces malheurs ne sont pas l'effet de la volonté de la Nature, il faut donc en chercher la cause ailleurs.
Cette cause n'est-elle pas dans la mauvaise organisation de la Society? Et le vice radical et cette organisation n'est-il pas l'Inégalité, qui lui sert de base?50

Later in *Voyage En Icarie* Cabet approvingly quotes Diderot on private property. "L'esprit de propriété et d'intérêt dispose chaque individu 'a son bonheur l'espèce entière. La propriété est la cause general et predominate de tous les disordres."51

The remedy for corruption, disorder and inequality was the formation of a new and rational social order, "A communauté l'avenir, par la seule puissance de la Raison et la Vérité."52 Cabet's idea, typical of utopists of his period, was that government should be replaced by administration. Since he had been greatly influenced by the ideas of Robert Owen, he accepted the ideal of total communism. Lewis Mumford gives a graphic illustration of Cabet's ideological community.

---

50 Ibid., p. a.
51 Ibid., p. 512.
Cabet describes all institutions in the minutest fashion, down to the noiseless window with which each Icarian's house is equipped, but the broad outlines of the industrial and social system are contained in this picture. What we see is a national state, abundantly organized for war, and remaining on that footing in the midst of its peace time activities.53

Marie Berneri, in her Journey Through Utopia, shares Mumford's view of Icaria.

The love of uniformity, centralization and state control is found in most utopias but in Voyage to Icaria it is carried to such extremes as to make it resemble, in many parts, the satirical utopias of our century.54

Nevertheless, Cabet, unlike the legion of other literary utopists of his day, was given the opportunity to carry out his designs. After the publication of his works, he received great popular support in France. Yet he felt the political climate there much too oppressive to appreciate his plans. In 1847 he began to plan for a move to America with the cry - "Travailleurs, allons en Icarie!" He received a good deal of financial support at this time also. On February 3, 1848, he left Le Havre with a group of would-be Icarians for Texas where he had contracted for


one million acres of land. Upon arrival in New Orleans, he found that the Texas land he had bought was in separate sections which must be claimed by putting cabins on it. Since this was nearly impossible, many would have given up had it not been for Cabet's determination. In the end only 10,000 acres were claimed, and malaria attacked the not yet established colony. After further trials and an unsuccessful trip back to France for new supplies, Cabet gave up on the Texas venture and bought en toto Nauvoo, Illinois, which had recently been vacated by the fleeing Latter Day Saints. About 280 men, women and children arrived in Nauvoo. Despite their small numbers, they were accorded several advantages over prior groups. As Holloway points out,

Most of them were French artisans with a native intelligence, eager for new knowledge and cultural amenities, but sufficiently shrewd, industrious, and disciplined to ensure an economic success to the community. They...acquired a library of 5,000 volumes and provided frequent musical and theatrical entertainments. Their schools were liberal; their sexual relations orthodox; their daily lives conventional.

Cabet, however, like other charismatics, was not in the least an adequate administrator. He insisted upon

55 Holloway, op. cit., p. 203.
subservience to his arbitrary rules and constantly alienated one or another of his followers. A real schism split the community into Cabetiste and anti-Cabetiste factions in August, 1856. Cabet finally led 180 of the faithful to Saint Louis where on November 8th he suffered an apoplectic fit and died. The Icarians had at an earlier time purchased land near Corning, Iowa. In 1860 the remainder of the party settled there, deeply in debt but continuing in their utopian convictions. The Civil War pushed farm prices up, and by working diligently the Icarians were able to pay off their debts and even double in membership. A blacksmith shop and mill were put into operation along with herds of sheep and cattle.

In the end, the "conflict of generations" was the demise of the small community. Many of the younger members of the commune had been deeply affected by the theories of Marx, Proudhon and other revolutionary evangelists. They chided their elders for the existence of private gardens, property, and above all for the egotism manifest in the colony. Moreover, they attacked the older generation for not giving women equal voting rights and for the isolationism of the group. In 1878 the split was formalized by court order as the younger group received a property settlement and left for new adventures in California. The older settlers continued to ossify and failed to win new converts.
to the group. They were able to hold out until 1898 when
the last president of the group legally divided the land
among the twenty-one remaining members.

When Nordhoff visited the community during its decline
in 1878, he was asked by one of its members to
deal gently and cautiously with Icaria. The man who sees only the chaotic village
and the wooden shoes, and only chronicles
those, will commit a serious error. In
that village are buried fortunes, noble
hopes and the aspirations of good and
great men like Cabet... It, and it alone,
represents in America a great idea -
rational democratic communism.56

Etienne Cabet represents the last great link between
nineteenth century European and American utopianism.

Oneida - John Humphrey Noyes

The Oneida experience is, in one sense, an epilogue
to the communalist period of American life. Based on the
concepts of the highly educated and articulate John Humphrey
Noyes, the Oneida colonists in 1844 adopted communism in
upstate New York. Noyes had participated in antislavery
agitation earlier and believe, as did the early Shakers,
that Christ's second return had occurred at precisely 70 A.D.
Since this momentous event had already occurred, man was
free to seek absolute perfection on earth.

56 Nordhoff, op. cit., p. 339.
Noyes was moved by the statement that in Heaven "they neither marry nor are given in marriage." While this led the Shakers to complete abstinence, Noyes moved in the other direction as he proposed his system of "male continence" and "complex marriage" which was adopted by the community in 1846.

We are opposed (he wrote in 1847) to random procreation, which is unavoidable in the marriage system... We believe that good sense and benevolence will very soon sanction and enforce the rule that women shall bear children only when they choose. 57

Further, Noyes disparaged monogamy which "gives to sexual appetite only a scanty and monotonous allowance and so produces the natural vices of poverty, contraction of taste and stinginess or jealousy. 58

The answer to this problem was complete freedom of intercourse combined with male continence to prevent unwanted births. Holloway states that "on the whole the system was remarkably successful." 59

Another, rather less dionysian, innovation at Oneida was "mutual criticism" which involved the entire society as it either castigated or praised an individual for his...
acts. If a member of the society was seen as unduly prejudiced against the individual in question, he too was rebuked by the group.

The membership of the group was eighty-seven in 1849, but by 1878 the community had grown to over three hundred. A valuable library was established with books by Darwin, Spencer, Huxley and others. The seventh decade of the nineteenth century brought with it some disharmony in the community. It was typically enough a conflict of generations. Noyes's son was frankly an agnostic. He caused a good deal of dissension within the ranks. Verbal attacks by outsiders threatened the community at this time, also.

Noyes began to realize that radical change would be needed to salvage the community, and in August, 1879, he advised against further practice of complex marriage as a tactic, although he remained convinced of its essential truth. In 1881 the colony moved closer to respectability as they abandoned communism for the joint stock method of operation. At this point, gradual disaffection began to occur; a colony of twenty moved to California; others moved to New York City, Boston and Niagra. In April, 1886, Noyes died, leaving only a corporation of craftsmen bearing the name Oneida.
Summation and Perspectives

The causes of the failures of the American communal scene are complex and not easily disposed to analysis. Many of the groups met their nemesis for ostensibly economic reasons. Most groups decried industrialization and turned to an agrarian system of values. Farming was a demanding and sometimes unrewarding profession. Usually the capital held by the membership was insufficient to promote expansion or to allow for the emergencies and disasters prone to befall the organization.

It would be incorrect to see financial problems as insurmountable to all groups, however. Without a doubt many were experiencing prosperity at the time of their demise. In reality, the problem would seem to be in the commitment of the membership to the group's goals. Many members of social organizations have experienced great poverty and deprivation as they struggled to facilitate the purposes of their organization. What, then, are the variables in the social structure making for maximum commitment?

Rosebeth Kanter gives a tentative answer to this question in her article, "Commitment and Social Organization: A Study of Commitment Mechanisms in Utopian Communities."^60

Kanter surveys ninety-one utopian communities in existence between 1780 and 1860 and proposes that the difference between "success" and "failure" for a group is dependent upon group cohesion which is achieved by an attitude of positive cathexis, continuance which is maintained by an attitude of positive cognition, and social control which is facilitated by positive evaluation.

Cohesion commitment involves the attaching of an individual's fund of affectivity and emotion to the group; emotional gratification stems from participation in and from identification with all the members of a close knit group. Cathectic-cohesion commitment is commitment to a set of social relationships. The individual cathects each member of the group, and his loyalty and allegiance are thus to the group as a whole.61

Successful utopian ventures are defined by Kanter as lasting twenty-five years or one generation. Successful communitarian experiments, Kanter found, maintained social cohesion by the use of two mechanisms. The first is renunciation of the outside world. Renunciation of the dyadic marital relation could take the form of celibacy or free love, for example. Second, Kanter sees as important the process of communion which "may be defined as becoming part of a whole, the mingling of self with the group, and

61 Ibid., p. 507.
relinquishing separateness in order to identify with all the members of the collective whole." Group ritual, community singing or even an experience of persecution may weld a successful group together.

Kanter sees continuance commitment mechanisms of great importance to the success of utopian communities also.

The individual who makes a cognitive-continuance commitment finds that what is profitable to him is bound up with his position in the organization, is contingent on his participating in the system - he commits himself to a role. For the actor there is a 'profit' associated with continued participation and a 'cost' associated with leaving.63

Two processes producing continuance commitment are **sacrifice** and **investment**. Once the member of a group gives up something as the price of membership, the motivation to remain in the group should increase. The giving up of pleasures of the world, such as alcohol, dancing, reading, sex, are all mechanisms of sacrifice used by the more successful groups. Many organizations required investments of money that were irreversible; that is to say, that defectors from the group were unable to be reimbursed for labor or property which they had invested.

The problem of "social control or commitment to norms involves securing a person's positive evaluative orientations, redefining his symbolic environment so that the system's demands are considered right in terms of his self-identity." Social control in successful groups is maintained by producing surrender or mortification in the individual believer. Some of the methods of surrender used by utopian groups are: (1) programming a fixed daily routine, (2) the development of "institutionalized awe" for leadership and authority by means of a psychological separation between leader and follower, and (3) the development of "institutionalized awe" for the group's ideology by explaining the "essential" nature of man in their philosophical system or by simply developing the idea that belief in the ideological system gives one special, magical characteristics.

"Mortification" is the negative side of social control and is designed to show the individual that he can have fulfillment as a person within the group structure. Some mechanisms of mortification in communal structures have been: (1) confession or mutual criticism, (2) spiritual differentiation in which members are distinguished on moral or spiritual grounds, (3) sanctions such as public denouncement of deviants, and (4) de-individuating mechanisms such as a common uniform or communal dwelling and dining hall.

---

^nbid., p. 510."
Regardless of the "mechanisms" and techniques utilized by most utopists, the industrial revolution broke down the essential insularity and closure of most groups and, in the main, they and their followers joined the mainstream of the "homogenized" American culture.
The difficulties in finding an objective history of the "Mormon" faith are manifold. Perhaps this is best shown by a quotation from *A Handbook of Mormonism*, a history written in 1880. It states in its introduction that:

Mormonism is made up of twenty parts. Take eight parts diabolism, three parts of animalism from the Mohammedan system, one part bigotry from old Judaism, four parts cunning and treachery from Jesuitism, two part thugism from India and two parts Arnoldism, and then shake the mixture over the fires of animal passion and throw in forms and ceremonies of the Christian religion, and you will have this system in its true component elements.\(^1\)

To the other extreme, the believer writes only of the "truth and light" in his faith.

Realizing these handicaps, certain facts are known about the "Mormon" faith. The Mormon Church (at the time of its origin simply called the Church of Christ) was founded in 1830 by Joseph Smith who offered claims that he was called of God to do a "marvelous work and a wonder" in restoring Christianity to its primitive purity. In 1823 Joseph stated that he had been visited by an angel, Moroni.

This daemonic visitor led Joseph to a hill not far from his home near Manchester, New York, and revealed to him a series of golden plates which were, according to Smith, accounts of pre-Columbian inhabitants of the American continents. These plates affirmed that Christ had visited this continent and that Christianity had also developed among these peoples.

This Book of Mormon (it was named after one of the writers) caused Smith trouble immediately, as he states,

I continued to pursue my common vocations until the twenty-first of September, one thousand eight hundred and twenty-three, all the time suffering severe persecution at the hands of all classes of men, both religious and irreligious, because I continued to affirm that I had seen a vision.2

The fact that Smith's family were none too prosperous farmers and that the personage which came to him stated, in reference to the established denominations in the area, "All their creeds are an abomination in His God's sight,"3 greatly exacerbated the situation.

The causes and validity of the vision and of the Book of Mormon are not the concern of this study. Some of the hypotheses that have come forth about the events leading to

2Joseph Smith Jr., Doctrine and Covenants (Salt Lake City: Deseret Press, 1952).

3Ibid., p. 48.
the Book of Mormon are that Joseph Smith was a visionary epileptic or that the book was a hoax resulting from a novel of the period. However, the various Latter Day Saint sects have vigorously opposed these charges and marshalled many arguments to refute them.

Robert K. Merton's concept of "the self fulfilling prophecy" has interesting implications here. Whether or not the "spiritual manifestations" of Smith were valid, their results (i.e., a gathering together of a church) were factual. Thus, as Merton states, "A false definition of the situation evokes a new behavior which makes the originally false conceptions come true."5

By 1829 Joseph's "translation" of the Book of Mormon neared completion. In April of that year, he and Oliver Cowdery, who had assisted him in the translation, went into the woods to "pray and inquire of the Lord" when a "messenger from heaven" came to the two and laid his hands upon Joseph conferring upon him the "restored priesthood of Aaron." In Latter Day Saint history this constitutes the formal institutionalization of the church.6 The priesthood bestowed upon

4Woodbridge Riley, The Founder of Mormonism (New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1902)


6Joseph Smith, op. cit., p. 57.
Joseph and the individuals that he himself ordained the "authority" from God to perform the various sacraments, rites, and procedures necessary for the "salvation" of the believers. It gives him the "keys to the Kingdom" in that the ordinances performed by the priesthood are given divine sanction and have effect on the outcome of the afterlife.

One year later, Smith met with a group of men near Fayette, New York, and called several to the various offices of the priesthood. Thus, the pattern was set for future evangelization.

This concept of "priesthood" which had such great theological implications is also interesting from the standpoint of ranking in terms of the relative valuations of the offices. There are two basic divisions in the priesthood. One is designed to meet the temporal or physical needs of the membership. This lower priesthood is termed the Aaronic priesthood. It contains three offices. The lowest is the office of deacon, whose duties are primarily attending to the physical comfort of the members and maintaining the church building. The teacher is given this task also, plus the responsibility of mediating disputes among members. Finally, the priest can preach, exhort and assist with certain sacraments.

Certainly the bulk of the administrative duties, the maintenance of the belief system, and the performance of ritual falls to the higher order of priesthood, the Melchesedec.
This order contains the **elder**, the **high priest**, the **seventy**, the **evangelist**, the **bishops** (who are in charge of tithes and the finances of the Church), the **patriarchs**, who give special blessings, the **twelve apostles** who are second only to the **prophet** in power, and finally the **first presidency**, containing the prophet and his two counselors.

At the apex, then, of the hierarchy, stands the prophet-seer and revelator of God. As Joseph Smith fulfilled this office and gave "revelations from God" they were carefully recorded and written in a book called, *The Book of Commandments*. This book was later revised and called the *Doctrine and Covenants*.

It is interesting to note that although these revelations were brought before quorums of the various orders of priesthood, never was any significant opposition to them recorded. This may give some indication of the cohesion of the priesthood and its complete subservience to the will of the prophet. The lay churchmen and women manifest quite clearly their dependence on the leader in a popular hymn of the day, "We Thank Thee, Oh Lord, for a Prophet to Guide Us in These Latter Days." Thus, the church can be seen in its early days as essentially a monolithic structure with the mores of the group originating with the prophet and being delegated and reinforced by his priesthood.
As the young church moved into Ohio seeking a more fertile ground for growth, certain goals became emergent as seen through the revelations given by Smith. They were:

(1) A concern for the personal salvation of the members of the church. The orthodox concept of rewards in after life was not only facilitated by the church; in order to attain the highest stratum of heaven ("celestial glory"), good works coupled with membership in the church was necessary. For example, in order to be "saved" baptism by a member of the priesthood was necessary. "Saved" in this sense meant attaining the highest glory of heaven.

(2) A second goal inexorably bound in Mormon social thinking and theology was the "establishment of Zion on earth." Zion is described in a passage from the *Doctrine and Covenants* as a place,

called the New Jerusalem, a land of peace, a city of refuge, a place of safety for the saints of the most high God; and the glory of the Lord shall be there, and the terror of the Lord shall also be there, insomuch that the wicked will not come into it, and it shall be called Zion.7

Zion was to be a communitarian venture wherein poverty, hatred and self-centeredness were to be abolished. Also, it need hardly be mentioned that it was to be a place of refuge for Saints who faced persecution for their beliefs.

---

Yinger describes the disadvantages of this withdrawal from the world as he states that "though withdrawal the sect is able to maintain its ethic in a purer form but does so only at the expense of a sharply reduced breadth of influence." \(^8\)

(3) The third goal in priority in the young church was winning new members. The Lord speaks through Joseph Smith again, addressing the priesthood, "Wherefore, go forth, crying with a loud voice, saying: The kingdom of heaven is at hand; crying: Hosanna! blessed be the name of the most high God." \(^9\) Mormon historians state that at the time of Smith's death over 100,000 people had been converted to the church.

(4) The fourth goal is related to, and indeed, dependent upon the first three. It is the return of Christ. This concern with the second advent is even manifest in the title of the church, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. Christ was to return to earth when Zion was perfected and the Saints were living in a highly "spiritual" condition. Many revelations ended with "Behold, I come quickly." \(^10\)

Thus, as these emergent goals became pervasive throughout the Latter Day Saint subculture, a closely knit organization

---


\(^9\) Joseph Smith Jr., *op. cit.* , p. 58.

\(^10\) Ibid.
developed. Again, the fact that these goals were disclosed by Joseph Smith testifies to the charismatic nature of his position.

These goals seemed always hindered, destroyed, and ridiculed by the "gentile," as the non-Mormon was called. For this reason, the Saints always seemed to follow the frontier to find the seclusion needed to develop and perfect Zion. The unfavorable attitudes of the Ohioans led the Saints to Northwest Missouri, Jackson County. It was here that the Saints were to settle and the town of Independence was set up as the center of Zion. Within Independence, a lot was chosen as the place that the Lord had commanded his people to build a temple to the Lord.\(^{11}\)

Unfortunately for the Saints, a collision with the Missourians was to follow. The Saints were essentially Eastern, nonslave-holding peoples. Their strangeness was compounded by their concept of themselves as a "chosen people" and of the outsider as a "gentile." Also the Saints bought huge sections of land and moved to "Zion" with a swiftness that gave even the most liberal of the local inhabitants qualms. Many gentiles spoke of a secret organization within the church called the "Danites" which was to bring havoc

\(^{11}\) Ibid., p. 89.
to any outsider conflicting with the church's aims. Whether the origin of this rumor had validity or not, its consequences were real as the Missourians took up arms against the Saints. By 1838 the conflicts with the Missourians had reached tragic proportions, with the famous Haun's Mill massacre killing thirty-one Mormon men, women and children. 12

The climax of this situation occurred when Governor Boggs, on October 17, 1838, ordered that the Mormons be "treated as enemies, and must be exterminated or driven from the state." 13

The next resting place for the Mormons was on the eastern banks of the Mississippi River in Illinois. They gradually settled near a town called Commerce, which name they changed to Nauvoo, claiming it meant "beautiful place" in Hebrew. The first few Saints arriving in this swampy area contracted malaria and many were buried there. At first the political climate seemed to be favorable to the Saints in Illinois as the Whigs and Democrats both vied for the Mormon block vote. By 1842, the Mormon establishment had grown to become the largest city in Illinois. It was estimated that over 15,000 inhabitants lived within the city limits of Nauvoo. 14

---

13 Ibid., p. 105.
14 Ibid., p. 223.
As the town became prosperous, "gentile" indignation was again aroused when Joseph Smith began to create the Nauvoo Legion, a group of Mormon Militia. Smith was, of course, Commander of his Legion. The sight of the active drilling of the Legion undoubtedly produced much disquietude in the unbeliever.

The internal tranquility of the church began to be shaken also at this time. Several revelations were discussed in the high councils of the church. The two most controversial were those concerning plurality of gods and spiritual marriage, the latter termed "polygamy." These revelations did not reach the Saints or the lower stratum of the priesthood, but were constantly the source of friction between the prophet and his subordinates.

The breaking point was reached as William Law, a counselor in the First Presidency, and several others broke away from the church, establishing an anti-Mormon newspaper - The Expositor. This newspaper eventually proved Smith's nemesis, although only one issue was ever printed. Joseph Smith, as Mayor of Nauvoo, had the paper declared a public nuisance, and it was immediately dumped into the Mississippi with little ceremony. The "gentile world" was up in arms at once and demanded action for this abridgment of freedom.15 A warrant was put out for Smith's arrest, and he proceeded to Carthage, Illinois, where he was to meet with Governor Ford to discuss the situation.

15 Ibid.
It is well known that Smith and his brother, Hyrum Smith, were killed by a mob on June 27, 1844. The chaos that followed this tragic event was almost predictable. With the death of the prophet, Nauvoo was soon deserted. The Saints did not flow out to the Rocky Mountains in an orderly fashion; rather, they turned in great part to many splinter group as many leaders struggled for the internal power. It is with these struggles and the rebirth of charisma to new figures and groups that this paper will now be concerned.

Over twelve groups were directly resultant from the break up of the church in 1844. Some survived only a few years; others became powerful and increasingly dynamic, as the Utah church today.

**Charisma, Its Routinization and Rebirth**

The Mormons as a people were used to dynamic leadership which they considered to be divinely inspired. Only the most cynical of those would suggest that they elect a "common or normal leader." Smith's sudden death only validated to the faithful the Scripture's message, "Blessed are all they that are persecuted for my name's sake for theirs is the kingdom of heaven."

Max Weber's famed "ideal types" or constructs have been useful to many social scientists in studies concerning bureaucracy and the church. One can assume, as did Weber, that the "sacred"
has its roots in complex social phenomena and that the sacred can be analyzed because its genesis is social in nature. Proceeding on these assumptions then, an attempt can be made to hold the major power figures in the church up to inspection as charismatic figures.

To Weber, "The charismatic leader gains and maintains authority solely by proving his strength in life. If he wants to be a prophet, he must perform miracles." Certainly the miraculous was in Joseph Smith's line; not only was he credited with visitations from several angels, but Brigham Young related that:

Joseph commenced in his own house and dooryard, commanding the sick, in the name of Jesus Christ to arise and be made whole, and they were healed according to his word.  

It is the belief of the followers which makes the leader charismatic. Thus, Weber states that:

The genuinely charismatic ruler is responsible precisely to those whom he rules. He is responsible for but one thing, that he personally and actually be the God willed master. Genuine charismatic domination therefore knows of no abstract legal codes and statutes and no 'formal' way of adjudication.

---


The fact that Smith was not only the prophet to the Mormons, but also the General of the Legion and the Mayor of Nauvoo, testifies of the extreme confidence placed in him by his followers. The fact that when dissent did arise in the church in the form of the Nauvoo Expositor, it was destroyed without regard to legality, shows again that the prophet was not to be judged in a critical light.

Another form of social control available to the prophet was the use of revelation from God. These revelations frequently chastised anyone in conflict with the prophet.

To Weber, the problem facing charisma was its preservation and routinization. Parsons states that:

Charisma is in the nature of the case a temporary phenomenon. For the message of the prophet to become embodied in a permanent everyday structure, to become institutionalized, it must undergo a fundamental change. In this process, the authority that the prophet exercises by virtue of his personal charisma may develop in one of two directions - a traditionalized or rationalized structure.19

When this structure (the church) becomes disorganized, and several leaders compete for the prophethood and church leadership, a rationale must be developed. In other words, each splinter group must have a raison d'être. As this rationale is verbalized, certain patterns of the "right to

leadership" become evident. This "right" is originally expressed in a charismatic leader in each of the Mormon sects, but it is also expressed in terms of the traditional or legalistic bureaucratic.

The several Mormon sects will be analyzed, then, on this premise.

Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. Headquarters, Salt Lake City, Utah. It is well known that Brigham Young assumed the leadership of this church soon after Smith's death. Young was president of the quorum of the twelve apostles at this time. He had few extraordinary or charismatic qualities. His position in the church was regarded by many as second only to Smith, however.

Young arrived in Nauvoo on August 8th, after Smith's death. There was at this time the only remaining member of the first presidency, Sidney Rigdon, contending for leadership in the church. Young quickly called a meeting of the Saints and gave a speech which called for the acceptance of the twelve apostles as leaders of the church with himself at the head. In this speech Young quickly turned from a high administrative officer to a charismatic one, as several stated,

"The mantle of Joseph fell upon him," meaning that he assumed the appearance and voice of Smith. 21

This supernatural occurrence did not suffice for Young, for he felt that his legalistic position in the church was adequate to demonstrate his "right to leadership." On August 15, 1844, he issued this statement:

Let no man presume for a moment that his place will be filled by another; for, remember he stands in his own place, and always will, and the twelve apostles of this dispensation stand in their own place and always will, both in time and eternity, to minister, preside, and regulate the affairs of the whole church. 22

The apostles were sustained in their position by a vote of the Saints at this time. Thus, resultant from his bureaucratic position in the priesthood hierarchy, Brigham Young and his followers had demonstrated their "right to rule."

Parsons comments on Weber's idea of the bureaucratic adaptation of charisma in this manner:

...this...mode of routinization is a line of development which involves thinking of the charismatic quality as objectified and hence capable of divorce from the particular concrete person. It then becomes either (a) transferable or (b) obtainable by a person by his own efforts or finally, (c) not a quality of a person as such but of an office or of an institutional structure without

21 Ibid.

22 Linn, op. cit., p. 315.
reference to personal qualities. It is hardly necessary to note that this is the road which leads to bureaucratic organization and 'legality' as the standard of legitimacy. 23

The fact that this mode of choosing leadership has been maintained over the years is shown in the selection of the present prophet of the church.

Meeting in solemn assembly on the morning of April 9, 1951, the membership of the church, voting by priesthood quorum and then as a whole, sustained President David O. McKay as the ninth president of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. 24

This mode of choosing leadership has seemingly given the Utah Church stability since there have been no real struggles for power since Brigham's days.

The reverence and awe manifest for the high ranking members of the priesthood is aptly demonstrated by the following quotation from the official church magazine;

When our leaders speak, the thinking has been done. When they propose a plan - it is God's plan. When they point the way, there is no other that is safe. When they give direction, it should mark the end of controversy. God works in no other way. 25

This Mormon organization has prospered greatly through the years. By 1960 it counted almost one million, five hundred thousand members.

23 Parsons, op. cit., p. 563.


25 Ibid., p. 354.
Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints (Strangites)
Headquarters, Voree, Wisconsin. Undoubtedly the most colorful leader of the Mormon faith after Smith's death was James J. Strang. Strang was converted to the church only two years before Smith's death. Upon the prophet's death, Strang used every method known to himself to take possession of the church. The basis for his "right to power" may be classified as both charismatic and legalistic.

Strang qualified himself as a charismatic being in the most decisive manner as he gave forth these claims:
(1) That at the moment of Smith's death an Angel came to Strang "giving him the keys to the kingdom" and bestowing him with the presidency of the church. (2) In 1845 he found the "Plates of Laban." These plates were revealed to Strang by an angel and contained a record of the "Rajah Manchore of Vorito." The Rajah was the leader of an ancient righteous people residing in Wisconsin. The cynic might suspect that the finding of the plates of Laban was almost a parody on Smith's finding of the Book of Mormon, but to the faithful, this represented added evidence that Strang was the "chosen one."

Again Parsons states that, "The charismatic leader never treats those who resist or ignore him, within the scope of his

---

26Henry E. Legler, A Moses of the Mormons (Milwaukee: Parkman Publications, 1897) p. 171.
claims, as anything but delinquent in duty."\(^{27}\) As evidence of this, both James Strang and Brigham Young delivered each other "to the buffetings of Satan" in no uncertain terms.

Strang did not rely totally on the supernatural for his claims - he produced a letter from Joseph Smith telling him that Joseph's time as a prophet was short and Strang was to lead the Church. Thus, the idea of the prophet transferring his claims of leadership to Strang offered a sense of legality to Strang's bid for leadership. This letter's authenticity was seriously questioned as were the "Plates of Laban."

In 1850, Strang announced a revelation which declared that he was to be "King in Zion," and his coronation took place on July 8, 1850. Strang had taken several wives shortly before this and had five at the time of his death. His "kingdom" at Beaver Island, Wisconsin, was shattered on June 15, 1856, as he was assassinated by two disgruntled ex-followers. After Strang's death, many of his followers joined the Reorganized Church, and by 1954 only 200 members remained as true believers.\(^{28}\)

---

\(^{27}\) Parsons, op. cit., p. 663.

Young won most of the support of the Nauvoo Saints. His greatest competitor, at this time, was Sidney Rigdon, the only surviving member of the presidency. Rigdon was a counselor to Joseph Smith and stated that the Lord had shown him a vision, and that there must be a "guardian" appointed to "build the church up to Joseph" as he had begun it. He was quickly excommunicated by Brigham Young for his activities and returned to Pennsylvania where he had been doing missionary work.

He proclaimed his visions to his followers and using his high priesthood to back his claims, gathered several saints in the Pennsylvania area. Sidney Rigdon was never quite successful in promoting his faith although he stressed the fact that the name of his church was "The Church of Christ" as Smith had called the church in the 1830's in Ohio. The changing of the name of the church showed to Rigdon that the church "had fallen into apostasy."29 After Rigdon's death, the leadership of this church was assumed by William Bickerton, and in 1961 they reported a membership of 2,346.30

Jehovah's Presbytery of Zion (now disorganized).

Charles B. Thompson, a missionary in the original church assumed his role of charisma with little difficulty. He

29Ibid.

held office in the priesthood and associated with James Strang from 1844 to 1848. In January, 1848, he received a revelation which stated two principles: (1) the church was rejected by God in 1844, but (2) the priesthood was to be continued until Zion was to be established.  

Thompson claimed to be Ephraim born again and took the title of "Baneemy, Patriarch of Zion," "Apostle of the Free and Accepted Order of Baneemy and Fraternity of the Sons of Zion," and "Chief Teacher of the Preparatory Department of Jehovah's Presbytery of Zion."

He moved to western Iowa with 50 to 60 families and established the community of Preparation. His group disintegrated as he established a communal economic system, then attempted to gain control of the collective property. Many of his followers joined the Reorganization Movement.

The **Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints.** Headquarters, Independence, Missouri. This, the church of central concern to this paper, is at present the only serious competitor with the Utah church. Its population in 1965 was well over 190,000, and it has a well organized evangelical program.

Its organization deals with another mode of adaptation to the phenomenon of charisma. Several elders in the original

31 Flanders, *op. cit.*
church had gone to Wisconsin to join the organization set up by James J. Strang. Jason Briggs and Zenas Gurley, two of these elders, became dissatisfied with Strang's claims and proceeded to contact Joseph Smith's son, asking him to take the leadership of the "new organization," later called the "Reorganization." Young Smith refused for some time, but finally in 1859 he received a revelation to this effect:

The Saints reorganizing at Zarahemla and other places, is the only portion of the church accepted by me. I have given them my spirit and will continue to do so while they remain humble and faithful.

To most of the faithful the idea of lineal descent of the prophethood provided the idea that the Reorganized Church was the "true successor" to the "pre-1844" organization.

Parsons commenting on this type of adaptation of charisma states that:

32 It is interesting to note that Jason Briggs later seceded from the Reorganized Church on the grounds that the placing of Joseph Smith's son into the presidency would "establish in our judgment a lineal descent of authority, equivalent to an imperial dynasty which is foreign to the spirit and genius of the gospel of Christ." Quoted in Joseph F. Smith, op. cit., p. 26.

In the one case, the charismatic quality is transferred according to one of a number of possible rules, from one concrete person (or group of persons) to another. The most usual, though by no means the only possible, instance is hereditary charisma. Then the element of sacredness, the qualifications for certain functions, inheres in the particular concrete person by virtue of his birth, an act within the given sphere becomes legitimate by virtue of the fact that he performs it.\textsuperscript{34}

Thus, it can be seen that while Brigham Young assumed leadership because of his place in the priesthood hierarchy, young Joseph Smith III became prophet by "right of birth."

The son of the assassinated prophet was confronted with the prejudices many had felt toward his father's organization and a dearth of membership. In 1860 the Reorganization Movement numbered less than five hundred followers.\textsuperscript{35} An aggressive missionary program initiated by the leadership of the young organization did gain membership by appealing to dissidents in other organizations which had come forth from the pre-1844 church. Missionaries were sent to Utah to capitalize on any discontent in the Latter Day Saint group under the leadership of Brigham Young. Further, rather profitable missionary work was done in Wales, Switzerland, Germany, Scandinavia, and Canada. By 1868 church membership had reached 10,000.

\textsuperscript{34}Parsons, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 663.

Extremely defensive concerning the polygamy being practiced by the Utah church, the Reorganization leadership argued that Joseph Smith Jr. had never condoned or practiced plural wifery. In 1872 Joseph Smith III of the Reorganization Movement published an editorial attacking the Utah Mormons and stating that Utah should not receive statehood until the constitution prohibited polygamy. Smith was sure that this act of prohibition would convince all that the practice had no divine sanction. Clearly, the Reorganization's attempts to place itself in contraposition to the Utah group's practices gave it a kind of negative identity to many. To those moving away from the other Mormon sects, however, this was a very powerful appeal.

During the first few decades of its existence the Reorganized Church gave very little attention to the idea of Zion other than affirming the desirability of regrouping at Independence, Missouri. Church headquarters were moved to Lamoni, Iowa, and a printing office was founded in 1881. In 1885 Graceland College was formed by the church as a nonsectarian liberal arts institution in Lamoni.

The son of Joseph Smith III, Frederick, was the first graduate of Graceland College. He was also the first of the charismatic Smith family to attain any degree of formal education. He received his Master's Degree from Kansas University and studied under the eminent G. Stanley
Hall at Clark College where he received his Doctorate in 1916. Two years prior, Joseph Smith III had died and had given a "letter of instruction" explaining that his son Frederick was to be the new prophet-president of the church.

With Frederick M. Smith a kind of consolidation of the church programs began. A degree of financial planning was initiated by the church leadership as was a building and missionary program. Frederick Smith was troubled by internal problems in the church in the 1920's as polity conflicts between the "Bishopric" and the "Presidency" caused much hard feeling and some actual withdrawals from the church. In the main, the church did gain a goodly number of converts and made financial progress as well, until the depression caused a retrenchment in the building and missionary programs. Frederick M. Smith, unlike his grandfather, was no revolutionary character. Perhaps due to his education and secure position in the community, he did not achieve the same adulation or hostility as did the original prophet.

Israel A. Smith, younger brother of Frederick, was ordained as the next prophet of the church when his older brother died in 1946. Israel A. Smith was no less "in the world" than his elder brother and held membership in the American Bar Association, Kiwanis, National Municipal League and other such organizations.36 He saw his basic role as an ameliorative one.

36Ibid., p. 587.
In 1957 he remarked, "I wanted to bring about an era of harmony in the councils of the church. We had passed through a period of disagreement, and that disagreement needed to be replaced with harmony before the work of the church could progress." He was essentially successful in facilitating agreement among the membership.

During the leadership of Frederick and Israel Smith the church had passed in many ways from sectarian to denominational status. The persecution of former days became almost nonexistent as the Saints were accepted into the communities in which they lived. They were not plagued by accusations concerning secret temple rites, as was the Utah church. Since the Reorganized church did not engage in temple ritual, such as "baptism for the dead" and "spiritual marriage," they were seen by many as closer to orthodox Protestantism than their Utah brethren.

In 1958 Israel Smith was killed in an automobile accident near Pattonsburg, Missouri. He had executed a document ten years before which made W. Wallace Smith, his younger brother, "President of the High Priesthood, the Prophet, Seer, and Revelator to the Church." Wallace Smith had taken a B.A. from the University of Missouri in 1924.

---


Since 1958 the church's leadership has been somewhat torn between the desire for the dynamic experiences of former days and the need for solidarity and respectability. The official organ of the church, The Saints' Herald, reflects the often bitter conflicts between those holding fast to the traditional sectarian values of a people considering themselves "the only true church" and those preferring cooperation with other religious groups, participation in politics and social action, and demythologization of the crucial beliefs of the church. 39

Those in the church opposing its trends toward secularization point to the fact that to compromise or change church dogma would destroy the uniqueness of the institution. The membership of more liberal persuasion maintain that the nineteenth century ideals of the organization are increasingly irrelevant in an urban and secular social setting. This tension between the secularism of its modernist membership and the convictions of those perceiving the organization as a closed and perfected institution is undoubtedly reflected in the utopian thought of the church.

39 Bryan R. Wilson, in his article, "An Analysis of Sect Development," American Sociological Review, XXVI No. 3 (February, 1959, p. 11) states that, "The absence of tradition and of stable class differences, the promotion of denominational competition, and the expectation of growth and development result in extreme accommodation which helps sects rapidly to evolve into denominations - almost as part of a success pattern."
Bryan Wilson comments on this general problem:

If the sect is to persist as an organization, it must not only separate its members from the world, but must also maintain the dissimilarity of its own values from those of the secular society.\textsuperscript{40}

\textsuperscript{40} \textit{Ibid.}, p. 9.
The Latter Day Saint Movement has sometimes been called a truly American religious phenomenon. There is a good deal of justification in this statement since, unlike most other religious groups in America, Mormonism cannot be traced to a formal break from a European parent church.

Nevertheless, the great number of religious groups having similar theological and utopian views to the Saints suggests that a great deal of complex "hybridization" of ideas occurred in Mormonism. The idea of Zion, "the New Jerusalem" was held by early Christians, the Anabaptists, later by the Shakers, Germanic utopists and a great many other religious groups. Edward Andrews points out the possible nature of this complex web of ideas between the Shakers and the early Latter Day Saints.

Though documentation is absent, and Joseph Smith himself disclaimed any inspiration from the Shakers, rumor had it that in his schemes for a religious community he was indebted to the section on united inheritance in Dunlavey's Manifesto [a Shaker document written in 1818]. Others said that Smith was influenced by a sect near Kirkland, Ohio, called "The Family," who before their conversion to Mormonism had been affected by the doctrines preached at the neighboring Shaker settlement of
North Union. Be that as it may, after two years of friendly trade between the groups, Smith received a revelation in March, 1831, to send three delegates to North Union on a proselyting mission. The inevitable issue regarding marriage, "lust," and the nature of the messiahship precipitated a stormy debate, ending with Elder Oasabel Kitchell angrily expelling the equally excited Mormons from the community... In a manuscript entitled *The Early Shakers*, Daryl Chase... noted the following similarities between Shakerism and Mormonism: the reception of revelations on a gold plate; the belief by both faiths that time was divided into long dispensations and that theirs was the last and greatest the claim by both that their church was a divine restoration of the primitive Christian Church; and acceptance of the doctrine of a dual Deity [*i.e.*., both male and female].

Another interesting possibility is brought to focus on the problem by Joseph Geddes in his doctoral dissertation, *The United Order Among the Mormons*. Geddes takes this position,

That Joseph Smith was informed concerning socialistic and communistic experiments, there can be no doubt. As a young man Joseph Smith worked at Harmony, Pennsylvania, the town which the Rappites first established in 1803... It was in Harmony, Pennsylvania, that Joseph Smith became acquainted with, and married, Emma Hale. She no doubt knew the history of the Rappites.

---


A more direct antecedent of the Latter Day Saints' communitarian ideal can be found with Sidney Rigdon who was a schismatic Baptist preacher living near Mentor, Ohio. Rigdon had developed a form of communalism near Kirtland, Ohio, where a group of his flock "held all things in common." In 1830 Rigdon and his followers were converted to the newly formed Latter Day Saint Movement. According to Geddes,

By February, 1831, about one thousand Saints had gathered to Kirtland to make their homes. During this time the little 'family' group continued their 'common stock' plan. Joseph Smith now at Kirtland prevailed on them to abandon it in favor of 'the united order.'

Richard P. Howard, historian for the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints comments that

Prior to the end of 1830 the word 'Zion' was used numerous times in documents eventually published in the Doctrine and Covenants. However, the term did not carry specific meaning beyond what may be implied from a general allusion to the work of the church.

Later, for the church the idea of Zion became extremely specific and no less radical. Joseph Smith's talents were

\[3\] Ibid., p. 21.
\[4\] Ibid.
organizational as well as charismatic and his concepts of Zion evolved as new ideas and crises faced his organization. He was well aware of the class differentials in his own society, and indeed, of the lowliness of his own background. To Smith, Zion, like early Christianity, would be God's advocate for the poor. In one revelation Smith declared

The poor shall be exalted, in that the rich are made low; for the earth is full, and there is enough to spare; yea, I prepared all things, and have given unto the children of men to be agents unto themselves. Therefore, if any man shall take of the abundance which I have made and impart not his portion, according to the law of my gospel, unto the poor, and the needy, he shall, with the wicked, lift up his eyes in hell, being in torment. 6

On February 9, 1831, in Kirtland, Ohio, Joseph Smith began to give structure to the nebulous utopian ideals of his time. His revelation at this time, in effect, required all members of the church community to transfer all their resources to the church.

And behold, thou shalt consecrate all thy properties, that which thou hast unto me, with a covenant and a deed which can not be broken; and they shall be laid before the Bishop of my church... And it shall come to pass that the Bishop of my church, after that he has received the properties of my church, he shall appoint every man a steward over his own property...inasmuch is

sufficient for himself and family: and
the residue shall be kept to administer
to him who has not, that every man may
receive according as he stands in need. 7

A great many troubles were to plague the Saints in
their "Zionic" endeavors at Kirtland. Defections from the
ranks caused serious legal dilemmas as the disaffected
members challenged the church's right to control their property.
Moreover, a banking venture by church leaders became bankrupt
and ruined several individuals financially. It was at this
time that Zion took on a specific geographic focus. In 1833
Smith received a revelation  [to purchase]
all the lands by money, which can be
purchased for money, in the region
round about the land which I have
appointed to be the land of Zion, for
the beginning of the gathering of my
Saints, all the land which can be
purchased in Jackson County [Missouri]
and the counties round about, and
leave the residue in mine hand...
and let honorable men be appointed...
and send them to purchase these lands
...in this way Zion shall be established. 8

In a letter written by Smith to Saints living in other
sections of the country he says:

The season is mild and delightful
nearly three quarters of the year,
and as the land of Zion, situated at

7 Howard, op. cit., p. 15.
8 Smith, op. cit.
about equal distances from the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans, as well as the Allegheny and Rocky Mountains..., it bids to become one of the most blessed places on the globe, when the curse is taken from the land.  

The land of Zion was to have definite geographical boundaries. In 1833 Smith related that

At this time the evil and designing circulated a report that Zion was to be extended as far east as Ohio, which in some degree tended to distract the minds of the Saints and produced a momentary indecision about removing thither according to the commandments, but the report was soon corrected, and the brethren continued to remove to Zion from Kirtland.  

Once the decision was made to establish Zion in Jackson County, Missouri, certain functional problems faced the Mormon leadership. First, and foremost, was the need of purchasing land; second was the problem of "dividing the inheritances" or properties; third the regulation of "the gathering," and fourth, the need for planning the City of Zion.

In 1830 the federal government was disposing of land at slightly over one dollar per acre. The Saints were typically poor but committed and within a short time had

---


10 Ibid., p. 376.
raised several hundred dollars. Since the older settlers were hostile to the Saints, the Church was unable to buy some of the most needed land. This, along with continuous persecution, produced constant insecurity in the community.

The economics of Zion were under fire in Independence, Missouri as well. Individuals balked at turning over all their possessions to the Bishop who in turn would lease the property back to the individual Saints. The revelation given by Smith earlier which began, "And behold, thou shalt consecrate all they properties..." was changed in 1835 to read, "And behold, thou wilt remember the poor, and consecrate of thy properties..." The Saints had been troubled by an influx of propertyless Easterners who produced economic chaos by "gathering" too rapidly. The profound desire for equality by the Saints was constantly frustrated by these problems and imprecise polity as well. Equality was still the ideal, but it was to be approached differently. The new tactic would involve the "consecrating" of the devout members' "surplus" over and above his "just wants and needs."

---

11 Geddes, op. cit., p. 38.

12 The original quote was made in the Book of Commandments which was revised by Smith and called the Doctrine and Covenants (Independence, Missouri: Herald House, 1966) p. 96.

13 Geddes sees the Mormon concept of equality as taking into consideration the size of the family, differential circumstances, and differential needs.
This meant, in effect, that the Church plan was not joint stock or communistic but a kind of private welfare fund which was to be administered by the Church. The "surplus" of an individual was to be paid by tithing, representing ten per cent or less of an individual's income. The surplus was to be held in a "storehouse." "The time has come, and is now at hand, and behold, and lo, it must needs be that there be an organization of my people, in regulating and establishing a storehouse for the poor of my people, both in this place and in the land of Zion."\(^{14}\)

The "storehouse principle," as it was later called, seemed to be a much milder economic change than the earlier totalist schemes. It was also much more compatible with the economic demands of capitalism.

The building of Zion in Independence involved a great deal of organization. It was, in a rather restricted sense, city planning. Each plot one mile square was to be divided into city lots, and in the center of each city block public buildings and storehouses were constructed for the Bishop. The city was to contain twelve temples. No lot was to contain more than one house. Permanency was to be achieved by permitting no buildings to be erected with less enduring

materials than brick and stone. Provisions against crowding were made by constructing streets at the uniform width of eight rods. Privacy and quiet surroundings were to be insured by making lots long and buildings twenty-five feet from the street. Civic cleanliness received consideration in the provision that barns, stables and the like must be built outside the residential district. Finally, the early Mormons attempted to dispel rural isolation by providing the farmer with a house in the city and a farm in the neighborhood.15

Plans did not reach full fruition, yet the Mormon communities were in the main well designed and efficiently organized.

If the demands for equality and order were attractive to many of the faithful, belief in the imminent return of Christ with its attendant disorders and crises was an even more compelling reason for fleeing to Zion.

In 1834 Joseph Smith had warned, "Prepare ye the way of the Lord, and make his paths strait, for the hour of his coming is nigh, when the lamb shall stand upon Mount Zion."16 And later, he cautioned that "...it shall come

15 This material is taken from two letters by Joseph Smith written in 1832 and quoted in Geddes, op. cit., pp. 88-95.

16 Smith, op. cit., p. 287.
to pass, among the wicked, that every man that will not take his sword against his neighbor, must needs flee to Zion for safety. And there shall be gathered unto it out of every nation under heaven; and it shall be the only people that shall not be at war with another. And it shall be said among the wicked, let us not go up to battle against Zion for the inhabitants of Zion are terrible wherefore we cannot stand.  

The millenarian aspects of any utopian movement give it a sense of urgency and in some cases abandonment. The best argument the Saints could provide for gathering to Zion was the state of the world in their time. Utopias are created successfully in so far as they can create a rejection of the present with its untold difficulties and disorders. The psychological and sociological functions of millenarianism have been discussed to a considerable extent by Yonina Talmon, an anthropologist. She finds that deprived groups are more likely attracted to the dynamic millenarian movements.

Another important factor operative in the emergence of millenarism was found to be social isolation brought about by the disruption of traditional group ties... The people most exposed to the new pressures and therefore more prone to millenarism were the malintegrated and isolated who could find no assured and recognized place in cohesive primary groups.  

---

17 Ibid.

Further she remarks that

Millenarism has strong disruptive potentialities. While it supplies the individual followers with strong identification with a cohesive movement and gives him hope for imminent delivery, it creates serious difficulties in the sphere of canalisation of aggression. Such movements always face the crisis of nonmaterialization and suffer from the turning of the aggression of its members inwards which manifests itself in numerous fissions.19

This could provide partial explanation for the schisms and heresies which had constantly plagued the Saints in their utopian endeavors.

Anthony F.C. Wallace, in an article in The American Anthropologists describes what he terms "revitalization movements."

A revitalization movement is defined as a deliberate, organized, conscious effort by members of a society to construct a more satisfying culture. ... The persons involved in the process of revitalization must perceive their culture as a system, they must feel that this cultural system is unsatisfactory; and they must innovate not merely discrete items, but a new cultural system, specifying new relationships as well as, in some cases, new traits.20

19 Ibid., p. 532.

Latter Day Saintism was perceived as a restoration of Christianity in a culture which the Saints believed had forgotten the essence of the faith. Wallace describes what he calls the "cognitive mazeway" of a culture and the attempt of the movement to restructure the mazeway in a more satisfying manner.

The reformulation of the mazeway generally seems to depend on a restructuring of elements and subsystems which have already attained currency in the society...and which are known to the person who is to become prophet or leader. The occasion of their combination in a form which constitutes an internally consistent structure...is abrupt and dramatic, usually occurring as a moment of insight, a brief period of realization of relationships and opportunities. These moments are often called inspiration or revelation...

These revelations express 1. the dreamer's wish for a satisfying parental figure (the supernatural, guardian-spirit content) 2. world-destruction fantasies (the apocalyptic millennial content) 3. feelings of guilt and anxiety (the moral content) 4. longings for the establishment of an ideal state of stable and satisfying human and supernatural relations (the restitution fantasy or utopian content).

The revelations given to Joseph Smith and those who followed him fulfill in the main Wallace's criteria.

Therefore, in viewing the progression of ideas concerning Zion held by the Saints, one should keep in mind the fact that

21 Ibid., p. 170.
the need for bringing a new and "higher" source of social and psychological integration has produced a powerful motivation within the followers of the movement. Out of the legions of sects proclaiming truth, the Saints felt that only they had been chosen for the "great and marvelous work." Out of the chaos of frontier life, a unity would arise obliterating the differences which kept men at odds with each other. Most importantly, the creation of Zion meant an end to history, as Christ's return would create a final stasis.

With the withdrawal of the Saints to Nauvoo in 1838, a setback to the Zionic ideal had to be admitted. Independence, Missouri had been consecrated the home of Zionic living and then had to be abandoned with the idea that the Saints would someday return to their home. In Nauvoo much planning was done for the city and the storehouse concept was realized to an extent. Yet further concern with the construction of the perfect society was not given highest priority since mass evangelism brought in new converts daily who were unfamiliar with the ideals of Mormonism. Practical problems, in large part, supplanted the dreams and theories of Zionic ideals. Nevertheless, even though the Saints had been forced out of Missouri, the prophet assured his people that

Zion shall not be moved out of her place, notwithstanding her children are scattered, they that remain and are pure in heart shall
return and come to their inheritance; they and their children, with songs of everlasting joy, to build up the waste places of Zion. 22

Post-1844 Concepts in the Reorganized Church

With the scattering of the Saints after the death of the prophet, Zion seemed further away than ever. Those Saints following the claims of the dynamic Brigham Young eventually did attempt another United Order in Richfield, Utah, in 1874. These experiments were largely reversions to pure communism and lasted largely in isolated communities. With the breakdown of isolation in those towns came a breakdown in the utopian dream, and by 1883 the experiments had been abandoned.

For the Saints in the Midwest who refused to follow Young, a different variety of problems was extant. They were a distinct minority since they were outnumbered two to one by the Utah branch. They resented the "heretical" ideas held by the Utahans and were constantly incensed by the fact that nonmembers confused the two sects. Another fact facing the new Reorganized Church was that isolation for their group was impossible. Many members of the early church

22 Joseph Smith, et. al., op. cit., p. 232.
after 1860 strongly wished to return to "Zion" or Jackson County, Missouri. The leadership of the new church was extremely cautious about the wisdom of such a move. Of more immediate concern to the church was the need to differentiate themselves from the "Mormons." Much of the pamphleteering and editorializing in the True Latter Day Saints Herald spoke to this issue. The early members of the church were possessed by a sense of urgency about their mission. In an article in the official church organ entitled, "The Speedy Advent of Christ," written in June, 1861, the point was made that:

"famine and starvation are staring them in the face in one section of the country; and secession and rebellion in another; arming and equipping for the most deadly conflict, waiting and preparing with all possible speed to drench the land with the blood of their brethren, and it will come as a whirlwind from the Almighty, in the own due time of the Lord..."23

Clearly, the millenarian vision was a part of the early Reorganization Movement, as it was of the pre-1844 organization. Missionary work was intensive in the movement and for a time "the gathering" was pushed to the background. Young Joseph Smith III held his organization headquarters in Plano, Illinois, but proposed that the offices be moved nearer to "Zion" as early as possible. A "removal committee" chose Lamoni, Iowa, 

23 "The Speedy Advent of Christ," Saints Herald. (June, 1861) II: 77.
as the most efficacious place. A company was formed, called The Order of Enoch, which was to buy land in the environs forming a joint stock organization. On July 15, 1879, the Saints Herald advised that

Men of the Church, whether holding office or not, may legitimately combine their moneys and goods in organized associations, composed of two or more members, for the purpose of carrying on any industrial enterprise that may offer opportunity for utilizing labor, giving employment to those who may need it, and returning a sufficient profit to pay a reasonable percentage to those who may need it, and returning a sufficient profit to pay a reasonable percentage upon the capital invested. We name in this connection the manufacture of woodenware, plows and other articles of husbandry... To those who may be hesitating, waiting for the institution of the Order of Enoch, we state that if the law concerning that order can not be filled by an association of men and money, for the transaction of every business enterprise in which honest men may spend their time and employ their means, legally organized according to the laws of the land, we believe that it can not be done... The Order of Enoch is when reduced to every-day practice but an organized legal body, having church origin and membership. That is divesting the Order of Enoch of all its legendary mistiness, it can but prove to be a legal method to carry out church designs.24

The Order of Enoch was successful in its creation of "one of the stakes of Zion." The economic premises of the

---

company, however, disintegrated into de facto capitalism. The town of Lamoni, save for its concentration of "Saints," became much like other villages in southern Iowa.

The idea of Zion at this point became somewhat ill defined with regard to specific plans by the church. The idea of "the gathering" was still foremost in the minds of the church leadership, although no specific plans were made. In 1887 the editor of the Saints Herald explicated the concept in this way:

there are at least three stages of gathering; first gathering out of Babylon, or other churches into the Church of Christ; second, the gathering of the Church of Christ afterward to the land of Zion; third, a subsequent gathering from various parts of the land of Zion to a center place or the City of Zion. Now the fact is, that the church is Zion, America is Zion, and there is to be a city called Zion. 25

This rather ill defined and diffuse concept of Zion was to characterize much of the thinking of the church for the next several years. By the turn of the century, the church had built several institutions, hospitals, schools, and a goodly number of new "branches" or congregations. Several thousand Saints had congregated in and around Independence, Missouri, and the church bought several farms

in Jackson County. Little communitarian experimentation was attempted, however. Regardless, the lack of physical progress did not deter the leadership of the Reorganized Church from advocacy of the ideal. Indeed, as the twentieth century progressed, the idea of Zion became an even more important facet of the church's evangelical program.

Although the church had become relatively wealthy and its membership essentially middle class, the economics of Zion were still considered and debated. Bishop Delapp wrote concerning the "storehouse principle" in 1947.

Surplus funds handled through the storehouse organization may be used for the care of the poor and needy, for the purpose of purchasing lands for the benefit of the church, and for building houses of worship; and for a much broader use which is the building up of the New Jerusalem. This shows that the use of surplus may be much broader than we can possibly anticipate at the present time, but that out of our experience in the years to come we will undoubtedly have sufficient freedom in the administration of surplus that it may be applied toward meeting the total needs of society, particularly in respect to those properties and facilities which may require ownership in common. Included in these would, of course, be utilities and real property necessary and essential to community welfare.26

Nevertheless, the precise structure of Zion was subject to a great deal of debate. Further, some members were somewhat unhappy with the lack of progress toward utopian goals being made by the church. These members may or may not have been buoyed up by the revelation given by Israel A. Smith on April 7, 1947. "The work of preparation and the perfection of my Saints go forward slowly, and Zionic conditions are no further away nor any closer than the spiritual condition of my people justifies..."27

By the sixth decade of the twentieth century, the concept of Zion had not been acted upon by the church leadership. Moreover, the leadership of the church hierarchy was to some degree in disagreement as to the conceptualization of the utopian scheme. Zion was sometimes conceived of in generalities as in the following quote from the editors of the Saints Herald.

Zion is, in a sense, a community of selected superlatives. The people of this place are more responsive to the word of God than in any other place in the world. They are more dedicated to divinity - more prayerful, more humble, more loving, more responsive in witnessing, than anywhere else. As to each other, they are kinder, more friendly, more helpful, and more concerned about the needs of others than in any other community.

The streets are wider, the yards are cleaner, the houses are neater, the air is purer, the food is more wholesome in Zion than any other place.\textsuperscript{28}

One can see that this concept is utopian only in the sense that it seeks "the good." This statement contains no basic denegation of the society at large. It merely approaches Zion as a greater degree of "the good."

Richard T. LaPiere points to the effect of generalized ideas and their effect on social organization in this way.

All ideologies that have endured over a significant period of time have been highly abstract, the beliefs included vague or at best ill defined, the values of the loftiest order.\textsuperscript{29} Since all ideologies that have endured have been highly abstract, it is reasonable to assume that only those that are highly abstract have survival value. Every society is subject to gradual and continuing change and to occasional periods of critical change; if it is to survive as a society, its institutions and other structures must be adapted to internal and external changes; if these structures are to be ideologically maintained, then the ideologies themselves must be adaptable.

LaPiere's point is well taken. Those utopian experiments least successful have historically been most inflexible. Yet one factor complicating the situation is the fact that the

\textsuperscript{28}Editorial comment, \textit{Saints Herald} (May 15, 1968) CXV No. 9:3.

Latter Day Saints had historically developed extremely specific ideas concerning the location, the economic system and other aspects of Zion. To turn from these specifics may be "functional" for the continuance of the organization, yet many individuals may resist this change. One church official writing in a 1968 issue of the Saints Herald reflects this point of view.

I do wish, however, that we could preserve the word "Zion" for the city New Jerusalem and its borders, where a gathered people shall be found... Certainly when the Lord repeatedly admonishes the church to redeem Zion, he is not referring to redeeming Los Angeles, Detroit, Mexico City, Tokyo, or other cities. Also, the temple to which Christ is to come is clearly designated to be built in the city, New Jerusalem, or Independence, Missouri.30

This quotation clearly shows the sectarian millenarianist views of traditional church leadership. Basic to this concept is the view that the Reorganized Church is unique and alone in its utopist program. Another proponent of this view adds,

this is no small task in which we are engaged. This is no small church of which we are part. We are engaged in a task that no other church and no other people can accomplish. We have the task of building Zion... We live in the day that many of those in the past would gladly live in. Zion is within our grasp. It can be a reality now!31


The conflict as to what Zion is or should be has undoubtedly upset or disoriented a goodly number of the church membership. Another church leader states rather defensively, "I cannot accept the idea that Zion is outdated or outmoded. We may have to redefine what we mean by Zion, but certainly we cannot limit it to a nineteenth century concept." 32

It is not difficult to understand that this plethora of concepts concerning the nature of Zion could injure the dynamics of the church organization.

In 1966 W. Wallace Smith, President of the Church, called for a reassessment of the situation in this way.

There is a great need to interpret concepts about the kingdom of God and Zionic communities in a world wide context... A study of basic theological foundations of the Zionic movement is prerequisite to implementation. 33

This is not the statement of a truly charismatic leader. No immediate call to action results from this concept of Zion, no radical rejection of the world is evident, and most importantly, no millenarian sense of urgency can be read into this statement. Possibly this reflects the changing mode of thought representative of a sectarian group moving ever closer to a denominational position.


RESEARCH DESIGN

Hypotheses

The guiding postulate of this study is that any group of individuals maintaining "perfectionistic" or utopian ideals of a religious nature in the dynamic and industrialized society of twentieth century America will very likely feel pressured to change those ideals and beliefs. If this point of departure is correct, several corollaries may follow. The most important of these is that social status, personality, and one's reference group are all possible intervening variables with regard to the strength with which one holds to a particular utopian belief system. To investigate this postulate in an empirical way, the investigator chose to examine the utopian attitudes and beliefs of individuals who hold membership with the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. Further, the population was delimited to take in only the church members in attendance at Graceland College in Lamoni, Iowa. Graceland College is the only institution of higher learning sponsored by the Reorganized Church. "It represents, in a rather unique way, the conflicts faced by a group holding to sectarian utopian views in an increasingly "homogenized" and secularized society. A great majority of the parents of students in this liberal arts institution are dedicated to
the traditional ideals of the sponsoring church. For this reason, their action in sending their offspring to the church college may be seen as an attempt to preserve the traditional value system of the sect. Yet, somewhat paradoxically, an institution such as Graceland College may, for some, produce results other than the preservation of traditional sectarian values. For it is precisely in liberal arts institutions, such as Graceland, that "secularity", "modernity" and "rationalism" are fostered. Heavy concentrations in the humanities and social sciences, typical of the liberal arts college, are likely to pose a threat to traditional utopian or religious beliefs. Thus, the college can be seen as a kind of microcosm of the confrontation between the sectarian world view and the critical viewpoint of modern rationality.

There are obvious limitations to the selection of a college group as a population in this study. Foremost is the fact that it is a highly select group in income, training, and perhaps even in intellect. Also, it is a somewhat "artificial" environment for many students since they are unincumbered by family or occupational responsibilities. For this reason, one should be extremely cautious about generalizing from this group to the Latter Day Saint Movement as a whole, to say nothing of utopian movements in general.

To reiterate the guiding postulate of this study, individuals (i.e., students) holding to utopian beliefs in this
society will be pressured to change those beliefs in conformity to the demands of the larger society. Why then do some individuals modify their utopian attitudes to a greater extent than others? The following hypotheses based on sociological and socio-psychological variables attempt to speak to this question in a partial way:

General Hypothesis I. **Social position is a determining factor in shaping utopian and religious attitudes.**

Corollary One. **Senior students in the sample will express significantly less commitment to the sectarian utopian ideal than will their freshmen counterparts.** This is postulated due to the "secularizing" influences of education and due to the fact that students in their later years of college are more prone to "emancipation" from the beliefs of their parents.

Corollary Two. **Senior students in the sample will express significantly less religious orthodoxy than freshman students.** The rationale for this hypothesis is much the same as for Corollary One; that is, students are exposed to ideas and attitudes foreign to sectarian religious ideals in courses in the humanities or social and behavioral sciences.

Corollary Three. **Senior students in the sample will demonstrate a significantly less "conservative" political and social belief system than will freshman students.** It is a commonplace that higher education is a liberalizing experience
for many students. Parochial attitudes are subject to criticism in the liberal arts environs and, therefore, may be expected to be pressured to change.

Corollary Four. Students who have parents extremely committed to activity in the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints will themselves be better able to maintain strong sectarian utopian beliefs than those students who have comparatively inactive parents. It is obvious from the review of historical utopias that the passing of utopian ideals from one generation to the next is the crux of the problem of the maintenance of the utopian ideology. One would naturally expect parents who had a strong attitudinal commitment to the utopian beliefs of their sect to be able to pass this to their children to a greater extent than individuals with only low or moderate commitment to their beliefs. The measure of parental activity in the church provides, in a rough way, an index of this commitment.

General Hypothesis II. Sectarian-utopian attitudes do not exist in a vacuum; rather, they are part of a complex of interrelated and supportive attitudinal clusters.

Corollary One. Those students who are able to maintain a strong belief in "religious orthodoxy" will also be able to maintain their utopian belief system more easily than those holding to less "orthodox" beliefs. Since the Latter Day Saint utopian concept is firmly grounded in theology, one would
expect that individuals who reject Latter Day Saint theology would reject or, at least, modify their traditional utopian attitudes.

Corollary Two. Those students who maintain an organic, conservative or static conception of society will be able to maintain their utopian belief systems to a greater degree than their "nonconservative" counterparts. The assumption here is that students "inherit" socially a "package" of beliefs from parents and community. Part of this package may be a resistance to change and modernity. In religious and social life this may take the form of religious orthodoxy and sectarian utopian attitudes. In politics, this is likely to be expressed in a generic form of conservatism.

Corollary Three. Those students demonstrating a dogmatic cognitive style will show greater commitment to sectarian utopian beliefs than less dogmatic students. Since "dogmatism" represents a generalized mental rigidity with regard to a belief system\(^1\), the researcher assumes that dogmatism performs a protective function in the maintenance of an ideology such as utopianism.

Corollary Four. Those students demonstrating a dogmatic cognitive style will show greater commitment to religious orthodoxy than less dogmatic students. As in Corollary Three, the investigator sees dogmatic cognitive style as providing a protective function for the traditionalist religious belief system.

Corollary Five. Those students demonstrating a dogmatic style will hold to a more conservative view of society than will nondogmatic students. Again, dogmatism may be assumed, here, to be a defensive mechanism against the intrusion of modernity into one's system of beliefs.

Corollary Six. Those students exhibiting a highly dogmatic cognitive style will see a greater number of beliefs as "essential" to their concept of utopia than will less dogmatic students. The reason for this hypothesis lies in the assumption that nondogmatic students will not be as "protective" of beliefs that they consider "non central." They may, in fact, develop only one central idea (i.e., utopia is "love"); while the dogmatic student, it is assumed, would insist that a greater number of his beliefs are "central" and, thus, not subject to disputation. According to Rokeach, "The more closed the system, the more the central part corresponds to absolute beliefs in or about authority, and the more the peripheral part
corresponds to beliefs and disbeliefs perceived to emanate from such authority."^{2}

The Instrument

A questionnaire was designed in October and November, 1968, which was to serve as a basis for the research. It contained, for the most part, forced choice attitudinal items relative to the student's utopian beliefs. The first section of the questionnaire was concerned with relevant demographic and factual material concerning the student and his family background. Specific questions related to the political persuasion of both the individual student and his parents. Further, the student was asked to describe the extent of his commitment and activity in the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints and to describe that of his parents as well.

A check list of topics concerning national and international social issues gave the student the chance to express his interests on current social issues.

Conservatism Scale. To explore the possible relationship between conservatism as a political belief system and the student's religious utopian thoughts, the investigator used a "conservatism" scale developed by Herbert McClosky at the

^{2} Ibid., p. 198.
at the University of Minnesota in 1958. The essence of "conservatism" according to McClosky lies in the idea that "man is a creature of appetite and will, governed by emotion rather than reason... Society is ruled by divine intent...; It is organic, plural, inordinately complex... change, therefore, must be resisted..." And finally, "Men are naturally unequal and society requires orders and classes for the good of all."³

This conceptualization of conservatism is congruent with many of the ideas of the sectarian utopist. The desire for stasis and resistance to external forces of change are perhaps common to both the sectarian utopian and the traditionalist conservative.

Questionnaire items from number 22 to 33 measure this variable. (See Appendix)

**Dogmatism Scale.** Rokeach's "dogmatism scale," as modified by Troldahl,⁴ was used to test the hypothesis that dogmatism in cognitive style would correlate positively with sectarian utopian commitment. Troldahl and Powell have refined the original sixty item dogmatism scale and through techniques of item analysis have selected those items most


discriminatory and relevant to social and political scientists. Questionnaire items from number 34 to number 44 measure this variable. (See Appendix)

**Conceptualization of Zion.** Item number 45 of the questionnaire asks the respondent to "define the concept of Zion as you understand it." The following items are of a more specific nature and concern the valence of the concept to the student, and the degree of attitudinal change, if any, which he had experienced toward Zion. Item 50 provides a list of beliefs held by many of the "Saints" concerning Zion. The students were asked to check those items which they considered "absolutely essential" to their concepts of Zion. The beliefs unchecked could be considered "peripheral" or rejected.

**Religious Orthodoxy Scale.** Items 51 through 55 represent a short but highly predictive scale by Snell Putney and Russell Middleton which measures commonly held concepts of religious orthodoxy. Since, in many ways, the religious beliefs of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church approximate those of orthodox Protestantism, this scale was held to be appropriate to measure this variable.

---


As an example of the scale's utility, see Richard R. Clayton, "Religiosity in 5-D: A Southern Test," *Social Forces* (September, 1968) XLVII: 80-3.
**Sectarian Utopian Commitment Scale.** This scale was constructed by the investigator to measure the degree of commitment held by the students to the concept of Zion. In the main, items for this scale were taken with some modification from statements put forth by authors of articles in the *Saints' Herald*. The first six items in the scale are designed to state in a positive way the sectarian attitude (i.e., The City of Zion will be a place of refuge in the last days). Later in the scale, antithetical statements express an anti-sectarian position (i.e., The concept of Zion, while a necessary part of the nineteenth century church, has outlived its usefulness). The scale consists of twelve attitudinal statements in all, numbered 56 through 67 in the questionnaire. (See Appendix)

To insure the unidimensionality of the items, they were scaled according to the Guttman Method. The "Cornell technique," a computer program, gave the researcher a coefficient of reproducibility of .787. According to Stouffer, *et al*, in *Measurement and Prediction*, a coefficient of reproducibility of this level denotes a "quasi" scale. The quasi scale indicates, rather than unidimensionality, "a single dominant factor and indefinitely many small random factors..."6 While a unidimensional scale is certainly to be

---

preferred, the "quasi scale" is not without its value. As Stouffer points out,

The importance of a quasi scale lies in how it is used for external prediction problems... The prediction of the external variable rests essentially on the dominant factor that is being measured by the quasi scale scores. Thus a quasi scale has the full mathematical advantages of a scalable area.7

It will be shown later in this paper that the "sectarian utopian commitment scale" does have predictive value.

Other Attitudinal Items Concerning Utopian Beliefs. Item number 69, not included in the Sectarian Utopian Commitment Scale, relates to the student's ability or willingness to place his concepts of Zion in an historical perspective by comparing it to utopian experiments by other religious sects. Failure to see any relationship between one's own ideas and those of historical competitors in religion is, to an extent, a sectarian attitude.

The last section of the questionnaire contains forced choice and open-ended items which asked the students the important question as to whether they believed their church is making significant progress toward the establishment of Zion. Another question posed to the students asked if they felt the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints should

7 Ibid., p. 162.
cooperate with ecumenical groups. A negative answer to this expresses an essentially sectarian religious position also.

In total, seventy-two (72) questions were included in the instrument. Most students were able to finish it rather easily in the fifty to sixty minutes allotted to them during the class period.

Sample and Population

As was mentioned previously, Graceland College was founded in 1895 as a Liberal Arts College. About ninety percent of its students are members of the sponsoring church. A great many of these students have selected this college due to their religious convictions or those of their parents. Zion, the utopian concept of the Saints, is usually the subject of a great deal of formal and informal discussion in dormitories, religious groups, and the like. As an instructor at the college, the researcher has seen manifestations of attitudes concerning "Zion" ranging from complete cynicism to total immersion in the "Zionic" belief system.

A sample was drawn from the Graceland College students, and questionnaires were administered to them in early December, 1968. The student body at this time consisted of 1,255 students; of this number approximately 130 were not members of the Reorganized Church. A further breakdown of the population shows an almost even number of men and women. Due to the fact that
Graceland College had been a junior college, no more than a decade ago, lower division students numbered twice as many as the junior-senior group.

Beginning with the assumption that higher education would greatly influence an individual's conceptualization of religious and utopian values, the sample was designed to focus on those beginning the socialization process in higher education, the freshman class, and those who have been exposed to higher education for a considerable length of time, the senior class. In December, 1968, 228 men and 293 women made up the freshman class. During the same period 87 men and 69 women constituted the senior class. Of the 521 members of the freshman class, 56 were non-members of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church and were eliminated from the sample. The senior class held 16 non-members, and they were subtracted from the sample group also.

The senior class, then, with the exception of the non-members, was used in its entirety. With the aid of instructors in the sociology, religion, natural science, business, and education departments, seniors were contacted in the classroom during upper division classes within a three day period. Three seniors were out of town or off campus due to sickness and were, therefore, unable to complete the questionnaire. Thus, 137 usable questionnaires were collected from the upper division students.
Since freshmen make up a larger proportion of the college population, a somewhat larger freshman sample was selected to provide a base of comparison for the senior group. To avoid "contamination" of the data due to interchange of ideas by the students, the investigator chose to administer the freshman sample in the classroom also, rather than by mail. The quota of freshmen students was selected by administering the questionnaire to all the freshmen in attendance at the required courses meeting from 9:30 to 11:30 on the morning of December 2, 1968. With the cooperation of the instructors of those classes, 190 freshmen were contacted. Of this number, seventeen were not members of the Reorganized Church, and seven students incompletely or incorrectly answered the questionnaire, leaving a total of 166 freshmen in the sample.

A total of 303 questionnaires were completed by the Graceland College students and utilized by this quota sample technique. This represents slightly less than one third of all the Reorganized Church members at the college.
FINDINGS, ANALYSIS

General Characteristics of Student Sample

Graceland students represent in many ways the characteristics of the general population of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church. For example, Table I shows that a majority of the Graceland population cite their hometown as located in the Midwest. The states of Iowa, Missouri, Michigan, Illinois, and Ohio are most frequently represented. The western part of the United States, especially California and Washington, account for about one fourth (20.8 per cent) of the students, the Northeast, 9.6 per cent, and the Southeast only 5.6 per cent. Only fifteen students (5.0 per cent) stated that their place of residence was outside the United States. A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place of Residence</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>58.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>20.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out of U.S.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE I
PLACE OF HOME RESIDENCE OF STUDENT SAMPLE

168
majority of the foreign students were from Canada or Australia. This distribution mirrors fairly well the dispersion of the 200,000 members of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church extant in the world in the late 1960's.

Moreover, the students in the sample reflect the fact that the Saints have moved from an almost entirely rural group to an urban environment. Only one-fourth of the students stated that they had lived most of their life on a farm or in a small town (Table II). Almost half (47.9 per cent) stated that their home was in a medium or large city.

**TABLE II**

RESPONSES OF STUDENT SAMPLE TO THE QUESTION "WHERE HAVE YOU LIVED MOST OF YOUR LIFE?"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On a Farm</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Small Town</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Small City</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Medium City</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Large City</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>20.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III shows the liberal arts orientation of students at Graceland College. Many plan to teach (25.7 per cent major
in education). Majors in sociology, history, economics and psychology account for almost one fourth (24.7 per cent) of the students. The remainder are distributed between the humanities (English and languages), business, the physical and biological sciences, fine arts, and mathematics.

**TABLE III**

**ACADEMIC MAJORS OF STUDENT SAMPLE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Humanities</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science (Physical, Natural)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>25.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social and Behavioral Sciences</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fine Arts</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering, Mathematics</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undecided</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Students' Definitions of the Concept of Zion**

Graceland students as a group varied vastly in their commitment to utopian beliefs and definitions of Zion. Table IV
places the students' open-ended definitions of Zion into a series of non-exclusive descriptive categories. Notable here is the fact that a fairly small minority of students (14.5 per cent) perceived the concept of Zion in clearly eschatological

**TABLE IV**

**ANALYSIS OF RESPONSES TO THE STATEMENT:**
"DEFINE THE CONCEPT OF ZION AS YOU UNDERSTAND IT", BY ACADEMIC STANDING*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Number and Percent Answering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freshmen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion is &quot;social good&quot; or societal reorganization</td>
<td>50(39.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion is a state of mind or spiritual condition</td>
<td>56(33.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as peace, harmony or unity</td>
<td>58(34.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as refuge from the world, return of Christ end of the world (mil-</td>
<td>25(15.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lenearian content)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Don't have a concept, rejection of idea</td>
<td>10(6.0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*More than one answer possible
or millenarian terms. The minority held firmly to its convictions, however. One student wrote, "Zion is a place where all good people will live after the destruction of the earth. Christ will be there to teach them and everyone will be happy." Another wrote, "Zion will be a city established around Independence. It will be made up of righteous people. It will be necessary to flee to Zion to be saved from the world which will be very wicked."

For most of the students Zion epitomized either an ethical restructuring of modern society or a kind of spiritual good. One senior expressed his ideas in this fashion,

Zion, to my way of thinking will put an end to all this senseless strife going on in the world today. People will learn to live together as equal brothers, there will be love among all peoples, and there will be an end to war, starvation, strife and all of the other present day problems.

Another student stressed the desire for unity and harmony which has come to characterize American utopian thought from the Shakers to the present. "Zion is a state in which all peoples can be equal and will think and act as one with one purpose in mind - to serve God and to do his will..."

A freshman student pointed to several ideas in his concept of Zion.

Zion is first of all a state of mind. After many people are living this way, they might be able to come together and live righteously but not before.
... It is a form of pure communism or maybe socialism which is not so bad as many feel it is. We cannot shut the rest of the world off from ourselves... Zion must be full of pacifists...

The students' concepts ranged from the most esoteric ("Zion is 'OM,' a realization within ourselves of oneness with God") to extremely mundane ideas ("Zion will be the best political and economic system. It will have the best educational facilities.").

About one student in eleven (8.9 per cent) admitted to having no clear idea of Zion or rejected the concept summarily. Seniors were more than twice as likely to reject the concept (with 12.4 per cent) than were freshmen (with 6.0 per cent rejecting the concept).

Academic Status and Utopian Beliefs

It is a commonplace assumption that students exposed to higher education of a liberal arts nature are likely to turn to the "left" in political, social, and religious issues. Theodore Newcomb's classic study at Bennington College¹ in the late 1930's was only one demonstration of the move toward liberalism permeating the student population of American higher education.

### TABLE V

**POLITICAL ORIENTATION OF STUDENT SAMPLE**

*BY ACADEMIC STANDING*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Liberal Democrats and Republicans</th>
<th>Conservative Democrats and Republicans</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freshmen</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>133</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniors</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>156</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>6.70*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* $P < .01$

Table V supports General Hypothesis I Corollary Three; that is, that senior students would demonstrate a significantly less conservative political and social belief system than would freshmen students. Slightly over one half of the freshmen sample (54.1 per cent) reported "liberal" political views. Seven out of ten (70.0 per cent) of the senior class claimed a "liberal" political persuasion.

Interestingly enough, the students reported that almost two thirds (65.3 per cent) of their fathers were conservative Democrats or conservative Republicans. One can see a decided shift in the political attitudes of the younger generation here.
Of particular importance to this study are the shifts in religious attitudes manifest by Graceland students. Table VI shows a significant difference in reported church participation between freshmen and seniors. Over one third (35.8 per cent) of the senior sample reported that they participated occasionally or were inactive. In contrast, less than one out of five (17.5 per cent) freshmen reported this comparative inactivity. This lends support to General Hypothesis I, Corollary Two, which is that senior students would express significantly less "religious orthodoxy" than freshmen students.

**TABLE VI**

**EXTENT OF RELIGIOUS ACTIVITY IN STUDENT SAMPLE BY ACADEMIC STANDING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How active would you say you are in the R.L.D.S. Church?</th>
<th>Very Active</th>
<th>Active</th>
<th>Participate Occasionally and Inactive</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>(x^2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freshmen</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>11.47*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*\(P < .01\)*
It would not be difficult to surmise that this differential activity between the two sample groups is symptomatic of ideological differences. Table VII supports this view. Both a majority of freshmen and seniors take a rather pessimistic point of view concerning the progress their church is making toward the accomplishment of Zion. For the seniors, however, the majority is significantly larger (69.3 per cent to 56.6 per cent for freshmen). Moreover, members of the senior class held the concept of Zion to be less important to their religious faith than did underclassmen. Thus, General Hypothesis I, Corollary One which stated that senior students in the sample would express significantly less commitment to the sectarian utopian ideal than would freshmen, is accepted.

While only slightly more than one in ten (10.9 per cent) perceived of the concept of Zion as completely unimportant to their religious beliefs, seniors as a group moved toward a lesser degree of utopian commitment. Clearly, the changes in the attitudinal involvement of the senior class were not drastic for the most part. Nonetheless, over one third (36.5 per cent) of the senior sample remarked that their ideas toward the concept of Zion had "changed a great deal."
TABLE VII
STUDENT SAMPLE'S CONCEPT OF ZION
BY ACADEMIC STATUS

In your opinion is significant progress being made by the R.L.D.S. Church to accomplish the creation of Zion?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Don't Know</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freshmen</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniors</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>7.54*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How important to your religious faith is the ideal of Zion?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Absolutely Important</th>
<th>Indispensable</th>
<th>Not Crucial</th>
<th>Important</th>
<th>Not Important</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freshmen</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniors</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>303</td>
<td>10.02**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Have your ideas about Zion changed in the past few years?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Changed a Great Deal</th>
<th>Changed But Not Drastically</th>
<th>Remained Same</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freshmen</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniors</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>9.04**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Further evidence of the ideological shifts occurring in the student population is given in Table VIII. Here it can plainly be seen that several attitudinal systems are undergoing significant shifts for members of the two sample groups. First, and expectedly, the senior sample scores significantly higher (and thus, less conservative) on the Conservatism Scale. Another difference between the groups is shown in the fact that seniors, perhaps due to the critical and relativistic aspects of their education, score on the average significantly less "dogmatic" than their freshmen counterparts. This finding is of some interest due to the fact that Rokeach\(^2\) suggests that dogmatism is a personality variable. If this is the case, one would not expect to find statistically significant variation between the two sample groups. It is possible that verbal sophistication may play some role in the differential mean dogmatism scores between seniors and freshmen.

Two highly significant differences between the sample groups manifest themselves in the mean religious orthodoxy and utopian commitment scales. The decided shift of attitude away from orthodoxy and commitment to utopian ideals for the

# Table VIII

**Students Academic Status: Its Relationship to Conservatism, Dogmatism, Religious Orthodoxy, Commitment to Utopianism, and Number of Cognitive Elements in Utopian Belief System**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Freshmen (N=166)</th>
<th>Seniors (N=137)</th>
<th>Value of T</th>
<th>Significance Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservatism Scale Score*</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 48.40$</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 50.22$</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td>$P &lt; .02$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D. = 9.04</td>
<td>S.D. = 7.34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dogmatism Scale Score*</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 39.77$</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 41.61$</td>
<td>2.04</td>
<td>$P &lt; .05$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D. = 6.43</td>
<td>S.D. = 7.13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Orthodoxy Scale Score*</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 9.23$</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 12.61$</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>$P &lt; .001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D. = 3.76</td>
<td>S.D. = 6.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment to Utopianism Score*</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 33.78$</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 40.59$</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>$P &lt; .001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D. = 10.34</td>
<td>S.D. = 13.68</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Cognitive Elements Judged Essential to Utopian Belief System**</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 4.24$</td>
<td>$\bar{X} = 3.85$</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>$P &gt; .05$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D. = 1.95</td>
<td>S.D. = 2.39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The higher mean score represents a lower degree of the variable (i.e., the higher the mean score on the conservatism scale, the lower the degree of conservatism).  

**This mean score is based on a ten item check list which asked the students to check those items he regarded essential to his concept of Zion.*
seniors is congruent with the fact that as a group they see themselves as participating somewhat less in church activities. One area of at least superficial similarity between the two groups lies in the fact that their mean scores for the number of cognitive elements essential to their utopian belief system was not significantly different. That is to say that while the senior group as a whole showed less commitment to utopian ideals, the structuring of those ideals was relatively similar.

In summation, this study finds consistent and significant differences between the two sample groups. The freshman class sample reports a higher degree of (1) conservatism, (2) religious orthodoxy, (3) church activity, and (4) commitment to utopian religious ideals than the senior group. It would be difficult to attribute these behavioral and attitudinal differences solely to the students' experience of higher education at Graceland. It does follow logically, however, that any liberal arts education may challenge the idea of the "uniqueness" of a given set of sectarian or utopian ideals. The clash of ideas, a valued norm in the liberal arts setting, is likely to confront the dearly held world cosmology of the sectarian believer. If for some, old rationales are destroyed or modified, new ones must supplant or complete them. For a minority, this cognitive reorganization is not undertaken, and the sectarian-utopian dreams of the larger group fade into irrelevance.
Parental Church Activities and Student's Utopian Commitment

Contrary to expectations, Table IX shows no statistically significant relationship between parental church activities and the degree of commitment to the concept of Zion by the Graceland student sample. It is true that the direction of the prediction was, in essence, correct; nonetheless, the null hypothesis is supported here. This may indicate that parental influence is, so far as religious and utopian beliefs are concerned, mediated by situational, personality, or other variables. Many social analysts, such as David Reisman, see a diminuation of parental influence on the mores of the contemporary adolescent. While this statement would be difficult to validate, one could surmise that for some students parents become an almost "negative" point of reference as the young attempt to demonstrate their independence.

Moreover, the tendencies toward attitudinal differences between parents and children were also apparent in Table V as the Graceland College sample showed a clearly more liberal approach to politics than their parents. It would follow, then, that this trend away from parental belief systems could occur in other areas (e.g., religious or utopian) as well.
## TABLE IX

**MOTHER AND FATHER'S CHURCH ACTIVITY AND IMPORTANCE OF UTOPIAN CONCEPT TO STUDENT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mother's Activity in R.L.D.S. Church</th>
<th>Degree of Importance of Zion to Student</th>
<th>Indispensable</th>
<th>Important But Not Crucial</th>
<th>Not Important</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Active</td>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participates Occasionally or Inactive</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>61</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total*</td>
<td></td>
<td>140</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>2.88**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Father's Church Activity in R.L.D.S. Church</th>
<th>Degree of Importance of Zion to Student</th>
<th>Indispensable</th>
<th>Important But Not Crucial</th>
<th>Not Important</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>$x^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Active</td>
<td></td>
<td>71</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>136</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active</td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participates Occasionally or Inactive</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total*</td>
<td></td>
<td>131</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>2.49**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Parents who were members of another denomination are not included here, nor were deceased parents.

**$p > .05$.**
Conservatism and Sectarian Utopian Commitment

At first glance, it would appear obvious that the conservative attitude is the antithesis of utopian thought. For the most part, this is sound reasoning. Yet as predicted in General Hypothesis II, Corollary Two, Graceland students did show a moderate but statistically significant correlation between their conservatism scale scores and their scores on the utopian commitment scale. (See Table X) This apparent contradiction is not as paradoxical as it may first seem. First, many of the students picture their utopianism in such a way that "stasis" is the end and ideal goal for society. One student wrote, "I see Zion as a place where perfect harmony both internal and external will exist." Another student implicitly rejects the liberal-pluralistic concept of society in his definition of Zion.

The concept of Zion to me is the establishment of God's kingdom here on earth in which there will be no worry of war, demonstrations, poverty, etc. known in the world today... (TE) will spread over the entire earth uniting everyone as brothers...

Here one can see the desire for organic unity which characterizes both the religious utopian and the conservative. The idea that "divine intent" rules the destiny of man is also common to both ideologies. It is likely that some
TABLE X

ZERO ORDER SCALE SCORE CORRELATIONS FOR CONSERVATISM, RELIGIOUS ORTHODOXY, UTOPIAN COMMITMENT AND NUMBER OF CONCEPTS SEEN "ESSENTIAL" TO BELIEF IN ZION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conservatism Scale</th>
<th>Dogmatism Scale</th>
<th>Religious Orthodoxy Scale</th>
<th>Number of Concepts Seen as &quot;Essential&quot; to Belief in Zion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utopian Commitment Scale</td>
<td>+ .133*</td>
<td>+ .295**</td>
<td>+ .680**</td>
<td>+ .605**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservatism Scale</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dogmatism Scale</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Orthodoxy Scale</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N = 303</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significant at the .05 level.
**Significant at the .001 level.

students "inherit" both a conservative, religiously orthodox belief system coupled with the desire for utopian change.

The relationship between the student's conservatism and utopian beliefs should not be overstated, however. For some the ideal of "equality" (which is the nemesis of conservatism) was dominant. As one student remarked, "Zion is a group of people who live together without jealousy
toward one another and without pride. There is no class structure which allows one person to be richer than another or superior to another."

Interestingly enough, a moderate and statistically significant correlation (+ .325) was found between the students' dogmatism scale scores and their conservatism scores. This, perhaps indicates that the desire for stasis is strongly related to cognitive rigidity.

A positive but statistically insignificant relationship between religious orthodoxy and conservatism is also shown in Table X.

Dogmatism and Sectarian Utopian Commitment

Milton Rokeach's concept of "dogmatism" was formalized in 1954. It had begun conceptually in the same genre as "authoritarianism" which had been explicated by Maslow, Fromm, Adorno, Frenkel-Brunswik and others. Dogmatism was initially conceived as a kind of generalized authoritarianism, or as Rokeach phrases it, "A closed cognitive organization of beliefs and disbeliefs about reality organized around an absolute authority which provides a framework for a pattern of intolerance or qualified tolerance toward others."3 If the

sectsarian utopian social structure were defined as "a closed social organization, organized around an absolute authority," no one could fail to see the parallel between "dogmatism" and "sectsarian utopianism." Moreover, Rokeach sees dogmatism as a defensive measure against threat. "Indeed," he says, "we may suggest that in the extreme the closed belief system is nothing more than the total network of psychoanalytic defense mechanisms organized together to form a cognitive system and designed to shield a vulnerable mind." The relationship between the individual personality and the institution is outlined by Rokeach in the following manner.

If threat leads to dogmatism in individuals, by the same token it should also lead to dogma in institutions. Dogma serves the purpose of insuring the continued existence of the institution and the belief-disbelief system for which it stands.¹

Table X shows a positive correlation of .295 between the Graceland students' dogmatism and utopian commitment scores. This is significant at the .001 level of significance (due to the sample size) and lends evidence to the hypothesis that individuals with a dogmatic cognitive organization are


²Ibid., p. 68.
better able to preserve "in tact" the sectarian utopist belief system (General Hypothesis II, Corrolary Three).

One student who scored in the highest quartile on the dogmatism scale underlines his sectarian religious position in this way.

If the existing churches were fulfilling Christ's purposes our church wouldn't be in existence today. Joining ecumenical groups is of no real value. We should be able to help society most by following the plan Christ laid down for us.

Table XI shows a checklist of those utopian beliefs considered "essential" to the student's concept of Zion. It is obvious that certain of the items connote more dogmatism than others. For example, to conceive of Zion as a place of refuge (number 4) or to see the necessity of building a "temple" in the center place, Independence, Missouri (number 5) is to assume a clearly sectarian-millenarianist attitude. This would logically be held by the "defensive dogmatist."

Another cognitive element extremely congruent with dogmatism is number 6, "Complete unity of thought and belief."

One cognitive element of a rather diffuse nature is the conception of Zion "as a mode of Christian living." One would suppose that this idea has no greater appeal to the dogmatic than to the nondogmatic individual. A large
### TABLE XI

RESPONSES TO THE QUESTION: "WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING IDEAS DO YOU CONSIDER ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL TO YOUR CONCEPTION OF ZION?", BY ACADEMIC STATUS*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Freshmen</th>
<th></th>
<th>Seniors</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The &quot;gathering&quot;</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>38.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as Jackson County, Missouri</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as America</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as a place of refuge</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The building of a temple in Center place</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>27.7</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>21.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete unity of thought and belief</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing revelation</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>66.9</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>65.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as a physical city</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as a mode of Christian living</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>83.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zion as a place of preparation for return of Christ</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>53.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Students checked ideas considered essential.
portion of both freshmen and seniors checked this item as "essential." It is interesting that two of the three items judged as having a great deal of dogmatic content were chosen more frequently by freshmen than by seniors, once again pointing to the fact that the senior sample as a whole tends toward less dogmatism.

Table XII shows an interesting and statistically significant difference between those students scoring high and low on the dogmatism scale. Those students classified as

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE XII</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

DIFFERENCE IN MEAN NUMBER OF ELEMENTS HELD "ESSENTIAL" TO BELIEF IN ZION AND DEGREE OF DOGMATISM OF STUDENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean Number of Elements</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Value of T</th>
<th>Significance Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low Dogmatics</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Dogmatics</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"low dogmatics" chose on the average about three (2.99) elements as "essential" to their concept of Zion while the mean score for the "high dogmatics" was close to five (4.69). Corollary Six of General Hypothesis II which proposed that, those students exhibiting a highly dogmatic cognitive style would see a
greater number of beliefs as "essential" to their concept of utopia than would less dogmatic students, is accepted.

**Religious Orthodoxy and Sectarian Utopian Commitment**

The short review of utopian communities undertaken in this study has shown the relationship between religious ideologies and utopian ventures. With only a few exceptions, the most successful or durable of the utopist groups were those held together by a common religious world view. The desire for universal unity and harmony manifest by utopian thinkers is quite compatible with many religious creeds. As Georg Simmel comments in his *Sociology of Religion*:

> Only if religion is accepted as the totality of the world picture, co-ordinated with other theoretical and practical totalities, will it and the other systems of life achieve a harmonious state of inner interdependence.⁶

Not surprisingly, then, the Graceland students who scored highest on religious orthodoxy scale were typically high scorers on the scale measuring commitment to sectarian utopianism. This confirms the contention of General Hypothesis II, Corollary Six.

---

In fact, Table X shows an extremely high (.680) positive correlation between the two scales. This lends support to the idea that many Graceland College students enter the institution with a package or "gestalt" of attitudes which give mutual reinforcement to each other. Once a change is effected in one of the attitudinal sets (i.e., the loss of religiously orthodox beliefs), it is difficult to maintain in tact the other cluster of attitudes (i.e., sectarian utopian concepts).

Moreover, religious orthodoxy and sectarian utopianism have a common enemy - rationalism and secularization. Max Weber suggested this increasing rationalization of our society in his Sociology of Religion. "As intellectualism suppresses belief in magic, the world's processes become disenchanted, lose their magical significance, and henceforth simply 'are' and 'happen' but no longer signify anything."7

One student who scored highly on both utopian commitment scale and religious orthodoxy scale expressed his resentment at the fact that at Graceland "Intellect is held above religious experiences...(this includes disproving the Book of Mormon, an extensive humanization of Christ, etc.)."

For those who have left the orthodox position behind, new modes of utopian thought are possible. Most likely is a

secular model of utopian thought. In this case, sectarian values are likely to turn to political concerns.

This points to the idea that the utopian ideals of the students with low dogmatism scores are not as rigidly structured as the higher dogmatics. In other words, the dogmatic attitude requires that one accept a greater number of cognitive elements as central, or "non-negotiable" in a psychological sense. A review of the history of utopian thought shows rather graphically the differences between non-dogmatic utopias, such as those propounded by Saint-Simon or Marx, and those highly structured (hence dogmatic) utopias designed by Fourier, Cabet, and the Shakers.
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

It is important to remember that a large majority of students at Graceland College are at least second generation members of the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church. They did not, as it were, "discover" the utopian system for themselves as did many of their forefathers. It is the contention of this study that a generation which is "born into" a utopist belief system is likely to react differently to that system than the generation which "discovers" it. Individuals are possibly "free" to give several forms of meaning to a system of ideas such as utopianism. It is true, however, that a generation can seldom transfer in entirety its enthusiasm to the one to follow.

Rather than aggressively pursuing the dictates of the utopian dream, many Graceland students may be defensive about their concept of Zion. Those students with some degree of sophistication in church history may well be aware of the frustrations and failures of past utopian ventures. In contrast to the true utopian in Mannheim's terms, the student may accommodate his beliefs to those acceptable to the larger society. Moreover, the move of the R.L.D.S. Church toward denominational status may signify an "accommodation" with the world. This is undoubtedly a frustrating experience for individuals holding to the ideals of the church's charismatic
past. Increasing bureaucratization, a social trend in almost all large scale organizations, has left its mark on the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church. This is frustrating to the activist and the sectarian as well. One student expressed his feelings toward this trend in this way, "The last World Conference of the Reorganized Church left me disgusted - the church finally had a chance to do some things - but laid it on the table. Perhaps the second coming of Christ will be laid upon the table until the next world conference in 1970."

The frustration manifest by this student is underlined by the fact that only about one fourth (25.5 per cent) of the senior sample and slightly over one third (37.3 per cent) of the freshman sample indicated they felt the church was making progress toward its utopian goals. When one places this in juxtaposition with the fact that only one freshman out of fifteen (6.6 per cent) and slightly more than one senior in ten (10.9 per cent) reject the concept of Zion, one can see the genesis of frustration. Leon Festinger, in his seminal book, *A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance*, takes the position that "cognitive dissonance" exists when an individual accepts two cognitive elements which are contradictory (i.e., if the obverse of one element follows from the other).¹ Festinger

goes on to show that the existence of dissonance gives rise to pressures to reduce it. Processes of dissonance reduction may be related to cognitive or behavioral changes.

It is obvious that for the student who believes strongly in the Church and who also believes it is making progress toward its utopian goal no conflict exists and, hence, no dissonance. A freshman student expressed his satisfaction with the Church's achievement in this way, "People are realizing more and more that God intends to bring Zion to earth and that we'd better get busy if we want to be a part of it."

Another student takes a less sectarian but still optimistic outlook. "It, The Reorganized Church/ is making progress since it has liberalized its former 19th century literal concepts. It has come to realize the necessity of a more universal and less exclusive concept."

Although a minority of students such as those cited were content with the utopian progress of their organization, a decided majority could find little comfort in the situation. This is the structural situation, then, most productive of dissonance - commitment to an organization and concurrently the view that it is not fulfilling its basic function. One student articulated this dilemma in the following manner, "Zion will come during my lifetime. Sometimes I wonder if that is possible when the Church is doing nothing. The gathering
Reactions to this inconsistent cognitive system vary greatly from individual to individual. Choices open to the individual are, nonetheless, delimited and structured by his personality system and his position in the social milieu. The following are logical possibilities open to the individual student at Graceland College with regard to the lessening of his "dissonant" situation:

Resectarianism. The central reality of a religious sect is its "closure" or "boundary maintenance." This is readily seen in the sectarian attempts at utopia building. For some students at Graceland College, who hold to "orthodox" or "fundamental" religious view, the truth of the original concept of Zion is evident. In their mind the failure to establish the utopian society is directly related to the "rationalism," "intellectualism," and lack of unity within the church body. Their solution to the problem is to fulfill the specifics of church law to a much greater extent. Generally, the sectarian advocates would be expected to fight to maintain

---

No attempt has been made to quantify the proportions of students solving the problem in a given way, since the choices open to them are separable only in a logical and analytical sense. For example, a student may choose both a "reformist" path and a path of withdrawal or disaffection to a degree at the same time.
the charismatic and dynamic attitude of the Reorganized Church's past. A student who scored in the "high" range on the dogmatism scale expressed his sectarian utopian concepts in this way:

Zion is still in an abstract state to us, but it will take place on earth. Zion is the kingdom of God established on earth. It will be established in the centerplace where the temple is. There will still be people outside of Zion who are evil and unbelieving. With the building of the temple, Christ will present himself (in the Temple) to those who are righteous enough to stand in His presence. He will give them the greatest endowment of the Holy Spirit. With this strength, the Saints can go out among the "outsiders" and preach to them. Because of this great endowment, these Saints will go forward with more power than any foe against them.

The rejection of the world and the eschatological vision are prominent in this student's distinctly sectarian view of Zion.

After the end of the world comes, Christ will come to reign for a thousand years on earth. All men of righteousness will be invited to flee to Zion, as the end comes. All the wicked will be destroyed and men with good works will be living in a highly structured form of communal living. Man is saved (to Zion) through his good works.

A senior expresses his idea of Zion as a place of refuge, as well. "It is a place to be established by Christ; its purpose - the protection of the righteous. All things
outside of Zion will be evil and unholy in the sight of God and will be destroyed. When Zion is established, Christ will come live in Zion with his people."

Like the Anabaptists, Shakers, or Rappites, the sectarian Latter Day Saint student awaits the imminent return of Christ and the establishment of swift and final justice on earth. Like the earlier millenarianists, the Latter Day Saint sectarians take a rather hostile point of view toward the world (i.e., the wicked will be destroyed). Max Weber discussed this feeling as he described what he termed "resentment" (ressentiment) in earlier sects:

Resentment is a concomitant of that particular religious ethic of the disprivileged which...teaches that the unequal distribution of mundane goods is caused by the sinfulness and the illegality of the privileged, and that sooner or later God's wrath will overtake them. In this theodicy of the disprivileged, the moralistic quest serves as a device for compensating a conscious or unconscious desire for vengence.  

The Graceland students mentioned in this paper are hardly an oppressed class, yet some maintain an apocalyptic vision of the future.

For those who see the problem of the Church's lack of progress in the creation of Zion as due to individualism and

---

rationality (i.e., liberalism), the problem is evident and the solution is obvious; a return to the past commitment and unity of the Church is needed. A freshman girl sums up her reasons for the Church's lack of utopian accomplishment. It is a straying away from eternal verities.

The Bible is being questioned.
The Kirtland Temple is not being used. The Principle of Tithing is not being effectively taught to the youth. Some leaders have their own ideas rather than support the Scriptures. Academics has become more important than the word of God. Many ordained leaders do not have faith beyond their own education.
The prophet is not considered a Holy Man. Revelation is rationalized.
The Book of Mormon is not used with the Bible for the full Gospel.

From the point of view of the sectarian, intellectualism and individualism produce a kind of institutional decadence which stultifies the dynamics of utopian achievement. Unity, above all else, is seen as important to effecting "Zionic" achievement. One student deplores the fact that "there seems to be much confusion and a diversity of ideas [in the Church]. Only when the people are of one heart and one mind will Zion be close."

A freshman girl with a sectarian perspective on the problem sees the solution in a coming "crisis" which she feels will soon overtake the Reorganized Latter Day Saint Church:
The dedicated ones are Souls who will strengthen the nucleus of the RLDS Church after the 'chaff' or hanger-ons have become separated during the major crisis of the church... My faith is supported by my testimony of the Book of Mormon. Nephi states that God speaks in plain truths and that men seek to confuse themselves. I believe that many will deny the prophet and that perhaps the crisis which will split the church is the teachings of the 'intellectual' priesthood.

Several aspects of the theory of dogmatism lead one to believe that it has a great deal to do with whether an individual will opt for the sectarian utopian approach. First, it was shown in Table X that a statistically significant correlation exists between dogmatism scores and sectarian utopian commitment scores. Second, the millenarian emphasis of the sectarian is quite compatible with the "future oriented" dogmatist. For the dogmatist, according to Rokeach,

it is primarily the future that counts. Throughout history, there have arisen many religious and political movements that have kept their eye on some future utopia or heaven. The present is but a vestibule to the future, unimportant in its own right, full of injustice and human suffering... Another clue to a future oriented time perspective is the belief that one knows or understands the future. Such a person, guided by his belief-disbelief system, typically expresses overtly a greater confidence of what the future holds in store, and a greater readiness to make predictions about the future.4

4 Rokeach, op. cit., pp. 52-3.
As if to demonstrate Rokeach's point, one student who scored in the "high" range of both the dogmatism and sectarian utopian commitment scales states with a great deal of assurity that Zion "will be the dwelling place of the Holy Ghost, a place of safety. It will be a place for those who are dedicated enough to even try the early economic plans. Zion will be in my lifetime."

A great many of the students who saw resectarianism as a correct mode for the Church to follow were greatly gratified that in the world conference of the Reorganized Church in 1968 a revelation was given by W. Wallace Smith to the effect that a temple would be built in Independence, Missouri. The nature and function of the temple was not spelled out explicitly to the Church, yet for those with sectarian propensities, this act signaled a possible resurgence of the charismatic spirit of former days. A male freshman student sees a hopeful sign in this. "The temple has stirred the people to thoughts of Zion." Here again, Table XI shows that only 27.7 per cent of the freshman group and 21.9 per cent of the seniors saw the building of the temple as an "essential" component of Zion.

In the main, then, those students moving toward "resectarianism" wish to revive the spirit and unity of the

---

early Latter Day Saint Movement. They are able to withstand or ignore the intellectual and organizational changes which threaten their concepts.

**Liberal Reform as an Option.** Ernst Troeltsch stated the classic dilemma of institutionalized Christianity when he commented that the Christian ideal is one "which cannot be realized within this world without compromise. Therefore, the history of the Christian Ethos becomes the story of a constantly renewed search for this compromise, and of fresh opposition to this spirit of compromise."  

The spirit of compromise to which Troeltsch referred is in some ways the requisite to the spirit of liberality. Reformist liberalism in religion or politics is not likely to be concerned by absolute (or Messianic) goals. One student describes his liberal concept of Zion in this way:

> It is no longer the mystic city of God-love-but more or less-a slum being rebuilt-and not necessarily in Independence.

The particularistic concept of Zion as a concrete reality in a delimited geographical area has lost validity to some students of liberal persuasion. One senior relates that "I have moved away from the idea of Zion as a cloistered style

---

of life where the Saints will go to escape persecution and problems of 'the world.'" Another analyzes her widening concept of Zion in this way,

I used to believe that only 'God's people' - the RLDS - would participate. Also I have learned that not all RLDS are God's people and a lot of non-RLDS are. I used to think that Independence was going to be Zion's boundary line...

The frustration of the liberal reformist is aptly articulated in the words of this student:

1. The Church has senile leadership.
2. The Church does not encourage education for its members.
3. Individual branches of the Church are being sacrificed to the bureaucracy of the districts, etc.
4. The Church has lost many youth, intellectuals and energetic people because of outmoded beliefs.
5. The Church is too hung up in doctrine and beliefs and has alienated itself from the needs of people.
6. The Church walks around with its head in celestial glory and doesn't concern itself with the 'now.'

John H. Schaar, in his Escape from Authority, demonstrates the lines between the "moderate" and the radical (i.e., sectarian) utopist. The reformist or moderate mode of operation "consists in looking at recent history and using the knowledge thus gained to exercise more or less control over short range future developments. The moderate utopian is not out of step with the present time nor in revolt against it."7 Pragmatism,

---

then, and a "partializing" of goals is characteristic of liberal reformists. Very much concerned with the present and its dilemmas, he is likely to protest against the otherworldly orientation of his denomination. A freshman student opines that:

Our church sits on its 'rear' and will not get involved with anything except their view points on dancing, smoking, drinking, and swearing. I think it's wrong to sit on a pedestal and say 'we're saved' when so many of the other churches are out doing us in so many ways. I was brought into the Church by birth, and I have many doubts about the Church.

The lack of absolutism implicit in the liberal position makes compromise and, hence, cooperation with other religious and secular bodies possible. This cooperation does, in effect, break down the "garrison mentality" of sectarian thought. A female student muses on this possibility in this manner.

200,000 Latter Day Saints are not going to overcome the world. Fact-This is why we need to get our little claws into the world Bodies of Churches. We need them and they need us. We still don't have all the revelations; neither do they... Maybe working together, helping each other help themselves for a physical reality like world peace and plenty and we'll awaken to the fact that the spiritual unity we have cried after for so long has been attained. Do I sound bitter? I am.
To the liberal reformist, the base cause of the Church's "irrelevance" in the modern urban setting is its "inactivity" concerning social issues of the day. A liberal student here rejects the idea that the Church is making significant progress in terms of its social idealism.

The Church does not take stands on world problems, and it hasn't been doing that much for others (poor, Negroes, etc.)

Another student concurs that the Church is making no progress, "Because I feel the Church is falling apart. Maybe it's just my age and mixed up feelings I've had about religion as well as other material things, but I see so many RLDS just sitting!"

It is interesting to note here that a large majority of both freshmen (74.7 per cent) and seniors (73.0 per cent) agreed that the Reorganized Church should participate in ecumenical groups such as the National Council of Churches. However, many sectarian students saw this as a chance to convert others rather than a way of effecting cooperation with other church bodies.

Sublimation. The two modes of solution to the problem of utopian accomplishment thus far discussed have involved, in one case, a reversion to the norms of former years, and in another, proposed modernization and "politicalization." Another means to solve an ideological problem exists as well, however. Don Martindale, in his Social and Cultural Change, makes a perceptive point to this effect:
All problems arising in the sphere of man's social life which are not solved in the course of his social behavior, tend to be transferred to the ideal sphere. The constructive forces of the individual's nature then supply ideal solutions to them.8

Martindale goes on to point out that this mode of problem solving can be called "sublimation" in a generic sense of the word.

That process of sublimation which Nietzsche discerned in the transmutation of socially unacceptable forms of cruelty into forms of high culture, and which Freud discerned in the transmutation of socially unacceptable sexual inclination into artistic creations are only special manifestations of a general process operating throughout man's social life.9

This concept of "sublimation," then, divested of its narrow psychoanalytical connotations, denotes the attempt of individuals to "transcend" the mundane problems of the practical day-to-day existence. Since, for many individuals, "Zion as a physical city" must seem less than possible and "Zion as social reform" may lack appeal as a religious concept, it would be logical to conceptualize Zion as a "transcendent category." This would not only give it a "spiritual" reality,

---


9 Ibid.
but would take it from the material world so that "failure"
in the material world would be an impossibility.

One student writes in an almost stream of consciousness
style:

Zion—a condition of spiritual awareness -
condition of attempting and achieving - of
depth perception - of sensation - of
striving, of assurity. Perhaps a place
but more a way of life and living -
understanding of Self and through this
perhaps understanding of others -
perhaps even God - not too clear on God
right now...

Another student concurs to a degree:

Zion as far as I'm concerned is more a
condition of the heart and mind than the
physical aspect. I'm not really looking
forward to 'the gathering,' etc., ad
infinitum... The prospect of a communal
Zion or the world coming to an end, etc.
doesn't inspire me. Sorry.

To place Zion "in the heart and mind" is to take it
from the realm of the physical where the buffeting of the
material world make compromises and imperfections necessary.

A woman student says,

The concept of Zion as I understand it
deals mainly with attitudes rather than
physical means to the ends. I believe that
Zion is the embodiment or essence of the
best that the Church membership has to offer
with its beliefs and standards.

Similarly, another relates, "I believe Zion will be the
ultimate in spiritual experience - it is in the hearts and minds
of the people."
Finally, a senior woman rejects the physical utopia as she opts for an ethical imperative.

Frankly, I am sick of hearing about Zion as Independence, Missouri, and the idea of gather together... I believe Zion will never come if everyone comes to Independence to hide and seek shelter. I see Zion as the whole purpose of the Church. Zion will come when people have taken their talents and developed them as best as possible, when people realize their duty of live to all mankind.

Disaffection - Rejection. A number of theoretical positions have been put forth as to the nature and causality of disaffection from a religious or political movement. Hans Toch sees disaffection as typically following this pattern. First, "qualified joining" may occur in which an individual may "perceive his social movement in a very personal way, may make special demands in return for loyalty, hold unrealistic expectations." Second, a period may follow in which the member develops "latent manifestations." If he remains in this susceptible state, the stage may be set for a crisis situation which produces for many psychological or actual separation from the group. Finally, "the disaffected member undergoes a period of cognitive reorganization. He

---

must establish his future identity, incorporating somehow his past identity as a member."

More particularly, Herve' Carrier, in his Sociology of Religious Belonging, points to the disaffection of the young from religious institutions.

Youth's religious crisis is interpreted from the standpoint of the child's psychological disassociation from his parents... The need for emancipation, the criticism of parents, the search for independence - all induce youth to reject everything that once identified him with his family: values, tradition, religious attitudes themselves.12

These are only some of the theoretical approaches which could be applied to this extremely complex phenomenon. What is certain is that a minority13 of the sample of Graceland students explicity reject the religious orthodoxy and utopianism of their parents and peers. One senior girl, for example, replied to the question, "Is significant progress being made by the RLDS Church to accomplish the creation of Zion?" -- "I don't know because I don't associate with the

---

11 Ibid., p. 181.


13 Thirty-five and eight tenths per cent (35.8%) of the senior class described their church participation as "occasional" or "inactive."
Church. But taking a view as a daughter of active parents, I'd say, 'no', because they are too wrapped up in 'for the moment issues' instead of long time goals and ideals."

Another opines that

the role and function of organized religion is no longer relevant. The need that organized religion filled in past is no longer there (to educate) also to give an outlet to unknown emotions, etc. Organized religion is now only a social club... If Zion was established, organized religion would be out of a job.

Finally, one student frankly admits, "I believe I almost become more atheist as every day goes by (I'm not kidding)."

Disaffection is a matter of degree, of course, for those who maintain their membership in the Church, and it should be conceived as a movement or trend, rather than a state of being. It may result in inactivity in church affairs, overt rejection of the organizational church, or even a rejection of all "religious" concepts.

Conclusions. The historical study of American communitarian thought leads rather directly to the conclusion that by the end of the nineteenth century, the cloistered utopian community had reached its nadir. For the Latter Day Saint sects, a routinization of the group's original charismatic impetus was evident. The Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints reflects this routinization
as it, like other sectarian movements of the same genre, moved toward denominational status. Denominational status must imply an accommodation to the world to some degree. The radical community building efforts of the Latter Day Saint prophet, Joseph Smith, have not as of this time been duplicated by the Reorganized Church. The students at Graceland College, as members of the Reorganized Church, are forced to confront this fact and to deal with it in some way.

This research has shown that a generalized trend toward "liberalism" expresses itself as the students progress up the academic ladder. This trend toward "rationality" and "disenchantment" with the world leads some students to a "revisionist" utopian belief system. For students holding to this position, activity and social reform in conjunction and cooperation with other established organizations is a way to fulfill the spirit, if not the letter, of the Church's nineteenth century utopian tenants. Although the trend of attitudinal shifts is, in general, to a more secular point of view for most students, it should not be assumed that it is the only possibility open to the group. A goodly number of students were able to resist what they considered to be the heresy of modernism.

Why were some students more successful in resisting the strain toward disaffection or liberalism? First, those
students conceptualizing society in a conservative manner tended to hold to sectarian utopian concepts to a greater degree than the nonconservative students. Second, those students with a dogmatic cognitive orientation were more prone to resist challenges to their sectarian beliefs than the nondogmatic group. Further, the high scorers on the dogmatism scale included a greater number of cognitive elements in their utopian concepts than did low scoring students. Another factor highly related to the continued support of sectarian utopian beliefs was an attitude of "religious orthodoxy." The attitudes expressed in the acceptance of "orthodox" religious beliefs probably indicate a trust in church authority and the "finality" of scripture. Both church authority and the scripture are used by the church to support sectarian utopian beliefs.

One factor which was not found to influence utopian commitment in a statistically significant way was parental church activity.

The fact is that however the Graceland student solves the problem of utopian commitment, he finds himself in an historical position of an extremely different nature than that of the early Latter Day Saint or even his own parents. As Mannheim explains:

The fact of belonging to the same class and that of belonging to the same generation or age group have this in common: that both
endow the individuals sharing in them with a common location in the social and historical process, predisposing them for a certain characteristic mode of thought and experience, and a characteristic type of historically relevant action.\footnote{Karl Mannheim, \textit{Essays on the Sociology of Knowledge} (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1957) p. 291.}

The generation of Latter Day Saints in attendance at Graceland College is faced with the problem of either defending, transforming, or rejecting the utopian conceptions passed to them by earlier utopists. Further, since Graceland students will tend to "scatter" to geographically diverse areas of the country, they cannot depend on the "face to face" commitment mechanisms utilized by earlier utopists. The maintenance and promulgation of utopian thought for these students must be dependent on a communality of symbols. It would go far beyond the data collected here to predict whether this "communality" can be achieved. Whatever the case for these students, it would be safe to argue that for some individuals and groups, one form or another of utopian thought will be characteristic of the twentieth century. For as Fyodor Dostoyevsky once said, "Man cannot stand too much reality."
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Periodicals


"Parable of the Wheat and the Tares," Saints Herald, XXIV, No. 9 (September 3, 1887), 335.


"Speedy Advent of Christ," Saints Herald, II, No. 6 (June, 1861), 77.


Unpublished Theses, Dissertations


APPENDIX

QUESTIONNAIRE

Dear Gracelander:

This questionnaire is being given to a randomly selected sample of members of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latterday Saints in attendance at Graceland College. It is concerned with your social, political, and religious concepts (including your conception of Zion).

Your honest answers to the questions will be greatly appreciated. Remember that your name will not be needed on the questionnaire. Please answer the questions in a way which reflects your feelings. Your opinions may or may not agree with your friends and family.

As a former Graceland student and faculty member, I can appreciate the fact that you are pressed for time; however, I believe that the study is of sufficient importance and interest to you to warrant your participation.

Thank you very much for your cooperation.

Ronald E. Roberts
Department of Sociology
Louisiana State University
ATTITUDES AND CHARACTERISTICS OF GRACELAND STUDENTS

1. What is your sex?
   ____1) male ____2) female

2. What is your age?
   ____1) 17 or under ____4) 20 ____7) 23
   ____2) 18 ____5) 21 ____8) 24
   ____3) 19 ____6) 22 ____9) 25 or over

3. What is your major at Graceland?

4. What is your academic classification?
   ____1) freshman ____3) junior ____5) other
   ____2) sophomore ____4) senior

5. Where have you lived most of your life?
   ____1) on a farm
   ____2) in a small town (less than 2,000 population)
   ____3) in a small city (2,000 to 40,000 population)
   ____4) medium sized city (40,000 to 200,000 pop.)
   ____5) large city (over 200,000 population)

6. In what state have you lived most of your life?

7. What is your approximate cumulative grade point? (Note: If a freshman, give your high school average.)
   ____1) under 1.0 ____5) 2.6 to 3.0
   ____2) 1.1 to 1.5 ____6) 3.1 to 3.5
   ____3) 1.6 to 2.0 ____7) 3.6 to 4.0
   ____4) 2.1 to 2.5

8. How active would you say you are in the R.L.D.S. Church?
   ____1) very active (participate in all services and activities)
   ____2) active (attend most services and activities)
   ____3) participate occasionally
   ____4) inactive

9. If a male, do you hold priesthood in the R.L.D.S. Church?
   ____1) No, not a male ____3) Yes (If yes, give your office)
   ____2) No, a male but do not hold priest-
10. How active would you estimate your father to be in the Church?
   ___1) very active (participates in all services and activities when possible)
   ___2) active (attends most services and activities)
   ___3) participates occasionally
   ___4) participates on special occasions only
   ___5) inactive
   ___6) not a member
   ___7) deceased

11. If a member, is your father now more or less active than he was in the past?
    ___1) more active
    ___2) less active
    ___3) about the same
    ___4) not a member
    ___5) deceased, but was very active
    ___6) deceased, not active

12. If a member, does your father hold priesthood in the R.L.D.S. Church?
    ___1) No
    ___2) Yes (If yes, what office is held?) ______________

13. How active would you estimate your mother to be in the R.L.D.S. Church?
    ___1) very active (participates in all services and activities when possible)
    ___2) active (attends most services)
    ___3) participates occasionally
    ___4) participates on special occasions only
    ___5) inactive
    ___6) not a member
    ___7) deceased

14. Do your parents tithe regularly?
    ___1) No
    ___2) Yes
    ___3) Don't Know

15. Indicate which of the following best describes your own political preferences?
    ___1) Liberal Democrat
    ___2) Conservative Democrat
    ___3) Liberal Republican
    ___4) Conservative Republican
    ___5) Other (name) _____________________________

16. Indicate which of the following best describes your father's political position?
    ___1) Liberal Democrat
    ___2) Conservative Democrat
    ___3) Liberal Republican
    ___4) Conservative Republican
    ___5) Other (name) _____________________________
17. Indicate which of the following best describes your mother's political position?

_____1) Liberal Democrat
_____2) Conservative Democrat
_____3) Liberal Republican
_____4) Conservative Republican
_____5) Other (name) ____________________________

18. Regardless of whether or not you could vote, which of the following statements best describes your interest in the 1968 presidential primaries and election?

_____1) very interested (I discussed it and thought about it a great deal)
_____2) interested (I have discussed it somewhat)
_____3) mildly interested (I seldom discussed it)
_____4) uninterested (I never thought about it or discussed it)

19. Which of the following social issues, if any, do you discuss frequently with friends?

_____1) the war on poverty
_____2) civil rights
_____3) the war in Vietnam
_____4) "law and order"
_____5) world peace
_____6) international trade

_____7) Arab Israeli conflicts
_____8) the Nigerian civil war
_____9) right to work legislation
_____10) the morality of birth control measures

20. Which of the following social issues do you feel fairly knowledgeable about?

_____1) the war on poverty
_____2) civil rights
_____3) the war in Vietnam
_____4) "law and order"
_____5) world peace
_____6) international trade

_____7) Arab Israeli conflicts
_____8) the Nigerian civil war
_____9) right to work legislation
_____10) the morality of birth control measures

21. List those magazines you read on a regular basis.

__________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________
The following statements represent attitudes toward current issues. I am interested in your position on these issues. There are no right or wrong answers to these questions for they represent many different points of view about which there is both agreement and disagreement. Please answer as honestly as possible what your opinion would be by checking the space before the answer which represents your position. Please answer all of the questions.

22. You can usually depend more on a man if he owns property than if he does not.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

23. Our society is so complicated that if you try to reform parts of it, you’re likely to upset the whole system.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

24. If you start trying to change things very much you usually make them worse.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

25. If something grows up over a long time, there is bound to be much wisdom in it.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

26. I prefer the practical man anytime to the man of ideas.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

27. Private ownership of property is necessary if we are to have a strong nation.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree

28. It is better to stick by what you have than to be trying new things you don’t really know about.
   (1) strongly agree (4) slightly disagree
   (2) moderately agree (5) moderately disagree
   (3) slightly agree (6) strongly disagree
29. No matter how we talk about it, political authority comes not from us but from some higher power.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

30. All groups can live in harmony in this country without changing the system in any way.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

31. It's really not undemocratic to recognize that the world is divided into superior and inferior people.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

32. You can't change human nature.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

33. Duties are more important than rights.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

34. In this complicated world of ours the only way we can know what's going on is to rely on leaders or experts who can be trusted.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

35. My blood boils whenever a person stubbornly refuses to admit he's wrong.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

36. Man on his own is a helpless and miserable creature.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree

37. It is better to be a dead hero than to be a live coward.

1) strongly agree 4) slightly disagree
2) moderately agree 5) moderately disagree
3) slightly agree 6) strongly disagree
38. The United States and Russia have just about nothing in common.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

39. The main thing in life is for a person to want to do something important.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

40. Most people just don't know what's good for them.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

41. The present is all too often full of unhappiness. It is only the future that counts.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

42. Most people just don't care about others.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

43. It is only when a person devotes himself to an ideal or cause that life becomes meaningful.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

44. Fundamentally, the world we live in is a pretty lonesome place.

____ 1) strongly agree ______ 4) slightly disagree
____ 2) moderately agree ______ 5) moderately disagree
____ 3) slightly agree ______ 6) strongly disagree

The following questions deal with the concept of Zion as held by the R.L.D.S. Church. I would like to know your position on these issues.

45. In your own words, define the concept of Zion as you understand it.
46. How important to your religious faith is the ideal of Zion? (Check the appropriate statement.)
   1) absolutely indispensable
   2) important but not crucial
   3) not at all important

47. Have your ideas about Zion changed or remained essentially the same in the past few years?
   1) changed a great deal
   2) changed but not drastically
   3) remained essentially the same

48. If your ideas have changed, in what way(s) have they changed?

49. Has any particular church leader influenced your thinking about Zion to a great extent?
   1) Yes
   2) No
   If yes, who?

50. Which of the following ideas do you consider absolutely essential to your conception of Zion? (Check those ideas you consider essential.)
   1) the gathering
   2) Zion as Jackson County, Missouri
   3) Zion as America
   4) Zion as a place of refuge
   5) the building of a temple in the centerplace
   6) complete unity of thought and belief
   7) continuing revelation
   8) Zion as a physical city
   9) Zion as a mode of Christian living
   10) Zion as a place of preparation for the return of Christ
These statements relate to your ideas concerning Zion and other religious topics. Again, remember that no answer is "correct" or "incorrect," for I am interested in your position. Answer as honestly as possible by checking the space before the answer which represents your position.

51. I believe there is a supernatural being, the Devil, who continually tries to lead men into sin.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

52. To me, the most important work of the church is the saving of souls.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

53. I believe there is a life after death.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

54. I believe there is a Divine plan and purpose for every living person and thing.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

55. The only benefit one receives from prayer is psychological.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

56. Zion represents the only true hope of mankind today.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

57. The City of Zion will be a place of refuge in the last days.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree

58. Zion will be established regardless of the actions of men.
   ___1) strongly agree ___4) slightly disagree
   ___2) moderately agree ___5) moderately disagree
   ___3) slightly agree ___6) strongly disagree
59. I expect to see the establishment of Zion in my lifetime.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

60. The building of a temple is essential to the establishment of Zion.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

61. Zion refers to the area in and around Jackson County Missouri.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

62. The Concept of Zion is one of the most important ideas the church has to offer today.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

63. The establishment of Zion will eliminate forms of deviant behavior such as stealing, cheating, lying etc.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

64. Zion refers to a spiritual condition rather than a geographical area.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

65. The Concept of Zion, while a necessary part of the Nineteenth Century church, has outlived its usefulness.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree

66. Zionic living does not differ significantly from Christian living.
   _____1) strongly agree _____4) slightly disagree
   _____2) moderately agree _____5) moderately disagree
   _____3) slightly agree _____6) strongly disagree
67. While Zion is an attractive ideal, it will probably never be realized.
   ____1) strongly agree   ____4) slightly disagree
   ____2) moderately agree  ____5) moderately disagree
   ____3) slightly agree    ____6) strongly disagree

68. Knowledge of the social and behavioral sciences is indispensable to the establishment of Zion.
   ____1) strongly agree   ____4) slightly disagree
   ____2) moderately agree  ____5) moderately disagree
   ____3) slightly agree    ____6) strongly disagree

69. Members of the Reorganized Church could learn much about the construction of Zion by studying the utopian communities of early American groups such as the Shakers, Perfectionists and Amana Colonies.
   ____1) strongly agree   ____4) slightly disagree
   ____2) moderately agree  ____5) moderately disagree
   ____3) slightly agree    ____6) strongly disagree

70. In your opinion, is significant progress being made by the R. L. D. S. Church to accomplish the creation of Zion?
    ____1) yes   ____2) no

    Why or why not?

71. In your opinion, should the R. L. D. S. Church participate in Ecumenical groups (such as the National Council of Churches)?
    ____1) yes   ____2) no

    Why or why not?
72. In your opinion, what role will other church groups play in the establishment of Zion?

______1) a great role
______2) a limited role
______3) no role at all

Who or who not?
VITA

Ronald E. Roberts was born in Chariton, Iowa, on July 31, 1939. He received his primary and secondary education in the public schools of Moline, Illinois and Lucas, Iowa. He attended Graceland College in Lamoni, Iowa, for two years and finished his Bachelor of Arts degree at Drake University in Des Moines, Iowa. In 1964 he completed his Master of Arts degree in Sociology at Louisiana State University.

The author has taught sociology at Graceland College and Memphis State University. He is now a candidate for the degree Doctor of Philosophy at Louisiana State University.
EXAMINATION AND THESIS REPORT

Candidate: Ronald Edward Roberts

Major Field: Sociology

Title of Thesis: DILEMMAS OF UTOPIAN COMMITMENT IN A CONTEMPORARY RELIGIOUS SECT

Approved:

[Signatures]

Major Professor and Chairman

Dean of the Graduate School

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

[Signatures]

Date of Examination: May 8, 1969