

1650-1850: Ideas, Aesthetics, and Inquiries in the Early Modern Era

Volume 19

Article 16

2012

ENLIGHTENMENT POLITICS AND CATHOLIC CHARITY IN SPAIN Bernardo Ward's *Obra pia* and *Proyecto economico*

Elizabeth Franklin Lewis

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/sixteenfifty>



Part of the [Aesthetics Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Elizabeth Franklin Lewis (2012) "ENLIGHTENMENT POLITICS AND CATHOLIC CHARITY IN SPAIN
Bernardo Ward's *Obra pia* and *Proyecto economico*," *1650-1850: Ideas, Aesthetics, and Inquiries in the Early Modern Era*: Vol. 19, Article 16.

Available at: <https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/sixteenfifty/vol19/iss1/16>

ENLIGHTENMENT POLITICS AND CATHOLIC CHARITY IN SPAIN

Bernardo Ward's *Obra pia* and *Proyecto económico*

Elizabeth Franklin Lewis

The influence of Christian belief and the Christian church in the process of Enlightenment reform is a topic that was just as much in dispute during the eighteenth-century as it is today, if not more.¹ While often we associate the compatibility of Christian belief and Enlightenment ideals with Protestant countries, Catholic nations also sought

¹ Helena Rosenblatt, "The Christian Enlightenment," in *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, vol. 7, *Enlightenment, Reawakening and Revolution 1660–1815*, ed. Stewart J. Brown and Timothy Tackett (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 283–301. Rosenblatt discusses the change among academics from the idea that the Enlightenment was at its heart an attack on religion to a more nuanced understanding of the relationship between religious belief and Enlightenment, resulting from an emphasis on the "pluralizing" of the Enlightenment experience in various national contexts. To this end, see also Richard Butterwick, Simon Davies, and Gabriel Sánchez Espinosa, eds., *Peripheries of the Enlightenment* (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 2008).

to reconcile religious faith with important political, social and economic reforms.² In eighteenth-century Spain the struggle between Enlightenment and religion reflected many of the tensions of other Catholic nations, with a power struggle between the Crown and various elements of the Church at its heart.³ While Catholicism in Spain remained an unquestionable given, the reaches of the authority and the political and economic influence of the Catholic Church were not. In the words of Jean Sarrailh: “if the stability of faith and dogma didn’t seem threatened, on the other hand certain practices were in danger.”⁴ The great Spanish Enlightenment thinkers such as Benito Feijoo (himself a Benedictine monk), Gaspar Melchor de Jovellanos, and Juan Meléndez Valdés, among others, sought to rid the Church in Spain of superstition and superficial religiosity while maintaining the importance of an individual “inner worship” that sought truth, fervor, love, and charity.⁵

Still, it can be argued that the main thrust of the Spanish Enlightenment was not religious (or antireligious) at all, but rather economic. The *ilustrado* Jovellanos said of economics that in contrast to the past when a nation’s greatness depended on military and geographic dominance, “Commerce, industry and opulence...probably will be for a long time the only supports of the preponderance of a state.”⁶ Jovellanos was one of a group of influential Spanish intellectuals who studied and wrote extensively about economic problems and possible solutions, and for whom the development of the Spanish economy was their foremost aim, which in turn called for agrarian reform, educational reform, tax and levy reform, and even a reform of the police.⁷ Many of these proposed economic reforms came into conflict with the Catholic establishment, which, aside from the Crown, was the na-

² Nigel Aston, “Continental Catholic Europe,” *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, 15–32.

³ Andrea J. Smidt, “Luces por la Fe: The Cause of Catholic Enlightenment in 18th-Century Spain,” in *Brill’s Companion to the Catholic Enlightenment in Europe*, ed. Ulrich L. Lehner and Michael Printy (Leiden: Brill, forthcoming). Smidt studies the uniquely Spanish attempts to implement Enlightenment ideals and reforms within Catholicism, especially the unique role Gallican jansenism played in Spanish Enlightenment reforms.

⁴ Jean Sarrailh, *La España ilustrada de la segunda mitad del siglo XVIII* (México: Fondo de Cultura, 1957), 612. The translations from Spanish to English throughout this paper are my own.

⁵ Sarrailh, *La España ilustrada*, 697.

⁶ Quoted in Sarrailh, *La España ilustrada*, 544.

⁷ Vicent Llomart Rosa, “El pensamiento económico de la Ilustración en España (1730–1812),” in *Economía y Economistas Españoles*, vol. 3, ed. Enrique Fuentes Quintana (Barcelona: Fundación de las Cajas de Ahorros Confederadas, 2000), 7–89.

tion's wealthiest landowner, and was the largest (and sole) provider of social services to the poor and sick.

The curious example of Bernardo Ward, the Irish-born minister of the Junta de Comercio y Moneda under Fernando VI and author of two books on economics, provides an interesting perspective on these issues—the important role of the Catholic Church, charity as both an individual and corporate moral duty, and a proposal for the economic development of Spain. Ward's two major works were his *Obra pía*, or *Pious Work*, of 1750, republished in 1767 and again in 1779 as an appendix to his second book, *Proyecto económico*, or *Economic Project*, which was written in 1762 and published posthumously in 1779 with an introduction written by Pedro Rodríguez de Campomanes. These books were of enormous interest to the *ilustrados* of Spain's late Enlightenment period, especially to the influential Campomanes, who was a founding member of the Economic Society of Madrid and one of King Carlos III's most powerful aids in the 1770s and '80s—serving as Spain's Minister of Finance and later as the director of the powerful Consejo de Castilla.⁸

Not much is known about Bernardo Ward, and much of what we know comes from his follower Campomanes. Juan Luis Castellano thinks that he probably came to Spain from Ireland in the 1740s with “more than the average education” and a good knowledge of European languages.⁹ Irish immigrants came to Spain in large numbers at the end of the seventeenth century as a result of the defeat of the Jacobites by the supporters of William III.¹⁰ Irish Catholics who as a result of the conflicts with Britain lost their positions, livelihoods, and even civil rights, moved to Spain throughout the eighteenth-century, concentrating in coastal cities such as Bilbao and Cádiz, as well as in the Spanish capitol Madrid. They were military mercenaries, farmers, merchants, and exiled priests. Many

⁸ Vicent Llobart, “Campomanes, el economista de Carlos III,” *Economía y economistas españoles*, 201–55.

⁹ Juan Luis Castellano Castellano, “Bernardo Ward,” in *Economía y economistas españoles*, 185–200. Castellano's assessment of Ward's education and knowledge comes directly from Campomanes's introduction “Al lector” in the 1779 edition of the *Proyecto económico*.

¹⁰ The question of Irish Enlightenment is especially addressed in the following two essays: Michael Brown, “Was There an Irish Enlightenment? The Case of the Anglicans,” in *Peripheries of the Enlightenment*, ed. Richard Butterwick, Simon Davies, and Gabriel Sánchez Espinosa (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 2008), 49–64; and Ultán Gillen, “Varieties of Enlightenment: The Enlightenment and Irish Political Culture in the Age of Revolutions,” in *Peripheries of the Enlightenment*, ed. Richard Butterwick, Simon Davies, and Gabriel Sánchez Espinosa (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, 2008), 163–82.

went on to build prominent businesses and hold important military and government positions.¹¹

But the Irish weren't the only outsiders moving to Spain in the eighteenth century. Bernardo Ward was part of a larger wave of immigrants to Spain from other European countries, bringing with them the social, political, philosophic, and artistic trends of the European Enlightenment movement. In "Article II" of his *Obra pía*, Ward states his desire to "follow the experience... that the most wise nations of Europe have... examining the steps they have taken"¹² and sets as his example Italy, France, Germany, Holland, and England, which he proposes to visit in preparation for his larger plan set out years later in his *Proyecto económico*. Ward researched and composed his two major works in the pre-Adam Smith period of economic thought, when the ideas that would culminate in what we recognize today as capitalism were still formulating, and when mercantilism was the dominant economic theory. It was also a time when modern notions of philanthropy and benevolence were beginning to develop, moving charity away from a purely spiritual practice to a means of economic and social development. Charitable works were increasingly seen, especially in countries like England, as important not only for moral or spiritual reasons, but also "as instruments of mercantilist policy insofar as they tended to safeguard national power."¹³ It was precisely to this end—to bring to Spain the European Enlightenment vision of the economic and political importance of charity—that Ward wrote his two economic treatises. Elena Maza Zorrilla calls Ward one of the personalities who most profoundly and originally dealt with the problems of poverty in eighteenth-century Spain.¹⁴ Ward's *Obra pía* and *Proyecto económico* offer two interesting contributions to the Spanish Enlightenment, which are the connection of religious/pious acts of charity to economics, and the importance of labor—particularly the labor of excluded groups such as women—to the economic development of Spain. I call these contributions original, in spite of a much studied controversy over whether the second part of the *Proyecto económico* is in fact plagiarized from José del Campillo y Cosío's *Nuevo sistema*

¹¹ María Begonia Villar García, *La emigración irlandesa en el siglo XVIII* (Málaga: Universidad de Málaga, 2000).

¹² Bernardo Ward, *Obra pía y eficaz modo para remediar la miseria de la gente pobre de España* (Madrid: Antonio Marín, 1767), 11.

¹³ David Owen, *English Philanthropy 1660–1960* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1964), 14.

¹⁴ Elena Maza Zorrilla, *Pobreza y asistencia social en España, Siglos XVI al XX, Aproximación histórica* (Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1987), 105–9.

de gobierno económico para la América, written in 1743 but not published until 1789. Most scholars, including Sarrailh, Castellano, and Street, conclude that the second part of Ward's 1762 *Proyecto*, which is a proposal for the economic development of the Americas, is in fact a copy of Campillo's previous work. However, since both works were published after their authors' death, the intentions of Ward, and of his editor, Campomanes, have been and will continue to be disputed.¹⁵ Castellano especially emphasizes the differences between Campillo and Ward, and outlines in detail Ward's original contributions to Spanish Enlightenment economic thought in the "Estudio preliminar" to his modern edition of the *Proyecto económico* as well as in another article on Ward.¹⁶ It is my aim to build on Castellano's studies by examining the evolution of Ward's arguments for the economic development of Spain over the course of his two works—the *Obra pía* and *Proyecto económico*—and the ways in which he employed language that evoked both Spain's Catholic tradition as well as its economic future.

Ward wasn't the first in Spain to discuss the political and economic implications of Christian charity among the country's poor. In the sixteenth century both Juan Luis Vives (*Subventio pauperum*, 1526) and Fray Juan de Medina (*Charidad discreta*, 1545) spoke of the importance of distinguishing the truly needy from the "vagabonds" and "lazy" poor.¹⁷ It is evident from the full title of Medina's work *Charidad discreta, practicada con los mendigos y utilidades que logra la República en su recogimiento* (*Discreet Charity, practiced with beggars and the utility that the Republic achieves in their collection*) why his book would have been reprinted in a 1757 edition,¹⁸ just a few years after

¹⁵ Sarrailh, *La España ilustrada*, 18; Juan Luis Castellano Castellano, "Estudio preliminar," in *Proyecto económico* by Bernardo Ward, ed. Juan Luis Castellano Castellano (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Fiscales, 1982), xix–xxiii; and Donald Street, "The Discurso sobre el modo de fomentar la industria popular and the Discurso sobre el fomento de la industria popular: A Reply to Vicent Llombart," *History of Political Economy* 23.3 (1991): 533–36. See also Anthony Pagden, "Escuchar a Heráclides: El malestar en el imperio, 1619–1812," in *España, Europa y el Mundo Atlántico: Homenaje a John H. Elliott*, ed. Richard L. Kagan and Geoffrey Parker, trans. Lucía Blasco Mayor and María Condor (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2001), 419–38. Pagden does not get into the plagiarism debate, but treats in part III of his article the ideas of Campillo, Ward, and Campomanes regarding economic reform, free trade, and the Americas.

¹⁶ "Bernardo Ward," *Economía y economistas españoles*.

¹⁷ Maza Zorrilla, *Pobreza y asistencia*, 77–87.

¹⁸ Fray Luis de Medina, *Charidad discreta, practicada con los mendigos y utilidades que logra la República en su recogimiento* (Valladolid: Tomás de San Pedro, 1757). This eighteenth-century version changed the title from the 1545 edition, which was titled *De la orden que en algunos pueblos de España se ha puesto en la limosna para remedio de los verdaderos pobres*. Bernardo Ward, *Obra pía*, 4–6.

Ward published his *Obra pía* in 1750. Usefulness to the state was the mantra of the ilustrados of Spain, and the early modern Medina anticipated eighteenth-century Spain's desire to regulate poverty and increase the utilization of the nation's most important capital—its human resources—for the greater good of Spanish society. Ward is even more specific than the Benedictine friar Medina in his lengthy title, establishing a link between religious or moral charity, and economic policy:

Pious Work, an efficient way of remediating the misery of the poor people of Spain. In which are solidly proposed the most adequate means for establishing a general Brotherhood in Spain composed of the most pious persons of all stations, facilitating taxes that can produce without hardship, sufficient effects to aid the truly poor, the widow, the farmer who lost a crop; raising orphaned girls, placing poor maidens, gathering vagabonds, facilitating the irrigation of fields and fomenting industry.

The *Obra pía*, which Ward wrote before becoming one of Fernando VI's top economic advisors, begins with a criticism of the current status of the poor in Spain, from the lack of care for the sick, the elderly, and the orphaned, to the rampant vagabonds living in the streets who, despite living in "a Catholic kingdom" act as if they were in the "center of Barbary...with no more law or Christianity than their vicious inclinations." A third problem group is the working poor—those laborers who want to earn their livings (either by working the land, or working in industry) but cannot for lack of opportunity.¹⁹ Ward concludes this first part of his book by pointing out the need for his new plan:

To seek the relief corresponding to each one of these 3 classes of the poor, forms the most noble task for pious efforts, and for those who know how to be sensitive to such a pitiable spectacle...nor can we persuade ourselves that charity alone can remediate a problem of this magnitude: we should each one of us agree as we most efficiently can to advance this Work, so that united all under the direction of a most superior hand, we might achieve with the help

¹⁹ Bernardo Ward, *Obra pía*, 4–6.

of a wise and Christian politics what all the treasures of Potosí could not have done: make 2 million useful vassals happy.²⁰

Ward appeals to the sensibility of his age in the *Obra pía*, to "those who know how to be sensitive" to the problems of the poor, yet warns that neither charity nor national treasure can resolve Spain's problems, but rather a combination of the two, in a "wise Christian politics."²¹

Clearly Ward sees Spain in a new economic era, one where neither riches from the colonies, nor a church-run system of charities can handle the challenges a modern Spain faces—unemployment, underdevelopment of its towns and farmland, underpopulation, and a lack of a protective network for the weak, old, and sick. To face these challenges, Ward proposes one of the original faith-based public-private initiatives, a "Brotherhood" or *hermandad* made up men from all walks of life—political, military, religious and business leaders, even farm workers—and divided by region so that each area of Spain would have a group of wise local leaders assigned to reforming it. After assessing the magnitude of the problems facing the poor of their respective regions, the Brotherhood's tasks would be 1) to provide for the "pobres impedidos"—the deserving poor who cannot provide for themselves, 2) to create hospices to house and employ vagabonds, and 3) to make plans to develop industry and agriculture. But although the *hermandad* would be made up of both religious men and laypersons, Ward clearly means to involve the clergy heavily in this Enlightenment governmental project. Much of the funds for these pious works that Ward plans would come from the Church, with each parish contributing to the brotherhood the alms that beforehand had been given to beggars.²² By only supporting the "deserving poor" and putting the

²⁰ "Buscar el alivio correspondiente a cada una de estas tres clases de pobres, forma la más noble tarea para los esfuerzos piadosos, y para los que saben ser sensibles a tan lastimoso espectáculo. . . ni persuadirnos, que la sola caridad pueda remediar un mal de este tamaño: debemos concurrir cada uno como más eficazmente podamos a adelantar esta Obra, para que reunido todo, bajo la dirección de una superior mano, se logre con el auxilio de una sabia y cristiana política, lo que no hubieran conseguido los tesoros de Potosí; hacer dichosos a 2 millones de vasallos útiles." Bernardo Ward, *Obra pía*, 7–8. I have modernized the spelling and accentuation of the Spanish.

²¹ This appeal to the sentiments and sensibility seems to coincide with what Helena Rosenblatt has identified as a mid-century "turn to sentiments" within Christianity, as opposed to earlier reliance on reason and rationalism. Helena Rosenblatt, "The Christian Enlightenment," 292–97.

²² Ward, *Obra pía*, 72–76. Ward also thinks that the wealthy nobility will gladly contribute to the goods works of the *hermandad* and furthermore he proposes a national lottery (3

rest to work, Ward believes that there will be a net savings, along with a reduction in poverty.

Ward's proposals are not unlike many other proposals for dealing with poverty made throughout Enlightenment Europe, and indeed Ward hopes to study and imitate their successes. But his proposals for Spain especially capitalize on the power and the participation of the Catholic Church: "Since the destination of the money we hope to gather is made in benefit to the poor, it seemed to us that the Church would not refuse to participate in such a pious effort, employing its credit to this end...making itself the mediator between the rich and the poor."²³

Ward goes on to make an interesting comparison between England and its parliament, and Spain and the Catholic Church. First, he admits that among supporters of the absolute rule of the monarchy "Ecclesiastic immunity...is seen by politicians...as a sort of obstacle, because in many cases it limits absolute power."²⁴ But it needn't be this way, says Ward. Just as the public in England has great faith in its parliament, and can find great sums of credit within its own country because of this trust in the Parliament, so too Spain has great faith in its Church, says Ward: "the credit of the Church being such a fertile principle, that well managed, it could be the foundation of public prosperity."²⁵ It is unclear what Ward might want to use this credit for, since "in the present case we don't need more than the church's mediation,"²⁶ but one wonders if he might be alluding to the great property holdings and wealth that the Church possessed, which others after him in the eighteenth, nineteenth, and into the twentieth centuries would seek to redistribute, notably his posthumous editor Pedro Rodríguez de Campomanes, who authored the *Tratado de la regalía de la amortización* in 1765.²⁷

In July of 1750, after publishing the *Obra pía*, Ward began his proposed tour of Europe to gather information and make contacts on behalf of Spain,

actually, in Spain, Peru and New Spain) to help build his proposed poor houses and factories (77-89).

²³ "Siendo el destino del dinero que queremos juntar, hacer beneficio a los pobres, nos pareció que no reusaría la Iglesia de concurrir a tan piadoso intento, empleando su crédito a este fin...hacerse medianera entre el rico, y el pobre." Ward, *Obra pía*, 109.

²⁴ "La inmunidad eclesiástica en un Estado Monárquico se mira regularmente por los políticos para algunas cosas, como un género de embarazo, porque en muchas ocasiones limita el poder absoluto." Ward, *Obra pía*, 110.

²⁵ "Siendo el crédito de la Iglesia un principio tan fecundo, que bien manejado, puede ser el fundamento de la pública prosperidad." Ward, *Obra pía*, 112.

²⁶ Ward, *Obra pía*, 113.

²⁷ Pedro Rodríguez de Campomanes, *Tratado de la regalía de amortización* (Madrid: Imprenta Real de la Gaceta, 1765).

a trip which took him four years to complete. Upon returning to Spain he was appointed minister of the Junta de Comercio y Moneda under King Fernando VI, and in 1756 probably began writing his *Proyecto económico*, which he completed in 1762, just before his death.²⁸ Although this book is supposedly written as a continuation of the proposals he had made in the earlier *Obra pía*, and certainly many of the ideas from the previous work are developed further in the second, there has clearly been an evolution of thought in the twelve or so years between them.

From the very titles, we can note a very different approach in Ward's second book. Religious references abound in the title of the first book—"pious work" meant to "relieve the suffering of the poor" by creating a "brotherhood" of the "most pious persons." Emphasis moves gradually in the title of this first book from the religious to the economic, with introduction of terms like "arbitrios" (referring to a municipal tax meant to support public works), and "fomentar industria" (developing industry).

Unlike the mix of economics and religiosity in the *Obra pía*'s long title, the shorter and more direct title of Ward's second book is purely economic: *Economic Project, in which are proposed various measures, directed to promote the interests of Spain, with the necessary means and funds for their establishment*.²⁹ Instead of appealing to Christian charity and morality, this title speaks of "intereses" (interests) and of "medios y fondos" (means and funds), to support implementation ("plantificación") of Ward's idea of an "economic project."

The different emphases continue beyond the titles of the two works. Early on in the *Obra pía* Ward elaborates on his choice of title:

An idea, that in addition to the relief of the poor, looks to the instruction of industry, solid base of the opulence and greatness of the Monarchy; and although this last point is our principal objective, it did not seem improper to us to give the name Pious Work to this operation, which is directed, not only to the aid of so many unhappy souls, but rather to drying up that fountain from which so much vice and unhappiness flows.³⁰

²⁸ Juan Luís Castellano, "Estudio preliminar," XII–XIII.

²⁹ Bernardo Ward, *Proyecto económico en que se proponen varias providencias, dirigidas a promover los intereses de España, con los medios y fondos necesarios para su plantificación* (Madrid: Joachin Ibarra, 1779).

³⁰ "Una idea, que además del remedio de los pobres, mira a la instrucción de la industria, basa sólida de la opulencia, y grandeza de la Monarquía; y aunque esta última es nuestro objeto

So although “pious,” the true aim of Ward’s proposals are economic—the “opulence of the Monarchy” gained through fomenting industry (work) among its people. The effects may be positive for the individual being helped, much like traditional charity, but Ward is aiming to change the system in order to improve the lot of an entire nation. And although Ward seeks to take advantage of charitable persons and institutions in Spain, especially in the creation of the “brotherhoods” throughout Spain to carry out his proposals, the real solution to the systemic problems of poverty and underdevelopment in Spain does not lie solely in charity. Spain’s problems can’t be solved by building more poor houses says Ward, but rather the solution is economics—*rentas* (income), *fondos* (funds), *industria* (industry).³¹ These are examples of the language of economics that Ward begins to introduce in his first book that later form the vocabulary of his *Proyecto económico*.

Toward the end of his first book, Ward defends some of the criticisms of the key points to his proposal for a pious work of economic development through charitable projects in Spain. He makes a case for his *hermandades*, or local brotherhoods, which would be the main executors of Spain’s economic development:

Teaching persons of different classes, passions and interests to unite their forces and direct their operations towards public ends, will be a way to make everyone understand how much importance this union and harmony has in the Political Body, and...is the cornerstone of the prosperity of the State.³²

Furthermore, he defends the heavy involvement of the clergy and the nobility in his *hermandades*, saying that those who have most influence with the people are needed, and that although they might not know much of factories and industry, through these organizations they would learn to apply the latest developments and technologies and pass this knowledge and enthusiasm on

principal, no nos pareció impropio dar el nombre de Obra Pía a esta operación, que se dirige, no solo al alivio de tantos infelices, sino a agotar la fuente de que dimana tanto vicio, y tanta infelicidad.” Bernardo Ward, *Obra pía*, 2–3.

³¹ Ward, *Obra pía*, 14.

³² “Habituar las personas de diferentes clases, pasiones, e intereses a unir sus fuerzas, y dirigir sus operaciones a fines públicos, será un medio de hacer comprehender a todos quanto importa esta unión, y armonía en el Cuerpo Político; y...es la piedra fundamental de la prosperidad del Estado.” Ward, *Obra pía*, 160–61.

to the people "and in this way the spirit of industry will be diffused imperceptibly throughout all of the Body of the Nation."³³

"Imperceptibly diffusing" his economic philosophy seems to be Ward's main strategy in the *Obra pía*, not only through his plan of using local leaders and existing structures within the Spanish Church to create economic development (and notably with little cost to the state, he claims), but also in the very language he employs and the structure of his arguments. Even the title of *Obra pía* reflects that "imperceptible diffusion" with its heavy emphasis on words that appeal to a religious sensibility, while introducing certain Enlightenment economic terms that will become key to his plan for economic renewal.

But twelve years later these subtleties are gone. One most obvious change is in the name of the body of leaders who would enact the proposed reforms. Rather than forming *hermandades* filled with laypersons and clergy, Ward now calls for a "commission" (*comisión*), formed by a group of *comisarios* who were to be engineers with experience in hydraulics and machinery.³⁴ While the *Obra pía* depended heavily on the active involvement of the clergy, in the *Proyecto económico* these pious men and the charity they promote have been relegated to a lesser role:

One could take advantage of the large number of ecclesiasts, who don't have any precise occupation, nor do they contribute at all to the political goals of the government, since there are various matters in which, without contradicting their status, they can employ themselves in benefit to the poor people and for the edification of all, not only directing hospices, but also in all the improvements that are directed at the general good.³⁵

Clearly throughout the *Proyecto económico*, Bernardo Ward not only expresses his belief that the Catholic church should be a willing partner in the quest for a stronger Spanish economy (which was his position in the

³³ "Y así se difundirá imperceptiblemente el espíritu de industria por todo el Cuerpo de la Nación." Ward, *Obra pía*, 175.

³⁴ Bernardo Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 2–3.

³⁵ "Se podrá sacar partido del gran número de Eclesiásticos, que no tienen ocupación precisa, ni contribuyen nada a los fines políticos del gobierno, habiendo varios asuntos en que, sin contravenir a su estado, se pueden emplear en beneficio de la gente pobre y con edificación de todos, no solo en la dirección de Hospicios, sino en todas las mejoras que van dirigidas al bien general." Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 15.

Obra pía), but that it should submit itself to that greater good. By his second book, Ward is much more critical of the clergy and of their charity. He suggests that the Church and the nobility ought to pay their fair share of taxes,³⁶ and he even complains that the way they give charity indiscriminately is not productive: "they serve in great part to encourage lethargy and to nourish vice."³⁷ Charity is even seen as a possible obstacle to reform and advancement: "charity, the queen of virtues, if not directed well, is the greatest stimulus for idleness."³⁸ He criticizes the Church for not encouraging virtue and industry in the poor through a practical education, despite his assertions to the contrary in the *Obra pía* as we have seen. Now, instead of instructing workers in technical advancements and asserting the value of their work, as he imagined they would in the *Obra pía*, Ward complains that the Church prefers to teach them a little "bad Latin" and facilitate their entry into ranks of the clergy—not the workforce—thus becoming an economic burden to the Church and the State, and an example of idleness (*ociosidad*).³⁹ Instead of appealing to religious sentiment as he did in his previous book, in the *Proyecto económico* Ward pits the present status of the Spanish Church in society—which he depicts as supporting idleness and vice—against a future that Ward posits in which industry and innovation dominate for the betterment of the nation.

This future is based on commerce, a word that, although appearing frequently in the *Obra pía*, dominates the *Proyecto económico*, and is addressed throughout both parts of the book, specifically in chapters XIII–XVI of part 1, and chapter VIII of part 2.⁴⁰ "Commerce," says Ward in chapter XIII of part 1,

doesn't create anything, but is the soul of industry, which in turn the soul of the State. Commerce sustains operations of politics and war, and is equally useful to the worker, the sailor, the soldier, the nobility, and the Prince.⁴¹

³⁶ Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 172–73.

³⁷ "Sirven en gran parte de entretener la desidia, y alimentar el vicio." Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 197

³⁸ "La caridad, que es la reyna de las virtudes, si no se dirige bien, es el mayor fomento de la ociosidad." Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 87.

³⁹ Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 88.

⁴⁰ Chapter VIII ("Comercio de América") of part 2 of Ward's book is virtually the same as chapter IV ("En cuántos ramos será conducente dividir el Comercio de América...") from part 2 of Campillo y Cosío's *Nuevo sistema de gobierno económico*.

⁴¹ "El comercio no crea nada, pero es el alma de la industria, y esta lo es del Estado. El comercio sostiene las operaciones políticas y la guerra, y es igualmente útil al labrador, al marinero,

It is interesting that Ward left out the Church from his list of the beneficiaries of commerce. Whereas in the *Obra pía*, the Clergy (*clero*) is listed as one of the groups that profit from increased commerce and industry, this is not the case in Ward's second book.⁴² Instead, Ward emphasizes in the *Proyecto económico* mercantilist concepts of commerce, with the idea of "usefulness" (*utilidad*) to the State being its foremost purpose.⁴³ Ward follows the English, he says, in defining which commerce should be encouraged: namely that which is "useful to the State" (promoting internal production, and to a lesser extent internal consumption), and not that which is "prejudicial to the State" (for example, promoting consumption of external products at the expense of internal).

In an ideal setting, commerce should be free of restrictions set by the State:

Of all the types of commerce, none is more efficient, nor more equitable than the free concurrence of buyers and sellers: it is the enemy of all monopolies and tyrannies: it opens the free path towards industry and talent: it gives preference to merit, and forms an equilibrium equally favorable to all: its influence would be universal, if it didn't find itself limited by the right that each State has to favor its own, and deny to outsiders the benefit of its commerce.⁴⁴

Free commerce, in a mercantilist conception such as Ward's, is nonetheless subservient to utility, and Ward admits that it can be beneficial in "*casos extraordinarios*" for the state to break this general rule, in order to achieve "an extremely useful purpose."⁴⁵

But Ward calls commerce merely the "soul" of more the important concept of industry, which in turn is the true soul of the State. "Industry,"

al soldado, al noble, y al Príncipe." Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 119. Castellano also comments on the importance of commerce to Ward's thinking in his article "Bernardo Ward."

⁴² This association appears on page 78 of the *Obra pía*, in a quote that I will discuss in depth later in relation to the concept of "industry."

⁴³ Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 120–21.

⁴⁴ "De todos los medios de comercio, ninguno es más eficaz, ni más equitativo que la libre concurrencia de compradores y vendedores: ella es enemiga de todo monopolio y tiranía: deja libre carrera a la industria y al talento: da la preferencia al mérito, y forma un equilibrio igualmente favorable a todos: su influjo sería universal, si no se hallase limitado por el derecho que tiene cada Estado de franquear a los suyos, y negar a los extraños el beneficios de su comercio." Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 130. Ward later confirms the necessity of protectionism.

⁴⁵ Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 211

and its related concept of "work," as well as its antithesis "idleness," were all important concepts in the economic language of the day, in that work had intrinsic economic value (an idea later reflected in Adam Smith's value theories).⁴⁶ Thus, idleness was not just a moral deficiency to Ward, rather it was an obstacle to real economic development for Spain. Already in the *Obra pía*, work was a key concept for Ward. Everyone, in Ward's estimation, should work. Even the "*pobres impedidos*," the deserving poor unfit for typical work because of physical ailments or age, could be put to work in hospices where "they will apply themselves to tasks that take little effort, not obliging them to more than they can handle, according to each one's robustness; and although they only earn half, or a third of their keep, it always goes to lighten the load of the People."⁴⁷ Work is not only a noble endeavor for the individual, it is of enormous economic value to the individual as well as to society. Speaking of the importance of sparking industry among the poor, Ward states, "the industry of the vassals of this class, precisely results in the increase of the income of the Sovereign, of the Clergy and the Nobility; increasing commerce, circulation, and all that enriches a Nation, is the legitimate effect of industry."⁴⁸ The difference between Ward's concept of work in the *Obra pía* and the idea of work in the *Proyecto económico* was not who should work, or the value of work, but rather who could best encourage work among the people. We have already seen how Ward argues in the *Obra pía* that the clergy are best suited to leading the people,⁴⁹ and the group they have most influence over, says Ward, is women.

Throughout both books, Ward argues for increased participation of women in work. The textile industry especially was one that many mercantilist ilustrados sought to develop in Spain, in order to discourage the purchase of foreign-produced goods and to encourage the development of a national textile industry. Women, as both consumers and producers of textiles, were often targeted in these reform efforts, and Ward was one of the early econo-

⁴⁶ Castellano, "Bernardo Ward," 194-95.

⁴⁷ "Se aplicarán a obras de poca fatiga, no obligándolos a más de lo que pueden llevar, según su robustez; y aunque solo ganen la mitad, o la tercera parte del gasto que causan, siempre es aligerar la carga del Pueblo." Ward, *Obra pía*, 54.

⁴⁸ "La industria de los Vasallos de esta clase, precisamente resulta el aumento de las rentas del Soberano, del Clero, y la Nobleza; el acrecentarse el comercio, la circulación, y todo lo que enriquece una Nación, es efecto legítimo de la industria." Ward, *Obra pía*, 91. Note that in this quote from Ward's earlier book, the Church still plays a part in the economic equation.

⁴⁹ "Necesitamos los que más pueden con el Pueblo" ("we need the ones who have most influence with the People"). Ward, *Obra pía*, 174.

mists to identify this area for economic reform and growth.⁵⁰ However, women are a difficult group to influence, says Ward:

Since the authority of the Sovereign, the zeal for the good of the Public, nor consideration of their obligation matter to them. Many times, not knowing what it consists of, a virtuous woman considers to have fulfilled her obligations to God, if she has prayed a lot, even if she hasn't worked at all to maintain her children. In order to change their ideas and insensitively their way of living, it has been necessary to search for the persons who have the most influence with women. . . their Priests and Confessors.⁵¹

But in the *Proyecto económico*, it is not the priests who will inspire women to greater productivity, but rather technology—for example the substitution of a spinning wheel (*torno*) for a distaff (*rueca*), which according to Ward would make women “four times” more productive in their spinning.⁵² He also called for the development of schools for young girls that would train them in a trade,⁵³ as well as for a competition with monetary prizes to reward their best work, thus also providing girls with a dowry so that they might marry.⁵⁴

One important question is why this shift away from the involvement of the Church between Ward's first and second book? An answer might lie in a shift in the religious and political climate in Spain, especially in the role of the Jesuits in Spanish society and politics. In 1750 at the time of the first publication of the *Obra pía*, the Jesuits were still in favor in the Court, exemplified in the influence of Fernando VI's royal confessor, the Jesuit priest

⁵⁰ For a discussion of the role of Spanish economists in the moralist discourse on fashion see Rebecca Haidt, “The Name of the Clothes: Petimetras and the Problem of Luxury's Refinements,” *Dieciocho* 23.1 (Spring, 2000): 71–75. See also Theresa Ann Smith “Fashioning the Enlightenment: The Proposal for a Female National Dress in Eighteenth-Century Spain,” *Dieciocho* 23.1 (Spring, 2000): 76–84.

⁵¹ “Pues en ellas no vale la autoridad del Soberano, el celo del bien Público, ni la consideración de su obligación. Muchas veces, por no saber en qué consiste, cree la más virtuosa haber cumplido con Dios, si ha rezado mucho, aunque no haya trabajado nada para mantener a sus hijos. Para mudar sus ideas, e insensiblemente su modo de vivir, ha sido preciso buscar las personas que más influjo tengan con ellas. . . sus Curas, y Confesores,” Ward, *Obra pía*, 157–58.

⁵² Bernardo Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 10.

⁵³ Bernardo Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 10.

⁵⁴ Bernardo Ward, *Proyecto económico*, 205. Increasing Spain's population was another concern of Ward's, as it was with many other ilustrados.

Francisco de Rávago.⁵⁵ This would explain a reference in the 1750 *Obra pía* to the Compañía (the “Company” or “Society” of Jesus) in an argument in support of the relocation of the gypsies to the Americas: “Once the gypsies are there, without any place to escape, they will be taken in and supported spiritually by the Fathers of the Company, who are established there; they will make a useful and Christian life.”⁵⁶ It is interesting that the reference persists in the second edition of the book in 1767—the same year that the Jesuits were exiled—despite the imposition of a general silence regarding any public mention of the religious group. Perhaps the 1767 edition came out before the decree on April 2 of that year. Or perhaps despite the royal ban of any comment related to the Jesuits, this reference passed the eyes of the censors, coming so soon after the expulsion decree. But by the time the *Obra pía* was republished for the third time as an appendix to the 1779 edition of the *Proyecto económico*, the phrase “Fathers of the Company” was exchanged for the more general Misionistas (missionaries). This change was probably made by Campomanes—the editor of the 1779 edition, and the principal author of the 1767 report that recommended the expulsion of the Jesuits.⁵⁷ There is no such mention of the Jesuits in the 1762 *Proyecto económico*, and despite the fact that Campomanes had a hand in the 1779 edition (the earliest known copy of Ward’s second book available today), I don’t believe that this explains the absence of this or any other religious group in the book. Rather, in the years leading up to the completion of Ward’s second book, under the new leadership of Carlos III, who succeeded his brother Fernando in 1759, the political pendulum was beginning to swing away from Rome and the

⁵⁵ Sydney F. Smith, Joseph A. Munitiz, and R. W. Truman, *The Suppression of the Society of Jesus* (Leominster: Gracewing, 2004), 324.

⁵⁶ “Y estando una vez allá los Gitanos, no teniendo por donde huirse, se acogerían en lo espiritual a los Padres de la Compañía, que están allí establecidos; se harían a una vida útil, y cristiana.” Ward, *Obra pía*, 42. This “round-up” of the gypsies (“La Gran Redada de los Gitanos”) had been approved by Fernando VI in 1749 and continued through his reign and into the early reign of Carlos III. See. Antonio Gómez Alfaro, *The Great Gypsy Round-Up: Spain, the General Imprisonment of the Gypsies in 1749*, trans. Terence W. Roberts (Paris: Université René Descartes Gypsy Research Center, 1993).

⁵⁷ This was in part a reaction to the Riots of Esquilace, also known as the Cloak and Hat Riots, of 1766, which were eventually blamed on the Jesuits. See Dale K. Van Ley, “Jansensism and the International Suppression of the Jesuits,” in *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, vol. 7, *Enlightenment, Reawakening and Revolution 1660–1815*, ed. Stewart J. Brown and Timothy Tackett (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 302–28. See also Teófanés Egido López and Isidoro Pinedo, *Las causas “gravísimas” y secretas de la expulsión de los jesuitas por Carlos III* (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1994).

Jesuits (and toward the Jansenists).⁵⁸ Carlos sought to make himself Spain's Enlightened Despot, which meant he claimed absolute power, not only over matters of the State, but also of the Church.

Thus one explanation for the change in language between Ward's first and second books, as well as his conception of the role of the Catholic Church in the economic development of Spain and the betterment of Spanish society, is that Ward reacted in response to this shift in politics. Spanish regalists of the last decades of the century found in Ward's work confirmation of their own political and economic beliefs. His writings were embraced not only by Campomanes, but also by the Economic Society of Madrid, which gave its approval for their publication in 1777.⁵⁹ In his introduction "*Al lector*," Campomanes, who calls Ward a man who tried to "enlighten the nation in the science of economics," encourages the Economic Societies of Spain to take advantage of the "lights that his writings provide."⁶⁰ Campomanes's contemporary Jovellanos recommends Ward's *Proyecto económico* to the Royal Economic Society of Asturias, calling it a "work full of estimable news and knowledge."⁶¹ Certainly the projects of the economic societies during the reign of Carlos III and later under his son Carlos IV reflected many of the ideas that Ward had set out decades earlier. His ideas for agrarian reform, his desire to apply recent technologies and the experience of other nations to the Spanish context, his call for the development of the textile industry and for improvements to facilitate commerce from better roads and canals to the establishment of a police force, and his plan to incorporate the poor and disenfranchised, most notably women, into the workforce—all of these were important points of contact between Ward and his successors in the 1770s, '80s, and '90s. The economic societies tackled all of these problems in

⁵⁸ In 1761 the young monarch forced the Spanish Grand Inquisitor to rescind the publication of a Vatican condemnation of Mésenguy's Jansenist catechism, and to apologize publicly for his actions. Van Kley believes this was more as an assertion of power of the Spanish throne over Rome than an embracing of Jansenist theology. See Dale K. Van Kley, "Jansensism and the International Suppression of the Jesuits," 319.

⁵⁹ Castellano, "Estudio preliminar," xiv.

⁶⁰ Pedro Rodríguez de Campomanes, "Al lector," in *Obra pía* (Madrid: Joachin Ibarra, 1779), i–vii. For more information on the provenance of this unsigned introduction to the *Proyecto económico*, but which was attributed to Campomanes by his contemporaries and by modern scholars, see note 4 of Juan Luís Castellano, "Estudio preliminary," x.

⁶¹ Gaspar Melchor de Jovellanos, "Discurso dirigido a la Real Sociedad de Amigos del País de Asturias sobre los medios de promover la felicidad de aquel Principado," in *Obras publicadas e inéditas de don Gaspar Melchor de Jovellanos*, vol. 2, *Biblioteca de autores españoles*, ed. Candido Nocedal (Madrid: Rivadineyra, 1859), 438–53. This quote is from page 440 of this text.

their published studies and proposals as well as in their pet projects—from economic proposals for improving industry and agriculture,⁶² to the *Escuelas patrióticas* established to train young girls in the textile trade, and their support of charities such as the foundling hospital the *Inclusa de Madrid*.⁶³ All of these proposals and projects can be traced in some way to Bernardo Ward. Even the Economic Societies themselves—distributed regionally and made up of civic-minded men (and some women) of various walks of life,⁶⁴ who sought to develop Spain's economy by bringing reform and scientific advances—were in a way the *hermandades* that Ward posited in his first book. But the power struggles between the Crown, liberal reformers, and the Spanish Catholic Church, were not resolved in the eighteenth century, and the tensions between them reflected in Ward's two books on economics would continue in Spain for two more centuries.

⁶² For example, the *Informe de ley agraria*, written by Jovellanos on behalf of the Economic Society of Madrid. Gaspar Melchor de Jovellanos, *Informe de la Sociedad Económica de Madrid al Real y Supremo Consejo de Castilla en el expediente de ley agraria* (Madrid: Sancha, 1795).

⁶³ For more on these charitable endeavors and the women's auxiliary group to the Economic Society of Madrid, the *Junta de Damas*, which was charged by the Society to run them, see Elizabeth Franklin Lewis, "Actos de caridad: Women's Charitable Work in Eighteenth-Century Spain," *Dieciocho* 31.2 (Fall 2008): 269–84.

⁶⁴ In an analysis of the records of the Economic Society of Madrid's membership between 1775 and 1808, Antonio Manuel del Moral Roncal found that 11.4% of them were of the nobility, 7.3% of the clergy, 38.9% government functionaries, 13.4% artists and skilled workers, 6.7% military officers, 6.7% educators, and 15.4% other "liberal" professions or self-employed investors, etc. Antonio Manuel del Moral Roncal, "Los socios militares de la Real Sociedad Económica Matritense de Amigos del País (1775–1815)," *Revista de cultura militar* 6 (1994): 103–13.